

MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
 REGIONAL DOMESTIC VIOLENCE COUNCIL
 MEETING MINUTES – JUNE 21, 2012

MEMBERS ATTENDING

Celeste Adams, Save the Family
 Christina Avila, City of Avondale
 Sgt. Marc Rivers for Lt. Robert Bates,
 Phoenix Police Dept.
 *Jodi Beckley Liggett, Arizona Foundation
 for Women
 John Belatti, City of Chandler Prosecutor's
 Office
 John A. Blackburn, Jr., Arizona Criminal
 Justice Commission
 Jessye Johnson for Allie Bones, Arizona
 Coalition Against Domestic Violence
 *Town Manager Rick Buss, Town of Gila
 Bend
 Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa
 Indian Community
 *Lacey Rose Cox, Town of Gilbert Police
 Dept.
 *JoAnn Del-Colle, Phoenix Family
 Advocacy Center
 Lynn Potts for Jon Eliason, City of Mesa
 *President Diane Enos, Salt River Pima-
 Maricopa Indian Community
 Kristen Scharlau for Naomi Farrell, City of
 Tempe
 +Janeen Gaskins, City of Surprise
 Patricia George for Will Gonzalez, City of
 Phoenix Prosecutor's Office
 Laura Guild, Arizona Dept. of Economic
 Security
 *Cmdr. Kim Humphrey, City of Phoenix
 Police Dept.
 Karla Houston for Lynette Jelinek, Glendale
 Fire Dept.
 *Mary Lynn Kasunic, Area Agency on
 Aging
 *Patricia Klahr, Chrysalis Shelter, Inc.
 *Councilmember Suzanne Klapp, City of
 Scottsdale
 Councilmember Sheri Lauritano, City of
 Goodyear
 Barbara Marshall, Maricopa County
 Attorney's Office, Chair

Chief Jerald Monahan, Apache Junction
 Police Dept., Vice Chair
 Mary Murphy, Governor's Office for
 Children, Youth, and Families
 Dottie O'Connell, Chicanos por la Causa
 Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center
 Kerry Ramella, City of Phoenix Fire Dept.
 Councilmember Lynn Selby, City of El
 Mirage
 Sarah Youngblood, Community Legal
 Services

OTHERS PRESENT

Sgt. Patrick Beumler, Glendale Police
 Department
 Kristina Bunch, Goodyear Police Department
 Chief Steve Campbell, El Mirage Police
 Department
 Melissa Certo, Phoenix Prosecutor's Office
 Kathy Gomez-Lee, Chicanos por la Causa
 Dulce Hidalgo, Chicanos por la Causa
 Carl Mangold, Private Practitioner
 Linda Melendez, Surprise Police Department
 Leah Meyers, Governor's Office for
 Children, Youth and Families
 Erika Moore, Valley of the Sun United Way
 Mary Picard, Maricopa County Attorney's
 Office
 Michelle Neitch, Arizona Criminal Justice
 Commission
 Brenda Nichols, Arizona Department of
 Health Services
 Alejandro Palacios, Chicanos por la Causa
 Teisha Portee, Scottsdale Police Department
 Bill Rademacher, Avondale Police
 Department
 Sandra Robertson, A New Leaf
 Iva Rody, El Mirage Police Department
 Sarabeth Seer, Arizona State University
 Sgt. Kelly Shore, Avondale Police
 Department

 Brande Mead, MAG
 Renae Tenney, MAG

	+Those attending by video/audio conference * Those not present or represented by proxy
--	---

1. Call to Order

Chair Barbara Marshall, Maricopa County Attorney's Office, called the meeting to order at 2:07 p.m. She welcomed Janeen Gaskins, Grants Administrator, City of Surprise, as a new member of the Council. Introductions ensued.

2. Call to the Audience

An opportunity was provided for members of the audience to address the Council on non-agenda items that fall under the jurisdiction of MAG, or agenda items for discussion but not for action. There were no comments.

3. Approval of the April 5, 2012 Meeting Minutes

Chair Marshall called for approval of the April 5, 2012, MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting minutes. Lynn Potts, City of Mesa, motioned to approve the minutes. John Blackburn, Jr., Arizona Criminal Justice Commission, seconded the motion. The motion passed.

4. Regional Coordinated/Centralized Intake System

Chair Marshall invited Brande Mead, MAG, to offer an update on the MAG Continuum of Care Regional Committee on Homelessness' efforts to guide development of a regional coordinated/centralized intake system for homeless and domestic violence providers.

Ms. Mead briefly provided background information leading to the efforts underway. Through guidance from the Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD), the Continuum of Care (CoC) completed an assessment in 2011 to determine the CoC's readiness in implementing the HEARTH Act. The HEARTH Act is legislation, passed in 2009, that reauthorizes the funding for HUD's McKinney-Vento homeless assistance program as well as the new Emergency Solutions Grant (ESG) program. Funding for these programs brings approximately \$27 million in funding to the region on an annual basis.

A CoC Action Plan was created based on the checkup assessment completed by CoC members and stakeholders. The action plan identifies steps to effectively implement the goals of the HEARTH Act. Ms. Mead advised the CoC was identified as a priority community, by HUD, in focusing efforts toward preventing and ending homelessness. Because of this designation, HUD approved funding for technical assistance (TA) to help achieve the priority action steps. HUD approved the TA plan in early 2012. The TA is being facilitated by HomeBase Consulting and the National Alliance to End Homelessness.

The following needs were identified and approved for TA:

- Support for developing a coordinated assessment/referral/resource targeting system to ensure the best use of resources and most effective outcomes.
- Clarify the role of transitional housing in the Continuum and develop a plan for strengthening the performance, and perceived performance, of transitional housing programs. Address the reality or perception that as a result of restrictive enrollment criteria individuals and family households that could benefit from transitional housing are being excluded.
- Create incremental enhancements to the governance structure of the planning and decision-making arms of the Continuum.

The first step in the technical assistance process was a community kickoff event, which took place on April 24, 2012. The event was sponsored by HUD and the National Alliance to End Homelessness. The event focused on the first two priority areas, developing coordinated intake/assessment and transitional housing programs. Over 100 stakeholders attended the kickoff event including great representation from domestic violence service providers, the housing authority, and homeless service providers.

The first part of the day focused on developing coordinated assessment. The purpose of coordinated assessment is to make the best use of community resources for those who need the services most. Research has highlighted centralized intake as a key factor in the success of homelessness prevention and housing programs as well as many other types of homeless assistance programs. Presentations included examples from other communities as to how coordinated assessment works. Models discussed included models from San Francisco, California; Hamilton County, Ohio; and Dayton, Ohio.

Table discussions were held to discuss developing coordinated assessment in Maricopa County and what type of style might work best. Initial feedback indicated that multiple gateways and entry points would work best. This is referred to as taking a “no wrong door approach” to coordinated assessment based on the needs in the community. Initial feedback indicated all sub-populations should be included in the coordinated assessment design. Because of the attendance of many domestic violence service providers, there was discussion about how the domestic violence programs might be integrated into the design of the system or possibly through a parallel system. Ms. Mead strongly emphasized that no decisions have been made as to how the system is going to be developed or operated. She advised they are in the early stages of this process. Input is welcomed and encouraged to inform the decision-making process.

The second half of the day focused on clarifying the role of transitional housing programs and strengthening the performance of transitional housing programs. The desired outcome is for transitional housing programs to serve the populations that will benefit most from the service-rich environment and serve people more efficiently. Norm Suchar, National Alliance to End Homelessness, provided a presentation on how Maricopa County can evaluate the transitional housing programs in the community. The attendees engaged in discussion on hypothetical scenarios in which a change was made to the transitional housing program and walked through planning questions on what it would

take to actually transform the transitional housing program to another service or housing model.

Ms. Mead advised next steps include creating two work groups: one for coordinated assessment and one focused on transitional housing. Both groups will be meeting on Wednesday, June 27, 2012. The meetings are open to anyone interested in participating. The work groups will map out action steps for beginning implementation. The process will take many months to complete. There is still a lot of planning and work to be done. Ms. Mead advised the process is open to anyone wanting to participate. She stressed the importance of a transparent and inclusive process.

The Committee asked for clarification on transitional housing and what discussion was held in terms of models being considered. Ms. Mead advised HUD defines transitional housing as programs that provide housing assistance for up to two years. The expectation is for persons leaving transitional housing to move onto permanent housing. In terms of models discussed, she advised there are a variety of options. She noted the intent is not to transform all of the transitional housing programs. She advised an assessment is being done to determine what is working well and identify challenges. Ms. Mead provided a brief overview of varying models including emergency shelter, permanent housing, and transition-in-place programs.

Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center, encouraged domestic violence providers to get involved in this process. She noted differences in addressing issues associated with homelessness versus domestic violence. She stated this process will lead to big changes in how business is being done. Ms. Phillips also commented on funding changes tied to transitional programs. She shared her concern that funds for emergency shelter may decrease creating the push to move people out of emergency shelter and into permanent housing.

Ms. Mead noted the Emergency Solutions Grant funding will continue to fund emergency shelter. The distribution of funding is up to the state, county and municipalities administering the funding. She advised these grants have expanded their criteria to include funding for permanent housing, rapid re-housing and homeless prevention in addition to emergency shelter. She stated the coordinated assessment process will change how people access the system as a whole. This will include how they are referred to different programs and how the most appropriate placement is determined. Ms. Mead agreed on the importance of having domestic violence service providers participating in the process.

5. Domestic Violence Protocol Evaluation Project

Chair Marshall invited Renae Tenney, MAG, to provide an update on implementation of the Domestic Violence Protocol Evaluation Project. Ms. Tenney advised affinity group meetings were held to gather information on what is and is not working well in addressing misdemeanor and felony-level domestic violence crimes. Focus group meetings were also held with victims and survivors of domestic violence to gather information about their experiences with police and the courts. Ms. Tenney acknowledged Leila Gamiz, MAG Communications Division, for her assistance with conducting the focus groups. She also expressed gratitude to De Colores, A New Leaf,

Autumn House, Sojourner Center, Shelter Without Walls, Phoenix Family Advocacy Center and the Peoria Police Department for their assistance in organizing the focus groups. Ms. Tenney noted the survivor focus groups provided her with a better understanding and appreciation for the work of victim advocates. Although it was difficult to hear their stories, the discussions were enlightening. She noted participants acknowledged the importance of having their voices heard and being able to provide information to help others.

Ms. Tenney offered preliminary findings from data collected through the affinity group and focus group discussions. She provided the Committee with a set of charts: 1) Misdemeanor Protocols: Opportunities for Enhanced Implementation; 2) Felony Protocols: Potential Areas of Opportunity; 3) Institutional Development; 4) When Interacting with Police About A Domestic Violence Situation, What Was Not Helpful; and 5) Best Practices. Ms. Tenney noted the charts are in draft form. Ms. Tenney reviewed each chart highlighting the areas with the greatest number of responses and identifying potential opportunities for enhancing the protocols. Ms. Tenney advised the charts are a work in progress and will require further refinement. She noted the charts will be brought back to the Committee in August 2012.

Ms. Tenney briefly noted there is work being done to provide additional supports for victim advocates working with domestic violence victims. She stated collaborative efforts are taking place with the O'Connor House and A New Leaf. Ms. Tenney indicated Nathalea Silva, MAG intern, will provide additional information about these efforts during the next agenda item. She thanked MAG interns Nathalea Silva and Amanda Stanko for their efforts to move this project forward.

Vice Chair Monahan advised the AVON Program for Women and Justice at the O'Connor House has developed a task force to address issues around orders of protection. He recommended an update be presented to the Committee at a future meeting.

6. Resources for Victim Advocates

Chair Marshall invited Nathalea Silva, MAG intern, to offer a report on a collaborative project with the AVON Program for Women and Justice at the O'Connor House and A New Leaf to support the work of victim advocates.

Ms. Silva provided a brief overview of the work being done to support victim advocates. The purpose of the project is to determine if the need exists among victim advocates for more support and training resources, and if so, how to address the need. The project arose from information collected from the AVON Program for Women and Justice's Victim Advocates Survey. The survey suggested victim advocates did not feel they were being supported in the work they are doing. Some victim advocates reported feeling isolated from their peers. Others indicated many training and resource opportunities exist but they are either not available or not accessible to them. The project will assess victim advocates' needs and determine how best to support their work.

Ms. Silva explained the collaborative nature of the project. The O'Connor House and A New Leaf have supported the work of this effort by bringing together victim advocates to evaluate the gaps. Two focus groups with facilitated discussion were held with

participants from the MAG Victim Advocates Affinity Group and A New Leaf's Domestic Violence Collaborators. Questions were asked about what supports would be most beneficial to victim advocates, and what training opportunities and resources would they most like to see implemented. These discussions provided insight for developing a follow-up survey to gather more specific information about what would be helpful to victim advocates.

Based on feedback at these meetings, a Victim Services Provider Inventory, interactive maps, and a list of training resources are also underway. The provider inventory is a compilation of different agencies throughout the region that offer victim services. The project will also utilize information collected for the provider inventory to create an interactive mapping system with search capabilities. Individuals will be able to search for agencies offering specific services such as filing orders of protections. Ms. Silva noted there has been discussion about developing a toolkit of resources for victim advocates to include these materials.

Ms. Silva invited anyone interested in being included in the provider inventory to complete the Victim Advocates Provider Information Form. The form was provided in the meeting materials. Completed forms as well as any questions should be directed to Ms. Silva. Ms. Silva noted the mapping is being developed by Amanda Stanko, MAG Intern. Ms. Stanko is seeking input on how to develop maps to be the most useful to victim advocates. Any suggestions may be sent to Ms. Silva to forward on to Ms. Stanko.

Ms. Silva provided an overview of the project's next steps. These included administering the follow-up survey while continuing to build the inventory, develop the maps, and further explore assembling toolkits. Ms. Silva noted feedback and input are welcome throughout the process. She stated the project will offer additional support for victim advocates, determine how to provide these supports more efficiently, and assist victim advocates in connecting with each other. Ultimately, with additional support, the work of victim advocates will help hold more abusers accountable.

Committee members inquired whether efforts are being coordinated with Arizona 2-1-1. Ms. Tenney noted efforts are underway to collect information from various sources. She stated the intent is to compile existing lists of information about victim advocacy providers into one resource. The purpose of this research is looking at how to best support victim advocates personally and professionally. For example, discussions have included the importance of teaching victim advocates how to cope with secondary trauma. Ms. Tenney acknowledged Ms. Silva and Ms. Stanko for their efforts on this multi-layered project.

Ms. Tenney advised the mapping portion is a work in progress. Input is requested from the Committee to determine how this resource can be most helpful. Ms. Tenney advised the mapping will not include shelter locations. This information will be included in the Victim Advocates Provider Inventory but no physical addresses will be listed.

Chair Marshall requested the Committee and guests complete the Provider Inventory Form prior to leaving the meeting. Chair Marshall requested a motion to approve next

steps for developing resources for victim advocates including the Victim Advocates Provider Inventory, victim services provider maps, and training resources. Vice Chair Monahan made a motion to approve the next steps. John Blackburn, Jr., Arizona Criminal Justice Commission, seconded the motion. The motion passed.

7. Regional Plan to End Domestic Violence

Chair Marshall invited Renae Tenney to offer a progress report on the strategies laid out in the Regional Plan to End Domestic Violence. Ms. Tenney advised she is in the process of compiling this information. The progress report will be distributed by email or brought to the Committee at the August meeting.

8. Legislative Update

Chair Marshall invited Jessye Johnson, Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence, to provide an update on domestic violence related legislation. Ms. Johnson advised the Coalition tracked more than 40 bills impacting survivors of domestic violence. A list of these bills will be forwarded to Ms. Tenney for distribution to the Committee.

Ms. Johnson stated the Coalition's main priority was monitoring the passing of the State budget. Their attention was focused on fulfillment of the Temporary Assistance for Needy Families (TANF) backfill of \$25 million dollars. Ms. Johnson reported the budget with the TANF backfill was passed. However, the gap was filled with excess Department of Economic Security (DES) funds from a mental health line item instead of general funds. The Coalition anticipates the same challenges during the next session and will continue to monitor this fund.

Another priority was the rewrite of legislation for child custody (Senate Bill 1127). The Coalition was heavily involved with the Domestic Relations Committee and sub-groups working on this effort. The Coalition remained neutral on the final bill that passed because the changes made were not substantive. Ms. Johnson noted the Coalition will remain involved in these efforts and was appointed a seat on the Domestic Relations Committee.

9. Success Stories

Chair Marshall offered an opportunity for the Committee to share stories of success experienced during their work with survivors of domestic violence.

- Vice Chair Monahan noted the AVON Program for Women and Justice has organized a task force to address concerns with issuance, service, and enforcement of orders of protection. He is co-chairing the task force with Beya Thayer of the Coconino County Coordinated Community Response Team. Discussions are including removing the plaintiff from the service process, timely notification of service, and service to defendants in jail. He also spoke of a pilot project addressing electronic data transfer that is underway in El Mirage and Apache Junction. Once complete, the results will be presented to other municipalities. Vice Chair Monahan acknowledged Chief Campbell, El Mirage, for his efforts on this project.
- Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community, announced revisions to the Community's domestic violence code. The changes will be taken before the

Tribal Council for approval. They are submitting a grant renewal with the hopes of extending the Batterer's Intervention Program. In addition, they recently hired two domestic violence advocates.

- Sgt. Marc Rivers, Phoenix Police Department, discussed their partnership with the Phoenix Prosecutor's Office and Maricopa County Attorney's Office on strangulation cases. Forensic nurse exams on victims of strangulation cases have yielded phenomenal results. The pilot program has been very successful. The program is set to expand Valley-wide on June 1, 2012. An example was given of a victim whose injuries were not visible. A forensic nurse exam revealed 19 physical injuries that were not visible to the naked eye. Vice Chair Marshall encouraged everyone to attend the strangulation training.
- John Blackburn, Jr., Arizona Criminal Justice Commission, thanked everyone for their input on the rules for the Victims' Compensation Fund. He introduced Michelle Neitch as the new Grants Coordinator for Victims Programs.
- Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center, announced a grant was received from the National Home Aide Group for upgrades on the Hope Campus including a new fire alarm panel. She noted the Board of Directors participated in a visioning session for how to add permanent housing as a component of the continuum at Sojourner Center.
- Kristen Scharlau, Tempe Care 7, provided a success story about a victim returning to her hometown and her support system. A mother of five young children sought help at Care 7 over a weekend. In listening to her, they determined she had moved to Arizona but really wanted to go back home to her home state. They were able to get her Section 8 housing transferred and inexpensive plane tickets for the family. When they arrived, the victim called to thank them for listening and helping her get home. Ms. Scharlau noted assisting this family took collaboration with several agencies. She also announced a job opening for a victim advocate to work weekends.
- Celeste Adams, Save the Family, announced they are nearing completion of the third year of a HUD grant for rapid re-housing services. This grant is in collaboration with UMOM and one of 23 demonstration grants awarded. She noted the grant is renewable for another three years.
- Sarah Youngblood, Community Legal Services (CLS), provided a success story about custody evaluation. An undocumented immigrant who was the victim of extreme verbal abuse was court ordered to participate in a custody evaluation as part of her divorce. The evaluator was not trained in domestic violence and concluded she made up the allegations to stay in the country legally. CLS hired Carl Mangold to conduct a domestic violence assessment. In the end, the court threw out the entire previous evaluation. The woman was awarded sole custody, allowed to remain permanently in California, and the father was ordered supervised visits for the first few months. Additionally, Ms. Youngblood noted CLS staff is providing training on the Violence Against Women Act requirements under HUD for public housing and early termination of leases for domestic violence victims. Trainings are being provided to judges, landlords, tenants, and other community groups.

- Jessye Johnson, Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence, announced the Coalition held its first 40-hour training specifically for batterer interventionists. She noted Carl Mangold assisted in development and delivery of the training curriculum. The training was a great success and will be held again later in the year.
- Christina Avila, City of Avondale, announced Avondale's Community Action Program staff participated in training on the Address Confidentiality Program.
- John Belatti, City of Chandler Prosecutor's Office, offered an update on a proposed change to Arizona Rules of Protective Orders of Procedure (Rule 1M). He noted last year, the East Valley Domestic Violence Fatality Review Team identified an issue related to the service of protective orders on victims. The team learned there was no uniform process in place for notifying plaintiffs once orders are served on defendants. The rule change proposed to require the court issuing the protection orders to send a copy of the affidavits of service to the victims within 24 hours. This week the Board of Governors gave their support for the rule change and the petition was sent to the Supreme Court.

10. Request for Future Agenda Items

Chair Marshall offered an opportunity for Committee members to request topics or issues of interest to be considered for discussion at a future meeting. Committee members voiced the following topics:

- Ongoing updates to changes with HUD and activities of the MAG Continuum of Care Regional Committee on Homelessness.
- Presentation on strangulation and suffocation training to include the new forensic exam protocols.
- Presentation on the work of the AVON Program for Women and Justice Orders of Protection Task Force.

11. Comments from the Council:

An opportunity was provided for the Council to present a brief summary of current events.

On request of the Valley of the Sun United Way, Ms. Tenney announced Project Connect will take place on Thursday, June 28, 2012 at North Hills Church of God. A flyer was made available with additional information about the event.

12. Adjourn:

Chair Marshall thanked everyone for their attendance. The meeting adjourned at 3:22 p.m. The next MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting is scheduled for Thursday, August 2, 2012 at 2:00 p.m. in the Saguaro Room of the MAG offices.