

MEETING MINUTES
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
TRANSIT COMMITTEE

April 11, 2013

Maricopa Association of Governments; Ironwood Room;
302 N. 1st Avenue, Suite 200
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

ADOT: Nicole Patrick	*Paradise Valley: Jeremy Knapp
Avondale: Kristen Sexton for Rogene Hill	Peoria: Maher Hazine
#Buckeye: Andrea Marquez	Phoenix: Neal Young
Chandler: Dan Cook for RJ Zeder	#Queen Creek: Chris Anaradian
El Mirage: Sue McDermott	Scottsdale: Madeline Clemann, Chair
Gilbert: Leslie Hart	#Surprise: David Kohlbeck
Glendale: Matthew Dudley	Tempe: Robert Yabes for Greg Jordan
Goodyear: Cato Esquivel	*Tolleson: Chris Hagen
*Maricopa County DOT: Mitch Wagner	Valley Metro: Wulf Grote
Mesa: Jeff Martin for Jodi Sorrell	Youngtown: Grant Anderson

*Members neither present nor represented by proxy. + - Attended by Videoconference
- Attended by Audioconference

OTHERS PRESENT

Eileen Yazzie, MAG	Christine McMurdy, Goodyear
Marc Pearsall, MAG	Ken Kessler, Phoenix
Margaret Boone, MAG	John Farry, Valley Metro
Alice Chen, MAG	Deron Lozano, Valley Metro
DeDe Gaishea, MAG	Mindy Kimball, ASU School of Sust.
Jorge Luna, MAG	Dale Miller, Jacobs
	Jennifer Pyne, URS

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 10:01 a.m. by incoming Chair Madeline Clemann. She welcomed everyone in attendance and announced that a quorum was present. She noted that three members were joining the meeting by teleconference; Andrea Marquez of Buckeye, David Kohlbeck of Surprise and Chris Anaradian of Queen Creek. Chair Clemann asked if there were any public comment cards, and there being none, proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

2. Approval of Draft March 14, 2013 Minutes

Chair Clemann asked if there were any comments or corrections to the Draft March 14, 2013 meeting minutes. Hearing none, she called for a motion to approve the draft meeting minutes. Mr. Jeff Martin moved to approve the motion, Mr. Robert Yabes seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

3. Call to the Audience

Chair Clemann stated that she had not received any request to speak cards from the audience and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

4. Transit Program Manager's Report

Chair Clemann invited Ms. Eileen Yazzie to brief the Committee with the Transit Program Manager's Report.

Ms. Yazzie noted that she had a few items to present. She congratulated and officially recognized Madeline as the new Chair of the Transit Committee. She added that due to Cathy Colbath's new position as Acting Executive Director of Glendale Transportation and her busy schedule, she was unable to continue as Chair and had stepped down. Ms. Yazzie explained that as per MAG Committee Policies and Procedures, the Vice Chair ascended to the Chair position. New Chair Clemann will fulfill former Chair Colbath's term through December 2012, with the option of one additional 2-year term at the Transit Committee's discretion.

Ms. Yazzie added that Mr. Pearsall would be sending out an email letter requesting candidates interested in the Vice Chair position. Letters would need to be submitted to the MAG Regional Council Chair by mid-May, with the Executive Committee appointing a new Vice Chair by June. She also congratulated Mr. Neal Young on his promotion to Senior Executive Assistant to the City Manager of Phoenix. Mr. Young replied that he would still be heavily involved with Transit Committee as a part of his duties. Ms. Yazzie completed her manager's report.

Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Yazzie for her report and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

5. Sustainable Transportation Land Use Integration Study – Recommendations and Findings

Chair Clemann requested that Ms. Yazzie continue and update the committee on MAG's Sustainable Transportation Land Use Integration Study (ST-LUIS) – Recommendations and Findings.

Mr. Wulf Grote of Valley Metro asked if the vote on this item could be tabled until the next meeting as to give his staff additional time to confer and review the study recommendations, outcome and guidelines with MAG staff.

Ms. Yazzie explained that if the vote on this item and indeed be tabled, that she be permitted to give the presentation, and then have open dialogue with the Committee on any concerns with the study. She advised that MAG staff needed to gather additional information so that a 10th stakeholder meeting could be held in order to address the comments and concerns brought forward. She noted that perhaps May 20th would be a good date to organize another review meeting. The members concurred and Ms. Yazzie continued with her presentation.

She recapped that her presentation would review the outcomes of the scenario modeling exercise: the study's recommendation of place types for high capacity transit and walkable communities; the local/community evaluation tool; the regional high capacity corridor evaluation process; and the overall recommendations and findings. She referred the members to Attachment #1 for additional information. She also noted that the item was originally on the agenda for information, discussion, and recommendation to accept the recommendations, key findings, and the three tools: 1) Place Types, 2) Local Toolkit, and the 3) Regional high capacity transit corridor evaluation and scenario planning process of the Sustainable Transportation and Land Use Integration Study; and consider using the regional corridor evaluation tool in the future Regional Transportation Planning process. She noted that the action item was tabled due to Transit Committee request.

Ms. Yazzie further continued with her presentation with an overview of all of the recently completed, current and ongoing MAG transit related studies. She noted that the completed studies were: Sustainable Transportation & Land Use Integration Study (completed March 2013); Southwest Valley Local Transit System Study (completed April-May 2013); Northwest Valley Local Transit System Study (expected completion in May-June 2013); and Designing Transit Accessible Communities (expected completion in June 2013).

She then explained the studies that were underway and/or pending: Valley Metro Performance Measures/Service Standards (Ongoing; with MAG participation); Regional Bicycle and Pedestrian Rail Crossing Recommendations Study (expected completion in October 2013); Hassayampa Valley Rail Corridors Cost Analysis (expected completion in October 2013); Grand Avenue Commuter Rail Corridor Cost Analysis Update (BNSF-MAG; Summer 2013) and Transit Tools (Transit Market Research Study) (Pending; 2014). She also noted additional future studies pending for FY14: Southeast Valley Transit System Study (Pending; 2014) and Regional Multimodal Level Of Service Map (Pending; 2014).

Ms. Yazzie then explained the STLUIS study and its relation to the Regional Transit Framework, and then noted that the uniqueness inherent to the ST-LUIS was the holistic approach taken to investigating transit's potential, by integrating real estate market analysis with transit corridor assessment and ridership modeling. The Study's focus was on transit and supportive land use and

was joined up with recommendations for creating compact walkable places throughout the region. The idea was to create an aggressive HCT network has been presented in a variety of regional documents in the past 25 years, with the following questions being analyzed: 1. What is sustainable transportation and how does it fit into the MAG region's future?; 2. Which corridors are best positioned to support High Capacity Transit (HCT)?; 3. How can land use and design decisions better support sustainable transportation?; 4. Which parts of the region have the greatest market support for TOD?; 5. What sustainable transportation options are available for places not supportive of HCT?

She added that the STLUIS project was launched in November 2010 to answer the questions noted previously. The Region wanted to figure out how to get a productive high capacity transit system with the right land use, and what was the market for these types of land uses that support transit. The ST-LUIS asked how the region could move toward sustainable transportation in ways that: Reflect market reality; recognize the high cost of high capacity transit, and were consistent with the values and aspirations of member communities. Mobility solutions were needed throughout the region, but limited parts of the region can support TOD and HCT in the near term.

Ms. Yazzie explained that sustainability depended upon productive investments as well as responsiveness to the needs of people and businesses. She said that there was genuine public and private sector enthusiasm for transit orientation and investment in the region, but cautioned that one size won't fit all and that future federal funding levels were uncertain. Additionally, shifting priorities were assisting the consideration of land use/transportation integration and transit's economic development impacts as well as considerable support among MAG member agencies for transit investments and supportive zoning for TOD.

She further explained that there were three umbrellas the Study's work fell into: Research & Analysis, Scenario Modeling, and Strategies & Tools. Additionally, they were building blocks to each other and as noted in the graphic, the first was integrated in the second and third components, and the second was integrated into the Strategies and Tools. She also referenced the previous Stakeholder Meetings and the attendance and support from the community from Feb. 10, 2011, March 28, 2011, May 12, 2011, Oct. 10, 2011, Oct. 24, 2012, Jan. 22, 2013, February 2013 - ULI Public and Business Forums, June 2, 2011 to Feb. 23, 2013 and today. She noted that today she was explained the Key Findings and Key Recommendations and reiterated that the strategies & tools dictated that 'One Size Doesn't Fit All'.

Ms. Yazzie then gave great examples of some of the work within the study, such as in section 3.1 Demand for TOD, which was supported by demographic shifts. Additionally, under section 3.2 Compact Walkable Communities, where TOD was achievable in different parts of the Region with different, unique characteristics. She then explained the 16 non-contiguous bus routes – which offered a mix of 10, 15, 20, 30 and 45 min peak service. She noted that the study team Arup and MAG were in the middle of mapping, which meant along one bus route, there were different frequencies depending on either a high demand area in urban phoenix, or if it crossed city boundaries due to not enough funding from cities. She also noted different starting and ending times depending on city limits and that it added a layer of complexity for the rider at times. She concluded that High Quality transit was bus or rail service that provided all day service with a long span of serve and frequencies of at least 15 minutes during daytime hours with high reliability, safety and customer experience, providing access to job centers and other major regional destinations.

Ms. Yazzie then explained further Key Recommendations from the Study. Regarding Place Types, the place type director would integrate the information MAG has gathered, and allows agencies throughout the region to use the data as a guide on different development patterns, prototypes and attributes for associated land use to support sustainable transportation options. She reiterated the need to use the data to provide a high quality, productive transit system supported by compact walkable and transit-oriented places and to create a small, focused rail network with an upgraded bus system that feeds the rail network and extends transit access to much of the region.

She then explained the four categories included within the recommendation: Suburban, Compact Walkable, Transit Served and HCT Oriented. She noted that back in February of 2012, the study questioned the private and public panel for input on strategies for local agencies to consider. It integrated the information gathered, and put it into a 'tool' for local and regional agencies to use in evaluating corridors, places, and areas. It was also based on limited Market Demand and providing a variety of sustainable transportation options including compact walkable and transit served. She also identified areas by their planned land use and transportation system characteristics, such as the Local Toolkit's Community Pathways to Sustainable Transportation, which featured the Development Prototype Catalogue. She added that the place type director integrated the information gathered, and allowed agencies in the region to use as a guide on different development patterns, prototypes and attributes for associated land use to support sustainable transportation options.

She also briefly explained Regional HCT Corridor evaluation and the scenario planning process, which evaluated existing corridor conditions, land use, transit supportive densities (people and jobs), and transit demand. Additionally, she noted the Community Pathways to Sustainable Transportation Interactive Tool, which featured pathway choices, place type profiles, place type dashboards, and reference materials. These permitted the study to "Synch up" with local and regional investment, planning and management decisions that supported sustainable transportation. Ms. Yazzie concluded her presentation by stating that every thing for the study was posted and available for review on the bqaz.org website under the Study's area. The presentations from ULI, the Stakeholder meetings, and findings from the different study components were all there as well. Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Yazzie and opened up the agenda item for discussion.

Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Yazzie and the Committee for their dialogue and for her presentation and asked if there were any questions or comments. After at length commentary and discussion by Dan Cook, Jeff Martin, Neal Young, Wulf Grote, and Eileen Yazzie regarding the study, recommendations and MAG Model, Chair Clemann agreed that the item would be brought back for consideration at a future meeting after the May 20th Stakeholders meeting.

Chair Clemann asked if there were any questions or comments. Hearing none, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

6. Southwest Valley Local Transit System Study

Chair Clemann requested that Jorge Luna present an update on the Southwest Valley Local Transit System Study

Mr. Luna updated the Transit Committee regarding the completed Southwest Valley Local Transit

System Study. He stated that the purpose of the study was to identify opportunities and strategies for improving the existing transit service in the Southwest Valley and to develop a short, mid, and long range local transit plan that effectively provided circulation within the Southwest Valley and also connected to the regional transit system. He referred the members to Attachment #2 for additional information and said that the item was on the agenda for information, discussion and possible action for acceptance of the Southwest Valley Local Transit System Study.

Mr. Luna then provided some background on the local transit service options that suited the specific characteristics and travel needs in the Southwest Valley. He noted that the plan called to develop a transit service network that complements and supports regional transit improvements that best service the local needs of residents in that region. He briefly gave an overview of the study approach, transit summit, data analysis, and survey results. He stated that the Data Analysis included: existing and future conditions; land use; population density; employment density; density mix and study area trips. Further, he explained that the public input surveys included a vast array and variety of question lines and topics best used to cull public sentiment, opinion and need regarding transit.

He then explained the public transit summit last Spring, in which over 50 attendees participated. They received key input such as the need to serve key activity centers, downtowns, medical facilities, employment centers, and schools; while enhancing multimodal connectivity and thus creating a total transit system. Some additional comments received were the need for the region to promote ease of use – such as a simpler fare system, transit branding, and more understandable maps.

Mr. Luna then explained the Plan Approach, which was to create an effective, convenient, cost-effective, affordable, equitable, sustainable, economical and consistent transit system. He also discussed the recommended Service Area, which featured 3 Subareas with a mix of intensity of service in order to maintain productivity goals such as service types, arterial grid routes, circulators, flex routes and required ADA services. He then summarized the plans for the Short Term: Subarea coordination to continue the efforts; increased current frequencies to 30 minutes; expanded existing circulator service and initiate planned Goodyear circulator; and investigate circulator service in Buckeye. For Mid Term: expanded east-west to Litchfield Rd; north-south service on Litchfield and Dysart Rds; expand/modify circulators to respond to conditions; introduce Flex service and expanded ADA required services. Lastly, he explained Long Term: expanded east-west arterial bus service farther west and south; improved service of productive and flex routes; expanded ADA services as fixed route serve expands.

Mr. Luna then explained the system cost estimates: net operating cost (after fare revenue); which featured Short-term [2015] at \$4.6 M; Mid-term [2020] at \$12.3 M; and Long-term [2030] at \$23.9M with an average annual 2015-2030 budget of \$10.6 M. He then explained the capital budget for (buses, bus stops, facilities); with Short-term [2015] \$3.3 M; Mid-term [2020] \$12.4 M and Long-term [2030] \$18.3 M with an average annual budget for 2015-2030 of \$2.5 M. He added that as for funding the recommended transit service; it would require a commitment of local funds and/or new local transportation tax; along with leveraging federal funds that are available to the study area and a possible regional continuation for new projects beyond the current RTP. He also noted that the next steps included that the Southwest Valley Local Transit System Plan would be finalized and placed online in April 2013; the Southwest Valley communities would continue to work together through the SW Multimodal Group or other forum; then a determination of funding priorities and level of commitment to short-term or long-term investments. Mr. Luna completed his presentation.

Chair Clemann thanked Mr. Luna and all of the Southwest Valley Study project management members for their work on the study. She then asked if there were any questions or comments. After a few brief comments of praise, she called for a motion to approve the agenda item. Mr. Wulf Grote moved to approve the motion, Mr. Cato Esquivel seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Chair Clemann asked if there were any further questions. Hearing none, she then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

7. Avondale-Goodyear Urbanized Area Federal Funds Programming

Vice Chair Clemann requested that Alice Chen provide an update to the Transit Committee on the Avondale-Goodyear Urbanized Area Federal Funds Programming.

Ms Chen noted that on March 27, 2013, the MAG Regional Council approved The MAG Regional Programming Guidelines for Federal Transit Formula Funds. In Section 702 of the Guidelines document, it was recommended that the utilization of Avondale-Goodyear Urbanized Area (AVN-GDY UZA) Federal Transit Funds be discussed during working group meetings comprising members of the AVN-GDY UZA. She said that MAG would begin the coordination process with AVN-GDY UZA member agencies to discuss programming options. She also referred the members to additional materials to review.

She noted that the Avondale-Goodyear UZA included the communities of Buckeye, Goodyear, Avondale, Glendale and Litchfield Park. She then briefly reviewed the AVN GDYUZA FY2012 vs FY2013 Projected budget and the Eligible Activities. These included Capital Facilities, under 5307/5339 with an 80/20 local match. The capital projects would be used to replace, rehabilitate and purchase buses, vans, and related equipment, and to construct bus-related facilities. With Operations under 5307, the requirement was 50/50 local match for bus purchases and under 5307/5339, a required 85/15 local match.

Ms Chen also referred to the next steps, which included meeting with AVN-GDY cities week of April 15th to discuss potential relevant studies such as the Southwest Valley Local Transit System Study and the Designing Transit Accessible Communities Studies

Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Chen again for her presentation and asked if there were any further questions. Hearing none, Chair Clemann then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

8. Unused Preventive Maintenance Funds

Chair Clemann requested that Eileen Yazzie present an update on Unused Preventive Maintenance Funds

Ms. Yazzie informed the Committee of how unused preventive maintenance funds from small transit operators were allocated. She said that between FY2011 and FY2015, it was estimated that the region would contribute \$77.8 million in federal funds to transit operators for preventive maintenance (PM). MAG had an approved preventive maintenance distribution methodology that was documented in the

MAG Regional Programming Guidelines for Federal Transit Formula Funds. She also referred to a graphic.

Chair Clemann thanked Ms Yazzie and asked if there were any questions or comments on the agenda item. Mr. Hazine asked if the Committee could learn a bit more on the topic during a future meeting. Hearing no further comments or questions, Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Yazzie and proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

9. Request for Future Agenda Items

Chair Clemann asked the members of the Committee if there were any issues that they would like added as future agenda items. Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

10. Next Meeting Date

Chair Clemann thanked those present and she announced that the next meeting of the MAG Transit Committee would be held on Thursday, May 9, 2013 at 10:00 a.m. in the MAG Office, Ironwood Room. There being no further business, Chair Clemann adjourned the meeting at 11:30 a.m.