

MINUTES OF THE
MAG DOMESTIC VIOLENCE COUNCIL MEETING
December 17, 2013
MAG Office Building, Saguaro Room
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

- Celeste Adams, Save the Family
+* Christina Avila, City of Avondale
Councilmember Robin Barker, City of Apache Junction
Lt. Bryan Coley for Lt. Robert Bates, City of Phoenix Police Dept.
John Belatti, City of Chandler Prosecutor's Office
Candice Hewitt for Libby Bissa, City of Phoenix Family Advocacy Center
John A. Blackburn, Jr., Arizona Criminal Justice Commission
Allie Bones, Arizona Coalition to End Sexual and Domestic Violence
Chief Steve Campbell, City of El Mirage Police Department, Vice Chair
* Michael Celaya, City of Surprise
* Councilmember Samuel Chavira, City of Glendale
Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community
Rick Foss for Lacey Rose Cox, City of Gilbert Police Dept.
Councilmember Ginny Dickey, Town of Fountain Hills
* President Diane Enos, Salt River Pima Maricopa Indian Community
Kristen Scharlau for Naomi Farrell, City of Tempe
Maria Garay, Sojourner Center
Patricia George for Will Gonzalez, City of Phoenix Prosecutor's Office
Laura Guild, Arizona Dept. of Economic Security
Constance Halonen, City of Apache Junction Police Department
* Cmdr. Kim Humphrey, City of Phoenix Police Department
Lynette Jelinek, City of Glendale Fire Dept.
Alice Ghareib for Mary Lynn Kasunic, Area Agency on Aging
* Patricia Klahr, Chrysalis Shelter, Inc.
* Councilmember Suzanne Klapp, City of Scottsdale
Councilmember Sheri Lauritano, City of Goodyear
Councilmember David Luna, City of Mesa
Barbara Marshall, Office of the Maricopa County Attorney, Chair
Leah Meyers, Governor's Office for Children, Youth and Families
* Dottie O'Connell, Chicanos por la Causa
D.C. Ernst for Kerry Ramella, Phoenix Fire Department
* Lynn Selby, City of El Mirage
Sarah Youngblood, Community Legal Services

- * Those members neither present nor represented by proxy.
+ Ex-Officio member
Attended by Teleconference

OTHERS PRESENT

Dick Geasland, Sojourner Center
Carl Mangold, Private Practice
Kate Henderson, Arizona Department of Public Safety
Dana Martinez, A New Leaf
Larry Grubbs, Arizona Criminal Justice Commission
Kristina Bunch, Goodyear Police Department
Rosalie Hernandez, A New Leaf
Teisha Portee, City of Scottsdale Police Department
Chris Panneton, Southwest Family Advocacy Center
Blaine Gadow, Maricopa County Attorney's Office
Kim Sterling-Heflin, O'Connor House
Sgt. Kelly Shore, Avondale Police Department
Rita Coronado, City of Surprise
Jon Eliason, City of Mesa
Amy St. Peter, MAG
Rena Tenney, MAG
Nikki Oxford, MAG

1. Call to Order and Introductions

Chair Barbara Marshall, Office of the Maricopa County Attorney, called the meeting to order at 2:05pm.

Chair Marshall welcomed new members of the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council: Maria Garay, Sojourner Center; Councilmember David Luna, City of Mesa; Vice Mayor Robin Barker, City of Apache Junction; and Leah Meyers, Governor's Office for Children, Youth and Families.

Chair Marshall asked members of the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council and audience members to introduce themselves. Introductions ensued.

2. Call to the Audience

An opportunity was provided for members of the audience to address the Council on non-agenda items that fall under the jurisdiction of MAG, or agenda items for discussion but not for action.

There were no comments made from the audience.

3. Approval of the September 4, 2013 Domestic Violence Council Meeting Minutes

Chair Marshall called for approval of the September 4, 2013, MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting minutes. Chair Marshall asked if there were any revisions to the

minutes. John Blackburn Jr., Arizona Criminal Justice Commission, requested a correction in paragraph four on page four of the minutes. He stated the word “court” in the last sentence should be changed to “attorney.” Chair Marshall entertained a motion to approve the minutes with the correction. John Blackburn, Jr., Arizona Criminal Justice Commission, made a motion. Allie Bones, Arizona Coalition to End Sexual and Domestic Violence, seconded the motion. All voted and the motion passed.

4. Refinement of the Regional Protocol Model

Chair Marshall introduced Renae Tenney, MAG, to highlight suggested revisions to the 2012 Misdemeanor Domestic Violence Protocol Model. Ms. Tenney stated the protocol model was developed in 2011 based on local and national best practices for law enforcement’s response to domestic violence crimes. Annually, revisions to the model are considered to ensure its efficacy.

Ms. Tenney stated this year’s proposed changes to the 2012 Misdemeanor Domestic Violence Protocol Model focused on clarifying language within the protocols. Ms. Tenney stated the proposed changes to the Protocol Model were vetted by law enforcement, prosecutors, and victim advocates during affinity group meetings as well as taken to the Leadership Affinity Group for feedback.

Ms. Tenney provided a brief overview of the proposed changes to the protocol model:

- In the second sentence of 17b, add the phrase “and describe” after “Document.”
- In the second sentence of 24d, replace “cell phone numbers” with “unit contact information.”
- In the first sentence of 24k, replace “Fill out Injury Documentation Picture Reports” with “Take and describe photographs.”

Chair Marshall asked if there were any questions about the proposed changes. Seeing none, she entertained a motion to approve revisions to the 2012 Misdemeanor Domestic Violence Protocol Model. Vice Chair Steven Campbell, El Mirage Police Department, made a motion to approve the changes. John Belatti, City of Chandler Prosecutor’s Office, seconded the motion. All voted and the motion passed.

5. Enhancing Domestic Violence Protocol Implementation Strategy Session

Chair Marshall introduced Renae Tenney, MAG, to guide discussion for the purpose of identifying strategies and next steps to enhance implementation of domestic violence protocols. Ms. Tenney began by thanking the Human Services Intern Nikki Oxford for organizing and planning the MAG Protocol Evaluation Project Roundtable event held on December 12, 2013. Ms. Tenney commented the event was a huge success and thanked Council members who attended. She invited those who participated to share any comments or insights from the workshop presentations. Mr. Blackburn stated the event was excellent. He went on to share he had gained new knowledge from the workshops. He noted the only downfall was having to choose between workshop topics.

Chair Marshall shared she attended the Neurobiology of Trauma workshop with Dr. Christopher Wilson. She noted the information presented in the workshop could be very influential in changing the way prosecutors and other professionals who work in domestic violence communicate with victims. Chair Marshall added she gained knowledge about how victims are thinking differently after the domestic violence incident as a result of the trauma they experienced. She said it was insightful to know that because of what is happening with their brain chemistry, victims are unable to give an account of what happened to them in chronological order directly after the incident. She noted the importance of sharing there is scientific evidence backing this information, especially for first responders who need to learn how to ask victims questions differently. Educating first responders and other professionals can make victims' accounts of the incident more accurate. She specifically noted the importance of asking victims what else they can remember and avoiding asking what happened next.

Ms. Kristen Scharlau, City of Tempe, commented that she enjoyed attending the roundtable. She noted it was reinvigorating to hear the passion Casey Gwinn has for domestic violence work. She added it was a great reminder to remain passionate about the fight against domestic violence, even after working in the field for many years.

Ms. St. Peter asked if there were additional insights gained from the roundtable event. She noted the goal is to identify opportunities to carry the information gleaned from the event forward. She added the importance of communicating information presented at the workshops that are relevant and can help to move the Council's work forward.

Vice Chair Campbell noted the great workshop topics that were provided at the roundtable. He asked about the feasibility of recording workshop presentations to share with those who are unable to attend these events. Amy St. Peter, MAG, indicated making videos of the trainings is an option for future events. She noted the opportunity for MAG staff to film one workshop training per session.

Mr. Blackburn voiced his agreement with Vice Chair Campbell about recording the training events. He noted it would be helpful to post all the presentations from the roundtable on the MAG website. Ms. Tenney noted she would be happy to make the presentations available online with the presenters' permission.

Allie Bones, Arizona Coalition to End Sexual and Domestic Violence, noted she was unable to attend but one of her victim advocates attended. Ms. Bones said her advocate was impressed by Sergeant Dan Rincon's workshop. She found it very helpful and mentioned she thought more advocates should learn about how to assess victims for strangulation injuries. Ms. Bones stated her advocate was unaware or unfamiliar with when these examines should be conducted prior to attending the roundtable workshop. She shared with Ms. Bones the NURSE (Neck, Unconsciousness, Restricted airway, Says were strangled or choked, Eyes) acronym for determining strangulation injuries.

Ms. Bones admitted that she had not heard of the NURSE acronym before this event. She indicated that this information is not only important for law enforcement to know but it is

also important for victim advocates to understand the signs and symptoms of strangulation. Knowing when victims need to seek emergency medical care is extremely vital information. It would be helpful to have more law enforcement and victim advocates trained on this information.

Vice Chair Campbell noted that Arizona Peace Officer Standards and Training Board (AZ POST) has worked with Sgt. Rincon and others to provide strangulation trainings to law enforcement across Arizona. He noted there might be an opportunity to provide these trainings to a broader audience by extending the invitation to others working with domestic violence.

Ms. Tenney asked the Council what they took away from the workshops and how they have incorporated what they learned into their work. Vice Chair Campbell stated the workshop on the Pima County Lethality Assessment Program presented by Kent Burbank was helpful in the work he is doing through a new Verizon grant awarded to the El Mirage Police Department.

Dick Geasland, Sojourner Center, commented that the Neurobiology of Trauma workshop was very well done. He added that all professionals working in domestic violence should know more about this information and the process of interacting with victims. The speaker was successful in simplifying explanations about the parts of the brain and their functions. Mr. Geasland stated this is not just important for making victims better witnesses but also minimizing the trauma they experience as a result of domestic violence and the potential for re-victimization by the criminal justice system. Ms. Bones added that her advocate also spoke very highly of the neurobiology presentation.

Ms. Tenney thanked the Council for sharing their thoughts about the roundtable event and asked how the Council should move forward with the new information gathered. Chair Marshall noted she spoke with Dr. Wilson about bringing him back to Arizona to provide training on this topic for the Arizona Prosecuting Attorney's Advisory Council (APAAC).

Chair Marshall commented it would be beneficial to incorporate strangulation procedures into the regional protocol model. Ms. Tenney agreed it would make sense to incorporate guidelines into the protocol model considering the ongoing discussions about the importance of identifying and investigating these cases.

Ms. St. Peter summarized the Council's discussion about the strategies and next steps for enhancing implementation of domestic violence protocols:

- Make changes to the regional protocol model to include interview techniques based on the information provided during the Neurobiology of Trauma workshop, information about detecting strangulation injuries, and aspects of the Lethality Assessment Program.
- Increase access to training materials by posting all presentations on the MAG website and record future trainings, if possible.
- Contact AZ POST about opportunities to provide strangulation trainings to a broader audience to accommodate all professionals who work with domestic violence who would like to attend. Consider combined training opportunities with AZ POST and APAAC.

- Explore opportunities to share information gained about the Neurobiology of Trauma with law enforcement.

Carl Mangold, Private Practice, stated Dr. Jill Messing did a great job explaining the Danger Assessment Tool. Mr. Mangold recommended including this tool in the protocol because it provides a more elaborate inventory than the Lethality Assessment Program tools.

Jon Eliason, City of Mesa, echoed what Mr. Mangold stated. Mr. Eliason noted Arizona is in the early stages of exploring the usefulness of the Lethality Assessment Program and the Danger Assessment tools. Every city is approaching this differently. In the future, this will provide the opportunity to identify promising practices. Mr. Eliason questioned that it may be too soon to tell which tool will work best for Arizona and should be included in the protocol model. Ms. St. Peter stated more discussion would be sought to gain consensus on inclusion of the Lethality Assessment Program and Danger Assessment tools in the protocol model.

Chair Marshall entertained a motion for the approval of strategies and next steps for enhancing implementation of domestic violence protocols as summarized by Ms. St. Peter. Mr. Blackburn made a motion. Sarah Youngblood, Community Legal Services, seconded the motion. All voted and the motion passed.

6. 2014 Protocol Evaluation Project

Chair Marshall introduced Renae Tenney, MAG, to provide a brief overview of plans for the 2014 work of the Protocol Evaluation Project. Ms. Tenney noted the Protocol Evaluation Project has assessed the arrest and prosecution protocols used to address domestic violence since 2011. The project is funded by STOP Violence Against Women formula grant dollars administered by the Governor's Office for Children, Youth and Families. She stated a renewal application for the third year of grant funding has been submitted and notice of fund allocations are anticipated by December 31, 2013.

Ms. Tenney referenced a handout in the meeting materials that provides the 2014 project goals and timeline as proposed in the renewal application. She noted many of the current activities of the Protocol Evaluation Project are proposed to continue into the coming year. These include maintaining the regional protocol model, conducting affinity group and leadership group meetings, coordinating training opportunities to help with further implementation of the protocol model. New elements proposed were supporting the Maricopa County Attorney's Office in reviewing the existing felony protocols for domestic violence, working with a survey services consultant to gather data from survivors about their experiences in working with the criminal justice system, and expanding the brown bag trainings to include topics of interest for law enforcement and prosecutors.

7. Committee Evaluation and Goals

Chair Marshall introduced Renae Tenney, MAG, to lead a discussion about the Committee's performance and goals. Ms. Tenney stated that each year the Committee is asked to evaluate its performance and discuss goals to guide the Committee's work in the coming year. She

noted this provides an opportunity to review what was done well and reveal any opportunities for improvement. She asked for members input on what was done well in 2013.

Vice Chair Campbell thanked MAG staff for pulling the different disciplines together to work on domestic violence crimes and issues. He commented on needing more focus on how the Committee measures success. He noted this has been an ongoing conversation of the Committee and acknowledged that measuring success can be different for everyone at the table. He added that outcomes are needed whether this means the frequency of domestic violence, recidivism, or holding the offenders accountable earlier. He suggested continuing to work on identifying measures for evaluating and monitoring the Committee's progress.

Mr. Blackburn commented that the Arizona Criminal Justice Commission (ACJC) gathers and assesses domestic violence data with the goal of gaining insight into how well domestic violence cases are being handled. He noted the ongoing discussions about issues surrounding the data including the missing dispositions. He added that improving the data quality is a resource issue and Arizona already is dealing with limited resources for this work. Ms. Tenney noted that MAG is working with ACJC to assess existing domestic violence data at the municipal level to identify promising practices that may assist in reducing the missing disposition levels across the region.

A comment was made that the brown bag trainings for victim advocates were an important part of the project. It was noted that these trainings fulfilled a great need for opportunities for victim advocates to come together to discuss their work and participate in free trainings. Ms. Tenney added the trainings were well attended and evaluations indicate the topics covered were helpful and relevant to the advocates work.

Councilmember Sheri Lauritano, City of Goodyear, commented on the need to raise awareness of the issue of domestic violence and the Committee's work through the use of technology. She spoke about utilizing the various platforms of FaceBook, Twitter, Instagram, and other technological advances for this purpose. Ms. Lauritano suggested making connections with the business sector to assist with these types of awareness efforts.

Chair Marshall stated there was discussion at the press conference in October about including more of an emphasis on addressing teen dating violence. She added this might be another opportunity to expand the Committee's work. Ms. Tenney noted the Committee's past work in this area resulted in the Web of Friends website, which provides information for teens about the signs of healthy and unhealthy relationships. She added the website is still available and updated with new information. Ms. Tenney noted there has been discussion with the Purple Ribbon Council about providing a presentation in the coming year about their BLOOM curriculum. She invited suggestions for presentations from other agencies doing this work.

Larry Grubbs, Arizona Criminal Justice Commission, noted the City of Phoenix has included an initiative focusing on teen dating violence as part of the work of the Roadmap to Excellence. He noted plans are underway for raising awareness and reaching out to teens in February 2014. Mr. Grubbs expressed the importance of training victim advocates with the

police departments to be aware of the barriers teens face when seeking safety when experiencing abuse in a relationship.

Ms. Bones stated she would like to see the Committee assist with expansion of the City of Phoenix's efforts to address domestic violence. She acknowledged MAG's participation in the development of the Roadmap to Excellence and the Paint Phoenix Purple campaign, and requested that the Committee assist with replicating these efforts across the region.

Ms. Tenney thanked everyone for their input on what was done well in 2013 and what can be incorporated into the Committee's work in 2014. She noted the Committee's interest in defining measures of success, continuing to assess domestic violence data for insights, conducting brown bag trainings, utilizing technology to help raise awareness, and learning more about resources for teen dating violence.

Ms. Tenney stated goals for the Committee's work in FY 2015 have been drafted for inclusion in the Unified Planning Work Program. She referenced the draft goals included in the meeting materials and asked for the Committee's feedback.

Lynette Jelinek, City of Glendale Fire Department, requested making the training resources, including the videos and training presentations, more easily accessible on the MAG website. The idea involved having a one-stop shop for professionals to check for training information and resources. Ms. Tenney commented the training resources are currently available on the Protocol Evaluation Project page of the MAG website and offered to send out the direct link to the page to the Committee.

Mr. Blackburn suggested that roundtable discussions be added to the goals. He stated there was discussion at the September meeting about conducting roundtable discussions to assist with determining strategies to support misdemeanor and felony protocols. Ms. Tenney commented that the roundtable event was held to provide information and time for discussion about the topics most relevant to the region. She added that future roundtable discussions can be explored.

Ms. Youngblood noted her concerns with record keeping and its impact on criminal histories. She stated that prior convictions are not showing up in the system, making it impossible to file felony domestic violence charges. Mr. Blackburn noted ACJC has been working on this issue for the past 15 years. He stated new laws are being passed but they are not effective because of issues associated with collecting criminal history data. Mr. Blackburn added that additional resources are needed to make an impact on this issue.

Ms. Bones stated there is the opportunity to educate the clerks and others responsible for entering this data about the importance and overall impact of having accurate information. She suggested asking Dr. Phil Stevenson to present to these individuals on how the data is used. She stated it is possible that if they know the importance of the data input, they may give this work more of a priority.

Mr. Blackburn agreed with Ms. Bones. However, he cautioned that in many cases the issue is not about whether they are entering the information. It is about the system being unable to recognize and match case information for a variety of reasons such as the charges being charged throughout the justice process. Jon Eliason, City of Mesa, echoed Mr. Blackburn's concerns stating he views this as a technology issue.

Chair Marshall inquired about legislation to address this technology issue and whether there may be an opportunity for the Committee to lend its support. Mr. Eliason indicated there is legislation in place and reiterated changes are restricted by the lack of resources.

Chair Marshall entertained a motion to approve the FY 2015 Committee goals with the amendment of adding roundtable discussions into Activity #6. Councilmember David Luna, City of Mesa, made a motion. Patricia George, City of Phoenix Prosecutor's Office seconded. All voted and the motion passed.

Chair Marshall asked the Council to review the proposed meeting calendar for 2014. Ms. Tenney requested feedback on any possible conflicts with the proposed dates. A comment was made about potentially needing to move the September 4, 2014 meeting with it being scheduled for the week of Labor Day. Ms. Tenney said she would inquire about options for the September meeting.

8. Chair and Vice Chair Appointments

Chair Marshall stated she will complete her two-year term as Chair of the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council on December 31, 2013. Per MAG policy, Vice Chair Campbell will ascend to the Chair position. Chair Marshall welcomed Vice Chair Campbell as the incoming Chair.

Chair Marshall added the MAG Executive Committee appointed Vice Mayor Robin Barker, City of Apache Junction, to the position of Vice Chair of the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council. Her term will begin as of January 1, 2014. Chair Marshall welcomed Vice Mayor Robin Barker as incoming Vice Chair.

Ms. Tenney thanked Chair Marshall for her leadership of the Council. Chair Marshall acknowledged the important work the Council has accomplished and stated she looked forward to the great work that will come from continuing to have great people at the table.

9. Success Stories

Chair Marshall asked the Committee to share stories of success experienced during their work.

Vice Chair Campbell shared the El Mirage Police Department has moved into their new facility. He was happy to report that the transition has been smooth and they are getting settled in.

Mr. Geasland spoke about Sojourner Center's program to earn holiday bucks for program participants.

Patricia George, City of Phoenix Prosecutor's Office, noted she is talking with criminal justice study and psychology students at Paradise Valley Community College about the dynamics of domestic violence.

Mr. Blackburn commented on Mr. Grubbs participation with the City of Phoenix's Roadmap to Excellence to expand teen and youth awareness about dating and domestic violence.

Mr. Belatti, City of Chandler Prosecutor's Office, noted his office is working more closely with the Chandler Police Department. Prosecutors are meeting with officers and making a point of going by the department at change of shift times to be available for officers to ask questions. He noted this has helped to strengthen trust and communication between the two departments.

Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community, spoke about the continuation of the batterers' intervention program. The program is growing and able to serve more victims.

Vice Mayor Barker shared that the Apache Junction City Council approved support of the Start by Believing campaign. She noted they were one of the first cities in Arizona to do so.

Alice Ghareib, Area Agency on Aging, commented that the DOVES program works primarily with survivors of domestic violence who are 50 years of age and more. They provide supportive housing to those seeking safety. She shared a story of how the program was able to help a client through the process to obtain her disability benefits.

Ms. Youngblood commented that their office has added another full-time attorney. She shared her excitement in being able to help more people with this addition of staff. She spoke about a difficult case she is working on where a rapist is challenging his victim for custody of the child conceived from the rape.

Celeste Adams, Save the Family, shared about a client who was brought to the program by police, received assistance, has stabilized her life, and was recently hired by the organization as their new facility manager.

Kristen Scharlau, City of Tempe, commented on her excitement in working with the Tempe Police Department to develop a lethality assessment program.

Candice Hewitt, City of Phoenix Family Advocacy Center, shared that Tamyra Spendley has been hired as the new Domestic Violence Coordinator.

Ms. Bones noted the Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence's name has changed to the Arizona Coalition to End Sexual and Domestic Violence. This is part of the Coalition's transition from single to dual coalition status. She added the Coalition held a community meeting to assist with choosing the new name and expanding their mission to include sexual

violence. The Coalition has made some additional changes to the staff structure including changing the title of their Systems Advocacy Department to Public Policy. She added that they will be hiring a new Public Policy Advocate.

Constance Halonen, City of Apache Junction Police Department, shared about a new partnership between the police department and the Community Alliance Against Family Abuse to provide on-scene response to domestic and sexual violence calls. The program has been in place for three months. The partnership is providing important services that were not available to Apache Junction residents before.

Councilmember Luna spoke about the City of Mesa's work on developing a set of lethality assessment questions for law enforcement to use when working on domestic violence cases. He acknowledged the work of Jon Eliason and others in making this a priority. He suggested having a future presentation on their work.

10. Request for Future Agenda Items

Council members were given the opportunity to request topics or issues of interest that the Council would like to have considered for discussion at a future meeting.

Mr. Blackburn requested a presentation by Dr. Phil Stevenson at ACJC on findings from the Arizona Victimization survey.

Councilmember Luna requested a presentation on the City of Mesa's work in developing a lethality assessment program.

11. Comments from the Council

Council members were given the opportunity to present a brief summary of current events. The Regional Domestic Violence Council is not allowed to propose, discuss, deliberate or take action at the meeting on any matter in the summary, unless specific matter is properly noticed for legal action. No comments were made.

Adjournment

Chair Marshall thanked everyone for their attendance. The meeting adjourned at 3:21 p.m. The next MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting is scheduled for 2:00 p.m. on Thursday, February 6, 2013.