

MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
REGIONAL DOMESTIC VIOLENCE COUNCIL
MEETING MINUTES – APRIL 5, 2012

MEMBERS ATTENDING

*Celeste Adams, Save the Family
+Christina Avila, City of Avondale
*Lt. Robert Bates, Phoenix Police Dept.
Jodi Beckley Liggett, Arizona Foundation for Women
*John Belatti, City of Chandler Prosecutor's Office
John A. Blackburn, Jr., Arizona Criminal Justice Commission
Jessye Johnson for Allie Bones, Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence
*Town Manager Rick Buss, Town of Gila Bend
Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community
JoAnn Del-Colle, Phoenix Family Advocacy Center
Councilmember Roy Delgado, City of El Mirage
Lynn Potts for Jon Eliason, City of Mesa
*President Diane Enos, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community
Kristen Scharlau for Naomi Farrell, City of Tempe
Janeen Gaskins, City of Surprise
Patricia George for Will Gonzalez, City of Phoenix Prosecutor's Office
Laura Guild, Arizona Dept. of Economic Security
*Cmdr. Kim Humphrey, City of Phoenix Police Dept.
*Lynette Jelinek, Glendale Fire Dept.
Alice Ghareib for Mary Lynn Kasunic, Area Agency on Aging
Patricia Klahr, Chrysalis Shelter, Inc.
Councilmember Suzanne Klapp, City of Scottsdale
*Councilmember Sheri Lauritano, City of Goodyear
*Councilmember Phil Lieberman, City of Glendale
Barbara Marshall, Maricopa County Attorney's Office, Chair

Jerald Monahan, Apache Junction Police Dept., Vice Chair
Mary Murphy, Governor's Office for Children, Youth, and Families
Dottie O'Connell, Chicanos por la Causa
Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center
Kerry Ramella, City of Phoenix Fire Dept.
+Sarah Youngblood, Community Legal Services

OTHERS PRESENT

Raquel Balcazar, Sojourner Center
Catrina Boppart, ASU/Sojourner Center
Chief Steve Campbell, El Mirage Police Dept.
Betsy Jo Fairbrother, Chandler Police Dept.
Debbie Hall, Arizona Foundation for Women
Keli Luther, Maricopa County Attorney's Office
Carol Mangold, Private Practitioner
Betty McEntire, Secretary of State's Office
Jon Meck, Peoria Police Dept.
Brenda Nichols, Arizona Dept. of Health Services
Lora Reid, Valley of the Sun United Way
Angela Rose, City of Scottsdale
Robert Ruocco, Homeward Bound
Sarabeth Seer, ASU/Elim House
Councilmember Lynn Selby, City of El Mirage
Sgt. Kelly Shore, Avondale Police Dept.
Lt. Doug Steele, Peoria Police Dept.
Jonel Thaller, ASU
Sgt. Jason Weeks, Buckeye Police Dept.

Rachel Brito, MAG
Brandee Mead, MAG
Renaee Tenney, MAG

+Those attending by video/audio conference
* Those not present or represented by proxy

1. Call to Order

Chair Barbara Marshall, Maricopa County Attorney's Office, called the meeting to order at 2:03 p.m. Introductions ensued. Chair Marshall announced Councilmember Roy Delgado, City of El Mirage, is resigning from the Committee. She thanked him for his service and welcomed Councilmember Lynn Selby as the new representative for the City of El Mirage.

2. Call to the Audience

An opportunity was provided for members of the audience to address the Council on non-agenda items that fall under the jurisdiction of MAG, or agenda items for discussion but not for action.

Brandee Mead, MAG, announced Maricopa County was chosen as a priority community for ending homelessness by the United States Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). This designation means the MAG Continuum of Care Regional Committee on Homelessness will receive technical assistance from HUD and the National Alliance to End Homelessness to conduct an in-depth analysis of the homeless service system. Findings will help reshape the way services are provided and how clients access homeless services. Ms. Mead extended an invitation to attend the MAG Continuum of Care Regional Committee on Homelessness Technical Assistance Event on April 24, 2012, at the Arizona Bridge to Independent Living-Disability Empowerment Center. Registration information was included in the meeting materials.

3. Approval of the February 2, 2012 Meeting Minutes

Chair Marshall called for approval of the February 2, 2012, MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting minutes. John Blackburn, Jr., Arizona Criminal Justice Commission, motioned to approve the minutes. Councilmember Roy Delgado, City of El Mirage, seconded the motion. The motion passed.

4. Domestic Violence Protocol Evaluation Project

Chair Marshall invited Renae Tenney, MAG, to offer an update on the Domestic Violence Protocol Evaluation Project (PEP).

Ms. Tenney advised Chair Marshall nominated PEP for the Desert Peaks Award for Regional Partnership. The award is presented to two or more agencies that have demonstrated commitment to regionalism through cooperative efforts. Partners must be MAG member agencies. The nomination was submitted with the help of the following partners: Apache Junction, Avondale, Buckeye, El Mirage, Gilbert, Tolleson, Maricopa County, Mesa, Peoria, Phoenix and Scottsdale. Recipients of the Desert Peaks Awards will be announced by June 2012.

On March 27, 2012, Ms. Tenney gave a presentation to the Coconino County Coordinated Community Response Team to Domestic Violence and Sexual Assault. The presentation provided a description of the efforts undertaken by the MAG Domestic Violence Council, an overview of PEP, and the process used to develop the Misdemeanor Domestic Violence Protocol Model. Ms. Tenney commented the presentation was very

well received. She noted Flagstaff was one of two cities chosen as a pilot project for the Fatality Review and Safety Assessment through the National Domestic Violence Fatality Review Institute. The Flagstaff Chief of Police recommended using the misdemeanor protocol model as a best practice in their upcoming safety assessment.

Ms. Tenney acknowledged the Governor's Office for their support of PEP. She reported an initial meeting was conducted on February 8, 2012 with the formal project partners to review the project tasks and timeline. Affinity group meetings with prosecutors, law enforcement, and victim advocates were held to discuss the successes, challenges, and opportunities experienced in the field.

Ms. Tenney reported highlights from the various affinity group meetings:

- The Prosecutors Affinity Group met on February 28, 2012 and March 28, 2012. This group discussed arranging for city prosecutors to observe a staffing session with county attorneys, and developing standardized communication and information sharing about cases between the city prosecutors and county attorneys.
- The Law Enforcement Affinity Group was conducted on March 6, 2012. The group discussed partnering smaller police departments with agencies providing advocacy services to victims, and discussing with prosecutors the criteria used in determining whether misdemeanor cases may be elevated to felony-level cases.
- The Victim Advocates Affinity Group was held on March 12, 2012. The group discussed concerns about victim notification about initial appearances and orders of protection. They spoke highly about the positive impact of strengthening their relationships with local law enforcement and prosecutors.

Ms. Tenney stated the information gathered from these meetings was used to identify areas of opportunity for moving the project forward. An Areas of Opportunity handout was provided in the meeting materials. Opportunities were noted in training, coordination and information sharing, communication, and equipment. For next steps, Ms. Tenney suggested bringing together all of the affinity groups to drill down into the areas of opportunity to identify action steps and ways to leverage resources. She requested input from the Committee. Patricia George, City of Phoenix Prosecutor's Office, recommended the prosecutors and law enforcement affinity groups have an opportunity to meet prior to bringing together the full group. There was consensus on this next step. Ms. Tenney stated she would be contacting members for their availability to schedule a joint meeting.

Ms. Tenney reported focus group meetings have been scheduled with victims and survivors. She acknowledged the assistance of Sojourner Center, De Colores, A New Leaf-Autumn House, and Elim House in organizing these groups. Ms. Tenney noted efforts are underway to schedule additional groups with the help of the Phoenix Police Department, Shelter without Walls and the Peoria Police Department. Ms. Tenney requested any recommendations for additional focus groups. No recommendations were received.

Chair Marshall requested a motion to approve the next steps of the Domestic Violence Protocol Evaluation Project with the recommendation law enforcement and prosecutor

affinity groups meet prior to the full group. Lynn Potts, City of Mesa, made a motion to approve the next steps with the noted recommendation. Jodi Beckley Liggett, Arizona Foundation for Women, seconded the motion. The motion passed.

5. National Domestic Violence Fatality Review Initiative

Chair Marshall invited Dr. Neil Websdale, National Domestic Violence Fatality Review Initiative, to present on fatality review and safety assessments. Dr. Websdale said fatality review teams analyze the events leading up to a death by domestic abuse with the focus of preventing it from happening again in the future. The goal is to develop a sense of how victims and perpetrators perceive systems and make the decisions they make. Cases are recreated through the eyes of those that lived it in the hope of adjusting services to fit the needs of individuals.

Over the past 30 years, there has been an enormous change in the delivery of services for domestic violence cases. Progress has been made in terms of developing services, providing shelter, and working with perpetrators. Through these efforts, what has been created is an overly institutionalized and somewhat rigid response to victims and perpetrators. Forty-five states are now conducting domestic violence fatality reviews with 175 to 200 teams permanently embedded in communities throughout the country. In Arizona, thanks to the efforts of Chief Jerald Monahan, 10 fatality review teams are now established. Two additional teams are being formed in Yavapai and in the West Valley. The focus in Arizona, and nationally, is to register the enormous impact of domestic violence on communities.

Deaths caused by domestic violence are far more numerous than the homicides reported in the news. They include cases involving suicide, men killing men, or those that involve family members or children. These cases often have adult domestic violence as their context. Additionally, there are a large number of near deaths and serious injuries. Arizona has an amendment allowing Domestic Violence Fatality Review Teams to investigate near deaths. Dr. Websdale discussed the number of children traumatized by witnessing domestic violence and the effects on them 10 to 15 years in the future. He discussed efforts to develop an intervention mechanism linking review teams with crime victim compensation boards to use Victims of Crime Act (VOCA) funding to provide services to those children. Some states, including Florida, Maryland, and Texas, are leading this effort.

Dr. Websdale spoke about the Fatality Review and Safety Audits (FRASA). This project researches how to blend fatality review methodology with safety assessments and safety orders. Funded by the Governor's Office, the project was developed in Coconino and Pinal Counties. Fatality review teams will scrutinize their review activity, engage in new and innovative review activity, conduct a retroactive analysis of their findings from previous cases, and discuss their finding with consultants. The teams will question how the system works in those two counties. One example of a question being asked is *how does the system, law enforcement and prosecution, manage risk assessment in domestic violence cases?* An audit team would review processes and observe practices to be able to provide very detailed feedback on how things can be done differently. Dr. Websdale noted the Phoenix Police Department has already begun to triage domestic violence cases to identify changes to implement.

JoAnn Del-Colle, Phoenix Family Advocacy Center, inquired about the connection between fatality review teams and victim compensation. Dr. Websdale advised they are exploring how to use crime victim compensation dollars to assist in developing intervention plans for child survivors, and how to obtain grant money to augment funding these interventions. One example would be to bring in a therapist with specialized training in working with children who have been traumatized by domestic violence. Ms. Del-Colle offered Maricopa County Victim Compensation. She said the board often receives claims for children who have been sexually abused but rarely see cases involving children traumatized by domestic violence homicide. Mary Murphy, Governor's Office for Children, Youth, and Families, inquired if the study would include children whose parent committed suicide. Dr. Websdale confirmed he would like to include suicide cases. He noted the difficulty in showing a suicide was a direct result of domestic violence. The suicide of a perpetrator and the effects on children would also be considered.

Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center, asked if grant dollars would be used for health care needs. Dr. Websdale advised the project is supported with grant dollars to be directed only for police and prosecution. However, in Coconino County, their focus on risk is designed to cut across systems.

Ms. Phillips inquired about common themes demonstrating where the system is failing to provide interventions. Dr. Websdale noted the work of the teams is new making it premature to use their findings to develop a statewide policy. The purpose of the audit groups is not to identify new gaps in the systems but to identify changes that would make the systems more effective.

Dr. Websdale noted the work of fatality review teams have shown the majority of victims never access services. These victims are very isolated and their community may even have knowledge of the abuse. The victims, who do access the system, do this many times. These cases demonstrate the failure of the system to communicate and collaborate, and the failure to conduct accurate risk assessment and triage of the most dangerous cases. Dr. Websdale recommended visiting the National Domestic Violence Fatality Review Initiative website at www.ndvfri.org for additional information on review teams' findings.

Vice Chair Monahan acknowledged Police Chief Steve Campbell, City of El Mirage, for supporting efforts in the West Valley. Chief Campbell noted the El Mirage Police Department is reviewing not only the recidivism rate but also the demand for service for domestic violence. Through the Governor's Office and STOP grant, El Mirage has acquired funding for a part-time victim assistant. He commended the Council for their work in bringing agencies and different jurisdictions together. Chief Campbell stated El Mirage has adopted the MAG Misdemeanor Protocol Model and implemented significant organizational changes to meet the demand. Chair Marshall thanked Chief Campbell. She acknowledged the talents and efforts of individuals in Arizona to make a change.

6. Address Confidentiality Program Update

Chair Marshall invited Betty McEntire, Executive Director of the Address Confidentiality Program, to provide an update on program implementation. Ms. McEntire stated Phase I is in the final stages. This phase included meeting with local and state agencies that will have the most interaction with participants such as the Motor Vehicle Division, Department of Economic Security, law enforcement, prosecution, courts, Arizona Health Care Cost Containment System, and municipalities and other utilities service providers.

Ms. McEntire reported Phase II is underway which includes training application assistants. Several training sessions are already scheduled. The program is collaborating with the AZ Coalition Against Domestic Violence to offer community trainings throughout the state. The goal is to begin enrolling participants into the program as of June 1, 2012. The enrollment date was pushed back from May to June to accommodate preparation in some of the larger agencies.

The program started receiving fines as of January 1, 2012. Ms. McEntire explained the program is supported by fines initiated by municipal courts. She advised they are tracking where fines are being collected. This will assist in checking in with courts when they are not be assessing these fees.

Phase III will begin when the program goes live on June 1, 2012. She noted state agencies have until December 1, 2012 to finalize their processes and policies. Sixty individuals have already inquired about enrolling in the program. Participation by the third year is expected to reach 1,200 people, which equals approximately 600 households across Arizona. Ms. McEntire stressed the program is focused on not burdening the cities, towns, and agencies implementing the program.

7. IRIS Project

Chair Marshall invited Jonel Thaller, Arizona State University, to demonstrate the online tools and resources provided to victims of domestic violence through the IRIS Project. The project is funded by the National Institute for Mental Health. The purpose of the study is to evaluate the effectiveness of an on-line safety intervention. Through this project, data will be collected on how women in unsafe relationships remain safe. Ms. Thaller shared a PowerPoint presentation of the IRIS Project's on-line safety intervention tool.

Ms Thaller noted recruiting women who are in an abusive relationship has been a challenge. The study requires that participants be Arizona residents and over 18 years of age. They may speak English or Spanish, and they must currently be in an unsafe relationship. The IRIS Project is recruiting through the use of advertisements on Craig's List. Ms. Thaller noted these ads generate 25 to 30 emails per day. She advised four questions are asked of interested individuals to assist in determining if they are in a current abusive relationship. They are asked about experiencing physical harm within the past six month; threats to harm; sexual violence; or coercion into sexual activities. Participants are also asked if they have felt unsafe at any time in their current relationship in the past six months.

A telephone screening is conducted prior to enrollment and computer safety issues are discussed with the potential participant. Ms. Thaller noted 55 percent of women access

the intervention tool from their homes. She provided an overview of the website participants access and how the intervention tool works. The program asks participants questions to gather demographic information. This is followed by sets of questions to determine abuse measures, mental health measures, safety seeking behavior measures, and participants' priorities. These factors are analyzed to provide participants with an overview of their situation, their level of danger, and suggestions for remaining safe. In Arizona, 120 women are currently enrolled in the program. Ms. Thaller advised the feedback received has been positive and indicates the program is very helpful to participants.

Ms. Murphy inquired whether the program provides participants with the ability to contact someone immediately if they receive feedback that they are in immediate danger. Ms. Thaller advised the IRIS Project is designed as an online intervention. Participants are provided with a hotline number and referred to 9-1-1.

Ms. Del-Colle asked about the average age of program participants. She commented about the project's technology focus and inquired if it was being accessed by a younger demographic. Ms. Thaller advised demographic data indicates the average age of participants is 32 years old.

The Committee questioned what process is in place to follow-up with participants who drop out of the project. Ms. Thaller advised losing contact with participants is a concern. She noted that out of 120 participants the program has lost contact with only three individuals. She noted retention is high. The program offers safety information upon enrollment in the project. Ms. Thaller advised the program has 70 percent of its intended participants and expects to have the remaining participants enrolled within the next six months. Outcome data is expected to be available within one to one and a half years.

8. Legislative Update

Chair Marshall invited Jessye Johnson, Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence, to provide an update on domestic violence related legislation. Ms. Johnson provided a brief update on legislative priorities, budget status and Temporary Assistance for Needy Families (TANF) backfill. She referred the Committee to a handout on 2012 legislative priorities and updates. The update outlined the bills currently supported by the Coalition.

Ms. Johnson noted the Coalition's primary focus is on the TANF backfill. She said if the State is unable to come to an agreement on filling this funding gap, it would severely impact direct service providers for domestic violence shelter and services. The Coalition is focused on ensuring the TANF backfill is a priority for the Governor and legislators.

9. Success Stories

Chair Marshall offered an opportunity for the Committee to share stories of success experienced during their work with survivors of domestic violence.

- Chair Marshall introduced Keli Luther, a nationally renowned prosecutor with a focus on victims' rights, who has joined the Maricopa County Attorney's Office. Ms. Luther has a sterling reputation as a victim advocate.

- Vice Chair Monahan reported the Santa Cruz County Board of Supervisors approved the county-wide fatality review team under the leadership of County Attorney George Silva and Sheriff Tony Estrada on March 28, 2012. Additionally, the Sierra Vista Police Department established a regional fatality review team in Cochise County. This brings the number of Arizona fatality review teams to 10.
- Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community, stated the batterer's intervention program is underway. Two sessions are underway with a third session beginning soon. There are three male groups and one female group.
- Mary Murphy, Governor's Office, announced National Crime Victim Rights Week begins April 23, 2012. A kick-off event will be held on the House Lawn of the Arizona Capitol with keynote speaker Heather Grossman.
- Janeen Gaskins, City of Surprise, announced she is the new representative on the Committee and is looking forward to working with the group.
- Patricia George, City of Phoenix Prosecutor's Office, commented on the increased collaboration among agencies to build cases. She said they have had several cases involving collaboration with the police detectives and County Attorney's office resulting in more jail time for offenders.
- Jodi Liggett, Arizona Foundation for Women, announced the Men's Anti-violence Network is recruiting members. The program is under the direction of Debbie Hall. Membership forms are available for anyone interested in joining. The program works on public awareness, education, and public policy to hold abusers accountable and support victims.
- Alice Ghareib, DOVES Program, commented it is wonderful to see systems are beginning to recognize there are older victims of domestic violence.
- Patricia Klahr, Chrysalis, advised they are completing Phase II of supportive services at the shelter. They are now accepting male victims into their transitional housing program. The program is currently serving a father with four children.
- Councilmember Roy Delgado, City of El Mirage, reported the approval of Catholic Social Services to purchase property at 51st Street and Thomas. The property will be used to develop a domestic violence shelter.
- Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center, spoke of one family that serves as a reminder that domestic violence does not get resolved quickly. The family went through Sojourner's shelter and transitional programs. They eventually moved into a house owned by and next to Sojourner Center. They lived in the home for six years. Ms. Phillips advised the mother recently purchased her own home and became a U.S. citizen.

- Councilmember Suzanne Klapp, City of Scottsdale, stated the Scottsdale Police and Fire Chiefs collaborated on developing a film about public safety. During one segment, the Police Chief was shown touring the family advocacy center and speaking with staff about the services provided to victims of domestic violence. She noted the film gives women a better sense of what the advocacy center is, what the environment is like, and what services are provided. The film is being aired on Scottsdale's Channel 11.
- John Blackburn Jr., Arizona Criminal Justice Commission, advised they are completing the domestic violence prosecution adjudication report. The draft copy is currently under review. He reported they will be working on the victimization survey for Maricopa and Pima County. He noted they are working to add specific domestic violence questions in the survey.
- Laura Guild, Arizona Department of Economic Security, acknowledged ASU and the many wonderful students she has seen engaged in advocacy work in the community. She noted these students reflect an increased level of engagement. She noted they are striving to learn as much as possible from their roles with community agencies and providing resources back to the community. She recognized several ASU students in attendance.
- JoAnn Del-Colle, Phoenix Family Advocacy Center, acknowledged the great relationships between community partners at the Family Advocacy Center. Impact has added a full-time therapist to work specifically with victims within the LGBT community. She shared a success story about law enforcement assisting an individual in obtaining a visa. The individual had been deported but brought back to serve as a witness in a violent domestic violence case. She noted partnerships have come a very long way.
- Kerry Ramella, Phoenix Fire Department, noted they are now able to provide three crisis units 24 hours per day, seven days per week, 90 percent of the time. Although they are struggling to maintain this level of service due to funding cuts, they have been able to respond to 100 percent of call-outs.
- Sarah Youngblood, Community Legal Services, noted seeing success with family law cases involving children and custody cases.

10. Request for Future Agenda Items

In the interest of time, Chair Marshall requested Committee members email Ms. Tenney their recommendations for future agenda items.

11. Comments from the Council:

No announcements were made.

12. Adjourn:

Chair Marshall thanked everyone for their attendance. The meeting adjourned at 3:46 p.m. The next MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting is scheduled for June 7, 2012 at 2:00 p.m. in the Saguaro Room of the MAG offices.