

MEETING MINUTES
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
TRANSIT COMMITTEE

Thursday May 9, 2013
Maricopa Association of Governments; Ironwood Room;
302 N. 1st Avenue, Suite 200
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

ADOT: Nicole Patrick	*Paradise Valley: Jeremy Knapp
Avondale: Rogene Hill	#Peoria: Maher Hazine
#Buckeye: Sean Banda for Andrea Marquez	Phoenix: Ken Kessler for Neal Young
Chandler: Dan Cook for RJ Zeder	#Queen Creek: Chris Anaradian
El Mirage: Sue McDermott	Scottsdale: Madeline Clemann, Chair
*Gilbert: Leslie Hart	Surprise: David Kohlbeck
Glendale: Matthew Dudley	Tempe: Robert Yabes for Greg Jordan
Goodyear: Cato Esquivel	*Tolleson: Chris Hagen
Maricopa County DOT: Mitch Wagner	Valley Metro: Wulf Grote
Mesa: Jeff Martin for Jodi Sorrell	Youngtown: Grant Anderson

*Members neither present nor represented by proxy. + - Attended by Videoconference
- Attended by Audioconference

OTHERS PRESENT

Eileen Yazzie, MAG	Kristen Sexton, Avondale
Marc Pearsall, MAG	Christine McMurdy, Goodyear
Alice Chen, MAG	Kini Knudson, Phoenix
Monique de los Rios-Urban	Ted Mariscal, Phoenix
DeDe Gaisthea, MAG	Wendy Miller, Phoenix
Teri Kennedy, MAG	Bob Antila, Valley Metro
Stephanie Shipp, HDR	Deron Lozano, Valley Metro
	Mark Wavering, Gannett Fleming

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 10:02 a.m. by Chair Madeline Clemann. She welcomed everyone in attendance and announced that a quorum was present. She noted that three members were joining the meeting by teleconference; Sean Banda of Buckeye, Maher Hazine of Peoria and Chris Anaradian of Queen Creek. Chair Clemann asked if there were any public comment cards, and there being none, proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

2. Approval of Draft April 11, 2013 Minutes

Chair Clemann asked if there were any comments or corrections to the Draft April 11, 2013 meeting minutes. Jeff Martin of Mesa and Dan Cook of Chandler noted that they had not received the electronic minutes supplement in their packets and requested if they may have time to review them. Chair Clemann concurred and noted that the Draft April 11, 2013 meeting minutes approval could instead be deferred until the May Transit Committee meeting. She called for a motion. Mr. Cook moved to approve the motion, Mr. Martin seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Chair Clemann then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

3. Call to the Audience

Chair Clemann stated that she had not received any request to speak cards from the audience and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

4. Transit Program Manager's Report

Chair Clemann invited Eileen Yazzie of MAG to brief the Committee with the Transit Program Manager's Report.

Ms. Yazzie noted that she had three items to present. She explained that the Sustainable Transportation Land Use Integration Study was nearly wrapping up and that there was a new, eighth Stakeholder meeting coming up on May 20²⁰¹³. She requested that any comments or questions from member agencies regarding the Draft Final Report be submitted by Monday May 13, 2013. She also noted that on May 3 she forwarded out the applications for the 5310 and the 5307 JARC funding programs, and the due dates for the applications would be June 7, 2013. She noted that she would resend out the initial email which included all of the web-links to the applications and project information pages.

Ms. Yazzie reminded the committee that Marc Pearsall of MAG had sent out an email on April 16, 2013 requesting candidates interested in the vacant Vice Chair position submit letters to the MAG Regional Council Chair by Friday May 17, 2013; the Executive Committee will appoint a new Vice Chair by June 17, 2013. Ms. Yazzie completed her manager's report. Chair Clemann responded to a member question that she would be willing to serve one additional term as Chair should the committee choose. Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Yazzie for her report and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

5. Federal TIGER Discretionary Grants

Chair Clemann noted that due to technical difficulties, Marc Pearsall of MAG and Jim Moore of Moore & Associates would provide a status update to the committee on the MAG Northwest Valley Local Transit System Study in a few moments. She requested that Item #9 be heard out of order so that Ms. Yazzie may brief the committee on the status of Federal TIGER Discretionary Grants.

Ms. Yazzie noted that many of the Transit Committee members present had been working with and attending the Valley Metro meetings regarding the TIGER program. She noted that the United States Department of Transportation (USDOT) was authorized to award \$473.847 million in Transportation Investment Generating Economic Recovery (TIGER) Discretionary Grants pursuant to the Full-Year Continuing Appropriations Act. She said that it was Round 5 (fifth year of the program). She said that the Notice of Funding Availability (NOFA) was issued on April 26, 2013 and that there was a tight turn around for submittals, with a due date of June 3, 2013.

She then explained the funding availabilities and a local match requirement of 20%, which would not necessarily make a project competitive. She noted that the USDOT was actually encouraging a 40-60% local match due to the high competition amongst the submittals. She said that the minimum project request for federal funds would also need to be a minimum of ten million (\$10,000,000). She noted that the last round's (Round 4) average award dispersal was \$13-\$16 million dollars. Ms. Yazzie explained that the MAG Region only had a few projects that would qualify for this grant application. Ms. Yazzie completed her presentation.

Mr. Cook asked if the state or region ever coordinated their TIGER efforts in recent past efforts. Ms. Yazzie replied that in previous TIGER applications, the MAG Region nor the state had coordinated their efforts. Discussion followed on how an uncoordinated program may prove detrimental to the Valley as many other states and regions had received substantial grant amounts due to their focused coordination. Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Yazzie for her report and noted that when the application process was complete, that perhaps the region analyze to see if those awards may have freed up Preventive Maintenance (PM) funding so that the region may start planning ahead.

Chair Clemann asked if there were any questions or comments. Hearing none, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

6. Northwest Valley Local Transit System Study

Chair Clemann requested that Marc Pearsall of MAG and Mr. Jim Moore of Moore & Associates return to the lectern to provide a status update to the committee on the MAG Northwest Valley Local Transit System Study.

Mr. Pearsall thanked Chair Clemann and the Committee for their patience and noted that the presentation and information was for discussion and possible action for acceptance of the Northwest Valley Local Transit System Study. He stated that the purpose of the study was to identify opportunities and strategies for improving the existing transit service in the Northwest Valley and to develop a short, mid, and long range local transit plan that effectively provided circulation within the Northwest Valley communities, but also connected to the regional transit system. He then thanked the Project Management Team members from the communities of El Mirage, Glendale, Maricopa County, Peoria, Surprise and Youngtown as well as Valley Metro for their involvement and guidance in the study since Spring 2012. He then introduced project consultant Jim Moore to give further details on the study's findings.

Mr. Moore referred to the attached Power Point presentation and noted the study was continuing with a number of public open houses to get public input as to the needs of a transit system in the NW

Valley. He noted that after twelve months of study, the final draft report's summaries were being vetted with a final round of public meetings in Surprise, Sun City and Youngtown. He explained that one of the objectives of creating a market-driven plan was the extensive public involvement. The activities were created specifically to engage study area communities as partners in the planning process, to ensure the Study's recommendations align with the communities' visions and desires for future transit service. He added that it recognized local citizens and stakeholders as the experts on their respective communities and emphasizes local control of the resulting plan. He also mentioned that the draft of the final recommendations would be posted on the website www.nvtransit.azmag.gov shortly after Memorial Day.

Mr. Moore referred to a study area map and noted that one ideal of the study was to create a transit blueprint for Northwest Region. He then advised of the Study Goals and the methodology in developing the study. He noted that current conditions were analyzed such as census data, demographic and existing resources. He noted that one of the primary functions of the study's public involvement process was its lengthy and in depth outreach element, which included over 2100 survey responses received, and over 30 community and public workshops, meetings and open houses over eight months.

Mr. Moore then discussed key findings of the study, which included both data driven results and user-demand oriented feedback. The top priorities noted by the residents were: 1) transit access to local shopping and medical needs was important, 2) Desire for neighborhood circulator shuttles, and 3) remedy insufficient transit access beyond the NW Valley. He added that some of the study outcomes were broken down into four service delivery options: 1) fixed route, 2) limited express, 3) deviated fixed route, and 4) Dial-A Ride. He noted that another outcome was to focus on enhancing local mobility while also improving connectivity with regional transit services. This featured a phased implementation – Near-term (present to 5 years), Mid-term (5 to 10 years), and Long-term (10 or more years).

He mentioned that one of the plan recommendations was the establish of an intergovernmental partnership agreement or charter in the near-term (present to 5 years); the result being a forged alliance between northwest communities in order to raise revenue and the governance structure that would permit the increase in bus service and the creation of five local neighborhood circulators. Subsequently, in the mid-term (5-10 years) there would be an increase in Valley Metro fixed-route service, an increase service to Banner-Boswell Medical Center; and an increase in frequency and coverage. In the long-term(10+ years), there would be support for the eventual implementation of high-capacity transit service; provision for a new north-south Valley Metro service along Litchfield Road that would connect the Northwest and Southwest Valleys, and extension of Valley Metro Routes. One additional element would be the transition of the Sun City Festival volunteer driver program, which could help link the community in far north Buckeye with Surprise, other Northwest Valley cities and even downtown Phoenix.

Mr. Moore also noted the report detailed a financing transit improvement program for the Northwest Valley. He stated that there were federal programs; state sources; and dedicated local transit-funding options with three phases for both implementation and long-term. He noted net implementation costs \$9,687,022 (Near-term); \$8,944,082 (Mid-term); \$89,140,980 (Long-term) as well as long term capital and operations costs of \$10,863,514 for near term, \$10,120,573 for mid-term and \$104,188,193 long-term. He then concluded his presentation and thanked the Committee.

Chair Clemann thanked Mr. Moore and all of the Northwest Valley Study project management members for their work on the study. She then asked if there were any questions or comments.

Jeff Martin of Mesa inquired on the study's near term prospects and David Kohlbeck of Surprise noted that local trips within Surprise were clearly popular and that increased transit within the city would help ease the burden on the City's Dial-A-Ride program. Sean Banda of Buckeye thanked the study partners and in particular the City of Surprise for including the Town of Buckeye's Sun City Festival within the study due to its unique geographic location in relation to Buckeye. Grant Anderson noted that since the Open Houses were occurring during the following week, could the agenda item be held for acceptance until after all final comments were solicited from the public and PMT members. Chair Clemann concurred and noted that the agenda item would return on a future agenda for approval.

Chair Clemann again asked if there were any questions or comments. Hearing none, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

7. FY 2013 Draft Program of Projects and FY 2014-2018 Draft Transportation Improvement Program

Chair Clemann requested that Alice Chen of MAG and Bob Antila of RPTA/Valley Metro provide a status update to the committee on the FY 2013 Draft Program of Projects and FY 2014-2018 Draft Transportation Improvement Program.

Ms. Chen noted that development of the FY2014-2018 Transportation Improvement Plan (TIP) was currently underway. She said that the Transit Committee is tasked with programming and balancing the TIP, which includes fiscal year 2013. MAG staff had been working with Valley Metro/RPTA to reconcile the needs of the Transit Life Cycle Program and to program the priorities of the Regional Programming Guidelines. She said that currently, the transit program was underfunded through the FY2013 and FY2104-2018 cycle by approximately \$14 million dollars. She thanked Bob Antila and Valley Metro for all of their efforts in assisting in working on the new TIP. She noted that it was on the agenda for information, discussion and possible recommended action.

She noted that the deficit of the transit projects in the 2014-2018 DRAFT TIP was only \$3 million. She also explained the draft listing represents the requests for programming as per the requests from cities. She noted that the decision was made to move capital bus purchases forward in order to smooth out the funding profile, as well as the reprogramming of park and rides. Ms. Chen explained possible scenarios on balancing the deficit, which included lowing the baseline preventive maintenance (PM) in 2013 and 2014 since there was additional PM from CMAQ closeout in 2013-14. Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Chen again for her presentation and asked if there were any further questions. Ken Kessler of Phoenix requested that MAG, Valley Metro and Phoenix meet and review the draft transit project listings to ensure the bus purchases are accurate. Mr. Antila offered some comments and clarifications.

Chair Clemann noted that until the details of the allocations were clarified and the deficit balanced between the agencies in advance of the TIP deadline, that it would not be prudent to approve the agenda item. She added that the item could return to the future MAG Committee agenda. After brief

dialogue, Dan Cook offered a motion in order to meet the TIP deadline, pre-approve the recommendations of MAG, Valley Metro and Phoenix in advance of the June 13th Transit Committee meeting. Clarification was heard, Jeff Martin seconded and the motion did not pass. Chair noted that the item would return to the June MAG Transit Committee for approval.

Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Chen and Mr. Antila again for the item and asked if there were any further questions. Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

8. Phoenix-Mesa Formula Competitive Projects Priority Listing

Chair Clemann requested that Alice Chen of MAG continue and provide a status update to the committee on the Phoenix-Mesa Formula Competitive Projects Priority Listing. She noted that the item was on the agenda for information and discussion.

Ms. Chen said that the Competitive Projects Priority Listing was a part of the Transit Formula Funds guidelines as approved by MAG Regional Council. She explained that under Section 701 of the Guidelines document, it was recommended that any unprogrammed funds in the Phoenix-Mesa Urbanized Area be utilized through a competitive evaluation process. The process began in February 2013. She added that eight projects were submitted for consideration of funding, with the Evaluation Committee meeting on April 24, 2013 to review staff presentations and recommend a list of priority projects. She said that while funding was not currently available at this time, the list might be used for future programming consideration.

She did add that the scaling and ranking of the projects was done on a point system, while the ranking and recommendations lists were a bit different in their results. She explained that the East improvement. While it was not a refurbishment or State of Good Repair item, it was vital and ranked high due to the timely fueling requirements of the bus fleet, which had limited stations for fueling during the day run schedule. She added a few other observations and completed her presentation.

Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Chen again for her presentation and asked if there were any further questions. Matt Dudley of Glendale asked some clarifying questions on behalf of Tempe and Chandler. Robert Yabes of Tempe explained the CNG expansion and Tempe's position on the listing. Chair Clemann and Ken Kessler asked some clarifying questions on categorization and criteria of the projects for pedestrian pathways and the future process when some of the projects are completed and convening future meetings of the review panel. Further discussion occurred. Wulf Grote of RPTA/Valley Metro offered some clarification and Rogene Hill of Avondale asked if the two different scores and rank order of the projects could be separated on a future agenda item.

Chair Clemann noted that she was uncomfortable with the results of the ranking, where the scores and the recommended ranking were open to subjective changes despite the ranking guidelines stipulating a clear priority listing. Ms. Chen offered more information on the background of the ranking process. Mr. Dudley recommended that as the Evaluation Committee could reconvene and assess the process and projects in light of the criteria. Mr. Kessler suggested that perhaps the JARC program could be possibly added in parallel to this process with the Evaluation Committee for next year, while still remaining a separate funding source.

Chair Clemann concluded that the Committee would table the item for a future date. She again thanked Ms. Chen again for her presentation and asked if there were any further questions. Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

9. Avondale-Goodyear Formula Funds Discussion

Chair Clemann requested that Alice Chen of MAG provide a status update to the committee on the Avondale-Goodyear Formula Funds Discussion. She noted that it was on the agenda for information and discussion.

Ms. Chen gave some background and noted that on March 27, 2013, the MAG Regional Council approved the MAG Regional Programming Guidelines for Federal Transit Formula Funds. Under Section 702 of the Guidelines document, it was recommended that the utilization of Avondale-Goodyear Urbanized Area (AVN-GDY UZA) Federal Transit Funds be discussed during working group meetings comprising members of the AVN-GDY UZA.

She noted some highlights from the April 25, 2013 meeting between staff from the cities of Avondale, Goodyear, Glendale, Phoenix, Town of Buckeye, and Valley Metro/RPTA where they met to discuss the current utilization of Avondale-Goodyear UZA funds and programming options for available funds. She said that new apportionment numbers from the FTA were obtained, which was approximately \$2.8 million. She said that the Southwest Valley Local Transit System Study has outlined future transit options in the SW Valley. Additional information followed.

Ms. Chen noted the options for operations and bus purchases, in regards to the 5339 program featured under MAP-21, that it is required by federal law that ADOT is the designated recipient of these funds and the AVN/GDY UZA would need to follow their application process. She added that MAG would be working with ADOT in order to clarify the funding guidelines and process. She concluded her presentation and Nicole Patrick of ADOT advised that fiscal apportionments were out as of mid-May and that a meeting had been called between all the AVN-GDY UZA members in attendance. She noted that the process and guidelines would be circulated in June to all the parties involved.

Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Chen and Ms. Patrick for their information and asked if there were any further questions. Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda, which would now be #10, as #9 was heard earlier out of order.

10. Quarterly Status Report on Federal Grant Activity

Vice Chair Clemann introduced Mr. Ken Kessler of the City of Phoenix Transit Department and noted that he and his staff were available to answer committee questions for the Quarterly Status Report on Federal Grant Activity ending with March 31, 2013.

Mr. Kessler briefly explained the process for charging staff time/costing to FTA projects. He noted that there were rules, specifically for Force Account work. He noted that if the charges for any project exceeded \$100,000, then a Force Account Plan document must be submitted to justify using

said staff for FTA projects. He added that City of Phoenix would assist in those document provisions. He also said that salaries and fringes were chargeable, but the fringe rates required more in depth documentation for approval to do so. He summarized that City of Phoenix staff was available for any assistance or clarification on how the FTA guidelines work. Brief discussion followed.

Vice Chair Clemann asked if there were any questions or comments on the agenda item. Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

11. Request for Future Agenda Items

Chair Clemann asked the members of the Committee if there were any issues that they would like added as future agenda items.

Chair Clemann noted that one issue she would like to include in a future meeting, would be the issue of regional holiday bus service scheduling and its costs, its overall effect on riders and the system as a whole during the workweek. She gave an example of a passenger who lost his job because of the weekday holiday hours had made him an hour late for work. She believed it was worth review and discussion from a system-wide level. Brief discussion followed.

Matt Dudley of Glendale also requested that from an operations and planning perspective, the committee discuss federally mandated ADA complimentary service coverage within the areas served by transit, as required for cities that operate buses and circulators. He said that since it has regional fiscal impact on all circulator service, it would be good to discuss it both at MAG and Valley Metro.

Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

12. Next Meeting Date

Chair Clemann thanked those present and she announced that the next meeting of the MAG Transit Committee would be held on Thursday, June 13, 2013 at 10:00 a.m. in the MAG Office, Ironwood Room. There being no further business, Chair Clemann adjourned the meeting at 11:40 a.m.