

DRAFT MEETING MINUTES
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
TRANSIT COMMITTEE

April 12, 2012
Maricopa Association of Governments; Saguaro Room;
302 N. 1st Avenue, Suite 200
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

*ADOT: Mike Normand	Peoria: Maher Hazine
Avondale: Rogene Hill	Phoenix: Neal Young
#Buckeye: Andrea Marquez	#Queen Creek: Tom Condit
Chandler: Dan Cook for RJ Zeder	Scottsdale: Madeline Clemann
#El Mirage: Lance Calvert	Surprise: David Kohlbeck
Gilbert: Ken Maruyama	Tempe: Greg Jordan
Glendale: Cathy Colbath, Chair	*Tolleson: Chris Hagen
Goodyear: Cato Esquivel	Valley Metro Rail/Metro: Ben Limmer for Wulf Grote
*Maricopa County DOT: Mitch Wagner	Youngtown: Jim Fox
Mesa: Mike James	Regional Public Transportation Authority: Carol Ketcherside
*Paradise Valley: William Mead	

*Members neither present nor represented by proxy. + - Attended by Videoconference
- Attended by Audioconference

OTHERS PRESENT

Eileen Yazzie, MAG	Terry Johnson, Glendale
Marc Pearsall, MAG	Brent Stoddard, Glendale
Eric Anderson, MAG	Christine McMurdy, Goodyear
Roger Herzog, MAG	Jeff Martin, Chandler
Teri Kennedy, MAG	Jorie Bresnahan, Phoenix
Jorge Luna, MAG	Tom Remes, Phoenix
Nathan Pryor, MAG	Chad Heinrich, Tempe
Kristen Sexton, Avondale	Robert Yabes, Tempe
Jason Crampton, Chandler	Bob Antila, Valley Metro/RPTA
John Bullen, Glendale	Lauren Nell, Strand Assoc.
Jenna Goad, Glendale	

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 10:03 a.m. by Chair Cathy Colbath. Chair Colbath welcomed everyone in attendance and announced that a quorum was present. She noted that the following members were joining the meeting by teleconference, Ms. Andrea Marquez of Buckeye, Mr. Lance Calvert of El Mirage and Mr. Tom Condit of Queen Creek. Chair Colbath asked if there were any public comment cards, and there being none, proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

2. Approval of Draft March 8, 2012 Minutes

Chair Colbath asked if there were any comments or corrections to the Draft March 8, 2012 meeting minutes. Mr. Mike James of Mesa noted that on page nine in the first paragraph, 4307 should've been recorded as 5307. Mr. Greg Jordan also noted that in the attendance, both he and Robert Yabes were present at the last meeting. Mr. Marc Pearsall of MAG noted that he would correct the errors. Hearing no further comments or corrections to the meeting minutes, Chair Colbath called for a motion to approve the draft meeting minutes. Mr. James moved to approve the motion and Mr. Dan Cook of Chandler seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

3. Call to the Audience

Chair Colbath stated that she had not received any request to speak cards from the audience and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

4. Transit Program Manager's Report

Chair Colbath introduced Ms. Eileen Yazzie of MAG who presented her Transit Program Manager's Report.

Ms. Yazzie began by referring for agenda items 5, 6 and 7. She added that Agenda Item 5 was on the agenda for action, number 6 was on for information and discussion along with some minor corrections and number 7 was on for information, discussion and possible action. She noted that they were the same three, inter-related agenda items from March's agenda.

Chair Colbath thanked Ms. Yazzie for her report and update and asked if there were any questions or comments. Hearing no further comments or questions, Chair Colbath proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

5. Reprogramming of Glendale Park and Ride/Transit Center and Preventive Maintenance Distribution of 5309-FGM Funds

Chair Colbath requested that Ms. Eileen Yazzie to brief the committee on an update regarding Reprogramming of Glendale Park and Ride/Transit Center and preventive maintenance

distribution of 5309-FGM funds.

Ms. Yazzie noted that as she previously explained, agenda items 5, 6 and 7 were all inter-related and linked, adding that a change in one of the items would effect the other items. She added that the item had been revised slightly and referred the members to the attachment and memorandum and a listing of the projects as well as analysis and scenarios for the distribution of the 5309 funds for PM. She added that Glendale was still undergoing a site location analysis on the project. She noted that it was recommended that the unprogrammed funds for the Glendale project be reallocated to later years in order to line up with the schedule of the new park and ride opening date in the future. Ms. Yazzie then began to explain the tables and scenarios. Discussion followed with Mr. Greg Jordan of Tempe and Ms. Rogene Hill of Avondale. She also explained that with the Glendale reprogramming and other adjustments, there was \$8.1 million in 2013 available for PM.

Chair Colbath asked if there were any comments or corrections regarding the item. Hearing no further comments, Chair Colbath called for a motion to approve the item. Mr. James moved to approve the motion and Mr. Dan Cook of Chandler seconded. Ms. Yazzie also noted that part of the motion was to also approve a methodology, for the distribution of the 5309-Fixed Guideway Modernization funds and asked if the committee was comfortable with also moving ahead with that portion. Mr. James amended his motion to include Ms. Yazzie's addition and the previously agreed upon selection of Scenario #3 for as the preferred option. Discussion followed. Mr. Dan Cook of Chandler seconded and the motion passed unanimously. Chair Colbath proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

6. Federal Fiscal Year 2012 DRAFT Transit Program of Projects for Federal Funds and FFY2013-2015 Transit Projects

Chair Colbath requested that Ms. Yazzie continue with a presentation on Federal Fiscal Year 2012 DRAFT Transit Program of Projects for Federal Funds.

Ms. Yazzie added that it was for information and discussion only. She referred to the previous month's discussion on the topic and that Mr. Jordan had previously requested a more detailed overview of the impacts to Preventive Maintenance for FY 2013, 14 and 15. She noted that she worked with the member agencies on the FY2012 Transit Program of Projects for TIP and asked the members to reconfirm the February information included within the document, specifically for 2014 and 15. She added that this sharing of information will continue as an annual reconfirmation of the TIP.

She elaborated by focusing on the FFY 2012 Transit Program of Projects as it featured the most substantial changes. When having discussions with the operators, it was noted that due to the relative youth of the regional transit fleets, there were deletions by the RPTA and Phoenix as they would not need fleet due to the recent service cutbacks, \$11.3 and \$16 million, respectively. She also explained that there was an additional deletion by City of Phoenix, for item Phx-11707 for a total of \$1.9 million. These deletions accounted for a substantial amount of funding being possibly available for PM, approximately \$45 million.

Ms. Yazzie then emphasized the fact that the region did not yet have approved guidelines or policies in place in order to prioritize and distribute unspent 5307 funds. She noted that from

2009 up until present, these allocations had been done on a case by case basis. She advised that at current, the plan was to continue with the understanding that the \$45 million would be used specifically for PM, but that the amount was the most the region had ever seen for PM. She added that the capacity to spend for PM in 2012 was actually \$47 million as per the feedback from the operators, but that the funds would need to be programmed for one year. She concluded her report and asked if there were any questions or comments. Discussion followed.

Mr. Jordan inquired on the use of the \$43M for PM. He asked for clarification for the range of years. Ms. Yazzie replied that they were only for FY2012. He wondered if the region may spread the funds out over a couple years. She noted that it must be obligated by end of 2015.

Mr. Ken. Kessler of Phoenix added that the region may keep the FFY2012 funds in one year in the TIP, but also noted that transit operations were permitted to select to use it over a two year period. He noted that anything beyond two years runs risks as per previous experience with FTA grant programming guidelines.

Mr. Ken Maruyama of Gilbert inquired regarding the possibility of a new call for projects that may be a possibility. He said that Gilbert had a variety of bus stop ADA improvements, Park & Ride lots, green upgrade, streetlights for Ped and other improvements identified in their eligible wishlist. Ms. Madeline Clemann of Scottsdale inquired if these cities would use their share of PM or would these capital projects require a recalculation of PM. Ms. Yazzie replied that the region did not do apportioning or equity analysis for PM. She added that it would come off the top of 5307 funds. Ms. Yazzie noted that she could send out an email asking the member agencies to submit projects for a possible scenario for use of 5307 funds. She added that she would bring that scenario back to the committee for review and direction.

Mr. Cook asked about using the funds for express bus help or operating needs, especially in light of the cutbacks in transit services across the Valley. He added that there should've been a balance of bus user needs and PM as service for riders should take precedent over capital needs. Mr. Maher Hazine replied that by keeping the funds solely in PM, the overall operating costs go down, and therefore freed up funds for some of these other wishlist capital projects mentioned by the region's operators. Ms. Yazzie noted that 5307 funds couldn't be used for operations, but noted that as Mr. Hazine and Mr. Young on previous occasions noted, when the region shores up PM, then it may use the savings for operations. Discussion followed.

On a side note, Ms. Yazzie noted that the final FFY 2012 Transit Program of Projects would not be approved until the funding is authorized by US Congress. She added that if Congress issues a Continuing Resolution, then MAG would have some better direction.

Ms. Clemann inquired if cities might swap and supplant some of their operating costs by allocating the un-used PM in trade between another city. Ms. Yazzie replied that since the distribution methodology for PM were already established by the region, any unused PM would simply revert back into the general pot for further allocation. Since PM was based on operating rolling stock, not jurisdictional equity, the regional funds and don't belong to any one city or operator. Mr. Neal Young of Phoenix added that the cities' might use their own savings from PM for funding of local capital projects. Mr. Cook replied that since some cities didn't actually operate services, then those PM dollars may not flow back to the smaller cities. Ms. Yazzie concluded that 5307 funds was eligible for use for all items relating to capital

transit needs, and noted that virtually everything transit related, except operations, was eligible. Discussion followed.

Chair Colbath thanked Ms. Yazzie and asked if there were any further questions or comments. Hearing no further comments or questions, Chair Colbath proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

7. Additional FFY2012 CMAQ Funds Available to Transit Projects

Chair Colbath requested that Ms. Yazzie continue with a presentation on Additional FFY2012 CMAQ Funds Available to Transit Projects. She noted that the item was on the agenda for information, discussion and possible action.

Ms. Yazzie noted that this item was in relation to the item that was just discussed. She added that since there was now \$45 million possibly available for allocation to PM, there were two important facts to keep in mind. She emphasized that the region cannot use the \$25 million available CMAQ funds in 2012. She added that those funds must be programmed in 2013 or later. She advised that there were two scenarios presented. One was spending the entire \$25 million in one year in 2013, or scenario two was spreading the funds out in 2013 and 2014 where the region has bus purchases and capital projects that may be swapped out with CMAQ funds so that they might be used for PM.

She added that at the previous committee meeting in April, there was interest in possibly using some of the funds on Alternative Analysis or other transit studies. She checked backed with the committee members and with METRO members earlier and no AA's were requested by the region for use of the CMAQ funds.

Ms. Yazzie added that if there were other ideas and comments, that MAG was open to considering them. She explained that in regards to the timing of a needed decision, the Transit Committee would need to decide on this item by the May 10th meeting in order to make Regional Council in July for their final decision. She also added that when MAG management discovered that there was a large amount of funds available for flexing to transit in closeout, that the Intergovs were contacted and briefed on the situation. When that discussion occurred, it was not yet known that there would be a total of \$43million available to transit PM. It was decided that such an important issue needed to be re-run through entire committee process, as a confirmation of the current motion that the Region did indeed still wish to flex \$25 million over to transit. She completed her presentation and asked for any questions or comments.

Mr. James offered a potential option scenario for discussion. He said that perhaps the region might take the entire \$25M and flex it to City of Mesa for application to their Central Mesa LRT Extension project, then in-turn swap the \$25 million of PTF money out of Mesa and then distribute back into the Regional Transit system pot. He noted that this would allow the use of CMAQ to be spent on a federally approved LRT project, while concurrently allowing local PTF dollars to be spent in shoring up local projects.

Mr. Jordan noted that it was an interesting idea. He inquired if the swapped PTF money would be restricted only on the rail side of the program due to the firewalls, or could it be allocated

to allow us on bus side as well. Ms. Ketcherside noted that there was a Board policy firewall, but that it could be amended to allow these swapped rail funds to be spent on bus should the Board choose to modify the policy. Discussion followed.

Chair Colbath asked if there were any comments or corrections regarding the item. Hearing no further comments, Chair Colbath called for a motion to approve the item. Mr. Jordan moved to approve the motion, Closeout Scenario #2, that would approve using CMAQ funds originally set aside for bus purchases of 2013 and 2014 and by extension make those funds available for Preventive Maintenance. Mr. Young seconded. Chair Colbath asked for comment on the motion. Mr. Cook suggested that with the motion as written, it would preclude using any of the funds to shore up the express bus services. Mr. Cook noted that he fully supports the use of the funds for PM, he suggested that the option to use the funds for express serviced that have been cut should be looked at. Ms. Yazzie replied that the FTA won't allow the flexing of CMAQ funds without specifically identifying projects. Ms. Ketcherside noted that flexing the CMAQ funds to PM was the best way to ensure that local dollars could later be allocated for shoring up express buses. Discussion followed.

Chair Colbath asked if Mr. Jordan might clarify his pending motion. Mr. Jordan stated that he moved to approve the motion, that would approve utilizing \$25 million in CMAQ funds originally set aside for bus purchases of 2013 and 2014 and by extension by making those funds available for Preventive Maintenance, as stipulated in Closeout Scenario #2. Mr. Young seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Chair Colbath thanked Ms. Yazzie and asked if there were any further questions or comments. Hearing no further comments or questions, Chair Colbath proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

8. Request for Future Agenda Items

Chair Colbath asked the members of the Committee if there were any issues that they would like added as future agenda items. Hearing no further comments, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

9. Next Meeting Date

Chair Colbath thanked those present for attending the MAG Transit Committee meeting and she announced that the next meeting of the MAG Transit Committee would be held on Thursday, May 10, 2012, at 10:00 a.m. in the MAG Office, Saguaro Room. There being no further business, Chair Colbath adjourned the meeting at 11:10 a.m.