

**MINUTES OF THE
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
REGIONAL COUNCIL MEETING**

February 26, 2014
MAG Office, Saguaro Room
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

Mayor Scott Smith, Mesa, Chair	Mayor Rebecca Jimenez, Guadalupe
Mayor Michael LeVault, Youngtown, Vice Chair	Mayor Thomas Schoaf, Litchfield Park
* Vice Mayor Robin Barker, Apache Junction	# Mayor Christian Price, City of Maricopa
Mayor Marie Lopez Rogers, Avondale	* Supervisor Steve Chucuri, Maricopa County
Mayor Jackie Meck, Buckeye	* Mayor Scott LeMarr, Paradise Valley
Councilmember Mike Farrar, Carefree	# Councilmember Cathy Carlat, Peoria
Councilmember Reginald Monachino, Cave Creek	Mayor Greg Stanton, Phoenix
# Mayor Jay Tibshraeny, Chandler	* Supervisor Todd House, Pinal County
Mayor Lana Mook, El Mirage	Mayor Gail Barney, Queen Creek
Mayor Tom Rankin, Florence	* President Diane Enos, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community
* President Ruben Balderas, Fort McDowell Yavapai Nation	* Mayor W. J. "Jim" Lane, Scottsdale
Mayor Linda Kavanagh, Fountain Hills	* Mayor Sharon Wolcott, Surprise
* Mayor Steven Holt, Gila Bend	Mayor Mark Mitchell, Tempe
* Governor Gregory Mendoza, Gila River Indian Community	* Mayor Adolfo Gamez, Tolleson
Mayor John Lewis, Gilbert	Mayor John Cook, Wickenburg
Mayor Jerry Weiers, Glendale	Jack Sellers, State Transportation Board
# Mayor Georgia Lord, Goodyear	Joseph La Rue, State Transportation Board
	Roc Arnett, Citizens Transportation Oversight Committee

* Those members neither present nor represented by proxy.

Attended by telephone conference call.

+ Attended by videoconference

1. Call to Order

The meeting of the MAG Regional Council was called to order by Chair Scott Smith at 11:34 a.m.

2. Pledge of Allegiance

The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Councilmember Cathy Carlat, Mayor Georgia Lord, Mayor Christian Price, and Mayor Jay Tibshraeny joined the meeting via teleconference.

Chair Smith introduced Mr. Jack Sellers as the new State Transportation Board member on the Regional Council. Mr. Sellers was presented with his Regional Council membership certificate.

Chair Smith noted that hearing assisted devices were available from MAG staff. Chair Smith requested that members of the public who would like to comment fill out a blue public comment card for the Call to the Audience agenda item, or a yellow public comment card for Consent Agenda items or items on the agenda for action. Transit tickets for those who purchased a transit ticket to attend the meeting and parking validation were available from staff.

Chair Smith noted that materials for agenda items #10 and #11 were at each place and on each side of the room.

3. Call to the Audience

Chair Smith noted that the Call to the Audience provides an opportunity to members of the audience who wish to speak on items not scheduled on the agenda that fall under the jurisdiction of MAG, or on items on the agenda for discussion but not for action. Citizens are requested to not exceed a three minute time period for their comments. A total of 15 minutes is provided for the Call to the Audience agenda item, unless the Regional Council requests an exception to this limit. Those wishing to comment on agenda items posted for action will be provided the opportunity at the time the item is heard. Chair Smith noted that the Regional Council could not respond to comments made under Call to the Audience because they were not agendaized for discussion.

Chair Smith recognized public comment from Mr. Pat Vint, who expressed his thanks to Mayor Smith who was going to be the next governor of the State of Arizona. Mr. Vint brought pens he had printed with the acronym for the slogan, “Whether You Believe You Can Do Something or Not You Are Right.” He stated that the City of Phoenix has problems and that he wished he had settled in a smaller town when he arrived here from Korea in 1952, but he did not know then it would grow to be such an undesirable place. Mr. Vint stated that unions have no place at city governments and they are trying to say they are giving back vacation time so the taxpayers can pay them for it. He stated that Mayor Stanton does not understand, and all President Obama says is “I, I, I,” and is useless. Mr. Vint stated that he would be attending a City of Phoenix meeting later that day. Chair Smith thanked Mr. Vint for his comments.

Chair Smith recognized public comment from Mr. John Rusinek, who stated that his City Council member never showed up for a scheduled meeting with Mr. Rusinek, nor did he call. Mr. Rusinek read from the Phoenix city ordinance that said that the areas used for parking at single or duplex residential units must be dust proofed, and non-conformity is not grandfathered. Mr. Rusinek stated that no one at the City of Phoenix will meet with him and his problem has been ongoing for 9.5 years. He stated that the Phoenix website encourages residents to contact their City Council office or the City Manager’s office if they have a problem at the City and they will try their hardest to be responsive. Mr. Rusinek

played a recording about the size of rock used on his neighbors' driveway (unintelligible). He noted that the large size rock is being ground up into smaller size gravel. Mr. Rusinek stated that Pioneer Rock said this large a size of gravel will never settle. Chair Smith thanked Mr. Rusinek for his comments.

Chair Smith recognized public comment from Dianne Barker, who stated that she was going to speak on something MAG has jurisdiction over – multimodalism – and that diversity is alive in Arizona and inclusive. It is open for business to everybody. Ms. Barker stated that the City of Phoenix needs to win its bid on the convention. She noted that the Republican National Convention brought in more than \$200 million to Tampa, Florida, which is more than the Super Bowl. Ms. Barker expressed her disagreement with the speaking rules. She said that the Open Meeting law and the Attorney General's interpretation intend for there to be dialogue between citizens and the government. Ms. Barker said that MAG can say more than your three minutes are up. She stated that federal law mandates that citizens should be heard and considered in transportation planning and state law says that on a comment made by the public, a committee member can ask for clarification, object to criticism, ask staff for further research, or put an item for action on the next agenda. She stated that she had read SB 1062 and Title 41 states "for a furtherance of governmental interest." Ms. Barker remarked that whenever she sees that statement, it means to her that government will be dictating the way things are going to be. She stated that we are in this together – the Phoenix Convention Center provides shared revenue to Phoenix and the entire state. Chair Smith thanked Ms. Barker for her comments.

5. Approval of Consent Agenda

This agenda item was taken out of order.

Chair Smith noted that agenda items #5A, #5B, #5C, #5D, #5E, #5F, #5G, #5H, and #5I were on the Consent Agenda.

Chair Smith recognized public comment from Dr. Marvin Rochelle, who expressed that Mayor Greg Stanton was going to be the next governor of Arizona. Dr. Rochelle stated that the Baby Boomers are getting older and have more physical challenges. He stated that more sidewalks and curb cuts like there are in Phoenix are needed throughout the County. Dr. Rochelle remarked that he sees people in wheelchairs traveling on roads with no sidewalks, which places them in danger of being hit by a car. He noted one road as an example: 99th Avenue from Camelback Road to Glendale Avenue. Dr. Rochelle commented that the government needs to do whatever is necessary to protect people. Chair Smith thanked Dr. Rochelle for his comments.

Chair Smith recognized public comment from Dianne Barker, who spoke on agenda item #5E. She said that the 70,000 crashes annually concern her, and she would like to promote transportation options that are not at-grade, are out of the traffic lanes, and will operate at faster speeds. Ms. Barker expressed her support for Google bringing its 100-times faster technology to Phoenix, Tempe, and Scottsdale, and she hoped the rest of the cities would be able to join in. Ms. Barker stated that faster Internet speed has been available in Europe for a long time. She stated that everyone has a responsibility for air quality. She noted that Phoenix is doing dust proofing and has an anti-litter campaign. Ms. Barker remarked that cigarette butt residue gets into the water table. She stated that she cleans up around bus stops while

waiting, but when she has a complaint that a bus shelter needs cleaning, the City comes right out. Ms. Barker said that this region does a lot for the needy, but why should any city have to allow panhandlers to stand with signs? She said that she would like law enforcement to not allow this. Chair Smith thanked Ms. Barker for her comments.

Chair Smith asked members if they had questions or requests to hear a Consent Agenda item individually. None were noted.

Chair Smith called for a motion to approve Consent Agenda items #5A, #5B, #5C, #5D, #5E, #5F, #5G, #5H, and #5I. Vice Chair Michael LeVault moved approval of the Consent Agenda. Mayor Marie Lopez Rogers seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

5A. Approval of the January 29, 2014, Meeting Minutes

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved the January 29, 2014, meeting minutes.

5B. MAG Federally Funded Locally Sponsored Project Development Status Report: January 2014, and Project Changes

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved federal fund projects to be deferred, deleted, and changed; and of the necessary amendments and administrative modifications to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, 2035 Regional Transportation Plan, and to the FY 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program as appropriate. The MAG Federal Fund Programming Guidelines and Procedures, approved by the MAG Regional Council on October 26, 2011, outlines the requirements for local agencies to submit status information on the development of their federally funded projects. This Project Development Status Report focuses mainly on projects funded with Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement (CMAQ), and Transportation Alternatives program funds that are programmed in the Fiscal Year (FY) 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) as of November 2013 to authorize in Federal Fiscal Year (FFY) 2014 and FFY 2015. The Project Development Status Workbook for each project that was sent to member agencies requires that a project development schedule be completed and allows project changes to be requested. This item was recommended by the MAG Street Committee on January 14, 2014, the MAG Transportation Review Committee on January 30, 2014, the MAG Management Committee on February 12, 2014, and the Transportation Policy Committee on February 19, 2014.

5C. Project Changes - Amendment and Administrative Modification to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, the Regional Transportation Plan, and the FY 2011-2015 Transportation Improvement Program

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved amendments and administrative modifications to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, the Regional Transportation Plan, and the FY 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program as appropriate. On January 28, 2014, the MAG Regional Council approved the MAG Transportation Alternatives program ranked order of projects (for fiscal years 2015-2017), the Fiscal Year (FY) 2014-2018 MAG Transportation

Improvement Program, and the Regional Transportation Plan. Since then, member agencies have requested general project changes. Additionally, the detailed listing of work phases for the Transportation Alternatives program, and the detailed work phase listings of the proposed PM-2.5 Paving Unpaved Road Projects are included in Table B. On February 12, 2014, the MAG Management Committee recommended approval of the project changes. On February 19, 2014, the Transportation Policy Committee recommended approval.

5D. Designing Transit Accessible Communities Study

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, accepted the Designing Transit Accessible Communities Study. The Fiscal Year (FY) 2011 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget, approved by the MAG Regional Council in May 2010, included a study to help provide member agencies with additional tools and guidelines to provide better transit accessibility for pedestrians and bicyclists. The study outcome details the process of categorizing bus stops that addresses the different needs and challenges of the existing built environment. A Designing Transit Accessible Communities tool kit was developed and includes sample policies and best practices specific to the MAG region and geography. The implementation check list is intended for use by development review planners, engineers and transit service planners. The Designing Transit Accessible Communities Study was recommended for acceptance by the MAG Transit Committee on January 9, 2014, by the MAG Transportation Review Committee on January 30, 2014, and by the MAG Management Committee on February 12, 2014, and was presented at the February 19, 2014, Transportation Policy Committee meeting.

5E. FY 2014 Road Safety Assessments and Project Assessments at Intersections and Corridors

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved the list of eleven (11) Road Safety Assessments and three (3) Project Assessments utilizing MAG on-call consultants at an estimated total cost of \$440,000. Each year, more than 70,000 crashes occur on the local and arterial street system in the MAG region. About half of these crashes occur at intersections and they result in nearly 20,000 injuries and fatalities each year. The MAG Transportation Safety Committee has recommended the performance of Road Safety Assessments (RSAs) and Project Assessments (PAs) as a regional road safety initiative to help identify and address safety issues at locations with high crash risk. The Fiscal Year (FY) 2014 MAG Unified Work Program and Annual Budget, approved by the MAG Regional Council in May 2013, includes \$300,000 for the RSA program. An additional \$146,322 is also available from funds approved for the RSA program in the FY 2013 MAG Unified Work Program and Annual Budget, approved by the MAG Regional Council in May 2012. Since 2011, 23 RSAs have been successfully completed through the MAG RSA program. On January 7, 2014, the MAG Transportation Safety Committee recommended approval of a list of 11 RSAs and three PAs to be performed in FY 2014. The list of 11 RAs and three PAs was recommended for approval by the MAG Transportation Review Committee on January 30, 2014, and the MAG Management Committee on February 12, 2014. Qualified MAG on-call consultants would conduct the RSAs and PAs.

5F. Programming of PM-2.5 Paving Unpaved Road Projects for MAG Federal Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement Funding in the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved the list of Fiscal Year (FY) 2014, 2015, 2016, and 2017 PM-2.5 Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement funded Paving Unpaved Road Projects to be added to the FY 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, the 2035 Regional Transportation Plan, and the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program as appropriate. The MAG Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) allocates MAG Federal Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement (CMAQ) funds to specific modes. For air quality projects, the RTP and Moving Ahead for Progress in the 21st Century identify CMAQ allocations. Funding levels are still estimated and are subject to change based on the Federal Surface Transportation Authorization, ADOT apportionments, and regional distributions. The estimated total amount of PM-2.5 CMAQ funding available for programming in Federal Fiscal Year (FFY) 2014 through FFY 2017 for PM-2.5 Pave Unpaved Road Projects is \$3.36 million. A Call for Projects was issued on October 23, 2013, with applications due on November 22, 2013. The PM-2.5 Paving Unpaved Road Projects were reviewed and recommended by the MAG Street Committee on January 14, 2014. On January 23, 2014, the MAG Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee recommended forwarding the list of projects to the MAG Transportation Review Committee. The list of projects was recommended for approval on January 30, 2014, by the MAG Transportation Review Committee and on February 12, 2014, by the MAG Management Committee.

5G. Prioritized List of Proposed PM-10 Certified Street Sweeper Projects for FY 2014 CMAQ Funding

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved the prioritized list of proposed PM-10 Certified Street Sweeper Projects for FY 2014 CMAQ funding. The FY 2014 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget and the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program contain \$900,000 in FY 2014 Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement (CMAQ) funding to encourage the purchase and utilization of PM-10 Certified Street Sweepers. An additional \$330,599 in CMAQ is available from sweeper projects that have been requested to be deleted and from savings on sweepers that have cost less than anticipated, for a total amount of \$1,230,599. On January 23, 2014, the MAG Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee (AQTAC) recommended a prioritized list of proposed PM-10 Certified Street Sweeper Projects for FY 2014 CMAQ funding. Prior to the AQTAC recommendation, the MAG Street Committee reviewed the proposed street sweeper applications on December 10, 2013, and on January 14, 2014, in accordance with the MAG Federal Fund Programming Guidelines and Procedures. The prioritized list of proposed PM-10 Certified Street Sweeper Projects was recommended for approval by the MAG Management Committee on February 12, 2014.

5H. Conformity Consultation

The Maricopa Association of Governments is conducting consultation on a conformity assessment for an amendment and administrative modification to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program (TIP). The amendment and administrative modification involve several projects, including the addition of several new Transportation Alternatives Program projects. The amendment includes projects that may be categorized as exempt from conformity determinations. The administrative modification

includes minor project revisions that do not require a conformity determination. This item was on the agenda for consultation.

5I. Social Services Block Grant Allocation Recommendations

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved forwarding the Social Services Block Grant (SSBG) allocation recommendations for FY 2015 to the Arizona Department of Economic Security. Through a partnership with the Arizona Department of Economic Security (DES), the MAG Human Services Coordinating Committee (HSCC) prioritizes services to receive funding with locally planned Social Services Block Grant (SSBG) dollars. Services funded by SSBG assist the most vulnerable people in the region, including four target groups of Older Adults; People with Disabilities; People with Developmental Disabilities; and Adults, Families, and Children. Each year, the MAG HSCC conducts a service ranking exercise to determine a prioritized listing of services to assist people in these four target groups. The service ranking exercise was conducted in November 2013 and the draft results were released for public comment in December 2013. The results reflect the prioritized listing of services as determined by the service ranking exercise and a 5.3 percent funding reduction required by DES. In addition to the reduction in funding, DES indicated funding for services within the Older Adults and the Adults, Families and Children target groups be held harmless. The funding reduction was applied to services within Persons with Disabilities and the Persons with Developmental Disabilities target groups. Services within these two target groups were ranked the lowest in the service ranking exercise. No services received an increase due to the 5.3 percent funding reduction indicated by DES. The draft allocations were recommended for approval by the MAG Human Services Technical Committee on January 9, 2014, by the MAG HSCC on January 22, 2014, and the MAG Management Committee on February 12, 2014.

4. Executive Director's Report

Dennis Smith, MAG Executive Director, reported on items of interest in the MAG region. Mr. Smith stated that the Desert Peaks Awards will be held on June 25, 2014. He thanked the Regional Council for the names that had been submitted to serve as judges. Mr. Smith encouraged member agencies to submit project nominations, which are due on March 14, 2014.

Mr. Smith stated that the study for the I-10/I-17 (Spine) Corridor Master Plan kicked off on February 21, 2014. He said that the study is a joint effort of Arizona Department of Transportation, Federal Highway Administration, and MAG. He called attention to the fact that the project team's work experience totals more than 500 years. Mr. Smith stated that funding for improvements to the Spine totals \$1.47 billion, and the projects could create 41,160 direct and indirect jobs, according to projections. He added that projections estimate that every \$1 billion adds 28,000 jobs. Mr. Smith stated that the South Mountain Freeway has a \$1 billion construction budget, and added to the Spine budget, these two projects could represent the addition of 72,240 jobs. He expressed his support for working together on these two projects. Chair Smith thanked Mr. Smith for his report.

6. Update on the MAG 2012 Five Percent Plan for PM-10 and Exceptional Events

Lindy Bauer, MAG staff, provided an update on the MAG 2012 Five Percent Plan for PM-10 and exceptional events. She said that the plan includes a wide variety of existing control measures and projects that have been implemented to reduce PM-10 and one new measure designed to reduce PM-10 during high risk conditions, including high winds. Ms. Bauer stated there are measures on trackout, open burning, unpaved shoulders, unpaved roads, vacant lots, earthmoving, all terrain vehicles, weed abatement, leaf blowers, street sweepers, and mining operations.

Ms. Bauer reported that on January 14, 2014, the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) signed a notice to propose full approval of the MAG 2012 Five Percent Plan for PM-10. She stated that this includes the 2008 baseline emissions inventory and the 2007, 2009, 2010, 2011 and 2012 projected emission inventories, the modeled attainment demonstration, a five percent reduction in emissions demonstration, reasonable further progress, contingency measures, motor vehicle emissions budget, and very importantly, that a determination that the Maricopa County Nonattainment Area has met the PM-10 standard based upon three years of clean data for 2010-2012. Ms. Bauer added that the EPA intends to finalize its action on June 2, 2014. She added that this was published in the Federal Register on February 6, 2014.

Ms. Bauer discussed the aggressive prevention activities to achieve three years of clean monitoring data. These activities include the City of Phoenix Dust Reduction Task Force short and long term goals; the MAG-produced PM-10 prevention video for education and training; near real time monitor data provided by Maricopa County with funding provided by the MAG Regional Council; the establishment of the Maricopa County Rapid Response Program network to prevent PM-10 exceedances regionwide; coordination between Maricopa County and MAG member agencies to avoid duplication of enforcement and the investigation of sources; implementation by the MAG member agencies of customized Rapid Response Action Plans that are based on a MAG template and tool kit; conduct PM-10 Prevention Workshops with local governments, Maricopa County, and the Arizona Department of Environmental Quality; communication by the Arizona Department of Environmental Quality of the Maricopa County Dust Control Action Forecast five days in advance; and notification by business, industry, and agriculture associations to their members when high winds are forecasted.

Ms. Bauer expressed her appreciation to every member of the Regional Council and their staff for all their hard work on these prevention activities, which were absolutely critical to the success of the MAG Five Percent Plan for PM-10. She also thanked the Arizona Department of Environmental Quality (ADEQ), Maricopa County Air Quality Department, and the Arizona Department of Transportation for their partnership. She noted that the region has never before had a determination that the standard had been met.

Ms. Bauer expressed her appreciation to the MAG Executive Committee for all of their hard work during difficult times. She reported that Chair Smith had traveled to Washington, D. C., to establish a rapport with the EPA officials, and help the EPA better understand the exceptional events in this region. Ms. Bauer stated that Chair Smith had also conducted a special meeting with EPA regarding its AP 42

dust factor for unpaved roads. She added that EPA then cut the dust factor by 62 percent, which helped this region avoid a conformity freeze.

Ms. Bauer presented the next steps for the Plan. She discussed that EPA needs to take final approval action on the Five Percent Plan by June 2, 2014, which is the date agreed upon with Arizona Center for Law in the Public Interest. Ms. Bauer mentioned that the aggressive prevention efforts must continue because clean data at the monitors and throughout the region must be maintained forever, or this region will be in nonattainment. Once EPA finalizes an approval action, MAG will begin work on a Redesignation Request and Maintenance Plan for PM-10.

Ms. Bauer indicated that EPA's Exceptional Events Rule and process still needs to be streamlined. She noted that EPA anticipates proposing rule revisions by April 2014 with final revisions in April 2015. Ms. Bauer noted that 18 packages of exceptional events were submitted to EPA, and she added that it cost the region \$675,000 to prove to the EPA that these were exceptional events. Ms. Bauer stated that there were six exceptional events in 2013 and they have been documented and are out for public review. She added that MAG prepared the documentation for five of the six events.

Ms. Bauer stated that MAG is preparing a letter of support for submission to the docket by the deadline of March 10, 2014.

Ms. Bauer then spoke about PM-2.5. She noted that an article in The Arizona Republic, and the cities and towns assisted Maricopa County in getting the word out to residents on no burn days during the holiday season. Ms. Bauer reported that the highest PM-2.5 concentration ever taken – 170 micrograms per cubic meter – was recorded on January 1, 2014. Ms. Bauer noted that the region will need an annual average of 12 micrograms per cubic meter for the entire year. She indicated that the Maricopa County Air Quality Department reported that this reading occurred from bonfire smoke at a New Year's Eve party nearby the West Phoenix monitor at 39th Avenue and Earll. Ms. Bauer urged expanding the outreach for next year's holiday season and she added that the County will likely be re-examining its enforcement policy.

Ms. Bauer stated that Congressman Harry Mitchell helped immensely on an important videoconference with the EPA offices in Washington, D. C., Ann Arbor, Michigan, Research Triangle Park, and Region IX. She expressed appreciation to all of the Congressional Delegation for their assistance.

Chair Smith remarked that approval of MAG's Five Percent Plan for PM-10 is a very significant accomplishment. He said it was a lot of work and many people played pivotal roles. Chair Smith stated that this was a great hurdle to have overcome, but it resets to a different challenge. He added that three years without an event is quite an accomplishment.

Mr. Smith remarked that MAG has been working on obtaining approval since May 25, 2010, when the EPA Region IX administrator indicated that EPA was going to disapprove MAG's Five Percent Plan for PM-10.

Chair Smith stated that the senior EPA officials in Washington, D. C., were unaware of the disapproval action planned by Region IX that could result in drastic effects for this region, and it took a concerted effort to pull this all together. Chair Smith stated that this is a great example of cities, towns, the county, and the state working together to make a difference. He expressed congratulations to everybody and thanked Mr. Smith and Ms. Bauer for their leadership and guidance throughout this process.

7. Alternative Transportation Solutions for Older Adults

Amy St. Peter, MAG staff, reported on alternative transportation solutions for older adults. She said that the lack of transportation can negatively impact the lives of people, particularly older adults. Ms. St. Peter expressed appreciation to Phoenix, Tempe, Scottsdale and the Northwest Valley cities for participating in the pilot projects in the Regional Age-Friendly Network. She said that the focus of the presentation today was the Northwest Valley program, and she expressed her appreciation to the Northwest Transportation Stakeholders group cities of Peoria, Surprise, El Mirage, and Youngtown, and Maricopa County.

Ms. St. Peter stated that the goal of the program is to connect older people with their communities, and in order to make the connections, they needed to know where these people resided. She said that the average age in the MAG region is actually two years younger than the national average, however, there are areas of deep concentrations of adults aged 65 and older, and adults aged 65 and older with no vehicle. Ms. St. Peter stated that the biggest barrier for older people to connect with the community is transportation. Ms. St. Peter noted that the number one reason that older adults request transportation is to go to a medical care facility. She noted that public transit is not always available nor is it the right solution in some cases, for example, in hot weather, or for a person who is returning from a dialysis treatment.

Ms. St. Peter expressed appreciation to the City of Phoenix for its Central Village program and the City of Tempe for providing a van to its Neighbors Helping Neighbors program. Ms. St. Peter stated that transportation not only helps individuals, it also helps businesses. Ms. St. Peter stated that if people cannot get to medical appointments, they could have higher readmission rates to hospitals, and she noted that medical facilities can be penalized for high readmission rates. She noted that each community is different and transportation strategies are different. Ms. St. Peter stated that Sun Health and Benevilla have been leading the charge to develop a membership based transportation system.

Jennifer Drago, Vice President of Community Development for Sun Health, continued the presentation on the program in the Northwest Valley. She said that Benevilla has a 34-year legacy as a nonprofit elder service agency and Sun Health a 43-year legacy as a nonprofit health organization in the Valley. Ms. Drago stated that the two agencies are interested in transportation because people's health and well being are at risk when they have difficulties finding transportation to activities like doctor appointments and grocery store visits.

Ms. Drago mentioned that the formation of the Northwest Transportation Stakeholders Group led to the transit system study supported by MAG and ADOT and will lead to improving transportation options in the area. Ms. Drago stated that they researched the needs for aging in place, and found that

transportation is one of those needs. She said that transportation for many older adults also could include door to door assistance.

Ms. Drago stated that a great deal of research has been done with the support of the City Leaders Institute and Grantmakers in Aging, and they conducted focus groups and community leader briefings. From a survey of 20,000 households in the Northwest Valley with a household member 65 years and older, 75 to 78 percent of older adults want to age in place and live independently in their own homes. However, they might not have a vehicle to transport them to shopping or appointments. Ms. Drago added that the survey was not transportation-focused, but led back to transportation. She then displayed a map that showed the location of shopping areas, transit routes, and homes without a vehicle. Ms. Drago stated that for this reason, they came up with an idea for a new model to fill the voids, called Northwest Valley Connect.

Michelle Dionisio, Executive Director of Benevilla, continued the presentation. She said that the Northwest Valley Connect project, which will be a separate nonprofit agency, includes creating a regional hub, and the first focus is addressing the transportation needs of older adults. Ms. Dionisio stated that the intention is to have a mobility manager incorporated into the hub, and she added that the MAG plan identified the need for a mobility manager in the Northwest Valley. Ms. Dionisio stated that the program will utilize volunteers and a few paid drivers to provide rides.

Ms. Dionisio reported that people tend to thrive when connected to others in the community. She said that information services will be provided through the Northwest Valley Connect project. A person can call or go to website and be connected to social events, etc., in their community. Ms. Dionisio stated that they feel the combination of providing transportation and information can help people to age in place.

Ms. Dionisio stated that the model is a public/private partnership. She noted that Benevilla has a large contingency of volunteers, and they take people shopping, to doctor appointments, etc. She said that one of the gaps indicated in the survey is a lack of transportation options on weekends, and they envision that weekend service would be available through their program 24 hours per day, seven days per week. Ms. Dionisio stated that they will receive revenue from rides and membership fees, however, scholarships will be available to low income residents. She added that the cost of rides in the program will be less expensive than taxis due to the volunteer aspect. Ms. Dionisio stated that the mobility manager will be working with all of the agencies to ensure they know about grants, etc., and to enhance transit options in the Northwest Valley.

Chair Smith thanked Ms. St. Peter, Ms. Drago, and Ms. Dionisio for their presentation. He asked members if they had questions.

Mayor Lewis stated that he had visited Benevilla and it is a wonderful facility. He asked if there was any liability or additional expense to volunteer drivers. Ms. Dionisio replied that Benevilla has umbrella coverage, but per Arizona law, the driver's insurance is primary. She noted they have not had any issues in all the years Benevilla has been using volunteers. Ms. Dionisio added that they are considering a mileage reimbursement to return a benefit to the volunteers.

Mayor Kavanagh remarked that the presentation described many Fountain Hills residents: older and wanting to age in place. She referenced the recent Valley Metro study said that in 2011, Fountain Hills residents aged 65 and older accounted for 25 percent of the Town's total population and residents aged 18 and younger represented 15 percent of the total population. Mayor Kavanagh stated that the 65 and older age group experienced a 48 percent growth rate between 2000 and 2010, far greater than the seven percent growth in the 18 to 64 age group. Mayor Kavanagh noted there was a ten percent decrease in the 18 years and younger age group. She noted that the population of Fountain Hills will continue to grow, but the average age of the population will trend toward the 65 years and older group. Mayor Kavanagh stated that this affects how transit operates in the Town. She spoke of the Town's Give a Lift program, in which they depend on volunteers who are not reimbursed in any way other than their kindness. Mayor Kavanagh stated that these volunteers are seniors themselves and could need transportation assistance themselves at a future date.

Ms. Dionisio stated that is one of the benefits at Benevilla – when a volunteer is unable to drive any longer, the volunteer knows that a ride will be available.

Mayor Kavanagh stated that Fountain Hills has no public transportation and it looks like it will be a serious need for them in the future.

Ms. St. Peter noted that MAG would gladly provide the Town with technical assistance. She added that the question arises of what will be the demand for service when the population increase in the 65 and older population is discussed. They are the most talented and educated workforce to date and are a huge asset to a community. Ms. St. Peter stated that the challenge becomes how to tap into that talent.

Mayor Kavanagh requested that Ms. St. Peter provide contact information to the Town staff member working on public transportation.

Mayor Stanton asked the cost to participants in the Northwest Valley program. Ms. Dionisio replied that they are estimating an annual membership fee of \$70, a charge of \$1.40 per mile and a pick up fee of \$3 to \$4. She noted that these costs were determined through their research of best practices and programs across the country and might need to be adjusted as the program is implemented.

St. Peter noted the significance of the relationship with businesses, for example, a doctor or a retail store, that could supply a subsidy or voucher to their customer.

Mayor Cook remarked that surveys usually do not extend into Wickenburg, which is in the Northwest Valley. He expressed that he would like to have Wickenburg included in these surveys. Mayor Cook said that Wickenburg has a large population of adults who are aging and unable to get to the doctor. He also mentioned that taxis come from Phoenix to pick up people on welfare, take them to appointments in Phoenix, drive them back to Wickenburg, and then make the return trip to Phoenix. Mayor Cook stated that this seems a wasteful expenditure of money and there should be a better way to do this.

Ms. St. Peter stated that staff would be in touch with the Town of Wickenburg soon and looked forward to working with the Town.

Councilmember Farrar stated that his Town also has a significant older adult population. He asked if staff was familiar with Foothills Caring Corps. Ms. St. Peter replied that she was and added that Foothills Caring Corps is also involved with the Scottsdale program.

Chair Smith stated that there is a lot of interest in transportation for aging adults. He noted that it will continue to be a huge challenge. There are not enough resources to operate fixed routes. Chair Smith stated that there is still a large segment of the population who will need mobility.

8. MAG Fiscal Balance Report

Scott Wilken, MAG staff, reported that MAG recently updated the MAG Fiscal Balance Report that was originally created in 2001. He said that MAG was approached by the Town of Queen Creek to update the report. Mr. Wilken stated that Applied Economics, the firm that developed the original report, was hired for the update.

Sarah Murley, Applied Economics, continued the report. She said that a regional fiscal model for member agencies in Maricopa and Pinal counties was prepared to analyze impacts of different land use scenarios and provide an understanding of how changes in land use can affect revenue and expenditure of jurisdictions. She noted that the types of services provided and different types of revenue for each community can vary widely. Ms. Murley stated that budget data and tax rates and socioeconomic and land use data from each community in Maricopa and Pinal counties were collected and used to create a set of operating and maintenance revenues and expenditures. She said that cities were grouped by size and level of service provided as part of the analysis. Ms. Murley stated that the land use data were interfaced with the budget data to estimate the fiscal impacts of different types of land use.

Ms. Murley stated that this study can be used in looking at individual developments or general plans. She noted that this study can be used in projections, because it projects 25 years of data and can help determine if a general plan is fiscally sustainable and the impacts of land use choices. Ms. Murley stated that cities can benefit in different ways by different types of developments.

Ms. Murley stated that the study looked at one-acre, non-residential parcels with various land uses (office, industrial, retail). She said that they then looked at five different uses for residential densities. Ms. Murley stated that she would be presenting the results by communities grouped by size, but the results are available for individual communities. She said that without understanding the impacts of individual uses, it is difficult to understand why or why not a general plan is sustainable.

Ms. Murley addressed the ratio of revenues to expenditures. For industrial impacts, cities with no property tax do not benefit as much from industrial development. Ms. Murley stated that industrial development tends to have more capital investment. She stated that sales tax is generated from leased industrial space, but not as much as from office space. Ms. Murley stated that counties are more dependent on property tax. She clarified that this analysis is looking at operations and maintenance impacts and not infrastructure impacts.

Ms. Murley addressed the ratio of revenues to expenditures for office impacts. She said that office development is the highest density among non-residential uses, and there is more value per acre and more employment. Ms. Murley stated that real property values are about 2.5 times the level for industrial or retail development. She said that the assumption is 85 percent leased and generates property tax and sales tax on leases. Ms. Murley stated that office is a net positive for most cities.

Mr. Murley addressed the ratio of revenues to expenditures for retail impacts. She explained that due to the structure of sales taxes in Arizona, retail development generates substantial net positive impact in all cities. Ms. Murley indicated that she thought the need to generate revenue could drive land use decisions.

Ms. Murley addressed key factors in fiscal results that apply to land use fiscal impacts for individual communities: 1) Type and mix of land uses; 2) Local revenue structure (range of services provided, such as public safety); 3) Characteristics of development (density of square footage and population/employment), value of land and improvements, taxable sales or leases; level of service and range of services provided, level of government (city vs. county), and development timing (due to state shared revenue). Ms. Murley stated that the rate of sales tax varies from city to city, and some cities have property tax and others do not.

Ms. Murley then addressed the ratio of revenues to expenditures for the five different types of residential development. She said that residential generally does not generate enough revenues to offset the cost of services, nor does increasing the number of housing units per acre. Ms. Murley noted that one exception was cities that had a high property tax and did not provide services.

Ms. Murley addressed issues for further study. While the model measures the impacts of different land uses, it does not account for the market feasibility of future land use plans. The fiscal model is based on average expenditure levels for city size groups but in reality there are differences between cities of similar sizes and development stages that are not captured in a regional model. Cities in a metro area do not function in isolation from a development perspective. While retail development alone does not create a healthy economy, it is fiscally sustainable as long as there are residents and job opportunities nearby to support it.

Chair Smith thanked Ms. Murley for her report and asked members if they had questions.

Mayor Schoaf recalled that when he first came on the Regional Council, planning for the transportation system was underway, but there was not discussion of the impact of transportation on land use and the sustainability of communities. He expressed he was pleased that MAG was looking into this. Mayor Schoaf stated that Litchfield Park is small and is very conscious of the costs of different types of development. He urged looking at this type of analysis when doing land planning in order to be sustainable from the standpoint of city budgets and residents who can work close to home. Mayor Schoaf stated that this study was a very positive step taken by MAG.

Councilmember Farrar echoed Mayor Schoaf's comments. He asked if the report was available electronically. Mr. Wilken replied that he would email a copy to Councilmember Farrar and he added that it was also available on the MAG website.

Mr. Smith noted that MAG staff could come to council meetings and present the report.

9. Economic Development Data and Analysis Meetings

Anubhav Bagley, MAG staff, reported on the economic development data and analysis tools roadshows MAG staff has been showcasing with member agency economic development department staff. He said that the meetings began in November 2013, and so far, MAG staff has met with 16 jurisdictions and WESTMARC. Mr. Bagley stated that three additional meetings are scheduled for March, and he encouraged agencies to contact him if they would like to meet.

Mr. Bagley stated that MAG has extensive macro data and will be producing reports at quarterly and annual intervals. He noted that a regional economist is on staff at MAG. Mr. Bagley said that MAG maintains and makes available to member agencies an employer database that lists employers with five or more employees. Mr. Bagley stated that the 2012 employer database included approximately 45,000 records.

Mr. Bagley stated that an analysis of employment into clusters and sub-clusters showed that retail is the largest cluster, accounting for approximately 170,000 jobs. Health care is second with approximately 142,000 jobs. Mr. Bagley stated that these clusters can be tracked over time and the results provided to members.

Mr. Bagley stated that MAG has data gathered from the Maricopa County Trip Reduction Program surveys. He explained that surveys are conducted of employers with 50 or more employees, and provide the employers' locations, residence of their employees, and occupations. Mr. Bagley noted that this database consists of approximately 500,000 records, which is about one-third of the jobs in Maricopa County. He added that it is larger than the American Community Survey.

Mr. Bagley then described some of the uses of MAG's data analysis. He said that looking at Mesa's commuting patterns, 65 percent of Mesa's workers commute to the City, and the majority of those reside east of I-17.

Mr. Bagley stated that the City of Peoria has a similar commuting pattern – 74 percent of its workers commute from other cities. Mr. Bagley also noted that the MAG data can be analyzed to show the occupations of a city's workforce.

Mr. Bagley stated that the MAG data can be analyzed to show where residents work. He displayed an analysis of Chandler that showed 77 percent of its residents work mostly east of I-17 and are in engineering and hi-tech occupations.

Mr. Bagley said that the question frequently is asked where people residing in a city are working. He stated that Surprise residents are working mostly in the City of Surprise, at the I-17 and Loop 101 Deer Valley financial district, and in Central Phoenix. Mr. Bagley noted that 18.5 percent of Surprise workers are in the business, financial, and professional fields and Surprise is exporting workers in these fields.

Mr. Bagley stated that the same type of analysis could be conducted for job centers of employers with more than 50 employees, such as the Gilbert Northwest Job Center, which consists of approximately 18,000 workers. He pointed out that data can be analyzed to show the residences and the ages of the workers, which in this case, the average age is lower than that of Maricopa County.

Mr. Bagley stated that the North Goodyear job center, which represents a significant number of health care jobs, consists of approximately 7,000 workers. Mr. Bagley stated that they conducted an analysis of the commute sheds, and the workers reside in a fairly compact area.

Mr. Bagley stated that MAG can conduct an analysis of occupations and show occupational profiles. He displayed a comparison of Glendale to Maricopa County. He noted that the community support/teaching category is nearly twice the number in Glendale as Maricopa County.

Mr. Bagley addressed people living and working in Tempe. He noted that Tempe is a large job generator, with 68 percent of Tempe workers living in other cities, but only 20 percent of Tempe residents working outside of Tempe.

Mr. Bagley stated that another useful analysis shows the occupations being imported and exported. The graph he displayed showed that 73 percent of business, financial and professional workers who reside in the City of Buckeye travel outside the city to work. Mr. Bagley stated that this data might be used from an economic development perspective to see if any businesses might be attracted.

Mr. Bagley stated that much of the work at MAG includes its substantial travel data. He referred to the commute shed for US-60 and Loop 101. He said that there are approximately 420,000 people and 260,000 jobs within a 15 minute travel time of this area. Mr. Bagley stated that household income, population by age, and educational attainment can all be applied, which is interesting information from an economic development perspective.

Mr. Bagley stated that MAG also maintains the Greater Phoenix Rising website, which includes all of the MAG regional data. He said MAG also maintains an online mapping and analysis tool that is quite detailed.

Mr. Bagley stated that three primary themes emerged from the roadshows. 1) High interest to understand workforce and skills data. Explore collaboration with colleges and other institutions to obtain workforce and skills data. 2) High interest to build new online tools for commuting patterns and occupational analytics, live/work charts, and travel-shed and demographic data. 3) High interest in sharing periodic discussion/data sharing meetings of economic development and planning staff.

Chair Smith thanked Mr. Bagley for his report. No questions from the Council were noted.

10. Discussion of the Development of the FY 2015 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget

Becky Kimbrough, MAG staff, reported that the draft FY 2015 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget was on the agenda for information and discussion. Ms. Kimbrough stated that the MAG budget is presented incrementally each year, beginning in January and extending through May, when approval is requested.

Ms. Kimbrough stated that this month, the draft of the proposed dues and assessments, the budget process timeline and the newly proposed projects are presented. She noted that four attachments were included in the agenda packet.

Ms. Kimbrough stated that an updated Attachment D, which is the description and the cost estimates of the newly proposed projects for FY 2015, was at each place. She explained that Attachment D was updated to include three current transportation associates to the project list.

Ms. Kimbrough stated that Attachment A is the proposed dues and assessments which were presented last month; Attachment B, which is the budget timeline; and Attachment C, which is the budget webinar invitation. She noted that the webinar was open to the public and members and was held on Thursday, February 20, 2014, at the MAG office. Ms. Kimbrough stated that they are looking for input throughout the period of development of the draft budget through May; any comments or questions regarding the proposed projects or the draft budget are welcome.

Chair Smith thanked Ms. Kimbrough for her report. No questions from the Council were noted.

11. Legislative Update

Nathan Pryor, MAG staff, provided a report on House Bill 2069. He noted that a copy of the legislation and talking points were at each place. Mr. Pryor stated that HB 2069 would exclude the employees of political subdivisions, such as MAG, who are hired after a certain date, from qualifying for the Arizona State Retirement System (ASRS). He noted that this would result in a two-tiered retirement system at MAG.

Mr. Pryor noted that the organizations impacted by this bill are created by public bodies to conduct a variety of governmental functions. These organizations include such agencies as the state's metropolitan planning organizations, councils of governments, the League of Arizona Cities and Towns, the County Supervisors Association, and the Arizona Municipal Water Users Association. Mr. Pryor stated that participation in ASRS is a recruitment and retention issue.

Mr. Pryor stated that some Legislators might be unaware of the functions provided by MAG in the areas of transportation, air quality, and human services. He said that MAG is coordinating with the League on developing a letter. Mr. Pryor noted that HB 2069 is scheduled to be heard on the House floor the next day, and they are trying to stop the bill at that point. If not, they will work on it at the Senate level. Mr. Pryor provided the talking points to the intergovernmental representatives earlier in the day.

Chair Smith asked if there was legislation to separate out these agencies, would there also be legislation exempting the same agencies from adhering to things such as the Open Meeting Law? Mr. Pryor said that they are pointing out in the letter that MAG is subject to such things as public records requests and the Open Meeting Law.

Chair Smith noted that these groups are treated as public bodies, but in the area of ASRS, they would be exceptions.

Mr. Smith stated that there are approximately 100 staff members at MAG, and 26 percent of them came to MAG from other agencies who would remain eligible ASRS members. Mr. Smith stated that membership in the ASRS is really a tool for MAG to attract and retain staff. He remarked that it is unfortunate that an agency that does the State Implementation Plan, is in State Statute for freeway priorities, is subject to a federal governmental audit and a performance audit by the State Auditor General's Office is not deemed to perform governmental service and it puzzles him as to the intent of the bill.

Chair Smith asked the motivation of the bill's sponsor. Mr. Smith replied he has heard different things. Mr. Smith reported that ASRS has advised this change will result in a \$23 million hit to ASRS and will increase the contribution rate to existing members, so it does not make financial sense.

Councilmember Monachino asked the bill's sponsor. Mr. Smith replied Representative Ugenti.

Mr. Arnett recalled that until about ten years ago MAG was not a member of ASRS, at which time when MAG joined there was great rationale and great support in the Legislature for its membership. He asked Mr. Smith to recount the history of MAG joining ASRS.

Mr. Smith replied that MAG was invited to join ASRS in 2004 and had worked with the Executive Committee to get all of the documents prepared. He said they went to an ASRS Board meeting to be accepted as members when the attorney for ASRS, who was new, expressed his opinion that he did not think MAG was a governmental body. Mr. Smith stated that MAG dealt with the Attorney General and then legislation was drafted to create a public entity. He noted that another Arizona council of governments, WACOG, had been a member of ASRS for more than 30 years at that time, and also the Arizona Association of Counties. Mr. Smith advised that for years, MAG had been encouraged to join ASRS and the Legislature supported MAG's membership. Mr. Smith stated that staff moves among the cities, counties, and MAG all of the time, and membership in ASRS makes good sense for recruiting and retaining staff. He stated that he testified against the bill, which passed the Insurance and Retirement Committee by a vote of four to three, and the Rules Committee, and is on its way to the House Floor. Mr. Smith stated that they are working with other associations to stop the bill on the House Floor and on a draft letter of opposition.

No further questions from the Council were noted.

12. Request for Future Agenda Items

Topics or issues of interest that the Regional Council would like to have considered for discussion at a future meeting were requested.

No requests were noted.

13. Comments from the Council

An opportunity was provided for Regional Council members to present a brief summary of current events. The Regional Council is not allowed to propose, discuss, deliberate or take action at the meeting on any matter in the summary, unless the specific matter is properly noticed for legal action.

Mayor Rogers wished for good weather at the NASCAR race and events that would be taking place on the upcoming weekend at Phoenix International Raceway in Avondale.

Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 1:05 p.m.

Chair

Secretary