

Maricopa Association of Governments  
 Elderly Persons and Persons with Disabilities 5310 Transportation Program  
 Ad Hoc Committee Meeting Minutes  
 August 22, 2013

<u>MEMBERS ATTENDING</u>	<u>OTHERS PRESENT</u>
Matt Dudley, City of Glendale, Chair *Julie Howard, City of Mesa Deron Lozano, Valley Metro RPTA, Vice Chair *Christine McMurdy, City of Goodyear Wendy Miller, City of Phoenix Ann Marie Riley, City of Chandler +Kristen Sexton, City of Avondale	Tricia Serlin, City of Scottsdale Miranda Jilek, Lifewell Tiffany Wilkinson, Arizona Spinal Cord Injury Association.  DeDe Gaisthea, MAG Amy St. Peter, MAG  +Present by audio conference. #Present by video conference. *Neither present nor represented by proxy.

1. Welcome and Introductions

Matt Dudley, City of Glendale, Chair, called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. Introductions ensued.

2. Call to the Audience

An opportunity was offered for members of the audience to address the Committee. No comments were made at this time.

3. Approval of the FTA Ad Hoc EPDT Committee July 22-23, 2013 Meeting Minutes

Chair Dudley asked for a motion to approve the July 22-23, 2013 meeting minutes. Deron Lozano, Valley Metro, Vice Chair, made a motion to approve the minutes. Ann Marie Riley, City of Chandler, seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

4. FY 2013 Application Process Update

*(This item was taken after agenda item number seven)*

Chair Dudley invited DeDe Gaisthea, MAG, to provide an overview of the FY 2013 application process. Ms. Gaisthea began by thanking the Committee for their time and dedication to the application review process. She advised the Section 5310 application priority listing was presented to the MAG Human Services Technical Committee (HSTC) on August 8, 2013. She noted the priority listing presented to the HSTC Committee did not include the City of Phoenix Disability Empowerment Center (DEC) project at the city's request. Ms. Gaisthea noted the City of Phoenix recently contacted MAG stating they would like to reconsider accepting funding for the DEC project. She noted the EPDT Committee included the DEC project in the evaluation process and the project was previously included the priority ranking. Ms. Gaisthea advised the revised priority ranking will include the DEC project and will be presented to the MAG HSTC, the MAG Management Committee, and offered to the MAG Regional Council for final recommendation in September.

Ms. Gaisthea noted the Section 5307 Job Access and Reverse Commute (JARC) priority listing went before the MAG Transit Committee and was unanimously approved for recommendation. The priority listings will proceed through the MAG approval process for final approval by the MAG Regional Council. Ms. Gaisthea noted a comment from the MAG Transit Committee regarding the evaluation process was that funding was prioritized not based on the evaluation of the project, but that all projects were funded overall. Chair Dudley commented he informed the MAG Transit Committee the approach of the MAG EPDT Committee is to ensure that all eligible projects that meet the requirements receive funding. He noted the MAG Transit Committee suggested conducting the evaluation process for Section JARC program.

Ms. Miller expressed concern the method to be used by the MAG Transit Committee for rating the JARC projects to take into consideration the nonprofits to ensure they are not at a disadvantage. She discussed the approach used for funding 5310 applicants to ensure that everyone receives some funding including government agencies and nonprofits and inquired whether the method for ranking 5310 applicants should be reconsidered. Chair Dudley agreed with the need to bring awareness to the nonprofit eligibility component for JARC funding. Ms. Gaisthea noted the MAG Transit Committee also expressed concerns regarding JARC funding for nonprofits and noted their interest in having the EPDT Committee participate in the coordination efforts for JARC to ensure nonprofits are not at a disadvantage. The MAG Transit Committee suggested for the Chair and Vice Chair of the EPDT Committee to be included in coordination efforts for the JARC program.

5. Development of a Priority Listing of Rural Section 5310 FTA Enhanced Mobility of Seniors and Persons With Disabilities Transportation Program applicants

*This item was taken after agenda item number three.*

Chair Dudley invited DeDe Gaisthea, MAG, to provide an overview of the priority listing of rural MAG region applicants for Section 5310 FTA Enhanced Mobility of Seniors and Persons with Disabilities Transportation Program to be forwarded to the Arizona Department of Transportation for submission to the Federal Transit Administration. Ms. Gaisthea advised staff MAG was notified by the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) there was one application from the MAG region outside of the urban area applying for Section 5310 through ADOT. She noted that while the agency is outside of the Phoenix/Mesa Urbanized Area (UZA), it is within the MAG planning area and would need to be evaluated by the MAG EPDT Committee.

Ms. Gaisthea noted ADOT received one rural application from PEP Encompass for the MAG region. The PEP Encompass application was previously forwarded to the Committee for review. Ms. Gaisthea advised ADOT had previously stated there were three additional applications however, they have confirmed the three applicants are included within the Central Arizona Association of Governments (CAAG) Coordination Plan. Ms. Gaisthea noted the PEP Encompass application is being submitted through the ADOT Section 5310 rural program. ADOT is including all rural and smaller urbanized areas application in the statewide application. ADOT is seeking input as the applicant has participated in the MAG region and is listed in the coordination plan. Ms. St. Peter clarified funding is awarded through ADOT funding, not MAG region funding. It was noted there were no other

applications competing for funding through the ADOT 5310 award program in the MAG rural area. Ms. Gaisthea concluded her presentation.

Chair Dudley questioned whether Committee members have had the opportunity to review the PEP Encompass application and whether there were any questions. It was noted the application is a request for one cut-away vehicle with lift to replace a previous vehicle. No further discussion ensued. Chair Dudley requested a motion from the Committee. Wendy Miller, City of Phoenix, motioned to approve the priority listing of PEP Encompass for the rural MAG region applicant for Section 5310 FTA Enhanced Mobility of Seniors and Persons with Disabilities Transportation Program to be forwarded to the Arizona Department of Transportation for submission to the Federal Transit Administration. Kristen Sexton, City of Avondale, seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

6. Committee Review of the FY 2013 Application Process

Chair Dudley welcomed Ms. Gaisthea to offer an overview of the FY 2013 application process. Ms. Gaisthea advised the 2013 process included a Committee evaluation of the Section 5310 traditional capital projects, New Freedom eligible projects, and include the Section 5307 JARC application requests. The Committee reviewed a total of 38 applications and heard applicant presentations over a two-day period. Ms. Gaisthea referred the Committee to the application materials provided in the handouts noting the Committee's request to further discuss the application process and possible new evaluation methods for next year.

Chair Dudley opened the topic for discussion. Ms. Miller addressed the Committee with a suggestion to forward the 5307 Job Access Reverse Commute (JARC) application process to the Transit Committee with the assistance of MAG staff. She noted removing JARC from the application process would simplify the process. Chair Dudley requested clarification on whether there would be two separate applications and applicant requests for Sections 5310 and 5307 if the JARC evaluation were not to be included in next years process. Ms. Gaisthea confirmed the process would require two separate applications. Ms. Miller noted the 5307 JARC process moving forward would be completely separate from the 5310 process.

Ms. Miller stated the MAG EPDT Committee would provide guidance on how to move forward with 5307 JARC but would not conduct any review or guidance on the applications. Ms. Miller noted JARC projects are not required to participate in regional coordination plans. Ms. Gaisthea noted MAG staff will assist in the coordination of the 5307 JARC application process to include Committee member's feedback. Ms. Miller added the competitive process, although traditionally open to municipalities, would remain open to nonprofits to compete for JARC funding. Chair Dudley inquired whether the timeline would remain the same noting the importance of keeping nonprofits informed of the timeframe for both application processes. Ms. Gaisthea noted the processes have historically coincided. She added the goal is to keep the communication and coordination a collaborative effort.

Chair Dudley shifted attention to 5310 grant application and requested input from the Committee on the application processes moving forward. He shared a report from the University of Montana on best practices for the 5310 program. The *Section 5310*

*Transportation State Management Plans: A Baseline Review* report was published in the Journal of Public Transportation in 2011. Chair Dudley offered to share the report with Ms. Gaisthea for distribution to the Committee for review and consideration moving forward. Input was requested from the committee on other recommendations for moving forward. Ms. Miller addressed the Committee regarding the application timeline noting the goal is to have the application process in place by late January or February. Chair Dudley suggested a working group of committee volunteers to meet to review and revise the 5310 grant application. He suggested also requesting that nonprofits provide feedback on the application process to obtain their perspective.

Ms. Miller suggested having an after action review that would include all nonprofits and allow them the opportunity to provide feedback. She suggested the Committee could then meet again to thoroughly review and provide input to the application line by line. Ms. Miller noted previous suggestions to review applications separately by project type such as mobility management, vehicles and operating assistance. Additional feedback was shared on the eligibility criteria to ensure it is accurate and up to date and the possibility of assigning mobility managers to a sub-region for more than one year. The Committee briefly discussed how funding would be applicable for a two-year period. It was noted that agencies starting a new process could be assured funding availability for at least a two-year period.

Chair Dudley noted the need to define mobility management needs and role for the region and sub-region moving forward. Ms. Gaisthea advised ADOT will be hosting a state-wide mobility management workshop in September. She noted to contact ADOT to request the region's sub-mobility managers to also be included in the workshop. The committee further discussed the need to be specific in terms of what is needed on the application to assist agencies in providing the proper information. Vice Chair Lozano addressed the Committee regarding the need to review the evaluation process specifically in terms of weighting for coordination and participation at TAP events. Chair Dudley agreed on the need to update the evaluation form. Ms. Miller inquired about the need to establishing a regional priority that would be included in the transportation plan that would address the region's priority.

Ms. Gaisthea advised as requested the *State Management Plan* report will be forwarded to Committee members. She summarized the discussion points for the City of Phoenix to schedule an after action meeting with applicants, and MAG to set up a workgroup meeting to work on the next application, and to weigh separate criteria for participation in coordination efforts. She noted it was recommended the next year's evaluation process to not include the 5307 JARC process. Ms. Miller inquired about the timeline for scheduling an after action review with applicants and whether the Committee would like to be included in the process. Chair Dudley noted two separate meetings are needed, the City of Phoenix's after action review and a smaller workgroup to provide feedback for the 2014 Section 5310 application. Ms. Miller noted to follow-up with further details for an after action meeting in October that will also include the Committee's participation. Ms. Gaisthea noted a workgroup meeting will be schedule after the after action meeting.

Chair Dudley hearing no further discussion requested a motion. Vice Chair Lozano requested clarification on the motion. Chair Dudley clarified the recommendation for the FY 2014

process to not include the Section 5310 JARC. Ms. Miller motioned to recommend the FY 2014 evaluation process not to include Section 5307 JARC. Vice Chair Lozano seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

7. Committee Meeting Schedule

Chair Dudley requested discussing the committee application timeline and review process. Ms. Gaisthea advised the Committee has generally met in January however, the Committee has noted the benefits of beginning the process earlier. The Committee noted it was suggestion was for a workgroup to meet after the City of Phoenix's after action meeting to review and provided input for the 2014 Section 5310 application. Ms. Gaisthea noted the Committee meets three times for the Section 5310 evaluation process. She noted the meetings included, to review the evaluation process, to provide training and to receive the applications, to hear presentation from applicants and develop a priority listing. Ms. Gaisthea noted due to changes in the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) 5310 program an fourth meeting was scheduled to review the application process.

Ms. McMurdy commented it would be beneficial for the Committee to meet before January if there were any new federal changes to the Section 5310 programs. No further discussed ensued. Chair Dudley called for a motion for the Committee meeting schedule. Ms. Miller motioned for the FY 2014 Committee meeting schedule to meet four times including the application review meeting with an option for a fifth meeting if necessary due to FTA changes in the Section 5310 program. Vice Chair Deron Lozano seconded the motion. The motion passed.

8. Request for Future Agenda Items

Chair Dudley requested input on items to be addressed at future meetings. No input was received.

9. Comments from the Committee

Chair Dudley acknowledged Ms. Gaisthea and Ms. Miller for their efforts and involvement in coordinating the awards program. Ms. Gaisthea commented that MAG Committee members will be forwarded information on the new language in the MAG policies and procedures pertaining to quorum. The Committee briefly discussed the current representation on the Committee. The Committee requested MAG staff to inquire into additional representation for the East Valley and to explore including a nonprofit representative.

10. Adjourn

The meeting adjourned at 11:20 p.m.