

MEETING MINUTES
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
TRANSIT COMMITTEE

August 8, 2013

Maricopa Association of Governments; Ironwood Room;
302 N. 1st Avenue, Suite 200
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

*ADOT: Nicole Patrick	*Paradise Valley: Jeremy Knapp
*Avondale: Rogene Hill	Peoria: Maher Hazine
#Buckeye: Andrea Marquez	Phoenix: Maria Hyatt
Chandler: Jason Crampton for RJ Zeder	#Queen Creek: Chris Anaradian
El Mirage: Sue McDermott	Scottsdale: Madeline Clemann, Chair
Gilbert: Leslie Hart	Surprise: David Kohlbeck
Glendale: Matthew Dudley for Cathy Colbath	Tempe: Robert Yabes
Goodyear: Cato Esquivel	*Tolleson: Chris Hagen
Marcicopa: David Maestas	Valley Metro: Wulf Grote
Maricopa County DOT: Mitch Wagner	Youngtown: Grant Anderson
Mesa: Jodi Sorrell	

*Members neither present nor represented by proxy. + - Attended by Videoconference
- Attended by Audioconference

OTHERS PRESENT

Eileen Yazzie, MAG	Jeff Martin, Mesa
Marc Pearsall, MAG	Dianna Evans, Phoenix
Margaret Boone, MAG	Ken Kessler, Phoenix
Alice Chen, MAG	Kini Knudson, Phoenix
DeDe Gaisthea, MAG	Ben Limmer, Valley Metro
Sarath Joshua, MAG	Deron Lozano, Valley Metro
	Mike Sabatini, Baker

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 10:06 a.m. by Chair Madeline Clemann. She welcomed everyone in attendance and announced that a quorum was present. She noted that two members were joining the meeting by teleconference; Andrea Marquez of Buckeye, and Chris Anaradian of Queen Creek. Chair Clemann asked if there were any public comment cards, and there being none, proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

2. Approval of Draft June 13, 2013 Meeting Minutes

Chair Clemann asked if there were any comments or corrections to the Draft June 13, 2013 meeting minutes. Hearing none, she called for a motion. Mr. Hazine moved to approve the motion, Mr. Anaradian seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Chair Clemann then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

3. Call to the Audience

Chair Clemann stated that she had not received any request to speak cards from the audience and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

4. Transit Program Manager's Report

Chair Clemann invited Eileen Yazzie of MAG to brief the Committee with the Transit Program Manager's Report.

Ms. Yazzie noted that she had a few items to present. She noted that the new Southeast Valley Local Transit System Study RFP was recently released and that the project was jointly managed by MAG and Valley Metro. She added that Ms. Alice Chen had recently distributed a meeting notice for 5307 (in the amount of \$3.9 Million) scheduled for Monday August 12th at 1:30. She explained that the item would be back to Transit Committee in September.

Ms. Yazzie also welcomed Mr. David Maestas from the City of Maricopa. She noted that he would be representing one of MAG's newest member agencies. Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Yazzie for her report and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

5.- Sustainable Transportation Land Use Integration Study – Recommendation, Findings and Tools

Chair Clemann requested that Eileen Yazzie present an update to the committee on the Sustainable Transportation Land Use Integration Study – Recommendation, Findings and Tools.

Eileen Yazzie said that she would provide an update to the Transit Committee on the Sustainable Transportation Land Use Integration Study (ST-LUIS). She said that her presentation would review the outcomes of the scenario modeling exercises, the study's recommendation of place types for high capacity transit and walkable communities, the local/community evaluation tool, the regional high capacity corridor evaluation process, and the overall recommendations and findings.

She noted that the item was on the agenda for information, discussion, and recommendation to accept the recommendation, key findings, and the three tools: 1) place types, 2) local toolkit, and the

3) regional high capacity transit corridor evaluation and scenario planning process of the Sustainable Transportation and Land Use Integration Study. She referred the members to Agenda Item #1 for further information. She said that all of the materials were also posted on the bqaz.org website under the Study's section tab. The presentations from the ULI panes, the Stakeholder meetings, findings from the different study components were also located on the web page.

Ms. Yazzie began her PowerPoint by explaining the uniqueness of the ST-LUIS was the holistic approach taken to investigating transit's potential, by integrating real estate market analysis with transit corridor assessment and ridership modeling. The Study's focus on transit and supportive land use is joined up with recommendations for creating compact walkable places throughout the region. She said that ST-LUIS asked how the region can move toward sustainable transportation in the following ways: reflect market reality; recognize the high cost of high capacity transit, and were consistent with the values and aspirations of member communities.

She summarized that the **ST-LUIS** study began in 2010 with an in depth, 2 ½ year effort amongst the stakeholder agencies and the general public. The study was completed in three phases: research and analysis, scenario planning and modeling, and the development of local and regional tools. The study was complemented by nine stakeholder activities. These activities included two business/public forums coordinated by the Arizona Chapter of the Urban Land Institute (ULI). The perspectives of participants from these forums were integral to understanding the market realities in local communities.

Ms Yazzie further explained that based on the ST-LUIS investigation of market realities and research findings, and the study's testing of high capacity transit (HCT) scenarios in the MAG region, the overarching recommendation from the ST-LUIS was to provide a high quality, productive transit system supported by compact walkable and transit-oriented places. The Study's key findings were: 1) TOD demand will be driven by projected regional growth in population and jobs, and supported by demographic shifts, 2) transit-supportive and compact walkable development is achievable, with distinct opportunities in different parts of the region, 3) targeted corridor modifications improve transit productivity, 4) regional transit mode share and regional access increase with a mix of LRT and upgraded bus services, and 5) existing conditions drive the pathway for future HCT service.

She said STLUIS was rooted on the projected demand for transit oriented development (TOD), which projects that in a future of 8.3 million people, 1 million (12%) would be the market for TOD; as well as a quarter, 1.1 million jobs from a future 4.4 million jobs would drive the TOD employment demand forward. Mobility solutions were needed throughout the region, but limited parts of the region can support TOD and HCT in the near term. She reminded the members that sustainability depended on 1.) productive investments; and 2.) responsiveness to the needs of people and businesses. She also noted that there was genuine enthusiasm for transit orientation and investment in the MAG region, but that the realities of sustainability means that there was not a one size fits all solution, nor would there be a guarantee of future federal funding levels, which added to the uncertainty of the endeavors.

Ms. Yazzie noted that back in February of 2012, the MAG STLUIS study team questioned the private and public in a panel setting for input on strategies for local agencies to consider. This integrated the information we had gathered, and put it into a 'tool' for local and regional agencies to use in evaluating corridors, places, and areas. It was based on limited Market Demand and

provided a variety of sustainable transportation options including compact walkable and transit served. This component was presented in October 2012 and the final product was available in February 2013. It identified areas by their planned land use and transportation system characteristics, which an emphasis on “Synching up” with local and regional investment, planning and management decisions that support sustainable transportation.

She further explained the Community Pathways to Sustainable Transportation Interactive Tool, which featured elements such as pathway choices, place type profiles, place type dashboards and reference materials. She added that the place type director integrated the information MAG had gathered, and allowed agencies throughout the region to use as a guide on different development patterns, prototypes and attributes for associated land use to support sustainable transportation options. She concluded that successful outcomes were heavily tied into the tool.

Ms. Yazzie said that with this and other key findings, the study moved forward with a scenario planning and modeling exercise to offer three visions for future land uses, high capacity transit networks, transit ridership and transit productivity, using the project’s market demand forecasts for TOD jobs and housing. The results of the scenario planning exercises provided high-level results rather than specific local recommendations. The scenario modeling exercise used the 44 recommended high capacity transit corridors from the MAG Regional Transit Framework Study, as the candidate corridors for analysis.

As part of the scenario planning exercise, the STLUIS created 3 place types: Compact Walkable, Transit Served, and High Capacity Transit (HCT) Oriented were created to reflect threshold densities and development patterns supportive of different transit modes. The land uses and were “applied” to station areas (½ mile) in the scenario planning process. Transit service and capital investments included in each scenario was derived from an understanding of related studies, existing and future transit services, projected travel demand characteristics, land use and growth patterns, and regional connectivity. She referred to her presentation to note brief summaries of each scenario:

1.) Enhanced Transit Scenario - The Enhanced Transit Scenario reflected a moderate expansion of the MAG Base Case scenario transit network (the RTP 2035 Network), as well as a reallocation of total regional growth to specify transit-oriented development (TOD) consistent with the ST-LUIS place types within one half mile of transit stations (“station areas”). The scenario includes 10 LRT, streetcar, and commuter rail corridors (including eight service corridors and two commuter rail corridors). 2.) Transit Supply Scenario - This scenario reflected a very generous expansion of the Base Case scenario transit network, as well as a reallocation of total regional growth to direct transit-oriented and compact walkable development to station areas. This scenario includes all 44 corridors including LRT, BRT (mixed flow running, similar to the LINK), streetcar, and commuter rail corridors. 3.) Refined Transit Supply Scenario - This scenario was generated after Scenario 1 and Scenario 2 were completed. The scenario tests a transit network that is more extensive than that of Scenario 1, but less extensive compared to Scenario 2. Transit network and land use assumptions were revised with the aim of increasing network productivity and reflecting constraints to HCT-supportive densities in some locations. This scenario included 25 corridors including LRT, BRT (mixed flow running, similar to the LINK), streetcar, and commuter rail corridors.

She concluded by saying that the study recommendations, findings and tools had set the stage for the region to move toward more sustainable transportation options. She added that this was

accomplished by evaluating regional projects that support sustainable transportation, jump start the regional transportation plan process, consider upgrading transit services, and support municipal actions.

Ms. Yazzie again noted that the item was on the agenda for recommended approval. After brief discussion by the members, the action was amended to read as follows: for information, discussion, and possible recommendation to accept the Sustainable Transportation Land Use Integration Study recommendation, key findings, and tools to be considered in future planning efforts and be consistent with the Federal Transit Administration process, including evaluation criteria as appropriate.

Chair Clemann asked if there were any questions or comments. Mr. Anderson commented on scenario 3, Mr. Grote complimented the study and commented on land use scenarios, and Chair Clemann and Matthew Dudley thanked Eileen.

Chair Clemann asked if there were any further questions or comments. Hearing none, she called for a motion. Mr. Hazine moved to approve the motion, Mr. Anderson seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Yazzie and asked if there were any further questions. Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

6. Avondale-Goodyear UZA Formula Funds

Chair Clemann requested that Ms. Chen present an update to the committee on the Avondale-Goodyear UZA Formula Funds agenda item.

Ms. Alice Chen presented an update on the MAG Regional Transit Programming Guidelines, which was approved by Regional Council on March 27, 2013. In Section 702 of the guidelines, it was recommended that the programming of Avondale-Goodyear UZA funds would be addressed during working group discussions comprising members of the UZA and any other impacted member agencies. MAG staff, working with the designated recipient – the City of Phoenix, the Regional Public Transit Authority, and Avondale-Goodyear UZA communities, convened the Working Group a total of four times. She noted that the group reached a consensus on the utilization of the funds and referred the members to attachment #2 for additional information. She added that the item was on the agenda for information, discussion, and possible recommended approval of the utilization of the Avondale-Goodyear UZA formula funds, updates to the TIP and any to Regional Transportation Plan as appropriate.

She then explained the background of the agenda item. The working group agreed to program the UZA for projects in Fiscal Years (FY) 2013-2015, with future years to be discussed as necessary. The general programming principles were outlined as well as the cost details: 1.) Provide services and improvements as required by law - includes Transit Security and Transit Enhancements; 2.) Fund Preventive Maintenance/Operations - fund ZOOM operations cost at 50 percent. 3.) Support the Transit Life Cycle Program (TLCP) capital bus program - with a total of 10 buses are currently allocated for service in the Avondale-Goodyear UZA. This included 6 express buses operated by RPTA and 4 local buses operated by City of Phoenix. Two buses were programmed for replacement in FY2013 and one per year thereafter. 4.) Fund Additional Projects. She added that this included

both additional operating costs and capital bus requirements for the following services: a.) Route 3 - Increase service to 30 minute frequency; b.) Route 17A - Increase service to 30 minute frequency c.) Route 17A - Extend service to Estrella Pkwy/Pebble Creek Pkwy at 30 minute frequency.

She added that n FY2013-2015, the UZA was over-programmed by approximately \$1.5 million. The Regional Public Transit Authority (RPTA), working with City of Phoenix, have submitted an application to the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) under the 5307/5339 grant program on behalf of the UZA for funds to be utilized toward capital bus purchase replacements.

Ms. Chen summarized that the item was on the agenda for information, discussion and possible action to recommend approval of the project changes to the MAG FY2011-2015 Transportation Improvement Program related to the reallocation of \$3,721,455 of unspent federal ARRA funds to operations.

Chair Clemann asked if there were any further questions or comments. Hearing none, she called for a motion. Mr. Dudley moved to approve the motion, Mr. Esquivel seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Chen and asked if there were any further questions. Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

7. FY 2013 FTA Section 5307 Job Access and Reverse Commute Eligible Projects Priority Ranking

Chair Clemann requested that Ms. Gaisthea continue with update to the committee on the FY 2013 FTA Section 5307 Job Access and Reverse Commute Eligible Projects Priority Ranking agenda item.

Ms. DeDe Gaisthea of MAG provided an update on the priority ranking for the FY 2013 FTA Section 5307 Job Access and Reverse Commute eligible projects which included the Section 5310 Enhanced Mobility of Seniors and Individuals with Disabilities grant program. She added that the MAG Elderly and Persons with Disabilities Program Ad Hoc Committee was tasked with the development of the priority rankings. The rankings would then move through the MAG Committee process for final approval from the MAG Regional Council for inclusion into the TIP. She referred the members to attachment #3 for additional information. She also noted that the item was on the agenda for information, discussion and possible recommendation to approve 1) the priority listing, 2) inclusion of the list of projects in the FY 2013 program of projects, and 3) amendments and administrative modifications to the FY 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program and to the Regional Transportation Plan 2010 Update, as appropriate.

She then walked the committee members through her agenda item. She said that when MAP-21 went into full effect October 1, 2012, authorizing programs through 2014-Revisions: the New Freedom 5317 (projects beyond ADA services) was repealed and now consolidated as an eligible program under Enhanced Mobility of Seniors and Individuals with Disabilities (5310). She said that there was no longer a single 5310 apportionment to the state; and now apportionments specifically for large urbanized, small urbanized and rural areas. She added that Designated Recipients needed to be officially designated in large Urbanized Areas, with 200,000 in population. She noted that funds

could not be awarded until the DR was on file with the FTA regional office, and as required by FTA guideline as the MPO, MAG was initiating the process for a Designated Recipient (DR) for the region.

Ms. Gaisthea further explained the Job Access Reverse Commute/5310 Elderly and Persons with Disability Program Update. She said that the New Freedom 5317 (projects beyond ADA services) was repealed and now consolidated as an eligible program under Section 5310, newly named the Enhanced Mobility of Seniors and Individuals with Disabilities. She stated that under SAFTEA-LU, the MAG region was allocated \$1.8 million in FY 2012 specifically for JARC eligible projects. With the passage of MAP-21, JARC the dedicated funding was repealed. However, she said that JARC projects were eligible under 5307 formula funds and that MAG has concluded the DR process for the Section 5310 Program.

She noted that in February 2013, MAG Regional Council approved City of Phoenix assume the role of Designated Recipient for the 5310 program previously held by the Arizona Department of Transportation. Under Section 703 of the Federal Formula Transit Programming Guidelines recommended for approval by Transit Committee on February 14, 2013, it was recommended that City of Phoenix coordinate both programs. She said that the City of Phoenix would lead the JARC evaluation process coordinating with the MAG Human Services Division. Applications would be a coordinated effort between MAG Human Services Division and the City of Phoenix with final approval from MAG Regional Council.-Sent out notification to applicants once approved by RC.

She concluded that all remaining projects met JARC requirements and addressed the criteria of addressing the needs of work related transportation for low-income individuals, utilizing the normalizing formula ensured the evaluations score from the committee was taken into consideration in calculation the funding amount.

Ms. Gaisthea concluded her presentation and noted that the item was on the agenda to: Recommend to approve 1) the priority listing, 2) inclusion of the listing of project in the FY 2013 program of projects, and 3) amendments and administrative modifications to the FY 2012-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program and to the Regional Transportation Plan 2010 Update, as appropriate.

Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Gaisthea and asked if there were any questions. Comments were provided by Mr. Esquivel regarding \$1.8 million vs the \$1.5 million in Item 6. Ms. Yazzie replied that the 5307 JARC process has different criteria than the other funds were being sent over the ADOT for use in the small UZA statewide pot, as they were not interchangeable. Mr. Anderson commented on the scoring-allocation process of funds. Chair Clemann recommended that MAG reconsider how the funding is allocated for next year and that MAG work with the members to ensure that the process for next year can ensure that projects are more regionally beneficial.

Chair Clemann asked if there were any further questions or comments. Hearing none, she called for a motion. Ms. Hyatt moved to approve the motion, Mr. Crampton seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Chen and asked if there were any further questions. Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

8. MAG Strategic Transportation Safety Plan

Chair Clemann requested that Ms. Margaret Boone present an update to the committee on the MAG Strategic Transportation Safety Plan agenda item.

Ms. Boone of MAG presented a brief introduction to the Transit Committee regarding the Strategic Transportation Safety Plan (STSP) and stated that the item was for information and discussion only. She noted that the MAG 2013 Work Program identified a project to develop a comprehensive Strategic Transportation Safety Plan (STSP). She explained that the previous STSP was developed in 2005 and was in need a revision and referred the members to her PowerPoint presentation.

She explained that the resulting plan would provide input to the next update of the Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) from a transportation safety perspective. It would identify regional priorities, strategies, resource needs and performance indicators. The plan would also help establish a unified approach for identifying and implementing solutions for key road safety issues that affect all agencies in the MAG Metropolitan Planning Area. Oversight for this process would be provided by the MAG Transportation Safety Committee and the Transportation Safety Stakeholders Group (TSSG). She added that some key areas of the plan focused on transit, bicyclist and pedestrian, and disability/mobility safety issues in the region. She noted that the MAG Transportation Safety staff seeks representation from the Transit Committee on participating in TSSG for this effort.

Ms. Boone briefly explained the elements of the Study Objectives. She noted that they were to: 1.) Develop a comprehensive Strategic Transportation Safety Plan (STSP); 2.) Update previous STSP adopted by MAG in 2005; 3.) Establish regional vision, goals, objectives, strategies, countermeasures and performance measures for transportation safety; 4.) Coordinate with the Arizona Strategic Highway Safety Plan and 5.) Provide input to MAG NextGen Regional Transportation Plan.

She briefed the committee through her presentation and referred to the ten tasks within the TSSG and STSP: Task 1 – Transportation System Performance and Available Resources; Task 2 – Establish Regional Vision and Goals for Transportation Safety; Task 3 – Emphasis Areas, Potential Strategies, and Performance Measures; Task 4 – Network Screening Methodologies for Prioritization of Road Safety Needs; Task 5 – Incorporating Safety in the Regional Transportation Plan; Task 6 – Develop a Strategy to Incorporate Safety Enhancements in Road Projects; Task 7 – Improving Safety via Traffic Operations and Technology Solutions; Task 8 – Monitoring & Reporting on System Performance & Program Effectiveness; Task 9 – Implementation Plan 2015-2025; and Task 10 – Draft Final Report, Executive Summary and Presentations

Ms. Boone thanked the committee members. She solicited interest in those who wish to assist and participate in the TSSG and that they should contact her for further information. Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Boone and asked if there were any questions. Mr. Anderson, Mr. Grote and Mr. Dudley added comments on the value of the study and the importance of bike/ped safety in aging communities as well as with increased transit usage in the Valley.

Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Boone and asked if there were any further questions. Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

9. Quarterly Status Report on Federal Grant Activity

Chair Clemann introduced Mr. Ken Kessler of the City of Phoenix Transit Department and noted that he and his staff were available to answer committee questions for the Quarterly Status Report on Federal Grant Activity ending with June 30, 2013. Chair Clemann asked if there were any questions or comments on the agenda item. Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

10. Request for Future Agenda Items

Chair Clemann asked the members of the Committee if there were any issues that they would like added as future agenda items. Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

11. Next Meeting Date

Chair Clemann thanked those present and she announced that the next meeting of the MAG Transit Committee would be held on Thursday, September 12, 2013 at 10:00 a.m. in the MAG Office, Ironwood Room.

There being no further business, Chair Clemann adjourned the meeting at 11:18 a.m.