

MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS  
HUMAN SERVICES COORDINATING COMMITTEE  
MEETING MINUTES  
JANUARY 26, 2011

| <u>MEMBERS ATTENDING</u>  | <u>OTHERS PRESENT</u>   |
|---|---|
| <p>*Arleen Chin, Tempe Community Council<br/> Vice Mayor Trinity Donovan, Chandler,<br/> Chair</p> <p>*Councilmember Dennis Kavanaugh, City<br/> of Mesa</p> <p>Mayor Marie Lopez Rogers, City of<br/> Avondale</p> <p>+Councilmember Manuel Martinez, City of<br/> Glendale</p> <p>+Councilmember Michael Nowakowski,<br/> City of Phoenix, Vice Chair</p> <p>*JoAnne Osborne, Councilmember, City of<br/> Goodyear</p> <p>Councilmember John Sentz, Town of<br/> Gilbert</p> <p>*Supervisor Mary Rose Wilcox, Maricopa<br/> County</p> <p>Councilmember Mike Woodard, City of<br/> Surprise</p> | <p>Sylvia Sheffield, City of Avondale<br/> Clinton Maxwell, Nina Mason Pulliam</p> <p>Rachel Brito, MAG<br/> DeDe Gaisthea, MAG<br/> Brande Mead, MAG<br/> Amy St. Peter, MAG</p> <p>+Those members present by<br/> audio/videoconferencing.</p> <p>*Those members neither present nor<br/> represented by proxy.</p> |

1. Call to Order  
Chair Trinity Donovan called the meeting to order at 10:10 a.m. Introductions ensued.
2. Call to the Audience  
An opportunity was provided for members of the public to address the Committee. No public comments were made.
3. Approval of the October 20, 2010 Meeting Minutes  
Chair Donovan called for a motion to approve the October 20, 2010, meeting minutes. Councilmember John Sentz, Town of Gilbert, motioned to approve the minutes. Vice Chair Michael Nowakowski, City of Phoenix, seconded the motion. The motion passed.
4. Legislative Update  
Chair Donovan introduced Timothy Schmaltz, Protecting Arizona’s Family Coalition, to offer an update on legislative activities. Mr. Schmaltz said the legislature has only been in session for a short period with most of the focus during the first week centered on the tragic events that occurred in Tucson. The second week focused on the Arizona Health Care Cost Containment System (AHCCCS) waiver. He noted an estimated 800 bills ready to be filed; some of which relate to health and human services. Additionally, he noted many

unanticipated bills that have not received a lot of attention may have huge implications on narrowly defined populations.

Mr. Schmaltz recalled Proposition 204, which raised the AHCCCS eligibility to 100 percent of poverty level, passed in 2000. He said the waiver will eliminate AHCCCS coverage for 280,000 people. The proposed reduction to AHCCCS would save the state \$542 million. Total Arizona health care expenditures range from \$27 to \$30 billion of which AHCCCS equals one-third. Two arguments opposing the waiver refer to capacity and elimination of 12,000 jobs, including many high-level positions. Mr. Schmaltz advised the Senate and House passed the waiver with a 21-9 and 40-20 vote respectively. He said many people who voted in favor are second-guessing their decision as they begin to see the affects it will have within their communities and in rural areas. Hearings are scheduled for February 1-2, 2011. Mr. Schmaltz encouraged everyone, in whatever manner possible, to voice how communities will be affected and how much would be lost.

An Arizona Department of Economic Security (DES) stakeholder meeting was held Friday during which attendees were informed there would be no further service reductions. Mr. Schmaltz said part of the concern is that the state is currently one of six states whose caseloads have decreased noting Temporary Assistance for Needy Families (TANF) caseloads are down 47 percent; 20,000 children lost child care services; and 100 percent of domestic violence and child abuse cases are not being investigated. While there will be no other service reductions, the state is already at a very low level of service. Mr. Schmaltz said the Department of Health Services (DHS), as part of a larger AHCCCS proposal, would eliminate services for 5,200 individuals with Serious Mental Illness (SMI). There are 29,000 individuals with general mental health issues that would also be eliminated. He said many of these individuals would qualify as SMI, but do not want to be labeled as such in order to receive services offered to individuals with SMI.

New members of the House of Representatives have posted a list of proposed federal reductions targeting all areas except for defense. Mr. Schmaltz noted President Obama's statements regarding a freeze on spending will have an impact on health and human services. He noted the number of people requesting service at the Human Services Campus continues to grow and the Arizona Coalition to End Homelessness reports the number of homeless families also continues to grow. He said there are no substantial discussions regarding alternatives to AHCCCS reductions other than to implement a provider tax. Doing so would draw raise revenue through on a bed tax. Therefore a hospital serving Medicaid patients would gain money, reduce cuts, save jobs, and save capacity. However, those hospitals that do not serve Medicaid patients would still be required to pay a bed tax but would not receive any of the funding raised through the tax.

Mr. Schmaltz noted discussions regarding tax exemptions. He said taxes on attorneys and on alcohol would raise a significant amount of money. He said the alcohol tax in Arizona is significantly lower than the national average and many states tax rates are above the national average. Mr. Schmaltz concluded his general summary. He advised PAFCO opposes the AHCCCS budget cuts and again urged everyone to participate in the upcoming hearings.

Ms. St. Peter asked Mr. Schmaltz to address the possible elimination of Community Development Block Grant funding. Mr. Schmaltz said it is unlikely the CDBG program would be eliminated and noted the strength in people speaking up in support of these programs.

Councilmember Manuel Martinez, City of Glendale, asked for further clarification on Arizona being one of only six states who have decreased TANF. Mr. Schmaltz said the primary reason is due to changes in eligibility requirements. He said the recent changes in July reduced the eligibility period from 60 months to 36 months; pushing 10,000 people off of TANF.

Mayor Marie Lopez Rogers, City of Avondale, said President Obama's State of the Union speech discussed eliminating CDBG and SSBG. She said the National League of Cities is urging everyone to not only contact their representatives but also the President's administration to oppose the President's administration being the first to introduce these budget reductions. She noted another specific target is Community Action Programs. Mayor Rogers noted individuals living in poverty often do not vote, are the most affected, and do not realize how their vote can make a difference. Mr. Schmaltz said the City of Phoenix's decision to implement a food tax was a difficult decision. He stressed there are decision that need to be made, such as taxing beer and alcohol that will contribute to the economy and help to maintain a safety net.

Mayor Rogers addressed the need to hold people accountable by naming the individuals who sponsor these bills. She said the City of Avondale has begun doing this at their Council meetings and staff is tracking legislation to keep the Council up to date. She encouraged other cities to do the same. Chair Donovan thanked Mr. Schmaltz and Committee members for their input.

##### 5. Social Services Block Grant Allocation Recommendation Process

Chair Donovan said one of the functions of HSCC has been to recommend service allocations for the Social Services Block Grant. HSCC approved the process to develop the allocations at the meeting in October. The MAG Human Services Technical Committee has been developing the allocation recommendations for the Social Services Block Grant through that approved process. Chair Donovan invited Sylvia Sheffield, Chair of the Human Services Technical Committee, to report on the recommendations developed.

Ms. Sheffield thanked the Committee for the opportunity to offer the allocation recommendations developed by the HSTC. She advised allocations were developed on the basis of research, a service ranking exercise, and the funding formula used in previous years. Research into demographics, service levels, and need was conducted through the fact sheets approved at the end of last year. Additionally, fact sheets were completed for each of the four target groups: Older Adults; People with Disabilities; People with Developmental Disabilities; and Adults, Families, and Children.

Ms. Sheffield said the service ranking was completed in November by 26 Committee members and community partners. The results are reported by HSTC and HSCC Committee

members, by community partners, and the total combined. Service ranking results identified the five groups used in the funding formula. The highest ranked services received a 20 percent funding increase. The second highest ranked services received a 10 percent increase. The third group was held harmless and funding did not change. The fourth group of services received a ten percent decrease and the last group received a 20 percent decrease in funding from last year's allocation.

Ms. Sheffield noted of the services in the highest ranked category, all four are from the Adults, Children, and Families target group and focus on emergency services and basic needs. The seven services in the second group receiving a ten percent increase are from three target groups: Older Adults; Persons with Disabilities; and Adults, Families, and Children. All four target groups are represented in the third group. These services did not receive an increase or decrease in funding. All target groups except Adults, Families, and Children are included in the fourth group to receive a ten percent decrease in funding. Persons with Disabilities and Persons with Developmental Disabilities make up the services in the last group receiving a 20 percent reduction in funding.

Ms. Sheffield advised nearly \$59,000 is being redirected to the services having the highest priority in the region. She noted last year, funding for transportation services was redirected to other human services in an effort to mitigate funding reductions to human services programs. She said at that time, funding for transportation services was more readily available. Recognizing that funding for transportation services has been significantly reduced in the last year, HSTC considered funding transportation services again. However, the decision was made to not recommend this action because funding for human services programs has also been significantly reduced and transportation is considered a lower priority than crisis services. Ms. Sheffield concluded her presentation.

Chair Donovan thanked Ms. Sheffield for the work completed by HSTC. Councilmember Sentz inquired about the overall funding. Ms. St. Peter advised the baseline for funding remains the same and nearly \$59,000 is being recommended for reallocation to higher priority services however the overall funding has remained the same. Councilmember Sentz questioned whether or not the Committee is doing a disservice by not funding transportation services. Ms. Sheffield advised Section 5310 funding supports services from the Social Services Block Grant. Ms. St. Peter noted agencies providing transportation services are not expecting to receive funding from SSBG as funding had been eliminated the previous year. As such, these services have looked to other sources of funding or fundraising. The Committee therefore agreed it would be more advantageous to increase funding for other high priority services.

Chair Donovan advised allocation recommendations will be released for public review and comment. If any feedback is submitted that warrants consideration of significant changes, HSTC and HSCC will reconvene. Otherwise, any feedback will be forwarded to the MAG Management Committee and Regional Council in February. Allocation recommendations are due to DES by March. Mayor Rogers asked what changes would occur should there be significant reductions in federal level funding. Ms. St. Peter advised if faced with reduction

the Committee would reconvene to review options which may include reducing funding levels across the board or adjusting the funding formula.

Chair Donovan asked for a motion from the Committee. Councilmember Woodard made a motion to recommend the draft Social Services Block Grant allocation recommendations for public comment and approval. Mayor Rogers seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously. Chair Donovan thanked the Committee, Ms. Sheffield, and HSTC for their time and support of these efforts.

6. MAG Human Services Coordination Transportation Plan Update

Chair Donovan advised MAG develops and updates plans to coordinate human services transportation each year. She invited DeDe Gaisthea, MAG to share the highlights of the new plan. Ms. Gaisthea thanked the Committee for the opportunity to present the draft FY 2012 MAG Human Services Coordination Transportation Plan. She acknowledged the City of Phoenix for continued financial support of human services coordination planning efforts and the many human services transportation stakeholders who provided valuable input and feedback for the plan and helped develop the strategies.

Ms. Gaisthea advised the MAG HSTC has recommended approval of the plan. MAG has developed plans to coordinate human services transportation in response to Safe Accountable, Flexible, and Efficient Transportation Equity Act: A Legacy for Users (SAFETEA-LU) federal legislation since 2007. MAG updates the plan yearly, although not required to do so, to enable potential agencies to apply for federal funding. Ms. Gaisthea said there has been an increase of grantees from 13 agencies in 2009 to 19 last year.

Ms. Gaisthea advised the plan presents strategies developed with input from stakeholders to address gaps within the region which are consistent with the United We Ride goals:

- Providing more rides for the targeted population(s) for the same or fewer resources
- Simplify customer access to transportation
- Increase customer satisfaction

The goal of the strategies is to continue coordination efforts and utilize available resources in the community. Additionally, the plan has five short-term strategies with two of them a continuation of the previous years and one long-term strategy:

Short-term Strategies

1. Identify and implement additional opportunities to coordinate with Title VI stakeholders. (minorities, people with low-income and female head of households)
2. Enhance the MAG Transportation Ambassador Program to include additional private sector representatives, Native Communities, and coordination with communities adjacent to this region.

3. Map domestic violence and homeless shelter clients' travel needs and organize collaborative services among the shelters to support employment and work-preparation activities. This builds on the strategy from the FY 2011 Plan Update to research the transportation needs of shelter clients.
4. Inventory agencies with vehicle downtime to include times and days when agency vehicles are available. This activity builds on the agency matching strategy from the FY 2011 plan and enhances opportunities for collaboration.
5. Research opportunities to resolve insurance as a barrier to volunteer opportunities and the use of agency vehicles for collaboration.

#### Long-Term Strategy

1. Research the development of a coordinated volunteer drivers program on a regional basis. Inventory volunteer programs, research partnerships with faith-based communities, provide training for volunteer drivers and the agencies that work with them and centralize information about programs and opportunities online.

Ms. Gaisthea concluded her presentation and asked for questions or comments from the Committee. Having no input, Chair Donovan asked for a motion from the Committee. A motion was made by Councilmember Sentz to recommend approval of the FY 2012 MAG Human Services Coordination Transportation Plan Update. Vice Chair Nowakowski seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

#### 7. Human Services Funding Reduction Study

Chair Donovan advised HSTC has been diligently working on a study about the impact of human services funding reductions. In January, the Committee requested staff reframe the report in a more qualitative context given the impact of new data received. She invited Ms. St. Peter to offer an update on progress made.

Ms. St. Peter advised HSTC has been working on the study which began last spring. There were three phases to the project which included key informant interviews, a review of the cities' and towns' budgets to determine changes in the Human Services line items, and a survey of HSCC, HSTC and community partners to identify what impacts had occurred and how human services is defined and funded. Based on all three functions, a report was prepared and presented to HSTC. Ms. St. Peter advised quality assurance checks were conducted and the Committee was advised the report would be brought back to them if there were changes in the data.

Ms. St. Peter advised additional data provided a better understanding but changed the report significantly. She advised upon review of the budgets, it was difficult to clearly identify human services related funding because municipalities record this funding in different areas. In some cases, human services funding is included in budgets for parks and recreation or libraries. She noted from a review of the budgets, it appeared one city did not provide human services funding when in fact it does. In another situation, an influx of federal funding

increased human services funding dramatically. This new information posed the question of whether or not to establish a baseline which includes federal funding. She said another concern is how human services is defined, noting for example, one city includes early childhood development programs in human services funding while other cities do not.

Additionally, Ms. St. Peter said that some cities reflecting an increase in funding also reported a significant increase in the service delivery area. While a review of the budget would suggest an increase in funding, the increased service delivery area means the workload and staff needed to accommodate the work increased as well, resulting in net effect that remained level for the budget. Based on these findings, staff suggested to not use the budget data provided in the report. HSTC requested staff review the surveys taking a more qualitative approach. As requested, staff has been reviewing the data provided by 13 cities out of 25 in the region. Those 13 cities represent 86 percent of the region's population. This makes the data more representative of what is happening in the region. Ms. St. Peter advised this information is being reported to HSCC to request feedback on the direction of the survey.

Chair Donovan opened the discussion for input and feedback from the Committee. Councilmember Sentz expressed agreement in using a standard or consistent baseline as opposed to one which includes one-time federal funding. He noted survey responses representing 86 percent of the population will provide a good set of data. He acknowledged HSTC and staff for their efforts on this study. Chair Donovan inquired about next steps for the study. Ms. St. Peter said the revised study will be presented to HSTC in February and brought back to HSCC in April. Chair Donovan and Committee members expressed agreement with moving forward as discussed.

#### 8. Committee Outcome Measures

Chair Donovan thanked the Committee for their input on the work they would like to pursue in the next fiscal year. She said, in October, HSCC approved areas of focus for FY 2012. Since then, staff has developed outcomes measures according to those areas of focus. She invited Ms. St. Peter to provide an update on the outcome measures. Ms. St. Peter advised the goals represent human services planning, transportation, public involvement, and Environmental Justice. She advised the goals synthesize feedback from HSTC and HSCC. Ms. St. Peter advised the draft outcome measures are included in the MAG FY 2012 Unified Planning Work Program and requested feedback from the Committee.

Councilmember Sentz recommended developing more specific objectives and timeframes for the outcome measures. He offered to work with Ms. St. Peter and proposed bringing back the outcome measures to the Committee for action. Chair Donovan noted the outcome measures could benefit from further clarification and timeframes and thanked Councilmember Sentz for his input. Ms. St. Peter asked for clarification on whether the request is to fine-tune the current goals or to include additional activities above and beyond what has been presented. Vice Chair Nowakowski recalled having been invited to different centers and on different tours. He said individuals in state leadership positions have not had those experiences and therefore may not fully understand the need. He asked how those experiences can be created for the State leadership who is making funding decisions that affect homeless shelters,

domestic violence shelters, and other human service providers so they may see the need for themselves.

Ms. St. Peter advised homeless immersion experiences were offered a few years ago allowing Councilmembers to spend the night being homeless. She suggested the possibility of forming such a program that can be offered. Chair Donovan said this opportunity would offer an opportunity to change one's mindset. She suggested having a variety of locations available as options where the impact can be seen. Vice Chair Nowakowski said individuals may be more open to participation if the timeframe is limited to one-half hour to an hour as opposed to an entire night. Chair Donovan suggested looking at how this could be planned including working with cities and people who are already receiving funding. She also suggested the possibility of working with Valley of the Sun United way to identify the points that need to be addressed. Councilmember Sentz suggested adding this effort as one of the goals. Outcome measures could include how many locations are visited within one year and how many elected officials will participate.

Vice Chair Nowakowski requested a fact sheet be created that provides information on current bills and who is supporting them or a fact sheet from PAFCO on legislative activities. He suggested this information can be used to share with and encourage colleagues to support human services. Mayor Rogers addressed the Committee regarding site visits. She recommended targeting the leadership and committee chairs. The outcome measure would target those key positions that would affect human services. Chair Donovan noted the need for flexibility on what locations are available. She said the Human Services Campus would be beneficial for anyone to see regardless of their location as it affects the entire state. She cautioned against services being labeled as a "Phoenix issue", or being exclusive to any one city or town.

Mayor Rogers requested input on how to increase public involvement specifically as it relates to voting. She questioned the most effective method suggesting website, media, or through a MAG story. Councilmember Woodard recommended public cable television noting many cities or towns televise their meetings. Chair Donovan noted as MAG develops these opportunities the HSCC will then have the responsibility to disseminate the information. She summarized recommendations for staff to work with Councilmember Sentz to add the new goals. She asked for a motion from the Committee. Councilmember Sentz made a motion to continue this item on the April 27, 2011 agenda with the specific recommendations to add additional target areas and bring back specific goals for the Committee to review and approve. Mayor Lopez Rogers seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

9. CY 2011 Committee Meeting Calendar

Chair Donovan advised as a Committee operating under Open Meeting Law, it is imperative to have quorum in order to meet and take action. In October, HSCC reviewed the meeting calendar for 2011 and directed staff to poll Committee members to ensure dates and times scheduled would most likely secure quorum. Staff revised the meeting calendar based on feedback received. Chair Donovan directed Committee members to the revised calendar. She requested a motion from the Committee.

Councilmember Mike Woodard, City of Surprise, thanked the Committee for changing the meeting time noting greater ease when driving in from the West Valley. Vice Chair Nowakowski made a motion to approve the CY 2011 MAG Human Services Coordinating Committee calendar. Councilmember Woodard seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

#### 10. Committee Updates

Chair Donovan said counterparts on other human services committees at MAG have been engaged in important efforts. She invited representatives to offer reports on their activities.

##### *MAG Continuum of Care Regional Committee on Homelessness*

Brande Mead, MAG, expressed gratitude to the cities and towns for their participation in the annual street count. Results of the count will be provided once all data have been collected. Ms. Mead said the count is part of a nationwide effort to count individuals and families living on the streets and in shelters to ensure the region is able to secure federal funding for people experiencing homelessness. Highlighting the importance of the annual street count as part of the application process, Ms. Mead advised \$22.5 million was received from HUD this year. She noted a major change in the count this year that requires volunteers to count the number of veterans as well as chronically homeless people in an effort to secure additional funding for these target groups. Chair Donovan thanked Ms. Mead for her efforts and acknowledged the City of Phoenix for the great work they do on the annual street count.

##### *MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council*

Ms. St. Peter reported a very successful Protocol Evaluation Project Promising Practices Roundtable event was held on December 1, 2011. The focus of the PEP is to review the protocols in place for arresting and prosecuting domestic violence offenders. The event was attended by representatives from law enforcement, prosecution, victim advocates, community partners and survivors. A significant impact was made by local and national speakers and survivors who shared their stories. Speakers included representatives from Arizona State University's Diane Halle Center for Family Justice; O'Connor House, Avon Program for Women and Justice; the Phoenix Police Department; King County, Washington; Blueprint for Safety, St. Paul, Minnesota; Domestic Violence Reduction Unit, Portland, Oregon; and Lieutenant Mark Wynn, Retired Police Lieutenant/Consultant, Nashville, Tennessee.

Ms. St. Peter advised staff continues to evaluate the protocols and has narrowed the focus to two specific areas including evidence collection and victim involvement. The end result of the project will offer resources, streamline the process to make efforts more cost effective, and provide a better outcome for victims of domestic violence. A stakeholder group meeting is scheduled for January 27, 2011 at 2:00 p.m.

##### *MAG Elderly and Individuals with Disabilities Transportation Program Ad Hoc Committee*

DeDe Gaisthea reported the 2011 Grant Application Workshop for Section 5310 Elderly Persons and Persons with Disabilities programs, (5316) Job Access Reverse and (5317) Commute New Freedom is scheduled for Wednesday February 2, 2011 at 10:00 a.m. at the MAG offices in the Saguaro Room. The Section 5310 application deadline is Friday, March

4, 2011, to the MAG office by Noon. Late applications will not be accepted. Ms. Gaisthea advised she is available to provide technical assistance and may be reached at (602) 452-5062 or by email at [dgaisthea@azmag.gov](mailto:dgaisthea@azmag.gov)

11. Request for Future Agenda Items

Committee members were given an opportunity to suggest topics or issues of interest for discussion at a future meeting. There were no requests from the Committee.

12. Comments from the Committee

An opportunity was provided for HSCC members to present a brief summary of current events. Councilmember Sentz requested future legislative updates be provided in summary form or through a written report to allow sufficient time to address other topics on the agenda. The meeting adjourned 11:24 a.m. The next Human Services Coordinating Committee meeting is scheduled for April 27, 2011, in the MAG Cholla Room.