

MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS  
 REGIONAL DOMESTIC VIOLENCE COUNCIL  
 MEETING MINUTES – JULY 15, 2010

MEMBERS ATTENDING

\*Celeste Adams, Save the Family  
 \*Christina Avila, City of Avondale  
 Marc Rivers for Lt. Robert Bates, Phoenix Police Dept.  
 Kristen Scharlau for Kathy Berzins, City of Tempe  
 Larry Grubbs for John A. Blackburn, Jr., AZ Criminal Justice Commission  
 Allie Bones, Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence  
 \*Rick Buss, Town of Gila Bend  
 \*Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community  
 JoAnn Del-Colle, Phoenix Family Advocacy Center  
 Councilmember Roy Delgado, City of El Mirage  
 \*President Diane Enos, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community  
 Will Gonzalez, City of Phoenix Prosecutor's Office  
 Laura Guild, Arizona Dept. of Economic Security  
 +Linda Melendez for Dan Hughes, City of Surprise  
 \*Cmdr. Kim Humphrey, City of Phoenix Police Dept., Chair  
 Lynette Jelinek, Glendale Fire Dept.  
 Alice Ghareib for Mary Lynn Kasunic, Area Agency on Aging  
 Patricia Klahr, Chrysalis Shelter Inc.  
 Councilmember Suzanne Klapp, City of Scottsdale  
 +Councilmember Sheri Lauritano, City of Goodyear

\*Councilmember Phil Lieberman, City of Glendale  
 \*Jodi Beckley Liggett, Arizona Foundation for Women  
 Barbara Marshall, Maricopa County Attorney's Office, Vice Chair  
 Maria-Elena Ochoa, Governor's Office for Children, Youth, and Families  
 Dottie O'Connell, Chicanos Por la Causa  
 Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center  
 John Pombier, City of Mesa  
 Kay Daukei for Kerry Ramella, City of Phoenix Fire Dept.  
 \*Sarah Youngblood, Community Legal Services

OTHERS PRESENT

Mary Anders-Greenwell, Tempe Police Department  
 Michelle Arino for Angela Andrews, Maricopa County Attorney's Office  
 Cheryl Brunton, City of Phoenix  
 Bill Hart, Arizona State University  
 Lora Reid, Valley of the Sun United Way  
 Samantha Rivera, City of Mesa  
 Carl Mangold, Consultant  
 Kristen Krey, City of Glendale

Rachel Brito, MAG  
 Amy St. Peter, MAG  
 Renae Tenney, MAG

+ Those attending by video/audio conference

\* Those not present or represented by proxy

1. Call to Order

Vice Chair Barbara Marshall, Office of the Maricopa County Attorney, called the meeting to order at 1:36 p.m. Introductions ensued. She introduced Renae Tenney, MAG, to discuss the completed domestic violence plan. Ms. Tenney advised the MAG Regional Plan to End Domestic Violence was available in its final format.

Copies were included along with the meeting handouts. Amy St. Peter, MAG, acknowledged St. Luke's Health Initiatives for sponsoring the plan and Wholonomy Consultants, for facilitating the MAG Regional Plan to End Domestic Violence Summit.

2. Call to the Audience

An opportunity was provided for members of the audience to address the Council on non-agenda items that fall under the jurisdiction of MAG, or agenda items for discussion but not for action. No comments were made.

3. Approval of the May 6, 2010, Meeting Minutes

Vice Chair Marshall called for approval of the May 6, 2010, MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting minutes. Lynette Jelinek, Glendale Fire Department, motioned to approve the minutes. John Pombier, City of Mesa, seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

4. MAG Domestic Violence and Homeless Transportation Project

Vice Chair Marshall introduced Carley Emery, MAG Intern, to provide an update on the Domestic Violence and Homeless Transportation Project. Ms. Emery advised MAG, in partnership with the CARE program at ASU, implemented a Domestic Violence and Homeless Transportation Needs Study in May 2010. The purpose of the study is to evaluate the transportation needs of people experiencing domestic violence and homelessness throughout the region. The questions and protocol for conducting focus groups were developed and finalized in June with input from the domestic violence and homeless shelter stakeholders. Throughout the month of July, eight of the nine scheduled focus groups had been completed.

Ms. Emery noted the main topics broached during the focus group discussions were activities requiring transportation, strengths of transportation, challenges to transportation, and recommendations to improve transportation services. Some of the preliminary findings gathered from the focus group discussions are as follows:

- Important activities requiring transportation include work, looking for work, grocery shopping, and medical appointments. Most residents said owning their own car, using the bus, or using light rail would work best for them when trying to get to the places they need to go.
- Some of the problems reported in accessing transportation include:
  - Prices or accessibility of bus passes/owning a car/light rail/Dial-a-Ride.
  - Disabilities that prevent walking or waiting at bus stops.
  - Bus routes being cut.
  - Non-frequent and unpredictable busses.
  - Requiring employment located along the bus route.
  - Fear of using public transportation due to the possibility of being seen by abusers, stalkers, or people asking too many questions.
  - Missing activities such as visiting family, social outings, appointments, and job opportunities.
  - Difficulty accessing transportation during early mornings, nights and weekends.

- The recommendations residents made to improve transportation include:
  - Decreasing the cost of bus passes.
  - Increasing the frequency and routes of buses.
  - Implementing a van system for transportation to jobs and grocery stores.
  - Increasing the availability of bus and taxi vouchers.
  - Increasing the number of shared vehicles for carpooling.
  - Implementing a neighborhood circulator like the Dash or the Orbit.

Ms. Emery reported results gathered thus far are passionate accounts of people's transportation necessities. She noted another aspect of the project is to gather information about clients' transportation habits from case managers and staff. However, due to busy schedules, only a few surveys have been collected. Ms. Emery advised information will be worked into key informant interviews that will supplement client responses. Once the data has been organized, a report will be provided highlighting the transportation needs and habits of people experiencing domestic violence and homelessness along with policy recommendations to address key issues.

#### 5. MAG Protocol Evaluation Project

Vice Chair Marshall introduced Renae Tenney to provide an update on implementation of the MAG Protocol Evaluation Project (PEP). Ms. Tenney expressed gratitude to the Governor's Office, Division for Women, and STOP Violence against Women Grant for funding the program. She also acknowledged and thanked community partners for their continued support.

Ms. Tenney said the project was developed to assess protocols used to arrest and prosecute domestic violence offenders at the misdemeanor level, build a framework of promising practices, and develop public awareness tools. It will help increase safety for survivors, hold abusers accountable, and produce cost savings by streamlining processes and enhancing operations. Ms. Tenney advised implementation of the project is underway. A diverse group of nearly 30 community partners participated in a PEP workgroup on July 7, 2010. She acknowledged and thanked the following Councilmembers for their participation on the workgroup: Chair Humphrey, Vice Chair Marshall, Celeste Adams, Christina Avila, Lt. Bates, Larry Grubbs, Laura Guild, Katie Hobbs, and Dottie O'Connell.

Ms. Tenney advised the workgroup agenda included discussion about key informant interviews, data collection elements, and promising practices. The group drafted a list of people who should be contacted for key informant interviews. The list includes representatives of the courts, police departments, city prosecutors' offices, domestic violence programs and shelters, medical personnel, child advocates, family advocacy centers, and others. She noted a request to increase East Valley representation on the key informant list. The workgroup also suggested researching existing data collection points gathered by the Governor's Office. They emphasized the importance of using consistent definitions for determining data elements across various municipalities/jurisdictions and how best to identify promising practices. Key indicators for determining promising practices were determined. The meeting notes, a list of key informant interviewees, and a list of key indicators of promising practices were available in the handouts.

The Council was asked for feedback. Recommendations were made to include Child Protective Services (CPS), Child Help, and Lt. Bruce Ciolli, City of Scottsdale Police Department. Vice Chair Marshall noted the greatest impact of the project will be on law enforcement followed by prosecutors. She recommended notifying all jurisdictions of the project and its potential impact.

Kristen Krey, City of Glendale, asked for clarification on whether the draft list of interviewees is different than the meeting attendees. Ms. Tenney advised the interviewee list is a wish list of whom to contact for participation in the interview process. She said the list includes the project's original partners, members of the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council, and other community partners. Input is still being sought for the list. She noted the workgroup continues to invite community partners to the table.

Councilmember Roy Delgado, City of El Mirage, noted cities such as Youngtown have proposed to consolidate courts with other cities. He said this would make the process of obtaining orders of protection more difficult. Councilmember Delgado inquired whether or not PEP would be a venue for recommending ankle bracelets for tracking domestic violence offenders. Ms. Tenney advised orders of protection are a key area being addressed by the Arizona Coalition against Domestic Violence. She invited Allie Bones to provide input. Ms. Bones stated one of the policy priorities for the 2011 legislative process is to extend how long an order of protection is valid from one year to five years. She noted the Avon Program for Women & Justice at the O'Connor House is researching how orders of protection are issued and enforced. She noted they are focusing on the fact that victims are responsible for having the order of protection served. Ms. Tenney noted orders of protection are not addressed in PEP but are a topic of discussion among advocacy groups.

John Pombier, City of Mesa, advised ankle bracelets are not used in domestic violence situations. Use of ankle bracelets has not been recommended due to the costs involved with monitoring offenders. He said the cost of the ankle bracelet is around \$15.00 per month, but the real-time monitoring is expensive to maintain. He noted another concern is the false sense of security they can provide to victims.

Ms. Tenney shared next steps for the project. Three separate sets of interview questions will be developed for law enforcement, prosecution, and survivors. This will ensure the right questions are being asked and appropriate terminology is being used for each group. Discussion about defining the protocols for the project led to the decision to develop an inventory of the protocols, investigation procedures, and/or general orders used by municipalities. Additionally, the workgroup recommended researching key data elements by looking to the Governor's report and Domestic Violence Fatality Review Team data as a starting point. Mr. Pombier asked if any consideration had been given to increasing the amount of time justice and misdemeanor courts maintain records of conviction. He noted retention schedules are typically for one year making it difficult to prosecute cases if prior records are unavailable. There was no further discussion on this topic.

Ms. Tenney said project materials will be revised and emailed out for additional feedback. Future meetings will be scheduled as needed. Any additional input may be forwarded to Ms. Tenney. Vice Chair Marshall asked for a motion to approve the next

steps for implementation of the MAG Protocol Evaluation Project. The Council indicated consensus to move forward with activities as discussed.

6. Annual Domestic Violence Press Conference

Vice Chair Marshall invited Ms. Tenney to discuss plans for the FY 2011 MAG Annual Domestic Violence Press Conference. Vice Chair Marshall noted she and Ms. Tenney participated in a radio interview about domestic violence for CBS Radio which aired on July 4, 2010. Ms. Tenney shared there will be two additional segments on homelessness and human services transportation.

Ms. Tenney gave a brief history on the domestic violence press conference. Since 2004, MAG has hosted an annual press conference at the end of September to announce the arrival of October as Domestic Violence Awareness Month. In previous years, the press conference has focused on recognizing abuse, acting to stop abuse, and recognizing the signs of unhealthy relationships. The press conference provides an opportunity to bring awareness to the issue of domestic violence while highlighting various domestic violence awareness activities taking place throughout the region. Ms. Tenney noted the decision was made to keep Domestic Violence Awareness Month in October instead of changing it to the month of May.

Ms. Tenney acknowledged St. Luke's Health Initiatives (SLHI) for funding last year's press conference, which launched development of the FY 2011 MAG Regional Plan to End Domestic Violence. The SLHI grant specified that this year's press conference would serve to celebrate completion of the new regional plan. Ms. Tenney asked for input on how best to demonstrate forward movement of the plan. Ms. St. Peter noted having a press conference at the end of September featuring the completed plan allows the Council to acknowledge the work done by community partners and highlight a key project, such as the Protocol Evaluation project. PEP could be featured as one example of collaboration that was driven by the plan itself. Ms. St. Peter asked for feedback on other efforts the Council would want to highlight. She also asked for input on key speakers and a venue for the event.

Vice Chair Marshall recommended highlighting new legislation. Councilmember Delgado suggested a proclamation be signed at City Council meetings. He recommended advertising in the City of El Mirage's local newspaper to raise awareness. Ms. St. Peter suggested other agencies or community partners may want to do the same, which would reflect strength within the community. Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center, recommended reiterating the availability of services. She noted media attention on the economy, health care, and other issues has taken over the focus making it important to inform the public that services are still available for those seeking assistance. Lynette Jelinek, Glendale Fire Department, recommended asking Judge Ellie Finn, City of Glendale, to speak at the event.

Ms. Bones suggested speakers include Chiefs of Police, County Attorneys, and others in leadership roles. She noted highlighting PEP would help emphasize the connection between county and city officials working together. Vice Chair Marshall advised PEP will have little impact on county procedures as the focus is on misdemeanor cases. However, the issue of domestic violence would draw the interest of the County

Attorney's Office. Mr. Pombier recommended strongly emphasizing that victims and their cases need to have importance. He said cities and justice courts are facing a wave of immigration issues that will deplete the resources available for addressing domestic violence. He stressed the importance of City Councils recognizing domestic violence as a priority.

JoAnn Del-Colle, Phoenix Family Advocacy Center, recommended inviting Sarah Buel as a speaker for the press conference. She commented on Ms. Buel taking the Director position of the domestic violence clinic at ASU Law School. Ms. St. Peter said it is good to include leadership from within the region. Ms. St. Peter noted one option could be to highlight PEP by holding the press conference in conjunction with the project's promising practices roundtable event which will feature local and national promising practices.

An inquiry was made about the details of last year's press conference. Ms. Tenney stated the press conference was held at Sojourner Center. The event focused on the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council's accomplishments over the past ten years. Speakers included Ms. Phillips; the Honorable Diane Enos, former Chair of the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council; and a survivor of domestic violence.

Input was requested for centrally located and media friendly venues. Ms. Del-Colle recommended the City of Phoenix Hall Atrium. She offered to assist with securing the facility once a date has been confirmed. Ms. Tenney thanked everyone for their input and recommendations. She added a stakeholder group will be scheduled to assist with press conference planning. Councilmembers were asked to notify staff of activities or events occurring in late September to avoid scheduling conflicts. The Arizona Coalition against Domestic Violence Conference scheduled for September 22–24, 2010 was noted.

Vice Chair Marshall asked for a motion to approve next steps for planning the annual domestic violence press conference. Councilmember Delgado made a motion to approve the next steps for planning the domestic violence press conference. Councilmember Suzanne Klapp, City of Scottsdale, seconded the motion. The motion was approved.

7. Sustainable Communities Grant Program

Vice Chair Marshall invited Amy St. Peter, MAG, to present on development of a consolidated application for the federal Sustainable Communities Planning Grant Program. Ms. St. Peter advised the Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD), in partnership with the Department of Transportation and the Environmental Protection Agency are offering the new sustainable communities program. The purpose is to offer funding to support the creation of regional plans for sustainable development with a focus on housing, land use, transportation, and the environment. The goal is to create more affordable housing, stimulate the economy, address social equity, and protect the environment.

Ms. St. Peter advised \$98 million will be available throughout the country. Forty grant awards are anticipated. Of these awards, 25 percent will be for small metro or rural areas. Large metro areas can apply for up to \$5 million. The application process is extremely competitive. MAG is proposing to be the lead applicant for an application on behalf of

the Sun Corridor (Maricopa, Pima, and Pinal Counties). Each of the regions is looking at what can be done to make the Sun Corridor more sustainable. In Maricopa County, the focus is on how to grow green jobs and housing along high capacity transportation routes as well as looking at the canals to provide an alternate mode of transportation such as walking, or biking, along with the social aspect.

Ms. St. Peter advised MAG, the Central Arizona Association of Governments (CAAG), and the Pima Association of Governments, (PAG) are working collaboratively under the umbrella of the Joint Planning Advisory Council (JPAC). JPAC predates the grant application as it was formed more than one year ago. She advised HUD has identified six livability principles to be addressed in the application. Safe neighborhoods are one of the principles identified. Ms. St. Peter said the work of the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council would be relevant to this grant and to the project should funding be awarded. The planning documents available in the meeting materials outline what the application is proposing to do, how the process might work, and who the partners might be. She noted having spoken with Chicanos por la Causa (CPLC) who has agreed to be a partner. Ms. St. Peter requested anyone wanting to become involved should contact her.

Ms. St. Peter reviewed the Partnership Agreement form for the Sun Corridor Consortium. She asked Committee members to identify activities they can complete and return the forms to her. The grant application is due August 23, 2010. She noted some activities can still be accomplished even if funding is not awarded. She said one of the benefits to applying is receiving preferred sustainability status. This distinction is given to applicants who pass the threshold requirements and can be beneficial when applying for funds in the future.

Ms. St. Peter gave an overview of match requirements. She noted St. Luke's Health Initiatives has provided a leverage letter for \$1.2 million dollars, which meets the 20 percent match requirement. She advised the Consortium is attempting to exceed the requirement and reach a 50 percent match. This has been advised to increase the competitiveness of the application. She encouraged Councilmembers to highlight activities their agencies are undertaking and submit leverage letters. She commented leverage letters of any amount are welcomed.

#### 8. Legislative Update

Vice Chair Marshall invited Allie Bones, Arizona Coalition against Domestic Violence, to provide a legislative update. Ms. Bones advised the Coalition's 2011 survey has been distributed. Responses are requested by Monday, July 19, 2010. She provided an overview of the topics listed on the survey including the budget, revision of child custody statutes, predominant aggressor language, and duty to warn. Other efforts include bills to prohibit corporal punishment in schools and to further clarify mandatory reporting requirements for medical personnel. A link to the survey will be forwarded to MAG staff for further distribution to anyone who has not received the survey.

Ms. Bones thanked Dottie O'Connell, Chicanos por la Causa, for working with the media to highlight the impact of SB1070 on victims of domestic violence. Ms. Bones noted recent legislation has led to expanding safety planning to include what to do when a

person comes in contact with law enforcement, how to address the needs of the children, powers of attorney, and roles of shelter staff.

Ms. Bones said Allan Katz, Morrison Institute for Justice, has crafted a memo based on a guide from the ACLU. The memo provides information and recommendations on how to live in the post SB1070 world. The Coalition is developing a user-friendly guide for shelter staff. Ms. Bones said questions are often asked about why domestic violence is such a big focus in regards to SB1070. She noted domestic violence does not discriminate based on citizenship, legal residency, or being undocumented. Ms. Bones acknowledged De Colores for the tremendous job they are doing in providing guidance to domestic violence advocates.

Mr. Pombier requested advocacy to mandate that court records memorialize orders of protection to ensure proof they have been issued.

9. Governor's Commission to Prevent Violence Against Women

Vice Chair Marshall invited Maria-Elena Ochoa, Governor's Office for Children, Youth, and Families, to provide an update on Commission activities. Ms. Ochoa reported on the following activities:

*Commission Meeting - July 8, 2010:* A presentation was given by Mona Lou Callery, Director of the Diane Halle Center of Family Violence at the Sandra Day O'Conner Law School. Ms. Ochoa said they are working with various schools at ASU to provide a holistic approach to address family violence. The opening will be held in fall 2010 with a grand opening event scheduled for January 2011.

*Grant Funding:* The Commission is working hard to distribute remaining STOP Recovery grant funds. A Request for Grant Application (RFGA) is being prepared for the fall. Rural grants are being clarified for FY 2011-12.

*Governor's Office Division For Women:* Ms. Ochoa advised JoAnn Del-Colle is Chair of the Sexual Assault Forensic Exam Workgroup. The group is finalizing a brochure and shoe cards for victims of sexual assault. Once completed, the resources will be posted on the Family Advocacy Center and Division for Women websites. Twenty-five thousand brochures will be printed. A brochure on relationship violence among teens has also been developed. These brochures are funded through a grant from the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community

*Fatality Review Workgroup:* Ms. Ochoa said Chief Monahan, Chair of the workgroup, announced Arizona has a seventh formal Fatality Review Team (FRT). The East Valley Agencies Team includes Mesa, Apache Junction, Chandler, Tempe, Gilbert, and Scottsdale. The team will be ready to review cases in late August. She noted two representatives from Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) will serve on a panel at the August conference.

Ms. Ochoa reported on meetings held between May 14 and June 28 during which commitments were made to form Fatality Review Teams in Cochise County, Santa Cruz, Yavapai County, and Navajo County.

*State Agency Coordination Team (SACT):* SACT consists of nine state agencies administering domestic violence, sexual assault, and some victims of crime funding. The group has been in existence since 1996. Their purpose is to have routine conversations about how to administer funds in a non-duplicative manner, meet the needs of victims, and manage funds efficiently.

Ms. Ochoa reported the SACT team is interested in participating with the Department of Economic Security to hold regional community conversations. Meetings have been scheduled in Yuma, Tucson, Prescott, Kingman, Flagstaff, Snowflake, Sierra Vista, Apache Junction, and Maricopa. Meetings in Maricopa have not yet been scheduled. They will be done in collaboration with MAG. Discussion at the meetings will include the following questions:

- What services are readily accessible in your area?
- How has the downturn in the economy affected services to victims?
- What changes, if any, have been seen in the request for services from victims?
- If you were responsible for funding, what five services, based on victims' needs, would be funded?

*Other Announcements:*

- The 2010 Sexual Assault Conference will be held at the Glendale Civic Center. Funding is provided by STOP funds and the Glendale Police Department.
- Yuma is working with the Mexican Consulate to inform them on victim's rights, services, and supports.
- The Douglas shelter is scheduled to be completed at the end of July, which will make 24 additional beds available.
- Amberly's Place is gearing up to celebrate their ninth anniversary in Yuma.

10. Request for Future Agenda Items

Committee members were asked to provide input on topics or issues of interest that the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council would like to have considered for discussion at a future meeting.

Ms. Klahr, Chrysalis Shelter, Inc., asked for any information regarding who administers the ADT program. She said the program helps victims get an alarm system or panic button for their residence. Additionally, she shared the grand opening of Chrysalis Phoenix Shelter will be held at the end of August as construction is almost complete. Invitations to the dedication will soon be distributed. Chair Marshall requested any information regarding ADT be forwarded to Ms. Tenney for distribution to the Council.

11. Comments from the Council

An opportunity was provided to Committee members to present a brief summary of current events. No input was received.

Ms. Bones announced Domestic Violence Awareness Night will be held at the Arizona Diamondbacks game on Friday, August 6, 2010. The event is in partnership with the City of Phoenix and the Family Advocacy Center. The Coalition is hoping to grow the

awareness night into a larger scale event, especially since the domestic violence walk will no longer be held. Discussions are underway regarding having survivors, shelter workers, and other community partners participate in the pre-game awareness activities.

The Coalition's 30<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Gala Celebration and Awards Dinner will be held on September 22, 2010. The Coalition, in partnership with the Arizona Foundation for Women S.H.E. Counts Coalition, will hold a gubernatorial debate on September 22<sup>nd</sup> and the *Telling our Stories, Writing our Future* Conference will be held September 23–24, 2010. Additional information can be found at [www.azcadv.org](http://www.azcadv.org)

Additionally, Ms. Bones noted July marks the time to renew annual memberships with the Coalition. The full program membership definition is being changed to include non-residential providers of domestic violence services.

12. Adjourn:

The meeting adjourned at 2:51 p.m. The next MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting is scheduled for September 16, 2010 at 1:30 p.m. in the Cholla Room at the MAG offices.