

**MINUTES OF THE  
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS  
REGIONAL COUNCIL MEETING**

January 27, 2016  
MAG Office  
Phoenix, Arizona

**MEMBERS ATTENDING**

Mayor W.J. “Jim” Lane, Scottsdale, Chair	Mayor Thomas Schoaf, Litchfield Park
Mayor Greg Stanton, Phoenix, Vice Chair	# Mayor Christian Price, City of Maricopa
Vice Mayor Robin Barker, Apache Junction	* Supervisor Denny Barney, Maricopa County
Mayor Kenneth Weise, Avondale	Mayor John Giles, Mesa
Mayor Jackie Meck, Buckeye	* Mayor Michael Collins, Paradise Valley
Councilmember Mike Farrar, Carefree	Mayor Cathy Carlat, Peoria
Councilmember Dick Esser, Cave Creek	Supervisor Todd House, Pinal County
# Mayor Jay Tibshraeny, Chandler	* Mayor Gail Barney, Queen Creek
Mayor Lana Mook, El Mirage	* President Delbert Ray, Salt River
Mayor Tom Rankin, Florence	Pima-Maricopa Indian Community
* President Ruben Balderas, Fort McDowell Yavapai Nation	Mayor Sharon Wolcott, Surprise
# Mayor Linda Kavanagh, Fountain Hills	* Mayor Mark Mitchell, Tempe
* Mayor Chuck Turner, Gila Bend	* Mayor Adolfo Gamez, Tolleson
* Governor Stephen Roe Lewis, Gila River Indian Community	Mayor John Cook, Wickenburg
Mayor John Lewis, Gilbert	# Mayor Michael LeVault, Youngtown
Mayor Jerry Weiers, Glendale	* Mr. Roc Arnett, Citizens Transportation Oversight Committee
Mayor Georgia Lord, Goodyear	* Mr. Joseph La Rue, State Transportation Board
# Mayor Rebecca Jimenez, Guadalupe	Vice Mayor Jack Sellers, State Transportation Board

\* Those members neither present nor represented by proxy.

# Attended by telephone conference call.

+ Attended by videoconference

1. Call to Order

The meeting of the MAG Regional Council was called to order by Chair W.J. “Jim” Lane, Scottsdale, at 11:35 a.m.

2. Pledge of Allegiance

The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Councilmember Michael Farrar, Mayor Rebecca Jimenez, Mayor Linda Kavanagh, Mayor Michael LeVault, Mayor Christian Price, and Mayor Jay Tibshraeny joined the meeting by teleconference.

Chair Lane noted that for agenda item #11, Legislative Update, a summary of legislation of interest to the MAG region was at each place.

3. Call to the Audience

Chair Lane recognized public comment from Ms. Dianne Barker, who thanked MAG for the transit pass. She thought she might pass it along to one of the mayors to use. Ms. Barker stated that multimodal feels good and she has been told she inspires people to get off the couch. She stated that she has been attending meetings at Valley Metro, the City of Phoenix, and at the Legislature. Ms. Barker stated that she feels the purpose of transportation is mobility, but the Phoenix Charter says it is for the common good. She said that transit cuts down on congestion and pollution and is the economic driver. Ms. Barker requested the Regional Council consider the Spine. She noted the traffic backups on I-10. Chair Lane thanked Ms. Barker.

Chair Lane recognized public comment from Mr. John Rusinek, who stated that he did not wish to address the Regional Council, but he wanted to express his agreement with Ms. Barker's comments. Chair Lane thanked Mr. Rusinek.

4. Executive Director's Report

Mr. Dennis Smith, MAG Executive Director, reported on items of interest to the MAG region. Mr. Smith stated that work continues on the Tourism and Shopping Initiative (formerly the Border Crossing Card). He reported that a Resolution of Support for expanding the shopping and visitor zone to Mexican nationals was approved by the MAG Regional Council, six other regional planning organizations in Arizona, and the Intertribal Council of Arizona. Mr. Smith stated that the *Financial Times*, an international daily newspaper with 2.2 million daily subscribers and 4.5 million internet subscribers, published a story about the Initiative. He added that the story was selected as an Editor's Choice story.

Mr. Smith stated that the Tourism and Shopping Initiative was featured on the PBS show *Horizonte* with Garrick Taylor from the Arizona Chamber of Commerce. Mr. Smith said that they have spoken with the field command in Tucson. He said that expanding the zone is important and will save time because it could eliminate having to complete I-94 forms for many visitors, which can be time consuming. Mr. Smith stated that the next step is to propose a rule change by Homeland Security.

Mr. Smith noted that tourism is Arizona's number one economic sector and accounts for 171,500 jobs statewide and 94,300 jobs in Maricopa County. He said that the University of Arizona evaluated the project over five years and found an expanded shopping zone could represent a \$181 million impact statewide.

Mr. Smith stated that a meeting of the Joint Planning Advisory Council called "The Sun Corridor - A Connected Economy" was attended by 127 people on January 8, 2016, at the Tucson Convention Center. Mr. Smith stated that speakers included Arizona State Legislators Senator Steve Farley and Senator Bob Worsley. He noted that representatives from the Utah Chamber of Commerce, the Salt Lake regional

planning organization and Utah Department of Transportation presented their unified plan, which began as a corridor plan. Mr. Smith stated that Arizona Department of Transportation is looking at a statewide unified plan and a meeting of Sun Corridor staff is scheduled for next week.

Mr. Smith stated that Arizona Canada Week will take place February 6-14, 2016. He noted that MAG elected officials will be receiving invitations to some of the scheduled events.

Mr. Smith stated that nomination forms are now available on the MAG website for the 2016 Desert Peaks Awards. He noted that awards will be presented in six different categories. Mr. Smith stated that the entry deadline is March 11, 2016, and the awards will be presented on June 22, 2016, following the MAG Regional Council Annual Meeting.

Chair Lane thanked Mr. Smith for his report.

5. Approval of Consent Agenda

Chair Lane noted that agenda items #5A, #5B, #5C, #5D, #5E, #5F, #5G, #5H, #5I, #5J, #5K, and #5L were on the Consent Agenda.

Chair Lane asked if members had questions or requests for a presentation on any of the Consent Agenda items. Chair Lane moved agenda item #5L from the Consent Agenda to be heard.

Chair Lane recognized public comment from Ms. Dianne Barker, who commented on agenda items #5A and #5D. She stated that no public comment was made at the last meeting, however, she wanted to say that citizens are watching and reading the minutes and care what the mayors are doing. Ms. Barker said that it is not all about making money. She stated that she cares about the more vulnerable of our population: children and elderly, and the health effects of projects. She remarked that she read the section of the minutes about exceptional events and Mayor Kavanagh's comments about ozone. Ms. Barker stated that it happens mostly in summer and from vehicles. She stated that EPA has labeled us second in the nation for carbon monoxide. Ms. Barker stated that the Presidential Administration is looking to expedite plans to cut this pollution. She said that her sister and mother had asthma, and she was also a school bus driver, so she is very aware of pollution. Ms. Barker stated that particulates from light rail and buses are exempt from pollution. She had a statement from the City of Phoenix regarding preemption of traffic signalization and light rail. Ms. Barker stated that all of the air quality funds going to light rail needs to be looked at in entirety to protect us from pollution. Chair Lane thanked Ms. Barker.

Mayor Georgia Lord moved to approve the Consent Agenda items #5A, #5B, #5C, #5D, #5E, #5F, #5G, #5H, #5I, #5J, and #5K. Councilmember Dick Esser seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

5A. Approval of the December 16, 2015, Meeting Minutes

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved the December 16, 2015, meeting minutes.

5B. MAG Federally Funded, Locally Sponsored Project Development Status Report

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, accepted the MAG Federally Funded, Locally Sponsored Project Development Status Report. A Project Development Status Report is produced twice each year, and project changes are completed quarterly or as needed. Monitoring of member agency project schedules within the Status Report, and the assurance by each agency that their project(s) will obligate federal funds as noted in the federally approved Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) listing, assist with ensuring that the regional suballocation of federal funds will be utilized and not swept from the region. The Project Status Report also assists with providing needed information in preparation of closing out Federal Highway Administration funding for the current year. The Project Development Status Report was recommended for acceptance on December 17, 2015, by the MAG Transportation Review Committee and on January 6, 2016, by the MAG Management Committee.

5C. Programming of Transportation Alternatives/Safe Routes to School Projects in FY 2017

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved a list of six Safe Routes to School projects for FY 2017 in the total amount of \$260,407 of Transportation Alternatives Program funding to be added to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, the draft FY 2017-2021 Transportation Improvement Program, and the 2035 Regional Transportation Plan as appropriate. Through prior MAG action, a total of \$400,000 in Transportation Alternatives funds is set aside each fiscal year for Safe Routes to School non-infrastructure projects. A call for qualifying projects was issued in August 2015 to program \$508,057 in Fiscal Year (FY) 2017 (includes \$108,057 moved to FY 2017 from earlier cycles). Six Safe Routes to School project applications were received requesting a total of \$260,407 in FY 2017. On November 17, 2015, the MAG Transportation Safety Committee reviewed and recommended approval of a list of Transportation Alternatives/Safe Routes to School projects. Since this recommendation will not result in the programming of all available funds, remaining Transportation Alternatives/Safe Routes to School non-infrastructure funds will be transferred to the Transportation Alternatives Program to be used to program infrastructure projects for FY 2018-2020. The six projects to receive funding were recommended for approval on December 17, 2015, by the MAG Transportation Review Committee and on January 6, 2016, by the MAG Management Committee.

5D. Request for Connection to the Regional Community Network

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved the revisions to the Regional Community Network Roles and Responsibilities document. MAG recently received a request from Arizona State University (ASU), with sponsorship from the City of Tempe, to obtain a connection to the Regional Community Network (RCN) fiber optic communications backbone. This connection would enable the ASU Traffic Engineering Laboratory to get access to traffic data from a partnering local agency for research purposes. Such a request cannot be approved within the Roles and Responsibilities document as approved by the Regional Council. This request was discussed at meetings of a Working Group and the MAG Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) and MAG Technology Advisory Group (TAG) committees. Steps necessary to address member agency concerns were noted. The RCN Roles and Responsibilities document has been revised based on discussion, and changes have been incorporated as necessary to accommodate this and similar requests in the future. A draft letter of authorization is also provided. On December 2, 2015, a joint session of the MAG ITS Committee and the MAG TAG recommended

approval. The Regional Community Network Roles and Responsibilities document was recommended for approval on December 17, 2015, by the MAG Transportation Review Committee and on January 6, 2016, by the MAG Management Committee.

5E. Arterial Life Cycle Program Status Report: April 2015 - November 2015

The Arterial Life Cycle Program Status Report provides detail about the status of projects, revenues, and other relevant program information for the period between April 2015 and November 2015. This is the program's twenty-second status report and the first published in Fiscal Year 2016. This item was on the agenda for information and discussion.

5F. Recommendation of Projects for the MAG FY 2016 Traffic Signal Optimization Program

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved the list of FY 2016 Traffic Signal Optimization Program projects. On October 7, 2015, MAG announced a call for new projects for the FY 2016 Traffic Signal Optimization Program (TSOP). The budget available for new TSOP projects is \$300,000. A total of six project applications was received. On December 2, 2015, the MAG Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) Committee reviewed all applications and recommended all six of the proposed projects and two additional projects that would involve performing before-and-after evaluations and a workshop to provide training on traffic signal timing software. These projects would help improve traffic signal coordination along a number of major arterial corridors in addition to freeway-arterial coordination in the Interstate 10 corridor. The total estimated cost for all eight projects is estimated to be \$304,000. An additional \$10,000 is available in TSOP funds carried over from FY 2015. All projects will be carried out using MAG on-call consultants. The list of FY 2016 Traffic Signal Optimization Program projects were recommended for approval on December 17, 2015, the MAG Transportation Review Committee and on January 6, 2016, by the MAG Management Committee.

5G. Federal Fiscal Year 2015 Year End Actuals Report of Federal Highway Administration Suballocated MAG Regional Funds, and Evaluation of Estimated Federal Fiscal Year 2016 Funding Levels

Federal Fiscal Year (FFY) 2015 Federal Highway Administration funding that was suballocated to the MAG region includes Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement Program, Surface Transportation Program, Highway Safety Improvement Program, Transportation Alternatives, and planning funds and programs. Final amounts for those funding allocations and project authorizations were reported by the Arizona Department of Transportation in October 2015. An update is being provided for the FFY 2015 year end actuals and an estimated outlook for FFY 2016 funding. This item was on the agenda for information and discussion.

5H. Programming of Paving Unpaved Road Projects for MAG Federal Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement Program Funding in the Draft FY 2017-2021 MAG Transportation Improvement Program

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved the list of FY 2018 Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement Program funded Paving Unpaved Road projects to be added to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement, and to add the lists of FY 2018, 2019, and 2020 Paving Unpaved Road projects to the Draft FY 2017-2021 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and 2035

Regional Transportation Plan as appropriate. MAG is developing a new Fiscal Year (FY) 2017-2021 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP). A call for projects was announced in August 2015 and the results from the evaluation and prioritization process for the Paving of Unpaved Road projects funded with the Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement Program (CMAQ) funds have been generated. The lists of FY 2018, FY 2019, and FY 2020 CMAQ funded Paving Unpaved Road projects were recommended for approval on November 10, 2015, by the MAG Street Committee, on December 17, 2015, by the MAG Transportation Review Committee, and on January 6, 2016, by the MAG Management Committee.

5I. Programming of Intelligent Transportation Systems Projects for MAG Federal Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement Program Funding in the Draft FY 2017-2021 MAG Transportation Improvement Program

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved the list of FY 2018 Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement Program funded Intelligent Transportation Systems projects to be added to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and to add the lists of FY 2018 and 2019 Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement Program funded projects to the Draft FY 2017-2021 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and 2035 Regional Transportation Plan as appropriate. MAG is developing a new Fiscal Year (FY) 2017-2021 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP). A call for projects was announced in August 2015 and the results from the evaluation process are included for the Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) projects that are funded with Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement Program (CMAQ) funds. The lists of FY 2018 and FY 2019 CMAQ funded ITS projects were recommended for approval on December 2, 2015, by the ITS Committee, on December 17, 2015, by the MAG Transportation Review Committee, and on January 6, 2016, by the MAG Management Committee.

5J. Programming of the Pinal County Surface Transportation Program Projects in Fiscal Year 2018 and Fiscal Year 2020

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved awarding full requested Surface Transportation Program funding to the Gilbert Road project and partial requested Surface Transportation Program funding to the Southern Avenue project in the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, draft FY 2017-FY 2021 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and 2035 Regional Transportation Plan as appropriate. Inclusion of the Southern Avenue project is contingent on a new finding of air quality conformity, anticipated in June 2016. MAG is developing a new Fiscal Year (FY) 2017-2021 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP). On August 10, 2015, MAG released a call for projects for the Pinal County Surface Transportation Program. An estimated \$1.620 million is available for FY 2018 and FY 2020. Three project applications were received by the September 21, 2015, due date. On October 13, 2015, the MAG Street Committee reviewed the applications and deemed one ineligible for funding under the program and had questions concerning the data in the two remaining project applications. The Street Committee requested that the agencies provide additional information at the next meeting. On November 10, 2015, the Street Committee reviewed the updated applications. The two remaining project applications received an identical project score based on the committee's technical review, program measures, and evaluative weights. At the meeting, the Gila River Indian Community indicated that it would not be able to proceed with its Gilbert Road project with partial

funding. The City of Apache Junction subsequently indicated that it would be able to go forward with its Southern Avenue project with partial funding. Awarding full requested funding to the Gilbert Road project and partial requested funding to the Southern Avenue project were recommended for approval on December 17, 2015, by the MAG Transportation Review Committee and on January 6, 2016, by the MAG Management Committee.

5K. Conformity Consultation

The Maricopa Association of Governments is conducting consultation on a conformity assessment for an amendment and administrative modification to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program and 2035 Regional Transportation Plan. The amendment and administrative modification involve several projects, including miscellaneous highway projects, transit projects, as well as Transportation Alternatives Program/Safe Routes To School, Paving Unpaved Road, Intelligent Transportation System, and Pinal County Surface Transportation Program projects for fiscal years 2017 and 2018. The amendment includes projects that may be categorized as exempt from conformity determinations. The administrative modification includes minor project revisions that do not require a conformity determination. This item was on the agenda for consultation.

5L. Ratification of the Annual Performance Review and Compensation Benefits of the MAG Executive Director

This item was removed from the Consent Agenda.

Chair Lane called forward Ms. Fredda Bisman, MAG General Counsel, who stated that at the January Executive Committee meeting, the Committee conducted its annual review of the MAG Executive Director and took action as noted in the agenda material. Ms. Bisman stated that in light of recent publicity at Valley Metro, the Executive Committee made its action contingent on a review of the Executive Director's contract by the Office of the General Counsel. She noted that this review is being conducted and they will report back to the Executive Committee in February.

Chair Lane stated that he wanted to make sure the Regional Council knew the Executive Committee was undertaking additional action in light of current considerations at Valley Metro. He stated that this was not a negative reflection on anything they have seen or heard, just a proactive action. Chair Lane stated that the Executive Committee would be reviewing the contract to ensure it is up-to-date and consistent.

No questions from the Council were noted.

Mayor Cathy Carlat moved to ratify the action of the Executive Committee regarding compensation/benefits of the MAG Executive Director. Vice Mayor Robin Barker seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

6. Status Update on the June 30, 2015 Single Audit and Management Letter Comments, MAG's Comprehensive Annual Financial Report and OMB Circular A-133 Reports (i.e., "Single Audit") for the Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2015

Ms. Becky Kimbrough, MAG staff, stated that CliftonLarsonAllen LLP has completed the audit of MAG's Comprehensive Annual Financial Report (CAFR) and Single Audit for the fiscal year ended June 30, 2015. She noted that a copy of the CAFR was included in the agenda packet. Ms. Kimbrough introduced Mr. Dennis O'Such, Principal of the accounting firm of CliftonLarsonAllen LLP.

Mr. O'Such stated that his firm conducted both the Single Audit Report of major federal programs and financial statement. For the Financial Statement Audit, his firm issued an unmodified opinion that it was in accordance with generally accepted accounting principles.

Mr. O'Such stated that for the Single Audit Report they issue two reports. The first report is the Government Auditing Standards Report, in which they do not issue an opinion, but do report on internal controls related to the financial statements. Mr. O'Such indicated they found no significant deficiencies nor material weaknesses. He said that the second report is the OMB Compliance Supplement and they provide an opinion on compliance with major federal programs and issue an unmodified or clean opinion and report on internal controls as they relate to major federal programs. Mr. O'Such indicated they found no significant deficiencies nor material weaknesses.

Mr. O'Such stated that the Fiscal Year 2014 finding related to documenting some DUNS numbers for subrecipients has been fully corrected. He pointed out one major item in the financial statement is a restatement of net position in the government-wide statements, which was not related to an error, but to new pension standards of GASB 68 and 71. Mr. O'Such explained that this requires all governments to report their unfunded pension liability for the Arizona State Retirement System (ASRS). He noted that previously, this was not required to be reported, just the required annual contributions and whether the government was making the contributions. Mr. O'Such stated that this is a \$13 million liability that is booked to the government wide financial statements on the full accrual basis of accounting and account for long-term assets and liabilities. As a result, a negative net position of \$8 million on the full accrual basis is being reported for MAG. Mr. O'Such explained that this means future liability for the unfunded pension portion but MAG still makes annual contributions based on ASRS contribution rates. He added that MAG's situation is not unusual, and a number of agencies are reporting a negative net position due to pension liability restatement.

Chair Lane remarked on oversight of agencies and noted concerns for the processes at the City of Kingman and Valley Metro. He stated that his question is who is ultimately responsible to review external controls. He noted that the auditor does not control an agency's process, however, might notice irregularities and that the auditor's opinion did not include expressing an opinion on items that were not material and that no opinion of assurance could be given.

Mr. O'Such stated that his firm did not conduct the audits at the City of Kingman and Valley Metro, and their purpose is to give an opinion. He explained their audit method and said that some of the elements have significance to taxpayers, for example, credit card disbursements have the potential for issues and have significance to the public.

Chair Lane stated that in view of the potential for problems, had someone come in and verified the level of internal controls by contracting for an independent audit that the potential lack of controls, though immaterial, would have been reviewed.

Mr. Smith stated that Mayor Jackie Meck is the MAG Treasurer and met with MAG Fiscal Services staff when he took office to learn about the department's functions.

Mayor Meck stated that he and his staff member, who is a former banker, met with MAG Fiscal Services staff. He expressed that he and his staff member were amazed at the competency, the reviews, the checks and balances that resulted in immaculate books. Mayor Meck stated that he was impressed with the amount of work processed by the department.

Chair Lane thanked Mayor Meck for performance of his duties as Treasurer.

Mayor Tom Schoaf wondered if in the budget process unfunded liability, especially with the way MAG is funded, is taken into account. He asked if a plan was in place.

Ms. Kimbrough noted that the unfunded liability is in the future and MAG has no control over it. Ms. Kimbrough stated that the contribution rate is set by the ASRS and approved by GASB, and that the assets and liabilities of the pension system belong to ASRS. It could mean an increase in the contribution rate in the future. Ms. Kimbrough stated that MAG could not fund the unfunded liability because it is a shared plan and ASRS handles this element.

Mr. Smith asked if this situation is common in other states.

Mr. O'Such stated that ASRS liabilities and assets are allocated to participating members. If MAG were to write a check to reduce its unfunded liability with a cost sharing plan, the amount would be applied and reduce the liability to all members. Mr. O'Such added that this differs from the public safety pension system. He stated that you could budget funding the balance, but that would not reduce the liability. Mr. O'Such stated that the liability would always be there, but you could be funding the balance.

Mayor Schoaf asked if this could be covered by federal funds or sales tax revenue. Mayor Schoaf added that he thought that we can include the amount to billing rates for the current year.

Mr. O'Such said that the current year overhead includes only the current year contributions.

Mayor Jackie Meck moved acceptance of the audit opinion issued on the MAG Comprehensive Annual Financial Report and Single Audit Report for the year ended June 30, 2015. Councilmember Dick Esser seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

7. Project Changes – Amendment and Administrative Modification to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program and to the 2035 Regional Transportation Plan

Ms. Teri Kennedy, MAG staff, provided a report on requested transportation project changes to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program by member agencies. Ms. Kennedy reviewed the changes shown on Table C, which include ADOT projects (pavement preservation projects, spot safety improvement projects, railroad crossing improvement projects and the final Grant Anticipation Notes payment); agency project changes related to the MAG Federally Funded, Locally Sponsored Project Development Status Report and general project changes; general transit project changes, FTA Grant bus procurement project changes, and advance purchase of eight rail vehicles to take place in one year (which saves approximately \$1.5 million per vehicle ).

Ms. Kennedy addressed the requested project changes in Table D that resulted from the calls for projects in August 2015. Projects were programmed for the Safe Routes to School Program eligible activities projects, Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement Program paving projects, Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement Program intelligent transportation system projects, and Pinal County Surface Transportation Program projects.

Transportation Board Member Jack Sellers moved approval of amendments and administrative modifications to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and, as appropriate, to the 2035 Regional Transportation Plan. Vice Mayor Robin Barker seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

8. First Year Evaluation Results from the Co-location of DPS Officers at the ADOT Traffic Operations Center

Mr. Sarath Joshua, MAG staff, stated that in August 2014, the MAG Regional Council approved a three-year pilot program with an evaluation component to co-locate Department of Public Safety (DPS) troopers at the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) Traffic Operations Center, for improving coordination necessary for faster response and clearance of major traffic incidents on the freeway system.

Mr. Joshua stated that the program began in October 2014 and it was fully operational in January 2015. He noted that the incident clearance data were gathered using the DPS electronic reporting system, TraCS, and evaluated over the January-September period in 2014 (before the pilot started) versus the same period in 2015. Mr. Joshua introduced Sgt. John Paul Cartier from DPS, one of the troopers at the TOC.

Sgt. Cartier expressed his appreciation to MAG members and to partners, ADOT and Federal Highway Administration. Sgt. Cartier displayed the comparisons for freeway crashes without injuries, crashes with injuries, and fatal crashes. He said that the evaluation has shown that, despite a nearly 23 percent increase in the number of crashes (11,243 in 2014 versus 13,862 in 2015), the average time taken to clear a crash site on freeways was reduced by 54 minutes, helping traffic move more quickly, preventing secondary collisions, and potentially saving lives.

Sgt. Cartier introduced DPS troopers Rob Brown and Dan Williams, who work with him at the TOC on this program. He noted that this project has national implications and they could find no where else that this type of a program was in operation in the country.

Mr. Joshua noted that a press conference on the program's first year evaluation was held on January 19, 2016. He stated that a traffic simulation model at MAG was used to estimate the difference in traffic delay experienced by travelers between 2014 and 2015, using the same observed numbers provided by DPS. He noted that in 2015, traffic delay experienced by travelers, in comparison to 2014, was reduced by nearly 8.4 million vehicle hours, which is equivalent to \$165 million in savings. Mr. Joshua advised that this number does not include potential savings from reductions in secondary crashes.

Mr. Joshua stated that MAG and ADOT are jointly funding the project at nearly \$450,000 for the first year, and approximately \$425,000 per year for years two and three. He noted that the cost/benefit ratio for year one is 368:1.

Chair Lane thanked Mr. Joshua, Sgt. Cartier, and Troopers Brown and Williams. He asked members if they had questions.

Mayor John Lewis recalled the concerns and discussions expressed by the Regional Council members the day this program was approved. He remarked that the results of the evaluation are extremely positive and he was pleased to see the results.

Mayor Cathy Carlat expressed appreciation for the program. She remarked on what an incredible accomplishment this was -- to set a goal and exceed it. Mayor Carlat remarked how many positive reports she had seen on this project and she thought it is a big deal.

State Transportation Board Member Jack Sellers stated that the Board visited the TOC. He said that they were very impressed with the TOC and this is a great addition to its operations.

Vice Chair Greg Stanton remarked that this was an excellent investment that achieved beneficial results. He asked the reason the accident numbers increased.

Sgt. Cartier replied that traffic volumes on the region's highways have increased. In addition, there are more distracted drivers.

Vice Chair Stanton stated that he was proud that local resources helped support this program. This program's reductions and improvements to the local economy could be presented to the Legislature. Vice Chair Stanton asked if there was anything else needed to better support DPS with this effort.

Sgt. Cartier replied continuous investment, which could allow expansion. He also commended ADOT's technology and MAG's fiber have been very helpful to them.

Mr. Smith remarked that ADOT has recently gone through done an organizational change to better address operations. He said that ADOT/DPS working with MAG and FHWA amounted to a culture change. Mr. Smith added that investing in improvements to traffic operations can have a better return than investment in pavement. He stated that this is one of the best investments MAG has made.

Chair Lane expressed his appreciation and remarked that this project has exceeded expectations. He said that better management and use of assets is a big plus in additional safety for the public and officers and reduction in secondary crashes.

9. Final Recommendations on the US-60/Grand Avenue Corridor Optimization, Access Management Plan, and Systems Study (COMPASS)

Mr. Bob Hazlett, MAG staff, provided a report on the US-60/Grand Avenue Corridor Optimization, Access Management Plan, and System Study (COMPASS). Mr. Hazlett stated that MAG decided to conduct the study because a few years ago, ADOT was ready to turn over US-60/Grand Avenue to local control of the agencies the corridor passed through. He stated that the leadership along US-60/Grand Avenue said the corridor is a regional facility and not a local road.

Mr. Hazlett stated that the Charter Partners, elected officials from the member agencies along Grand Avenue, developed a vision statement and guiding principles of the COMPASS study. He indicated that four alternatives were identified during the study: continue with planning improvements contained in the Regional Transportation Plan; reconsider the US-60/Grand Avenue Expressway option; plan for commuter rail with operational improvements; identify other high capacity transit options with US-60 enhancements.

Mr. Hazlett stated that an alternatives screening process was conducted and he pointed out where criteria of travel demand, safety and accessibility, economic opportunity, investment needs, and corridor vision were met and not met by the different alternatives. He noted that neither the Expressway Option nor the Other High Capacity Transit Option the criteria as alternatives for the corridor. Mr. Hazlett stated that the study recommended establishing a corridor access management system; continuing with improvements in the Regional Transportation Plan; addressing remaining bottlenecks and congestion points; and planning for commuter rail with operational improvements.

Mr. Hazlett noted that the 51-page COMPASS recommendations document is posted on the MAG website. He stated that the corridor could be optimized by maintaining private property access, adding ten overcrossings of the BNSF railroad, cleaning up existing geometries of intersections, and reducing the need for traffic signals at some locations. Mr. Hazlett displayed an aerial photograph of the 35th Avenue/Indian School Road/Grand Avenue intersection and noted some of the corridor driveways are recommended for closure to improve operations.

Mr. Hazlett stated that the recommendations are only concepts at this point, and design and environmental clearances are the next steps with required local, state and federal agency approvals. Mr. Hazlett stated that 230 access points could be consolidated from the 429 driveways along the corridor over time, leaving a remainder of 197 driveways. Mr. Hazlett noted that they are currently working with the Town of Youngtown on a couple of access points.

Mr. Hazlett stated that cities along the corridor could form a zoning overlay district to allow them to enforce access management along the corridor. He noted that at the Transportation Policy Committee meeting, Mayor Sharon Wolcott and Mayor Greg Stanton recommended that annual COMPASS progress updates be provided.

Chair Lane thanked Mr. Hazlett for his report.

Mr. Dennis Smith stated that action is not being requested for this item, however, it does have teeth. He said that a list of those that reduced access or increased access will be sent to all member agencies annually. Mr. Smith remarked that they hope this will assist cities in their work with developers.

Mayor Sharon Wolcott expressed her appreciation to Mr. Hazlett and MAG for this project. She remarked that it is important to her city. Mayor Wolcott stated that Grand Avenue is an important facility; it connects five downtowns and has a unique configuration. She commented that it will require everyone to look at land use, which needs to be done correctly. Mayor Wolcott stated that when she first came to Arizona, she was horrified at the number of access points along Grand Avenue. She indicated it needed to be made more people-friendly. Mayor Wolcott stated that the City of Surprise has been successful locating the Westmec campus on Grand Avenue. She indicated that improvements to Grand Avenue will be beneficial to all member agencies along the way. Mayor Wolcott stated that she looked forward to working with all parties on Grand Avenue.

10. Discussion of the Development of the FY 2017 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget

Ms. Kimbrough then reported on the development of the FY 2017 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget. She noted that the draft Dues and Assessments and the proposed budget production timeline were included in the agenda packet. Ms. Kimbrough stated that the development of the Work Program begins in January each year in order to provide opportunities for early input and review.

Ms. Kimbrough explained that the draft MAG Dues and Assessments are calculated using the 2015 average Consumer Price Index-Urban Consumers (CPI-U) estimated at 2.33 percent, which was issued January 20, 2016. She noted that this should be the final number for the Dues and Assessments. Ms. Kimbrough stated that the draft timeline was also included in the agenda packet.

Chair Lane asked members if they had questions. None were noted.

11. Legislative Update

Mr. Nathan Pryor provided an update on legislative items of interest. He stated that the 52nd state legislature second regular session began on January 11, 2016. Mr. Pryor noted the legislative summary was at each place.

Mr. Pryor stated that at Mayor Stanton's request, MAG started tracking HB 2037, which affects First Things First funding. A hearing on this bill was scheduled for that afternoon and they will continue to monitor this legislation.

Mr. Pryor stated that they are following the Joint Technical Education District (JTED) funding issue as the MAG Economic Development Committee has been interested in this issue since the funding reduction was proposed in the last legislative session. Mr. Pryor stated that a breakfast event with a focus on JTEDs, called Opportunity Arizona: Identifying a Qualified Workforce, is scheduled for March 3,

2016. He noted that the breakfast will be at the Sheraton Phoenix Downtown and hosted by the Greater Phoenix Chamber of Commerce.

Mr. Pryor stated that the MAG Building Codes Committee has also requested that a number of bills be tracked that could impact building codes and code enforcement.

Mr. Pryor recalled that in the 2015 legislative session, a bill was enacted that provided approximately \$2.5 million from MAG and approximately \$500,000 from PAG to fund the operations of the Arizona Department of Revenue (ADOR). The funds to pay for the ADOR assessment are from the voter approved half cent sales tax dedicated to transportation improvements. Mr. Pryor stated that last summer, a working group of MAG and PAG elected officials had a number of discussions with the Governor's office to find a solution to this issue. At the August 2015 MAG Regional Council meeting, Mr. René Guillen from the Governor's office presented a potential solution to this issue and to more directly fund the Department of Public Safety.

Mr. Pryor stated that last year, the Rural Transportation Advocacy Council (RTAC) coordinated a letter to the Governor and Legislature requesting a stop of transfers from the Highway Users Revenue Fund (HURF). In January 2015, the MAG Executive Committee supported Mayor LeVault signing the letter on behalf of MAG.

Mr. Pryor stated that MAG received a similar request this year to sign onto a RTAC coordinated letter requesting a stop of the HURF sweeps. However, since MAG has been working with PAG and the Governor's office to find alternatives to fund DPS, limit HURF sweeps, and repeal the ADOR assessment, a joint MAG/PAG letter might be more appropriate. Mr. Pryor stated that a letter has been drafted that has a positive, productive tone that is supportive of funding solutions to these issues. He noted that Tucson Mayor Rothschild has signed the letter on behalf of PAG. Mr. Pryor stated that Mayor Lane could sign the letter on behalf of MAG to reflect the standing position at MAG for similar requests regarding HURF. Mr. Pryor stated that the letter could be sent to the Governor and all members of the Legislature.

Mr. Pryor stated that the Governor's proposed FY 2017 budget does include a HURF transfer and another assessment to MAG and PAG to support ADOR operations. He said that they are hopeful and look to be supportive of finding alternatives to fund DPS, limit HURF sweeps and stop to assessment of MAG and PAG.

Chair Lane thanked Mr. Pryor for his report. He stated that the momentum with Mr. Guillen slowed and remarked that MAG did not agree with the mechanism for funding the Arizona Department of Revenue. Chair Lane noted that discussions need to continue.

Mr. Pryor noted that there still could be an opportunity to work on this issue since it is early in the session.

Vice Chair Stanton suggested an executive session might be an option. He noted there were questions last year on the legality of using Proposition 400 funds to support ADOR. Vice Chair Stanton also noted that the state is now operating in the black so it is beyond the pale to charge us to support ADOR. He stated that this is not acceptable and MAG should invest in legal options.

Mr. Smith stated that a solution to funding DPS is needed. He noted that ADOT Director John Halikowski suggested raising the vehicle registration fee and he indicated that vehicle registration fees are higher in California. Mr. Smith stated that state law allows that \$20 million of the Highway User Revenue Fund can be used toward funding DPS. If the amount from HURF was contained to the \$20 million, it would mean an additional \$500 million over five years would go toward transportation. Mr. Smith noted that adding miles to the highway system has put additional demands on DPS. He stated that he had inquired with Mr. Guillen at the recent JPAC meeting. He added that this year's budget did not include his proposal. Mr. Smith stated that last year, MAG pulled back on the lawsuit.

Vice Chair Stanton asked if the vehicle registration fee increase of Mr. Halikowski was formally proposed last year.

Mr. Smith replied that it was in the Governor's budget proposal, but was removed during the legislative process.

Mayor Kenneth Weise expressed concern that the efforts to work together are gone. He indicated that he thought annual letters were futile. Mayor Weise stated MAG needs to act because this is our money. He remarked that he felt the situation will only worsen and he thought a national downturn could be coming.

Mayor Sharon Wolcott stated that she did not think there was time to waste. She expressed that she liked Mr. Halikowski's proposal, which is a reasonable solution and goes a long way to make us whole. Mayor Wolcott stated that sending letters is ineffective and MAG needs to stand its ground. She added that investing in infrastructure grows a strong state and improves the economy. Mayor Wolcott urged that time not be wasted.

Chair Lane expressed his agreement regarding interaction with the Governor's office.

Supervisor Todd House stated that the County Supervisor's Association shares the same frustration and he noted they have sent the same type of letters. He suggested condensing efforts and partner on this.

Mr. Smith discussed assembling a group of agencies, including the County Supervisor's Association, that could meet with the purpose of presenting a united cause. He noted Mayor Christian Price's comment at the JPAC meeting that fixing DPS funding takes a small bite of the \$20 billion state transportation needs elephant.

Chair Lane asked if there were any objections. None were noted.

Mr. Smith suggested a meeting with the Governor's office.

Mayor Lana Mook commented on funding a very important element, which is public safety.

Vice Chair Stanton stated that public safety is being funded, but by us, not them. He proposed dropping a bill soon because time is passing.

Mr. Smith suggested a meeting with Senator Worsley to potentially run a bill. He noted that Mr. Halikowski proposed legislation that would give Mr. Halikowski the authority to increase the registration fee.

Chair Lane asked if a reason was given why this proposal has not moved forward. Mr. Pryor replied that to his knowledge, no reason had been given.

Mr. Eric Anderson noted that he had met with Mr. Guillen and discussed the proposal. Mr. Anderson said that Mr. Guillen indicated the \$2.5 million for ADOR was part of the Governor's budget, however, he had not had a conversation with the Governor on the budget. Mr. Anderson remarked that he felt nothing was moving forward this year, and from his perspective, potentially there could be a special session on transportation.

Chair Lane said that Mr. Guillen indicated he would forward this to the Legislature. He asked if this had taken place. Mr. Anderson replied not that Mr. Guillen mentioned.

Mayor John Lewis stated that he thought Mr. Guillen was struggling and that some legislators do not support the proposal. Mayor Lewis thought a meeting was a good idea, but recommended a smaller group.

Chair Lane stated that he thought this was an interesting suggestion, but this needs to move quickly.

Mayor Georgia Lord expressed her agreement with Mayor Lewis on being cautious with remarks to the Governor's Office because some of the Governor's statements seemed somewhat threatening to cities. Mayor Lord encouraged that a small group meet soon.

Chair Lane stated that he would be calling Mr. Guillen, and he added that not communicating causes him concern. Chair Lane noted that a small group would be assembled, which could ultimately facilitate a larger group.

Mr. Pryor then continued with his legislative report. He stated that HB 2157, ASRS; political subdivision entities, by Representative Ugenti-Rita is being monitored. In 2014, a bill was run that, if enacted, would have prevented future employees of MAG from being enrolled in the Arizona State Retirement System (ASRS). This would also include other councils of governments, metropolitan planning organizations around the state, as well as the League of Arizona Cities and Towns, county associations, the Arizona Municipal Water Users Association, and others. In 2014, MAG worked with these associations and much credit goes to the MAG member agencies in getting this bill defeated. Mr. Pryor stated that in 2015 the bill was not run, however, in 2016 the bill has been introduced again.

Mr. Pryor stated that at issue is the ability to recruit and retain employees. Many of the employees of MAG come from cities/towns/state/other associations, where they have been enrolled in ASRS. Mr. Pryor stated that just as in 2014, MAG staff is working with the other associations throughout the state and is looking to MAG member agencies to assist in defeating this bill.

Mr. Pryor stated that the bill has been assigned to the House Government and Higher Education Committee; it has not been scheduled for hearing yet. Members of the House Government and Higher

Education Committee in the MAG region include Representative Lela Alston, Phoenix; Representative Larkin, Glendale; Representative Lovas, Peoria; Representative Olson, Mesa; Representative Petersen, Gilbert; Representative Townsend, Mesa. Mr. Pryor encouraged outreach to these legislators in opposition to HB 2157.

Chair Lane thanked Mr. Pryor for his report. No additional questions were noted.

12. Request for Future Agenda Items

Topics or issues of interest that the Regional Council would like to have considered for discussion at a future meeting were requested.

No requests were noted.

13. Comments from the Council

An opportunity was provided for Regional Council members to present a brief summary of current events. The Regional Council is not allowed to propose, discuss, deliberate or take action at the meeting on any matter in the summary, unless the specific matter is properly noticed for legal action.

No comments were noted.

Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 1:10 p.m.

---

Chair

---

Secretary