

**MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
CONTINUUM OF CARE REGIONAL COMMITTEE ON HOMELESSNESS
NOVEMBER 15, 2010 MEETING MINUTES**

MEMBERS ATTENDING:

Shana Ellis, City of Tempe, Councilmember,
Chair
Bob Duvall for Roberto Armijo, Community
Information & Referral Services
*Kathryn Brown, AZ Dept of Corrections
Louise Moskowitz for Kendra Cea, APS
*Krista Cornish, Town of Buckeye
*JoAnn Del-Colle, Phoenix Family Advocacy
Center
Steve Frate, City of Glendale, Vice Mayor
Theresa James, City of Tempe
*Michael Johnson, City of Phoenix,
Councilmember
*Don Keuth, Phoenix Community Alliance
Stephanie Knox, Magellan Health Services of
Arizona
Judith Fritsch for Arizona Department of
Economic Security
*Nick Margiotta, Phoenix Police Department
Michael McQuaid, Human Services Campus
Linda Mushkatel, Maricopa County
Darlene Newsom, UMOM New Day Centers
*Joanne Osborne, City of Goodyear,
Councilmember, Vice Chair
Gina Ramos Montes, City of Avondale
Brenda Robbins, Arizona Dept of Health
Services
Amy Schwabenlender, Valley of the Sun
United Way
Joan Serviss, Arizona Coalition to End
Homelessness
Christina Soto, Catholic Charities
+Jacki Taylor, Save the Family
*Margaret Trujillo, MG Trujillo Associates
*Mary Rose Wilcox, Maricopa County,
Supervisor
Nicky Stevens for Ted Williams, Arizona
Behavioral Health Corporation
Margo Cordova for Diana Yazzie Devine,
Native American Connections

OTHERS PRESENT

Elaine Adamczyk, Glendale Housing
Bill Black, Arizona Organizing Project
Cynthia Brooks, NOVA Safe Haven
Cheryl Brunton, City of Phoenix
Armando Carrillo, Southwest Behavioral Health
Leon Castanio, Jefferson Street Gentlemen's
Association (JSGA)
Estelle Clack, The Salvation Army
+Amy Corriveau, Arizona Department of
Education
Jenny Day, Basic Mission
Dan Demers, Central Arizona Shelter Services
Mark Fair, Arizona Organizing Project
Trish Georgeff, Maricopa County Human
Services
Katie Hobbs, Sojourner Center
Anthony Irby, Department of Veteran Affairs
Kathy Kelley, Tumbleweed
Ted Mabie, Jefferson Street Gentlemen's
Association (JSGA)
Donald McKee, Arizona Organizing Project
Tim McLaughlin, Jefferson Street Gentlemen's
Association (JSGA)
JoEllen McNamara, Home Base
Dottie O'Connell, Chicanos Por la Causa
Greg Perem, Central Arizona Shelter Services
Richard Perez, Jefferson Street Gentlemen's
Association (JSGA)
Marlena Pina, The Salvation Army
Milon Pitts, Homeward Bound
Vicki Rainey, RIAZ
Rosalie Ramos, Women of Wealth
Maria Rodriguez, Basic Mission
Runningdeer, Arizona Organizing Project
Keith Thompson, Phoenix Shanti
Amber Wakeman, City of Tempe
John Wall, Arizona Housing, Inc.
+Chris Wudarski, WINR

Rachel Brito, MAG
Brandee Mead, MAG

Amy St. Peter, MAG

*Those members neither present nor represented by proxy.

+Those members present by audio or videoconference.

1. Call to Order and Introductions

Chair Shana Ellis, City of Tempe, called the meeting to order at 2:07 p.m. Introductions ensued.

2. Call to the Audience

Audience members were given an opportunity to address the Committee. No comments were made.

3. Approval of the October 25, 2010 Continuum of Care Regional Committee on Homelessness Meeting Minutes

Chair Ellis asked for a motion to approve the October 25, 2010, meeting minutes. Mike McQuaid, Human Services Campus, recommended that two changes be made to the minutes. Under item number six, he said 33 of 55 should be 33 of 35; also, under the second paragraph 50th anniversary should be 5th anniversary. Judith Fritsch, Arizona Department of Economic Security, said that the divisional name “CPIP” should be removed after her name as that division does not exist at the Department of Economic Security any longer. A motion to approve the minutes with the recommended changes was made by Vice Mayor Steve Frate, City of Glendale. The motion was seconded by Robert Duvall, Community Information and Referral. The minutes were approved unanimously.

4. Approval of the 2010 Application for HUD McKinney-Vento Homeless Assistance Funding

Chair Ellis invited Brande Mead to provide a report on the 2010 application for HUD McKinney-Vento funding. Ms. Mead thanked the Chair and members of the Committee and began her report. She said the 2010 application for HUD McKinney-Vento funding represents a solution to homelessness for thousands of people within our community. She thanked the service providers, stakeholders, committee members who have all contributed to the application. Ms. Mead reviewed key points within the application.

Ms. Mead said that the consolidated application represents 56 projects from across region totaling \$23.8 million dollars in funding. Three new projects are being recommended this year for \$1.39 million in new permanent supportive housing for homeless individuals and families. Ms. Mead thanked the Ranking and Review Committee members for their time and work spent reviewing and recommending new projects for funding. She stated that all of the projects that came in for new funding were well thought out projects however the Committee feels strongly that the three new projects being recommended will have a good chance in being funded by HUD. The new projects total \$1.39 million in new permanent supportive housing for 35 chronically homeless individuals though collaboration between the Human Services Campus and Arizona Housing Inc., seven disabled families through collaboration between the City of Mesa and Save the Family, and 10 disabled veteran families at UMOM

New Day Centers. Ms. Mead referred members to the complete listing of projects included in their meeting materials.

Ms. Mead summarized the consolidated application funding request stating that \$15.9 million is being requested for permanent supportive housing, \$5.3 million is being requested for transitional housing, \$1 million for a safe haven project, and \$1.4 million for supportive services.

Next, Ms. Mead continued on with an overview of the Exhibit One portion of the consolidated application. She reminded members that the performance objectives were approved at the Continuum meeting in October and thanked everyone who contributed to developing the measures. Ms. Mead guided the focus of the discussion on goal achievement toward meeting HUD's performance standards and setting goals for short and long term performance moving forward. Ms. Mead indicated that this was a challenging year regarding goal achievement for the HUD funded programs. Out of the five areas of focus, the Continuum met its goal in only one area.

In the area of increasing the number of permanent supportive housing beds for chronically homeless, the Continuum exceeded its proposed goal of creating 50 new beds. The Continuum actually created 67 new permanent supportive housing beds for chronically homeless individuals. Ms. Mead referred members to page 35 of the draft application. She explained that there needs to be a correction made to the goals in the draft document. Ms. Mead recommends setting the goal of adding 35 permanent supportive housing beds in the next 12 months for a total of 640 beds in 12 months. For the five and ten year goal, Ms. Mead proposed using the Valley of the Sun United Way's goal of creating 1,000 units by 2015. Of the 1,000 new units, Ms. Mead allocated 250 to the five year goal and 750 by ten years. In summary, the proposed goals are 640 beds in 12 months, 890 beds in five years, and 1,640 beds in ten years. Ms. Mead asked members if they agreed with the proposed goals. Mr. McQuaid commented that he thinks the proposed goals are very realistic and hopes that the community can even create more than they are proposing.

In the area of percent of homeless persons staying in permanent housing for more than six months, the Continuum was slightly below the proposed goal. HUD's national objective in this area is 77 percent, the Continuum is currently at 88 percent, and the goal was 89 percent.

Ms. Mead referred members to the proposed short and long term goals moving forward. The 12 month goal is proposed for 90 percent, the five and ten year goal is proposed for 91 percent. Ms. Mead asked members if they agreed with the proposed goals. Members agreed and there were no comments or questions.

In the area of moving clients from transitional housing to permanent housing, Ms. Mead indicated that the Continuum is not doing well. She referred members to page 39 of the draft application. The 12 month goal for the Continuum was set at 67 percent and the Continuum is currently at 57 percent. Ms. Mead continued that the national objective in this area is 65 percent. Ms. Mead expressed concern that the Continuum is so far below the national objective in this area. Ms. Mead suggested setting the five year goal at 67 percent and the ten

year goal at 70 percent. She asked for comments and feedback on the proposed goals by members.

Linda Mushkatel, Maricopa County, asked if the shortfall in meeting the goals was because of a lack of permanent housing beds for clients. Ms. Mead responded that feedback from transitional housing providers is that clients are having a harder time stabilizing and finding employment which makes it harder for them to move to permanent housing. She continued that the percent of clients employed at exit also dropped which could be tied to moving to permanent housing.

Darlene Newsome, UMOM, commented that many of the transitional housing programs are domestic violence programs. She wondered if the low percentage in this area is because victims of domestic violence are less likely to move to permanent supportive housing programs. Ms. Newsome said that the goal for clients in domestic violence programs may not even be permanent supportive housing. She indicated that she would like to hear from domestic violence providers on where clients most commonly go when they leave the program.

Milon Pitts, Homeward Bound, asked where the percentages are coming number from when determining the number to submit to HUD. Ms. Mead responded that the numbers come directly from the Annual Performance Report (APR) for each HUD funded program. Each transitional housing program reports on the number of clients exiting their program and the destination of clients when they leave the program.

Jacki Taylor agreed with Ms. Newsome that the availability of jobs and jobs that pay livable wages is critical to clients being able to move on to permanent housing. She continued that the economy has impacted the availability of jobs and it is very challenging for clients to obtain employment and therefore move on to permanent housing. She continued that the percent of clients in her program moving to permanent housing is lower than ever and she believes the economy has contributed to the decrease.

Brenda Robbins, Arizona Department of Health Services, asked where clients are exiting to if they are not going into permanent housing. Ms. Taylor responded that many are going to a doubled-up situation where they are sharing housing with family or friends and some aren't exiting in a timely manner. She indicated that she would like to look into that question further to better understand where clients are going when they leave the program. Mr. Pitts commented that clients seem to be staying longer in their program. He said that the average time in the program has gone from 18 months to 30 months time for families to get resources needed to have a sustainable income and move on to permanent housing.

Amy St. Peter, MAG, indicated that she remembers completing the APR when she worked for a transitional housing program and that the percentage is capturing data on the clients that exit the program, not on clients that are still in the program. Also, she added that the percentage reported to HUD includes all permanent housing exits, not just permanent supportive housing. Ms. Newsome suggested that a training session be conducted on correctly completing an APR because there has been some confusion on how to complete the

report correctly. This would ensure that the data going into determining the percentage for the Continuum is accurately reflecting client destinations.

Brandee Mead supported the idea of a workshop on completing the APR and indicated that the suggestion leads nicely into establishing performance objectives in that area. She indicated that there are some transitional housing providers that did very well in transitioning clients from transitional housing to permanent housing. She suggested working with them to conduct training on best practices and providing technical assistance for those programs not doing well. Ms. Mead recommended that this be an area of focus moving forward to improve on this performance measure. She added that doing well in this area will be especially important with the implementation of the HEARTH Act. The bar for performance measures will be raised and as a Continuum, we need to be at the national standard at a minimum. Ms. Robbins agreed that it would be helpful to conduct training on completing the APR. She said that her agency held APR training for another source of federal funding and it was very helpful.

Ms. Mushkatel asked if the performance measures are an average of all the transitional shelters and wondered if some of the low performing programs are pulling down the percentage for all. Ms. Mead indicated that the percentage reported to HUD does reflect all of the programs and that some programs are doing well and some are not. She added that there was a downward trend this year as more programs were below the national objective. Ms. Newsome asked if the percentages were broken down between subpopulations. For example, does the percentage include programs serving homeless youth versus programs serving domestic violence survivors? Ms. Mead indicated that the percentages are not broken down by sub populations. Ms. Mead asked the Committee if they agreed with the 12 month and five year performance objectives proposed. The Committee agreed with the proposed objectives. Ms. Mead confirmed that improving on this area will be an area of focus for next year.

The discussion moved on to increasing percentage of clients employed at program exit, page 41 of the draft application. The goal proposed in the application last year was 34 percent. Currently, 30 percent of clients are employed at program exit. Therefore, the Continuum was three percentage points below our goal. The national objective in this area is 20 percent, so the Continuum is still above national goal, but didn't meet the performance objective. The proposed 12 month goal in this area is 32 percent and the five year goal is proposed at 34 percent and the ten year goal is proposed at 35 percent. Ms. Mead asked for feedback from members on the proposed goals.

Ms. Newsome commented that there is always a percentage of clients that are not going to become employed because of disabilities. She asked if other income is counted in the percentage such as Social Security Income. Ms. Mead responded that HUD only counts employment income in determining this percentage. Discussion ensued on the challenge of obtaining employment in this economy. It was suggested that narrative in the application address the challenges the region faces due to the economy. Members suggested that the 12 month goal be to remain at 30 percent and the five year goal be set at 34 percent, and 35 percent in ten years.

Moving on to decreasing the number of homeless families, Ms. Mead referred members to page 43 of the draft application. She noted corrections that need to be made to the draft application. Ms. Mead explained that the numbers indicated represent the total number of families on the streets and in shelter. However, it should only be reporting the number of families on the street. Instead of 789 families, it should be 47 families. She proposed the 12 month goal be 30 families, housing 17 in the new projects, the five year goals to be 20 families, and the ten year goal be set at five families.

Mr. Duvall commented that the national goal is to eliminate family homelessness in ten years and suggested that this Continuum's ten year goal be zero. Ms. St. Peter responded that staff discussed setting the ten year goal at zero but if there is just one homeless family then the goal will not be achieved. She said that it is difficult to balance between being competitive and setting goals that are achievable. She added that Arizona was hit very hard by the economy and that it will take the State longer to recover from the recession and will be hard to reach a zero family goal. Ms. Robbins agreed that setting the goal at zero would be hard to achieve adding that most of the banks have not put foreclosed properties for sale yet and that will be more families likely to hit the streets when they do. Members suggested explaining the economic situation in the narrative of the application so that HUD is aware of the challenges faced due to the recession. Discussion ensued on setting short and long term goals. The Committee agreed that the 12 month goal should stay at 47 families; the five year goal should be 20 families; and the ten year goal should be five families.

Ms. Mead thanked all the service providers, stakeholders, and committee members involved in the completion of the 2010 HUD McKinney-Vento application. Chair Ellis asked for any public comments on the draft application. There were no additional comments. Ms. Robbins made a motion to approve the 2010 application to HUD with the changes to the performance measures agreed on by members. Theresa James, City of Tempe, seconded the motion and the Committee unanimously approved the 2010 HUD McKinney-Vento application.

5. Update on the Arizona Commission on Homelessness and Housing

Chair Ellis invited Judith Fritsch, Arizona Department of Economic Security, to provide an update on the activity of the Arizona Commission on Homelessness and Housing (ACHH).

Ms. Fritsch thanked the Committee for inviting her to present on the work of the ACHH. She informed the Committee that Governor Brewer signed an Executive Order last year on January 12, 2010 that reinstitutes the Interagency Community Council on Homelessness with some changes. The group is now called the Arizona Commission on Homelessness and Housing, and the Executive Order allows for designees in place of agency Directors. Ms. Fritsch referred members to a copy of the Executive Order handed out as well as information on the charge of the Commission.

The Executive Order states that the Commission serves as a statewide homelessness planning and policy development resource for the Governor and the State of Arizona, oversees the implementation and progress of the Housing Arizona State Plan to prevent and end homelessness, and revise the State Plan as needed. Also it allows the Commission to be

chaired by the Governor, and in his/her absence, to be co-chaired by the Directors of the Department of Economic Security and the Department of Housing, each of whom shall have the power to convene the Commission. The Commission is comprised of at least 13 members and members can designate an alternate to act on their behalf.

Ms. Fritsch provided a briefing document to members of the Committee with additional information on the State Plan, developed under prior Interagency and Community Council on Homelessness, and what this new mission has determined. She said that they have been fortunate in having a quorum at every meeting thus far under the new Executive Order and are currently in working on implementation of six initiatives. Ms. Fritsch referred members of the Committee to a document with the six initiatives of the Commission. The six initiatives are:

1. Develop a joint pre-release discharge planning process;
2. Create a mechanism for state agency applications for funding and awards made for housing or services regarding homelessness;
3. Provide cross-training among benefits specialists;
4. Develop and maintain a statewide inventory of housing stock designated for special populations and paired with some level of support services;
5. Conduct a comprehensive statewide needs assessment and analyze results; and
6. Create a business plan for developing an array of housing and support services to meet the needs of homeless populations in the state.

Small work groups have been developed to focus on implementation of the initiatives. Ms. Fritsch indicated that DES was approved to hire a Homeless State Coordinator to replace Mattie Lord and they hope to have someone in place in that role soon. She invited Continuum of Care members to attend meetings of the Arizona Commission on Homelessness and Housing and added that the next meeting is tomorrow, at 10:00 a.m. at 1717 W. Jefferson. Meetings are open to public.

Chair Ellis thanked Ms. Fritsch for her update on the Commission and asked if there were any questions. There were none.

6. Human Services Campus Five Year Celebration Event

Chair Ellis invited Mike McQuaid, Human Services Campus, to provide a report on the celebration event in honor of the Campus.

Mr. McQuaid said that he is honored to be here representing all the agencies on the Human Services Campus. The Campus did celebrate its' fifth anniversary on Friday, November 5th. He said that the celebration represented the community in its finest as representatives from all sectors were there. He added that the collaboration that exists among the Campus demonstrate what can be done if we work together. Mr. McQuaid thanked the Continuum members for their continued support of the Campus.

Mr. McQuaid offered some Campus statistics:

- On any given day, the Campus serves 1,300 individuals.
- In five years, more than 2,500 people have secured fulltime employment.
- 5,000 people receive mail at the Campus.
- More than 14,500 individuals have received shelter.
- 15,500 individuals have received identification replacements.
- The Campus has served 1.85 million meals.
- More than 1,500 individuals have been housed since the Campus began.

Mr. McQuaid said as the celebration concluded, they focused on where the Campus is going in the next five years. He said that it is the vision of the Campus to provide Permanent Supportive Housing. They are collaborating with Valley of the Sun United Way on their goal to create Permanent Supportive Housing units. He said that achieving 1,000 units of supportive housing will free up many resources at the Campus. Mr. McQuaid ended his report by thanking everyone for their support.

7. Committee Evaluation and Goal Planning

Chair Ellis asked members to provide feedback on the work of the Continuum of Care Committee over the past year. She asked for feedback on what has gone well, what things members would like to see changed, as well as what should be continued.

Chair Ellis suggested forming a small task force to delve into the overall low performance of clients transitioning from transitional housing to permanent housing. The task force would work on improving performance in that area.

There was also discussion on conducting outreach and awareness on developing new and creative permanent supportive housing projects.

A recommendation was made to conduct training on successfully completing the HUD Annual Performance Report (APR).

Ms. Newsome made a motion to proceed with the recommendations for next year as discussed. Ms. Fritsch seconded the motion and it was approved.

8. 2011 Committee Meeting Schedule

Chair Ellis referred members to the draft 2011 meeting schedule provided in the meeting materials packet. She asked members if they had any concerns with the proposed meeting dates. Ms. Fritsch made a motion to approve the draft meeting schedule, Stephanie Knox, Magellan Health Services of Arizona, seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously.

9. Request for Future Agenda Items

Chair Ellis asked for input from the Committee on any requested topics or issues of interest to consider for future agendas.

Ms. Newsome suggested an agenda item on the HUD Family Options Study update. There was also a suggestion to have a report on the Homeless Street Count, since that is taking place in January.

Ms. Fritsch suggested a report on the Season of Service, faith-based activity since February will focus on homelessness.

10. Announcements

Chair Ellis asked for announcements from Committee members. She explained that announcements are for information only.

Nicki Stevens, Arizona Behavioral Health Corporation, commented on the wonderful collaboration between Valley of the Sun United Way, CASS, the Human Services Campus, and Magellan as they were able to assist 50 individuals with housing.

Amy Schwabenlender, Valley of the Sun United Way, announced that there is a Project Connect event in Buckeye on November 16 at First Southern Baptist church. There is also a Project Connect event on December 21, 2010.

She also announced that on December 3, 2010 there will be an information session at Valley of the Sun United Way about the Permanent Supportive Housing Institute they are offering with Corporation for Supportive Housing.

Ms. St. Peter announced that on December 1, 2010 MAG is holding an event on Domestic Violence Promising Practices. National speakers will discuss arresting and prosecuting domestic violence offenders. She said the event is not just for law enforcement and prosecutors but for anyone who works with domestic violence survivors. Ms. St. Peter thanked the Governor's office for the funding for the event.

Ms. Newsome announced that UMOM just opened the first phase of Legacy Crossing, 80 units of below market rate units. She said there would be an open house in January.

John Wall mentioned that Arizona Housing Inc. is scheduled to close on its' third property on Monday. They were able to purchase the property with funds through the City of Phoenix, NRP and HUD McKinney-Vento project funding.

Ms. Fritsch announced that Neil Young, DES Director, announced his resignation today, which will be effective January 1, 2011.

11. Adjourn

The meeting adjourned at 3:36 p.m. The next regular meeting of the Continuum of Care Regional Committee on Homelessness is scheduled for January 24, 2011, at 2:00 in the MAG Saguaro Room.