

MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
REGIONAL DOMESTIC VIOLENCE COUNCIL
MEETING MINUTES – FEBRUARY 4, 2010

MEMBERS ATTENDING

Celeste Adams, Save the Family
*Christina Avila, City of Avondale
Marc Rivers for Lt. Robert Bates, Phoenix Police Department.
Kristen Scharlau for Kathy Berzins, City of Tempe
Larry Grubbs for John A. Blackburn, Jr., AZ Criminal Justice Commission
Jessye Johnson for Allie Bones, Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence
Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community
*Councilmember William Conner, City of El Mirage
JoAnn Del-Colle, Phoenix Family Advocacy Center
*President Diane Enos, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community
*Will Gonzalez, City of Phoenix Prosecutor's Office
Laura Guild, Arizona Dept. of Economic Security
Shannon Cotton for Cindy Hallman, Marley House
+Linda Melendez for Dan Hughes, City of Surprise
Cmdr. Kim Humphrey, City of Phoenix Police Department, Chair
*Lynette Jelinek, Glendale Fire Department
Bianca McDermott for Mary Lynn Kasunic, Area Agency on Aging
Patricia Klahr, Chrysalis Shelter Inc.
Suzanne Klapp, Councilmember, City of Scottsdale
*Phil Lieberman, City of Glendale

*Jodi Beckley Liggett, Arizona Foundation for Women
Barbara Marshall, Maricopa County Attorney's Office, Vice Chair
Maria-Elena Ochoa, Governor's Office for Children, Youth, and Families
Dottie O'Connell, Chicanos Por la Causa
*Stephanie Olohan, City of Goodyear
Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center
Lynn Potts for John Pombier, City of Mesa
DC Ernst for Kerry Ramella, City of Phoenix Fire Department.
*Sarah Youngblood, Community Legal Services

OTHERS PRESENT

Cheryl Brunton, City of Phoenix
Tim Cole, City of Phoenix
Bob Demloy, Phoenix Police Department
Bill Hart, Arizona State University
Maya-Rebecca Martin
Sandra Robertson, A New Leaf
Kim Sterling-Heflin, O'Connor House
Angela Andrews, Maricopa County Attorney's Office

Rachel Brito, MAG
DeDe Gaisthea, MAG
Brande Mead, MAG
Amy St. Peter, MAG
Renney Tenney, MAG

+ Those attending by video/audio conference

* Those not present or represented by proxy

1. Call to Order

Commander Kim Humphrey, Phoenix Police Department, Chair, called the meeting to order at 1:36 p.m. He introduced Suzanne Klapp, Councilmember, City of Scottsdale, as a new member of the Regional Domestic Violence Council. Introductions ensued. Commander Humphrey advised the Committee of a prior engagement and his need to leave the meeting early. Vice Chair Barbara Marshall, Maricopa County Attorney's Office, would chair the meeting upon his departure.

2. Call to the Audience

An opportunity was provided to members of the audience to address the Council on non-agenda items that fall under the jurisdiction of MAG, or on agenda items for discussion but not for action.

DeDe Gaisthea, MAG, Human Services Transportation Planner, announced the Section 5310 Grant Application process has begun. She provided an overview of the process, application requirements, and provisions of the grant. The application, instructions, handbook, and summary of definitions were provided in the meeting handouts. Ms. Gaisthea advised the Committee that MAG facilitates the application process for the Arizona Department of Transportation. Applications are due to MAG by noon on March 5, 2010. Ms. Gaisthea encouraged agencies to apply for the grant and advised she would be available to answer questions and/or provide technical assistance.

3. Approval of the December 3, 2010, Meeting Minutes

Commander Humphrey called for approval of the December 3, 2010, MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting minutes. Lynn Potts, City of Mesa, motioned to approve the minutes. JoAnn Del-Colle, Phoenix Family Advocacy Center, seconded the motion. The motion passed.

4. O'Connor House Avon Program for Women and Justice Presentation

Commander Humphrey introduced Kim Sterling, O'Connor House Avon Program for Women and Justice, to provide a presentation on their program and focus on domestic violence. He advised the Committee that Lucia Howard was unable to attend the meeting.

Ms. Sterling thanked the Committee for the opportunity to present on the topic at hand. She said the O'Connor House was Justice Sandra Day O'Connor's family home which was relocated to Papago Park. The O'Connor House will stand as the icon for the process being developed and is a reflection of how Justice O'Connor has conducted her entire career with a foundation of collaboration and inclusion.

Ms. Sterling said in February 2009, Justice O'Connor received a \$250,000 five year grant from the Avon Foundation to establish the program. She provided the "Summary of O'Connor/Avon Domestic Violence Project" handout on accomplishments to date and provided an overview of the following project priorities:

- Recruitment and training of victim advocates

- Better and more consistent training of law enforcement, prosecutors and judges
- Improvement of procedures for issuance and enforcement of protective orders
- Integration and streamlining of data collection between law enforcement and the courts
- Public awareness and education
- Grants for domestic violence

Ms. Sterling said the Committee has been meeting since April and that it has been an amazing experience to see what can be accomplished when all parties come together to share information, issues, and concerns. Ms. Sterling said they have no boundaries dictating what cannot be accomplished because they have not worked in the field before. The Committee is attempting to accomplish work that is “outside the box”. Ms. Sterling said the Committee is collaborating with the Administration of the Courts and other agencies on a grant through the U.S. Department of Justice. She said the deadline for the grant application is February 17, 2010, and if they receive the award, they will develop, produce, and institutionalize training across the board statewide.

Ms. Sterling invited anyone interested in attending the committee meetings to contact either her or Ms. Howard. The next meeting is scheduled for February 13, 2010 at the Historical Society Museum. Commander Humphrey said he had the privilege of attending the last meeting and noted the committee is an action-oriented group. He said their efforts will interconnect with efforts of the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council.

5. MAG Shelter Capacity Study

Vice Chair Barbara Marshall introduced Amy St. Peter, MAG, to present the final findings of the MAG Shelter Capacity Study. Ms. St. Peter thanked everyone for their efforts and participation in the Shelter Capacity Study with special gratitude to shelter staff. She said the 2005 report “The Need for Increased Domestic Violence Shelter” determined the need for 325 additional shelter beds. Recognizing the risk of losing funding, the Shelter Capacity Study is intended to show the need to maintain shelter beds and to help shelters maximize operations by increasing the number of people served or increasing the diversity of the people being served. Ms. St. Peter advised the shelter survey was conducted in the summer of 2009 and staff has been working on the draft report since then. She apologized for the delay in distributing the study results and encouraged Committee members to share their ideas, comments or questions to help strengthen and improve the report.

Ms. St. Peter referred Committee members to the Executive Summary within the report. She advised 18 shelters participated in the survey but clarified the report is not a representation of all shelters because not all had participated in the study. She said there was greater participation from domestic violence shelters than from homeless shelters. Ms. St. Peter noted the information contained within the report may have already changed due to funding cuts, changes in demand, or other circumstances. She asked Committee members to keep in mind the report is a product of the time in which it was completed, noting the lessons and insights gained will hopefully move the Committee forward.

Ms. St. Peter reported on the findings focusing primarily on data collected from domestic violence shelters. She gave a brief overview of reasons why shelter was denied which included no vacancy/shelter at capacity, not a victim of domestic violence, availability of only top bunk beds and men and/or former clients not accepted for varying reasons. She advised one shelter reported 86 percent of the responses noted in the “other” category and advised staff is following up with the shelter to further clarify. Overall, 68 percent of those seeking domestic violence shelter and 64 percent of those seeking homeless shelter were either denied or placed on a wait list. Ms. St. Peter advised data specific to homeless shelters is also available.

Ms. St. Peter advised the recommendations being offered are based on the data collected, but said staff is also relying on the expertise of the Committee to strengthen the recommendations. The recommendations fall into two basic groups: 1) Increasing the number of people served and 2) Increasing the diversity of people being served. Ms. St. Peter noted not as many requests for shelter were denied due to mental illness and substance abuse as had been expected. She gave a brief overview of the strategies recommended to address these two issues some of which included: Filling top bunks first, cross-training staff, screening on-demand, and revising policies that restrict eligibility. With regard to screening, Ms. St. Peter clarified domestic violence shelters screen clients when a call is received but some homeless shelters screen only during scheduled times.

Patricia Klahr, Chrysalis Shelter, Inc., said from a shelter perspective, the report was eye-opening. She thanked Ms. St. Peter for clarifying the issue of on-demand screening. Ms. St. Peter said collaboration between the Regional Domestic Violence Council and the Continuum of Care Regional Committee on Homelessness offers an opportunity for each Committee to learn from each other. Celeste Adams, Save the Family, expressed appreciation for inclusion of rapid re-housing and the ability for shelters to move families into homes more quickly. She noted UMOM was awarded a rapid re-housing grant from the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development in July 2009, but has yet to receive the funding. Save the Family is a partner with UMOM on the grant.

Kristen Scharlau, City of Tempe, said it was interesting to have so many different perspectives at the table. She added many of the issues discussed, such as pets and the top bunk at the shelters, are reasons why some of their clients do not contact the shelter hotline. She discussed people’s concerns about leaving their pets behind and in harm’s way. Ms. Scharlau said the City of Tempe had developed a relationship with an animal shelter which allowed victims to leave their pets there for up to one year. The relationship ended due to the owner’s passing and another opportunity such as that has not presented itself.

Ms. Sharlau said many times women simply do not want to go to shelter for their own personal reasons. She gave an example of a woman who had been accepted to a shelter but chose to leave it because her children would not be able to attend the same school. She commented those are the types of stories heard by shelter staff working the in the field. Ms. Klahr advised Chrysalis Shelter works with the Arizona Human Society to

place animals in shelter. She stressed the importance of coordination and patience on everyone's part and offered to provide assistance with this issue if needed.

Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center, said she appreciates all the discussion and hopes it opens the door to additional dialogue. She added there are issues, barriers and different perspectives that need to be discussed in order to improve shelter processes. She suggested coming together in a forum to discuss these types of issues. She also commented on a recent opportunity to add space for a kennel at Sojourner Center, but staff was resistant. Ms. Scharlau agreed noting a definite disconnect between methodology and practices. She said there is also a lack of communication with second shift employees working after business hours. Jessye Johnson, Arizona Coalition against Domestic Violence, said the Coalition has a quarterly residential life committee meeting. She offered those meetings as a venue to continue the dialogue. Ms. Johnson also encouraged everyone to develop relationships with shelters to better meet the needs of people seeking shelter.

Sandra Robertson, A New Leaf, commented the report suggests there are not enough beds. She said during the study period 239 calls for shelter were denied, but there was an average of 53 open beds during the first study period and an average of 16 open beds during the second study period. She added DV STOP has not had a client since October. Ms. Phillips said Sojourner Center has had open beds at a rate of 20-30 percent since September. She said the study is relevant in assessing why people are turned away from shelter when there is space for them. She said one of the discussion points should be how to encourage women to come to a shelter. She said it may be the right timing to address issues other than space, such as processes, the economy, a woman's fear of not having a job or child care services, or lack of available resources. Maria-Elena Ochoa, Governor's Office for Children Youth and Families, encouraged staff to frame the issues in a larger context. She referenced past community conversations where some of the same issues surfaced.

Vice Chair Marshall asked whether the Committee wished to vote to approve the MAG Shelter Capacity Study report or have staff incorporate the changes and vote at a future meeting. Ms. Klahr asked if there is a time frame or pressing reason for requiring a vote from the Committee. Ms. St. Peter advised there is no specific timeframe. Ms. Klahr recommended staff make the recommended changes to the report including framing the issues prior to a Committee vote.

Dottie O'Connel, Chicanos por la Causa, said De Colores shelter had the largest denials reported in the "other" category. She said while the numbers were reported correctly, there may have been a misunderstanding by the shelter staff about the available options on the survey. She asked for an opportunity to research the issue.

Ms. St. Peter summarized the requests from the Committee to frame the issues presented by the study in a larger context, recognizing Save the Family for partnering with UMOM on the rapid re-housing project, addressing the disconnect between policy and practice, and the opportunity to have on-going dialogue. Ms. St. Peter asked that additional

recommendations be forwarded to her or Ms. Tenney. Changes will be incorporated in the report which is scheduled for presentation to the MAG Continuum of Care Regional Committee on Homelessness in March.

6. FY 2011 Committee Goals

Vice Chair Marshall said the Committee had brainstormed proposed goals during the last meeting. She invited Ms. Tenney to provide an overview. Ms. Tenney said the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council proposed goals for FY 2011 includes five separate goals and she provided a brief review of each goal.

Vice Chair Marshall referred the Committee to Goal #2 “Evaluate the protocols used to arrest and prosecute domestic violence offenders...” She said those in prosecution are aware of domestic violence protocols and added Maricopa County Attorney’s Office (MCAO)’s opinion is that Goal #2 is a very good project, but would suggest making a change to the goal. She added the protocol does not need to be evaluated because MCAO believes it represents best practices and suggested changing the goal to *increase compliance* with the protocol. She stated the protocol is not always followed, therefore the issue is not with the protocol itself, but rather with adherence. Ms. St. Peter clarified when referring to evaluation of protocols, the goal refers to municipal policies and not felony charges at the county level.

Ms. Del-Colle said it is important for the Committee to not only review protocols at the municipal level but also at the felony level. She said there are overwhelming issues at the felony level that often get routed back to the municipal level. She recommended modifying the goal to include both felony and misdemeanor protocols. Vice Chair Marshall said the same protocol is applied at both the municipal and felony level. Ms. St. Peter summarized requests to change the goal from evaluating protocols to increasing compliance and to evaluate both felony and municipal level protocols.

Lynn Potts, City of Mesa Prosecutor’s Office, asked when the protocol was last reviewed collectively to evaluate what is working and what is not. She suggested perhaps the goal should be to bring everyone back together to review the protocol a second time noting the last review occurred ten years ago. Vice Chair Marshall advised the protocol has not changed and was signed by all parties. Ms. Potts suggested the need to review the protocols to determine if they are still best practices. Vice Chair Marshall shared an example of a case not prosecuted due to lack of necessary information. In her example, the prosecution needed a recording of the victim’s testimony, however, when the issue was addressed, the victim recanted her story. Vice Chair Marshall said there are certain things that need to be done and an immediacy to get them done in order to prosecute a case. Ms. Potts agreed, stating the City of Mesa Prosecutor’s Office experiences similar issues.

Ms. Phillips suggested a good option would be to evaluate the protocols and allow all parties to review and comment. Ms. Ochoa noted a review would help identify issues that are no longer applicable or need to be changed. Ms. St. Peter asked for a motion to recommend approval of the proposed goals for FY 2011. Ms. Del-Colle asked for

clarification on whether or not the recommended changes would be included. Ms. St. Peter advised the goal would be revised to include evaluating protocols for misdemeanor and felony cases". Ms. Del-Colle added bringing prosecutors together to review the goals. Vice Chair Marshall asked for further comments or a motion to approve the goals. Ms. Del-Colle motioned to approve the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council Proposed Goals for FY 2011 with the recommended changes. Ms. Potts seconded the motion. The motion passed.

7. MAG Regional Plan to End Domestic Violence

Rena Tenney, MAG, reported on the progress made in developing the FY 2010 MAG Regional Plan to End Domestic Violence including an update on the Appreciative Inquiry Interview process and community forum. Ms. Tenney said development of a new regional plan to address domestic violence was identified as one of the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council's FY 2010 goals. She acknowledged Saint Luke's Health Initiative for funding the project. Using a strength-based approach to engage the community and access their expertise, the process includes Appreciative Inquiry interviews and a community forum. The goal of the plan is to identify what has been done well and what can be capitalized upon to address domestic violence in the future.

Reporting on progress thus far, Ms. Tenney said the process was launched in October 2009 at the Domestic Violence Press Conference. Interview guides for the Appreciative Inquiry interviews were developed by stakeholders and interviews were conducted between November 2009 and January 2010. Ms. Tenney thanked everyone who has participated in the interview process noting 82 interviews have been completed: 34 from professionals in the field and 43 from survivors of domestic violence. Ms. Tenney gave special recognition to Save the Family, De Colores, Phoenix Family Advocacy Center, and AzCADV SHARE Committee for participation in the survivor interviews.

Ms. Tenney said the information gleaned from interviews will be used for further discussion at the MAG Regional Plan to End Domestic Violence Summit. The Summit will be held on February 24, 2010 from 9:00 a.m. - 3:00 p.m. at the University of Arizona College of Medicine. Ms. Tenney advised there is no fee to attend the summit and parking will be available behind the building as well as at the Arizona Center. Transit tickets will also be provided for those interested in using public transit. Registration information was provided in the meeting handouts.

Ms. Tenney thanked everyone in advance for participation in the AI interview process taking place after the meeting. She encouraged Committee members to attend the Summit and help distribute information about the Summit to community partners.

8. Appreciative Inquiry Interviews

This item was taken out of order to allow Committee members to stay after the meeting to participate in the Appreciative Inquiry Interviews.

Committee members participated in an Appreciative Inquiry interview as part of the development of the FY 2010 MAG Regional Plan to End Domestic Violence.

9. Request for Future Agenda Items

Committee members were asked to provide input on topics or issues of interest that the Regional Domestic Violence Council would like to have considered for discussion at a future meeting.

Ms. St. Peter discussed the idea of creating a community forum or registry to help connect the Domestic Violence Council with agencies who are applying for grant opportunities. She said it would be beneficial to know in advance what other agencies may be doing and this knowledge could lead to further collaboration. Ms. Del-Colle requested a presentation by the Purple Ribbon Council. Ms. Tenney advised contact has been made and representatives will be presenting at a future meeting.

10. Comments from the Council

An opportunity was provided to Committee members to present a brief summary of current events. Larry Grubbs, Arizona Criminal Justice Commission (ACJC), provided an update on the funding status for crime victim assistance. He noted ACJC had sustained another additional \$800,000 budget cut. He said they are awaiting final results before determining what the impact will be for this year and FY 2011.

Mr. Grubbs also discussed efforts by Ken Burbank, Victim Services Program Director, for Pima County. He said Mr. Burbank, acting as a private citizen as well as Director of Victim Services, is putting forth exemplary effort in defense of crime victim assistance funds through a press conference and an editorial piece. Mr. Grubbs encouraged Committee members to support Mr. Burbank's efforts and the defense of victim assistance funds. He said it is important that this issue be at the forefront and thanked everyone for their efforts.

Ms. Ochoa provided the Arizona Law Enforcement Response for Fiscal Year 2009 handout on law enforcement statistics. The handout provides statistics for law enforcement organizations that participated in the report. Ms. Ochoa said the information will also be included in the annual report available on-line in the near future. Vice Chair Marshall invited Committee members to stay after the meeting to participate in the Appreciative Interview process if they had not already done so.

Ms. Tenney informed Committee members the Safety for Kids coloring books are available for anyone interested in taking some with them for distribution at events. Ms. St. Peter acknowledged and thanked the *Arizona Republic* for providing MAG with 10,000 color books free of charge.

11. Adjourn:

The meeting adjourned at 2:43 p.m. The next MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting is scheduled for April 1, 2010 at 1:30 p.m. in the Saguaro Room at the MAG offices.