

MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
REGIONAL DOMESTIC VIOLENCE COUNCIL
MEETING MINUTES – FEBRUARY 2, 2012

MEMBERS ATTENDING

*Celeste Adams, Save the Family
+Christina Avila, City of Avondale
Sgt. Marc Rivers for Lt. Robert Bates,
Phoenix Police Dept.
+John Belatti, City of Chandler Prosecutor's
Office
John A. Blackburn, Jr., Arizona Criminal
Justice Commission
Elizabeth Ditlevson for Allie Bones, Arizona
Coalition Against Domestic Violence
*Town Manager Rick Buss, Town of Gila
Bend
Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa
Indian Community
*JoAnn Del-Colle, Phoenix Family
Advocacy Center
Councilmember Roy Delgado, City of El
Mirage
*President Diane Enos, Salt River Pima-
Maricopa Indian Community
Kristen Scharlau for Naomi Farrell, City of
Tempe
Patricia George for Will Gonzalez, City of
Phoenix Prosecutor's Office
Laura Guild, Arizona Dept. of Economic
Security
*Cmdr. Kim Humphrey, City of Phoenix
Police Dept., Chair
+Karla Houston for Lynette Jelinek, Glendale
Fire Dept.
Alice Ghareib for Mary Lynn Kasunic, Area
Agency on Aging
+Patricia Klahr, Chrysalis Shelter Inc.
*Councilmember Suzanne Klapp, City of
Scottsdale
*Councilmember Sheri Lauritano, City of
Goodyear
*Councilmember Phil Lieberman, City of
Glendale
Debbie Hall for Jodi Beckley Liggett,
Arizona Foundation for Women

Barbara Marshall, Maricopa County
Attorney's Office, Chair
Jerald Monahan, Apache Junction Police
Department, Vice Chair
*Mary Murphy, Governor's Office for
Children, Youth, and Families
Dottie O'Connell, Chicanos Por la Causa
*Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center
Lynn Potts for John Pombier, City of Mesa
Prosecutor's Office
*Kerry Ramella, City of Phoenix Fire Dept.
*Sarah Youngblood, Community Legal
Services

OTHERS PRESENT

Detective George Arias, Chandler Police
Department
Sergeant Patrick Beumler, Glendale Police
Department
Catrina Boppat, Sojourner Center
Rita Coronado, Peoria Police Department
Aimee Currey, El Mirage Police Department
Paulina Jackson, Yavapai-Apache Nation
Carl Mangold, Therapist
Brenda Nichols, Arizona Department of
Health Services
Teisha Portee, Scottsdale Police Department
Iva Rody, El Mirage Police Department
Robert Ruocco, Homeward Bound
Sarabeth Seer, Elim House
Kim Sterling-Heflin, O'Connor House
+Beya Thayer, Coconino County

Rachel Brito, MAG
Renae Tenney, MAG

+Those attending by video/audio conference
* Those not present or represented by proxy

1. Call to Order
Chair Barbara Marshall, Maricopa County Attorney's Office, called the meeting to order at 1:35 p.m. She welcomed Jerald Monahan, City of Apache Junction, to his first meeting as Vice Chair of the Council. Introductions ensued.
2. Call to the Audience
An opportunity was provided for members of the audience to address the Council on non-agenda items that fall under the jurisdiction of MAG, or agenda items for discussion but not for action. No comments were made.
3. Approval of the December 1, 2012 Meeting Minutes
Chair Marshall called for approval of the December 1, 2011, MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting minutes. Councilmember Roy Delgado, City of El Mirage, motioned to approve the minutes. Lynn Potts, City of Mesa Prosecutor's Office, seconded the motion. The motion passed.
4. Domestic Violence Protocol Evaluation Project
Chair Marshall invited Renae Tenney, MAG, to offer an update on the Domestic Violence Protocol Evaluation Project. Ms. Tenney said thanks to a new STOP Grant through the Governor's Office, the Committee will be able to continue the work of the Domestic Violence Protocol Evaluation Project. The next chapter of the project will include updating the misdemeanor protocol model developed last year, expanding the reach of the project to include assessing the implementation of felony-level protocols, and exploring opportunities for measuring success through data collection.

Ms. Tenney acknowledged the 20 project partners who assisted with development of the STOP Grant application. These partners either signed a Memorandum of Understanding or provided Letters of Participation for submission with the grant. The partners include: The Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence; Arizona Criminal Justice Commission; Arizona Peace Officers Standards and Training Board; Arizona Prosecuting Attorney's Advisory Council; Apache Junction Police Department; Avondale Police Department; Buckeye Police Department; Glendale City Court; El Mirage Police Department; Gilbert Police Department; Maricopa County Attorney's Office; Mesa Prosecutor's Office; Peoria Police Department; Phoenix Police Department, Prosecutor's Office, and Family Advocacy Center; Scottsdale Prosecutor's Office; Sojourner Center; Southwest Family Advocacy Center; and Tolleson Police Department.

Implementation of the next chapter of PEP will mirror many of the activities conducted last year. Ms. Tenney referred Committee members to the 2012 project timeline noting the project has been divided into three phases: Information Gathering, Research, and Training.

Phase I will gather information from community stakeholders through a series of affinity group meetings with law enforcement, prosecutors, victim advocates, and community leaders. In addition, focus groups will be held with survivors of domestic violence. This phase will lay the groundwork for the rest of the project.

Phase II will research the implementation of misdemeanor and felony protocols. Affinity groups will be convened to identify opportunities for enhancing implementation of these protocols. Areas of opportunity will be identified and local priorities determined. Data collection methods and indicators of success will be analyzed. Research into promising practices will help establish the most effective practices with local relevance and the potential for successful replication. This phase will result in recommended practices for enhancing implementation of domestic violence protocols.

Phase III will develop and deliver various training resources to assist in putting the recommended practices in place. These resources will include in-person training, a training video, and webinars to ensure misdemeanor and felony protocols are being implemented in the field.

Ms. Tenney advised the next chapter of PEP will include a few new activities as well. Based on feedback, affinity group or peer-to-peer meetings will continue with the addition of multi-disciplinary, topic-based discussions. These conversations will be open to anyone interested in participating. This new component will allow for bringing together broader perspectives to further inform the project.

In addition, opportunities to better support victim advocates in their work with victims and survivors will be explored through a collaborative effort with the AVON Program for Women and Justice at the O'Connor House. Findings from the AVON Program's Victim Advocate Survey will provide a starting point for further research. Ms. Tenney advised through the Arizona State University Community Action Research Experiences (CARE) program staff has identified an intern to work on this project. The intern's activities will include developing an inventory of existing training and networking resources, conducting further research with victim advocates through surveys and/or focus groups, and making recommendations on how best to support their work. Findings will be provided to the AVON Program for possible implementation.

A meeting with the PEP Partners has been scheduled. Affinity group meetings will be scheduled for later this month. In March, focus groups will be conducted with victims and survivors in residential and non-residential programs. Staff is seeking volunteers to help organize focus groups with their clients. Anyone interested in assisting is asked to contact Ms. Tenney. Staff will also be gathering information on topics to explore during the survivor focus groups with a focus on learning about their experiences with the criminal justice system. This will include what worked well, what didn't, and if they didn't use this system, why not. Ideas for topics to explore during focus groups are welcomed.

Ms. Tenney concluded her update. John A. Blackburn, Jr., Arizona Criminal Justice Commission, made a motion to approve the next steps for continuing the work of the Domestic Violence Protocol Evaluation Project. Lynn Potts, City of Mesa, seconded the motion. The motion was approved.

5. Regional Plan to End Domestic Violence

Chair Marshall invited Ms. Tenney to offer a progress report on the Regional Plan to End Domestic Violence. Ms. Tenney advised the plan was completed in June 2010. The plan

laid out 15 strategies for addressing funding, training and education, coordination and collaboration, and services. Progress is monitored on a quarterly basis through reports to the Council. Quarterly reports provide an opportunity for the Council to determine if modifications are needed. This consistent oversight ensures timely and complete implementation of the plan. Ms. Tenney noted the progress report was sent out for review prior to the meeting. She asked if there were questions, comments or concerns about the progress report. Ms. Tenney advised information regarding activities that occurred in collaboration with the Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence and the Governor's Office were added since the last progress report. Mr. Blackburn made a motion to approve the Regional Plan to End Domestic Violence progress report. Lynn Potts, City of Mesa, seconded the motion. The motion was approved.

6. Committee Meeting Start Time Survey

Chair Marshall discussed the meeting start time survey. She noted due to a conflicting meeting she is unable to arrive at the meetings until 2:00 p.m. John Belatti, City of Chandler, recommended keeping the meetings on Thursday and changing the start time to 2:00 p.m. to accommodate Chair Marshall's schedule. Karla Houston agreed, on behalf of Lynette Jelinek, City of Glendale. Christina Avila, City of Avondale, and Patricia Klahr, Chrysalis Shelter, Inc. both expressed agreement.

Chair Marshall offered an opportunity for Committee members in attendance to express their preference for the meeting start time through a roll-call vote. The majority of members agreed to a 2:00 p.m. start time. Councilmember Roy Delgado, City of El Mirage, expressed his preference for an alternate start time. Chair Marshall noted Committee members may also attend meetings via audio conference. Ms. Potts made a motion to approve the start time of 2:00 p.m. for the 2012 MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meetings based on the roll-call survey of the Committee. Mr. Blackburn seconded the motion. Councilmember Delgado opposed the motion. The motion passed.

7. Domestic Violence Fatality Review Initiative

Chair Marshall invited Vice Chair Monahan to offer a report on the Domestic Violence Fatality Review Teams. Vice Chair Monahan offered a brief history noting Arizona began reviewing domestic violence related fatalities in 1998-1999. The Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence had grant money available and began the initial work of reviewing cases and statistics. Dr. Neil Websdale, National Domestic Violence Fatality Review Initiative, also did some preliminary work with the Coalition during that time period. Mohave County was one of first teams to form in 2000-2001 prior to the state legislation protecting the confidentiality of these cases.

Vice Chair Monahan advised three things happened in 2004 that were instrumental in moving the initiative forward: the national conference on domestic violence fatality review was held in Arizona, Arizona Revised Statute 41-198 passed, and the Governor's Commission to Prevent Violence Against Women created a state plan to address sexual assault and domestic violence. One of the 56 recommendations laid out in the Governor's State Plan was to develop and implement domestic violence fatality review teams.

Vice Chair Monahan noted there are both city and county teams. The City of Phoenix launched the first formal city team under Arizona legislation. Pinal County developed the second team based on a county model. In 2008, the Governor's Commission voted to assist in the development and implementation of fatality review teams across the state. Vice Chair Monahan led the work group for this effort. Currently, there are eight formal municipal teams. He referenced a map highlighting domestic violence fatality review teams formed by region. He noted there are various models around the state including municipal governments, county and city partnerships. For example, Coconino County and the City of Flagstaff have developed a team while six East Valley cities have formed another.

Vice Chair Monahan noted progress has been made. When selecting a case, teams are asked to ensure the case involved interactions with the criminal justice system. The desired outcomes include assessing system interventions for improvements to prevent similar incidents from occurring in the future. Each team reviews one case per year.

Vice Chair Monahan advised an East Valley team is in place and a West Valley team is coming together. The East Valley team consists of the cities of Mesa, Chandler, Tempe, Scottsdale, and towns of Gilbert and Apache Junction. Over the course of five months, the East Valley team reviewed a Scottsdale case. Recommendations for change were made along with strategies for implantation. He noted Arizona teams are not seeking long lists of recommendations. They tend to highlight two to four recommendations per review.

Vice Chair Monahan commented on additional teams in various stages of process. He advised the West Valley is replicating the East Valley model. The City of Glendale and the Town of Wickenburg are in the process of having their legal advisors review their process. Yavapai County is drafting their county resolution for their Board of Supervisors to approve.

Vice Chair Monahan noted work continues on a national level and Arizona is fortunate to have Dr. Neil Websdale, National Domestic Violence Fatality Review Initiative, working in Flagstaff. Dr. Websdale was recently refunded by the Department of Justice to continue work over the next three years. As part of this effort, Arizona will host three conferences throughout the state focusing on risk and lethality. An additional conference will be offered in Phoenix for the fatality review teams.

Chair Marshall asked if there have been any common themes among cases reviewed. Vice Chair Monahan responded two reviews noted barriers to obtaining information from mental health providers such as counselors or therapists. This information was not made available to the team. One of their recommendations was to invite a member of the licensing board to participate on the review team. This might help communicate that those participating on the team will not endanger their license. Other themes involved issues about probation and batterer treatment programs. Inconsistencies were identified in how judges are ordering and administering batterer treatment. State regulations require 26-weeks of treatment. The recommendation was made to bring this to the attention of the Arizona Supreme Court's Committee on the Impact of Domestic Violence and the Courts (CIDVC). The Department of Health Services brought this matter to the attention

of CIDVC. Vice Chair Monahan noted these are small steps but the teams are moving in the right direction. He shared a few examples of other unexpected intangible outcomes that are also assisting in moving the process forward.

Chair Marshall commented Dr. Websdale feels strongly that suicide, especially those committed by women, are domestic violence related. She questioned whether or not this issue has been researched by fatality review teams. Vice Chair Monahan said he is unaware of any teams focusing on suicide. He noted those types of cases can be reviewed. Arizona law changed last year to also allow near fatalities to be reviewed.

Elizabeth Ditlevson, Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence, advised the Coalition maintains a list of domestic violence fatalities. Information is gathered primarily from news reports. She said unless a case is a homicide/suicide, they do not include suicides due to limited access to information. She noted the Coalition is unable to provide a list of cases involving suicide to fatality review teams. Vice Chair Monahan acknowledged the Coalition's participation on fatality review teams statewide. He commended the involvement of Ms. Stephanie Mayer on many of the state's teams. Additionally, he introduced Ms. Beya Thayer from the Coconino County team. Ms. Thayer said fatality review teams are a great process for developing a community's response to domestic violence.

8. Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence's Strategic Plan and Legislative Update
Chair Marshall invited Ms. Ditlevson to offer an update on the Coalition's activities. Ms. Ditlevson advised a handout of the Coalition's 2012 legislative priorities would be provided to Ms. Tenney for distribution to the Committee. The information was not available during the meeting.

She noted one of the Coalition's top priorities is working on the custody statute SB 1248 (domestic relations; decision-making; parenting time). The Domestic Relations Committee has been working for years on rewriting the custody bill. The rewrite addresses coercive control as a factor to consider when awarding custody. As noted by the Coalition, "research indicates abuse often continues throughout and after the court process, and judges should take into account a victim parent's experience of abuse and control before awarding custody. The Coalition supports language that requires judges to make custody decisions that prioritize the safety of children and victim parents."

The Coalition is opposing HB 2587 (domestic relations; children; family unit). This bill "requires divorcing couples with children to attend mandatory pre-divorce counseling. There is a poorly worded exemption that does not ensure protection for victims." Ms. Ditlevson advised the bill reduces the marriage license fee by half if participants go through pre-marital counseling. This would result in a \$67,000 loss to domestic violence programs and services in the region. The Coalition is working with the sponsor of the bill to increase the base fee to ensure there is not a negative impact to funding for domestic violence programs, if the bill passes.

Chair Marshall recalled Judge Elizabeth Finn, City of Glendale, offered information about rule changes at the last meeting. One of the proposed rule changes will keep protective orders exempt from public inspection until they are served. The other states

victims will be notified by mail once protective orders are served. Ms. Ditlevson asked if language had been added to allow jurisdictions more options, such as email, for victim notification. Mr. Belatti advised there have been several suggestions to modify the original language. A draft is currently being vetted through different committees at the State Bar. He suggested the Committee discuss this topic further at the next meeting. Chair Marshall advised both rules will be forwarded to Ms. Tenney to be distributed to the Committee. Chair Marshall advised the proposed rule changes are open for public comment.

9. Success Stories

Chair Marshall offered an opportunity for the Committee to share stories of success experienced during their work with survivors of domestic violence.

Vice Chair Monahan advised he had received a call from the Coconino County Victim Witness Program expressing interest in obtaining a copy of the PEP training video. He advised Ms. Beya Thayer, Coconino County Coordinated Community Response Team, was able to deliver the training video to Coconino County in time for their meeting. Coconino County used the video and found it valuable in their training. Ms. Tenney said it is exciting to see the work of PEP expanding across the state.

Ms. Ditlevson noted there are limited training opportunities for offender treatment programs. Licensing for these services requires 40 hours of training. She noted batterer interventionists were attending the Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence's "The Sharing Experience" to fulfill this requirement. This training provides general domestic violence training but does not provide training specific to working with offenders. Ms. Ditlevson advised the Coalition is working with Mr. Carl Mangold to develop curriculum for a 40-hour training specifically for offender treatment. "The Sharing Experience" is a pre-requisite for taking the offender treatment training. Professionals who want to attend are invited to participate. The first class will be held on April 15, 2012 with additional classes planned for November.

Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community (SRP-MIC), advised Mr. Mangold has been assisting them with this same issue. SRP-MIC began a batterer intervention program in December. They currently offer two sessions for male perpetrators and one for females through a grant received from the Office for Victims of Crime.

Mr. Belatti advised the City of Chandler is pursuing efforts to reinstitute county supervised probation officers for their domestic violence cases. He noted they do not currently have probation officers for this purpose.

Vice Chair Monahan discussed the tool used by the City of Phoenix to identify coercive control behaviors. Sgt. Marc Rivers, City of Phoenix, shared a success story in which a judge was able to identify coercive behavior from information documented in the police report. Based on this, the judge increased the amount of jail time recommended by the prosecutor in addition to ordering supervised probation, restitution, and anger management classes.

Patricia George, City of Phoenix Prosecutor's Office, noted collaborative efforts and communication between her office and the Maricopa County Attorney's Office (MCAO) has led to increased opportunities to keep offenders in custody until trial. When a case is deemed a felony, they work closely with MCAO to ensure the offenders aren't released before the case is filed with the County. Sgt. Rivers noted increased communication and collaboration between officers at the Family Advocacy Center and prosecutors has helped in determining whether a case should proceed in city court as a misdemeanor or be sent to the county to pursue felony charges.

Ms. Ditlevson advised the Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence is hosting a predominant aggressor and mandatory arrest work group. Anyone interested in joining or wanting more information may contact Ms. Ditlevson.

Chair Marshall advised the Office of the Maricopa County Attorney is proposing changes in the Juvenile Justice arena. One of the changes will be to exempt children under the age of 15 from the mandatory arrest provision of the statute. She provided brief background leading up to the proposed changes. She noted this effort will begin dialogue regarding alternative services for children living in domestic violence environments.

10. Request for Future Agenda Items

Committee members were given an opportunity to suggest topics or issues of interest they would like to have considered for discussion at a future meeting. The following items were suggested:

- Protective order rule changes.
- Legislative update.
- Address Confidentiality Program update.

11. Comments from the Council:

Committee members were given an opportunity to share announcements.

Mr. Blackburn advised the Arizona Criminal Justice Commission approved opening up a rule making docket for victims' compensation and victims' assistance programs in March. The Commission is seeking input to streamline the process.

Debbie Hall, Arizona Foundation for Women, advised a reunion and member drive event for the Men's Anti-violence Network is scheduled from 5:00-7:00 p.m. on March 15, 2012. She noted their website is being updated to include an online training for employers about addressing domestic violence in the workplace.

12. Adjourn:

Chair Marshall thanked everyone for their input and attendance. The meeting adjourned at 2:34 p.m. The next MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting is scheduled for April 5, 2012 at 2:00 p.m. in the Saguaro Room of the MAG offices.