

FINAL MEETING MINUTES
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
TRANSIT COMMITTEE

Tuesday April 19, 2016
Maricopa Association of Governments; Saguaro Room;
302 N. 1st Avenue, Suite 200
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

*ADOT: Mike Normand	*Paradise Valley: Jeremy Knapp
Avondale: Kristen Taylor, Vice Chair	Peoria: Stuart Kent
#Buckeye: Andrea Marquez	Phoenix: Ken Kessler for Maria Hyatt, Chair
Chandler: Jason Crampton for RJ Zeder	Queen Creek: Mohamed Youssef
El Mirage: Jose Macias	Scottsdale: Gregory P. Davies for Madeline Clemann
#Gila River Indian Community, Sasha Pachito	Surprise: Martín Lucero
Gilbert: Kristin Myers	#Tempe: Robert Yabes
Glendale: Kevin Link for Debbie Albert	*Tolleson: Jason Earp
*Goodyear: Cato Esquivel	Valley Metro: Abhi Dayal for Wulf Grote
#Maricopa: David Maestas	#Youngtown: Grant Anderson
Maricopa County DOT: Reed Kempton	
Mesa: Jeff Martin for Jodi Sorrell	

* Members neither present nor represented
by proxy.

Participated (or attended) by teleconference
+ Participated (or attended) by videoconference

OTHERS PRESENT

Audra Koester Thomas, MAG
Marc Pearsall, MAG
Alice Chen, MAG
Teri Kennedy, MAG
Margaret Boone, MAG
DeDe Gaisthea, MAG
Maria Pina, MAG

Jorie Bresnahan, Phoenix
Stephanie Child, Phoenix

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Vice Chair Kristen Taylor. She welcomed everyone in attendance and announced that a quorum was present. She noted that several members were joining the meeting by teleconference: Andrea Marquez of Buckeye, David Maestas of Maricopa, Robert Yabes of Tempe and Grant Anderson of Youngtown. She asked if there were any public comment cards, and there being none, proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

2. Approval of Draft March 15, 2016 Meeting Minutes

Vice Chair Taylor inquired if there were any comments or corrections to the Draft March 15, 2016 Minutes. Mr. Davies mentioned that in section two, Mr. Martin's representation of Chandler did not match his representation of Mesa listed on page one. It was noted that Mr. Martin's representation that day was indeed for City of Chandler, so Vice Chair Taylor thanked Mr. Davies and added that MAG staff noted that they would make the correction to the meeting minutes. Hearing no further comments, she called for a motion on the Draft March 15, 2016 Minutes. Kristin Myers of Gilbert moved to approve the motion, Jeff Martin of Mesa seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Vice Chair Taylor then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

3. Call to the Audience

Vice Chair Taylor stated that she had not received any request to speak cards from the audience and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

4. Transit Planning Report

Vice Chair Taylor introduced the MAG Transit Planning Project Manager, Audra Koester Thomas. Ms. Koester Thomas then proceeded to brief the Committee with the Transit Planning Report.

She noted that she had several items to report on with recent transit planning activities and followup for previous agenda items. She began by welcoming new member, Ms. Sasha Pachito of Gila River Indian Community via teleconference.

Ms. Koester Thomas then noted a few items of interest from the upcoming calendar: She explained that the USDOT announced a \$20.5 Million program on April 14, 2016 to Improve Access to Transit in Communities Around the Country. The FTA would provide up to \$20.5 million in competitive grant funds to support comprehensive planning associated with new fixed guideway and core capacity improvement projects that are seeking or have recently received funding through FTA's Fixed Guideway Capital Investment Grants (CIG) Program. The grant funds would be provided through FTA's Pilot Program for TOD Planning and the NOFO appears in the Federal Register.

A summary of the funding opportunity with links to application materials was available on the FTA website. She added that the FTA would host a webinar on this funding opportunity on Thursday, April 28 at 2:00 p.m. Eastern time at <https://connectdot.connectsolutions.com/fta-tod-pilot>. Applications are due at midnight Eastern time on June 13, 2016.

She invited members to attend the ADOT Long Range Transportation Plan Update Stakeholder Workshop. She explained that in partnership with ADOT, MAG would feature a session regarding ADOT's Long Range Transportation Plan (LRTP) update, known as What Moves You Arizona. ADOT was seeking input on the direction the state should be heading and the goals that the residents should set as a community. The meeting would take place on Thursday, May 12, 2016 from 1:00 p.m. - 3:30 p.m at MAG in the 2nd Floor Saguaro Room For more information, please visit the ADOT website: www.azdot.gov/whatmovesyourarizona.

She also noted that the APTA 2016 Rail Conference hosted by Valley Metro , was scheduled for June 19-22, 2016, at the Sheraton Grand Phoenix Hotel, downtown Phoenix, AZ. She suggested that interested parties visit the American Public Transportation Association website for details. She also added that there was a training opportunity this summer: TSI's Transit Safety/Safety Management Systems would take place in Phoenix, AZ on June 22-24, 2016.

She closed by explaining that after receiving feedback from the Committee, with their concurrence, there was a plan to 'test' moving the Transit Committee meeting time to an earlier and more convenient starting time of 2 p.m. beginning May 2nd in order to accommodate late afternoon travel schedules. Since the Bike/Ped Committee was right down the hallway and traditionally lasted only one hour, the members could attend both meetings in sequence. Members voiced support for the change. Vice Chair Taylor thanked Ms. Koester Thomas. She asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing no further comments, Vice Chair Taylor proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

5. Federal Transit Administration Funding Projections for the MAG Region

Vice Chair Taylor invited Teri Kennedy of MAG to present on the item. Ms. Kennedy explained a brief background regarding the FTA Funding Projections for the MAG Region.

She began with by explaining that MAG, in coordination with Valley Metro-RPTA and the City of Phoenix as Designated Recipient/Direct Recipient of FTA funds, had developed revised FTA projections for the MAG region based on the FAST Act, FTA guidance information, and historical projections. She encouraged the members to refer to their attachments #1a and #1b for additional information. She added that the information represented an overall 7.66% increase within the TIP.

Vice Chair Taylor thanked Ms. Kennedy and asked the if there were any comments or input from members. Hearing none, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

6. Draft FY 2017-2021 Transportation Improvement Program Listings and FY 2016 Program of Projects

Vice Chair Taylor invited Alice Chen of MAG to present on the item. Ms. Chen explained a brief background regarding the Draft FY 2017-2021 Transportation Improvement Program listings and FY 2016 Program of Projects.

She began her presentation by stating that MAG was currently developing the Fiscal Year 2016 Annual Transit Program of Projects (POP) and the Fiscal Year 2017-2021 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP). She mentioned that at the March 15, 2016 Transit Committee meeting, member agencies provided input regarding the programming of federal funds with the funding projections available at the time. She said that staff had presented three programming scenarios that fell within the parameters of the programming guidelines and that Committee members requested that MAG staff move forward with a modified programming scenario two. She referred the members to Attachment #2 and the handouts for additional information and began her presentation.

She also referred to the TIP programming schedule (as of 4/18/2016) for summer / fall 2016 and Job Access Reverse Commute & ADA discussions. She explained the items of notes for the Phoenix-Mesa UZA, with some TLCP projects for FY 2016 that were back-filled with FY 2013-2014 apportioned funds. She also referenced Priority 3: Preventive Maintenance which were used to “balance the program” so it was not always at exactly 25% with the allocation to cities have not been updated. She again highlighted the Priority 4: Job Access and Reverse Commute discussion to begin summer/fall of 2016. “Priority 9” (highlighted in blue) would fund additional projects. They would also fund a number of expansion vehicles dependent on type of vehicle procured as well as ADA transition funding. She also footnoted the rail projects which added that project work and location needed to be updated.

Ms. Chen then discussed the items of notes for the Avondale-Goodyear UZA. She briefed the bullet points regarding costs that were not finalized for expansion vehicles, and the ADOT Statewide application which was due on April 22, 2016, but that projected funding from competitive grants was not currently included. She also noted the March 15, 2016 Transit Committee discussion regarding the \$8 million that was available annually, to which the final amount was listed at \$6.6 million. She explained that the Transit Committee input from March 15th also contemplated the un-programming of the one percent towards the safety associated ‘Transit Investment’ per elimination of FAST Act requirement. Another topic reviewed was the possible reduction of the JARC funding from approximately \$1.8 million annually to \$750k annually (assuming 25k growth annually). That rate would program approximately eight expansion buses per year for a total 40 buses; allocate approximately \$2 million a year to ITS and related infrastructure needs; and allocate approximately \$2 million a year to ADA and accessibility needs.

She concluded by referencing Priority 8, which would support the other TLCP projects as the program is updated, from 2016-2021 = \$17,140,687 (2.2%). She showcased the Federal Funding Programming Priority by Year slide/chart as well as the Priority 9: fund additional projects (projected) \$8.25 million/ year slide. She completed her presentation by stating that the Committee might wait until May to approve the item as she would create a modified version of scenario two from the March committee meeting.

Vice Chair Taylor thanked Ms. Chen and asked if there were any questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Ms. Kristen Myers commented that the ADA improvement funds were better served under bus funding, especially if complications may arise so that they could be moved back into the fleet program. Ms. Chen added that the region could push funding off until 2017 in order to get input from regional ADA standards. Ms. Myers noted that there were already standards, applied locally by each jurisdiction. Brief discussion followed.

Mr. Abhishek Dayal commented regarding the Transit Standards and Performance Measures. Mr. Jeff Martin concurred with Ms. Myers comment that large bus procurements for Phoenix for expansion buses funding allocations should be a top priority. Ms. Chen noted that she would work with Valley Metro and return with an ADA issue formula. Mr. Martin, Mr. Stewart Kent and Mr. Jason Crampton provided additional discussion and noted the importance of both West Valley and East Valley transit service expansion efforts throughout the next TIP. Ms. Chen advised that there would be a new TIP next year. Additional discussion was heard regarding procurement for bus fleet size options and pricing, both for a bulk order, or spread out over successive years. Mr. Greg Davies also noted that there was a FTA requirement for agencies to develop ADA transition plans by 2018.

Ms. Chen noted that she would table the item and return in May with condensed scenarios. She also added that the scenarios would feature ADA, bus expansion, \$5 million for additional buses, TSPM as well as Phoenix' bus needs from 2021 to 2025. Vice Chair Taylor again thanked the members and asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing none, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

7. Updates to Regional Programming Guidelines for Federal Transit Formula Funds

Vice Chair Taylor invited Ms. Chen of MAG to continue with her presentation on the next item. She explained a brief background regarding updates to Regional Programming Guidelines for federal transit formula funds.

Ms. Chen began by stating that the MAG Regional Programming Guidelines for Federal Transit Formula Funds was approved on March 27, 2013. She added that it had been modified twice with the latest modification approved on May 27, 2015. The guidelines were developed under MAP-21 and as the region was recovering from an economic recession and updated federal legislation and shifting transit needs under the current economic conditions had created the need to update the guidelines to better utilize federal funds for the MAG region. She stated that on March 15, 2016, the MAG Transit Committee reviewed the guideline as part of the process for the FY 2016 POP and FY 2017 TIP and proposed funding scenarios that trigger modifications to the guidelines. She referred the members to Attachment #3 for proposed language updates to the guidebook and referred to her presentation.

She again stated that the Regional Programming Guidelines for Federal Formula Funds were approved and adopted by MAG Regional Council on March 27, 2013, along with updates on October 23, 2013 and May 27, 2015. They were developed under MAP-21 with the proposed updates to align with March 15, 2016 Transit Committee discussions and requested revisions. She explained that the

text in red color were strikeouts indicating proposed deleted language; while the text in blue indicated proposed additional/clarification language. She then noted that Section 202 was the Transit Life Cycle Program, and that the TLCP was a 20 year (2006-2026) program that included: fleet replacement for all transit services; State of Good Repair Program: rural, local, regional, express, RAPID, Bus Rapid Transit, vanpools, and dial-a-ride/paratransit). She added that buses funded under the Transit Life Cycle Program included any buses currently in the system as of January 1, 2016. There were no expansion un-programmed buses in the life cycle bus capital program.

Ms. Chen then showcased the Section 500. Transportation Programming Priorities Update, which featured some changes. 2.) Provide funding for support services for grant management to the designated recipient, the City of Phoenix. The funding amount would remain at \$40,000 until further guidance is provided; 3.) Avondale/Goodyear UZA would receive operations funding in line with 2012 for the FY TIP years 2016-2021. And 9.) Fund additional projects based on a regional competitive evaluation process or by conducting a Regional Transit Survey and through a collaborative discussion at the Transit Committee, per the Committee's discretion.

She also described Section 700., the Job Access Reverse Commute (JARC) program and added that under the FAST Act, requirements and eligibility for JARC remained unchanged. She stated that for FY 2016, the MAG Region would sub-allocate \$750,000 toward JARC eligible activities in the MAG Planning region and that the funding would emphasize non-profit organizations and other activities that fulfill the "spirit" of the program. Funding amounts and the future of the program would be reviewed annually/biannually or during TIP development cycles. For Section 800. The "Priority 9" Projects (Phoenix-Mesa UZA), any project request that was not part of Priorities 1 - 8 would be addressed through Priority 9. She added that items also included as part of Priority 9 were: 1) any bus expansion vehicle, 2) advancement of replacement vehicles, and/or 3) change in vehicle types for replacement vehicles (i.e. 40' standard to 60'), 4) cost increases of replacement vehicles due to special requests related to specs and/or technology that is not part of the standard fleet.

Ms. Chen also commented on Section 802., the Regional Transit Survey. She said that in lieu of a competitive process, the Transit Committee may elect to request that MAG conduct a Regional Survey to assess the needs of the region and fund projects under Priority 9 and through a collaborative discussion at the Transit Committee. The process would be initiated every two years, consistent with the Regional Transportation Improvement Programming (TIP) cycle or as necessary, per the recommendation of the Transit Committee. The process would focus funding the implementation of on-going and existing planning efforts at Valley Metro and MAG, including but not limited to: Transit Standards and Performance Measures; Short Range Transit Plan; Regional Transit Framework Study; and Subregional Studies (i.e. Southwest Valley, Northwest Valley, Southeast Valley Local System Studies).

She wrapped up her presentation with a description of the 803., the Non-TLCP Bus Capital Program. She added that bus expansion purchased would be programmed for replacement so long as the route remained in service. She noted that any discontinuation or significant change in service would require the agency work through the TSPM/SRTP and competitive processes. She said that those buses remained outside the Transit Life Cycle Program. She closed with a quick summary of the Fast Act definition and components.

Vice Chair Taylor thanked Ms. Chen and asked if there were any questions or comments regarding the agenda item. There was brief commentary on Section 202, the TLCP and a suggestion that the members remove Section 700. JARC. Ms. Chen replied that the JARC discussion continually occurs every two years in the TIP cycles. Another suggestion was that in Priority 9, the 802 Regional Transit Survey feature new language. Vice Chair Taylor inquired on the Section 802 and Mr. Dayal clarified that Section 802 was actually for the Short Range Transportation Plan. Ms. Chen noted that this item was also be tabled and revisited with additional information for the May meeting.

Vice Chair Taylor again thanked the members and asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing none, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

8. Grants for Buses and Bus Facilities Program 5339(b)

Vice Chair Taylor invited Mr. Abhishek Dayal of Valley Metro present on the next item. He explained a brief background regarding grants for Buses and Bus Facilities Program 5339(b).

He began his presentation by noting that on Tuesday, March 29, 2016, the Federal Transit Administration issued a Notice of Funding Opportunity (NOFO) for two grants: 5339(b) Buses and Bus Facilities and 5339(c) Low or No Emission programs. Approximately \$211 million was available for Section 5339(b) grants and \$55 million for 5339(c) grants for Federal Fiscal Year 2016. He stated that applications, among other criteria, must demonstrate consistency with local and regional long-range planning priorities and goals.

He then reviewed the Program Purpose. He explained that the goals were to improve the condition of the nation's public transportation bus fleets; expand transportation access to employment, educational, and healthcare facilities; improve mobility options in rural and urban areas throughout the country; and that funds awarded will finance capital projects to: replace, rehabilitate, purchase or lease buses and related equipment as well as to rehabilitate, purchase, construct or lease bus-related facilities. He also reviewed the evaluation and award process. The NOFO would consider the age and condition of buses, bus fleets, related equipment, and bus related facilities (useful life); prioritize projects that had demonstrated how the agency addresses significant repair/maintenance needs; improved the safety of transit systems; deployed connective projects with advanced technologies to connect bus systems with other networks; and support the creation of ladders of opportunity under two criteria: maximum award not more than \$21.1M (10 percent of total available funding of \$211M); and local match required: minimum 15%.

He then explained the Regional Bus Fleet Need, which would feature an updated replacement portion of the Regional Bus Fleet Replacement plan with existing/programmed Federal Formula Funds; identify buses programmed to be replaced beyond their useful life - based on age of the fleet (12 years or older) and based on the life mileage (500,000 miles or greater); and feature shortfall in fleet replacements (programmed versus projected) of 73 buses (FY17) and 38 buses (FY18) with the excess fleet replacements programmed for (FY19 – 21) of 25 buses and the net fleet replacement need for (FY17-21) of 86 buses. He noted that the Regional Bus Fleet Need had an overall expected shortfall of 86 buses (all Phoenix operated) as well the number of 60' buses totaling 44, and the number of 40' buses totaling 42.

He noted that the recommendation for the grant application would include: The oldest buses beyond useful life and with the most mileage in our region currently operated by Phoenix; applying for 25 buses (60') for Phoenix; the Federal request would equal \$20.3M (does not exceed maximum of \$21.1M); and the proposed local match \$3.58M (PTF) with the applications due on May 13th, 2016.

Vice Chair Taylor thanked Mr. Dayal for his presentation and asked if there were any questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing none, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

9 . Request for Future Agenda Items

Vice Chair Taylor asked the members of the Committee if there were any issues or topics that they would like added as future agenda items. Hearing no further comments, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

10. Next Meeting Date

Vice Chair Taylor thanked those present and announced that the next meeting of the MAG Transit Committee would be held on Tuesday, May 17, 2016, at the new time of 2:00 p.m. in the MAG Office, Saguaro Room. There being no further business, she adjourned the meeting at 4:01 p.m.