

**MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
REGIONAL DOMESTIC VIOLENCE COUNCIL
MEETING MINUTES – December 6, 2012**

<p style="text-align: center;"><u>MEMBERS ATTENDING</u></p> <p>Celeste Adams, Save the Family Christina Avila, City of Avondale *Lt. Robert Bates, Phoenix Police Dept. +John Belatti, City of Chandler Prosecutor’s Office John A. Blackburn, Jr., Arizona Criminal Justice Commission Jessye Johnson for Allie Bones, Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community *Lacey Rose Cox, Town of Gilbert Police Dept. Councilmember Ginny Dickey, Town of Fountain Hills *Jon Eliason, City of Mesa Prosecutor’s Office *President Diane Enos, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community Kristen Scharlau for Naomi Farrell, City of Tempe Jessica Blazina for Janeen Gaskins, City of Surprise *Will Gonzalez, City of Phoenix Prosecutor’s Office Laura Guild, Arizona Dept. of Economic Security *Cmdr. Kim Humphrey, City of Phoenix Police Dept. *Lynette Jelinek, Glendale Fire Dept. Alice Ghareib for Mary Lynn Kasunic, Area Agency on Aging *Patricia Klahr, Chrysalis Shelter, Inc. *Councilmember Suzanne Klapp, City of Scottsdale</p>	<p>+Councilmember Sheri Lauritano, City of Goodyear Barbara Marshall, Maricopa County Attorney’s Office, Chair Leah Meyers for Mary Murphy, Governor’s Office for Children, Youth, and Families Maribel Gloria for Dottie O’Connell, Chicanos por la Causa Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center *Kerry Ramella, City of Phoenix Fire Dept. Councilmember Lynn Selby, City of El Mirage +Sarah Youngblood, Community Legal Services</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><u>OTHERS PRESENT</u></p> <p>Kristina Bunch, Goodyear Police Department Elizabeth Ortiz, Arizona Prosecuting Attorneys Advisory Council Tom Hutchinson, A New Leaf Teisha Portee, City of Scottsdale Jewel James, City of Scottsdale Bill Hart, Morrison Institute, Arizona State University Sandy Robertson, A New Leaf Dick Geasland, Sojourner Center Stephanie Smith, Peoria Police Department</p> <p>Rachel Brito, MAG Amy, St. Peter, MAG Rena Tenney, MAG</p> <p>+Those attending by video/audio conference * Those not present or represented by proxy</p>
--	---

1. Call to Order
Chair Barbara Marshall, Maricopa County Attorney’s Office, called the meeting to order at 2:08 p.m. and welcomed Councilmember Ginny Dickey, Town of Fountain Hills, to the Committee. Introductions ensued.

2. Call to the Audience

An opportunity was provided for members of the audience to address the Council on non-agenda items that fall under the jurisdiction of MAG, or agenda items for discussion but not for action. There were no comments.

3. Approval of the November 1, 2012 Meeting Minutes

Chair Marshall called for approval of the November 1, 2012, MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting minutes. John Blackburn Jr., Arizona Criminal Justice Commission, motioned to approve the minutes. Christina Avila, City of Avondale, seconded the motion. The motion passed.

4. Cradle to Crayons Presentation

Chair Marshall invited Honorable Eddward Ballinger, Presiding Judge of Maricopa County Juvenile Court, to offer a presentation on Cradle to Crayons, a specialty court for dependency cases involving children ages zero to three years of age.

Judge Ballinger noted that in 2011 the court system was experiencing a tremendous number of cases in the child welfare system. The rate of filings for dependency actions increased by 50 percent between 2010 and 2011. An additional 30 percent increase was experienced within the last year. The cases center primarily on children ages zero to five years of age, with the majority being under the age of three years. Judge Ballinger noted his work with the Juvenile Court began in 2010. Children in this age group are spending years in the child welfare system. He discussed the importance of finding children a permanent, safe, and loving home where they can form an attachment before the age of three. The program's focus is on the best interests of the child.

Judge Ballinger noted a change to the system was needed. Issues facing children under the age of five were identified and discussed. These included not being evaluated properly, abuse, witness trauma, developmental needs, fatality, and more. In July 2011, a new court was created. Four judges were assigned to the court to handle cases with infants and toddlers ages three years and under. It was noted that the program was originally intended for children ages zero to five. However, due to the high volume and , the age was lowered to zero to three years of age. Judge Ballinger noted that unlike other assignments, these judges do not rotate out of the court. This allows them an opportunity to become more knowledgeable of the individual and ongoing developmental needs of infants and toddlers.

Judge Ballinger provided an overview of the process prior to the Cradle to Crayons program. In the past, a child was removed from the home and placed in foster care. Parents were ordered to attend classes such as anger management or substance abuse and return to court six months later. After six months, the agency providing services would likely report back to the judge on the parents' lack of engagement. The parents and their lawyers would point blame at the agencies for not providing assistance to follow-through with the program requirements. These situations placed tremendous pressure on judges making a determination in cases.

The Cradle to Crayons program has changed this process. It now includes more frequent hearings, more parent contact with children, and a dependency drug court. Judge Ballinger noted there is now a new paradigm that immediately sets into motion two tracks for each case. One track gives parents the opportunity to comply with court orders and be reunited with their children. The other one identifies from the first day an alternative placement for the child. He commented on the need to ensure parents are given a fair opportunity for reunification. Efforts are underway to set up additional meaningful services for them. He noted many struggle with issues such as substance abuse or lacking positive parenting skills. The Cradle to Crayons Child Welfare Center was set up to offer active parenting-coaching sessions with parents. These efforts are to help parents gain skills and win their case. Completion of the program increases their chances of reuniting with their children.

The program's success is leading to further expansion and replication. Judge Ballinger noted within seven to eight months there will be six judges assigned to the program. In addition, federal grant funding was received to hire staff to work with children who are placed in foster care to ensure they are enrolled in programs such as Head Start. Additional efforts are underway to set up a program for those children who have experienced trauma and are unable to attend a typical Head Start program. Judge Ballinger advised that Maricopa County has provided a \$2 million grant toward these efforts. He shared pictures of the campus including the kitchen facilities, common areas for parents, as well as indoor and outdoor play areas. Judge Ballinger stated a commitment is in place to replicate the campus in downtown Phoenix. The ultimate goal is to replicate these services in three locations across the valley.

Leah Meyers, Governor's Office, asked whether the program provides space for supervised visitation for custody cases. Judge Ballinger advised this is not part of their services. Ms. Meyer commented grant funding is available to assist with adding these services, if the program was interested. She noted Pinal County is providing supervised visitation services for domestic violence cases. She commented on the importance of these services when allegations of abuse exist to keep the abuser from having an opportunity to gain access to the non-abusing parent during a visitation or exchange. Judge Ballinger noted children in the program are not in the care of either parent and most situations involve the mother coming to the campus to interact with the child. He noted the program further benefits parents by providing them with community coordinators. These individuals attend the court hearings and follow-up with parents to ensure they are following through with the orders given by the judge.

Judge Ballinger encouraged council members to learn more about the program. The campus is open and individuals are welcome to schedule a tour of the center. Chair Marshall thanked Judge Ballinger for offering his presentation.

5. Protocol Evaluation Project Update

Chair Marshall invited Renae Tenney, MAG, to offer an update on the Protocol Evaluation Project. Ms. Tenney offered an update on data collection, best practices, implementation of the protocol implementation survey and training resources. She thanked the Arizona Criminal Justice Commission and the Arizona Department of Public Safety for assistance with accessing and analyzing arrest data measures for a 10-year

period, 2001-2010. She acknowledged the work of Nathalea Silva, MAG Intern, in developing the charts. Ms. Tenney explained the charts provide a snapshot of misdemeanor and felony domestic violence arrest counts by main outcomes such as dismissed by the court, guilty, disposition missing and no complaint filed. She noted this information provides a starting point for discussion.

Ms. Tenney noted domestic violence arrest data are collected and compiled by the Arizona Department of Public Safety (DPS). According to Arizona Revised Statute 41-1750, law enforcement agencies across the state are required to report arrests for domestic violence crimes to DPS. Arrest information is connected to a biometric, such as fingerprints. Arresting agencies have 10 days after a physical arrest is made to submit arrest information to DPS. This is primarily done using electronic fingerprinting devices. She added the data submitted to DPS are not a complete picture of domestic violence arrests. If fingerprinting is not conducted, such as with “cite and release” arrests or a summons, the arrest information is not submitted to DPS. “Cite and release” arrests occur when the offender is cited for the offense but not taken into custody nor fingerprinted. Because the offender is not fingerprinted, the identification information for this arrest is not entered into the system.

Laura Guild, Department of Economic Security, asked why there are a significant number of cases shown as “disposition missing.” Ms. Tenney noted there are many reasons why this may occur. She asked Mr. Blackburn Jr. to assist in answering this question. He noted it is the responsibility of the police, prosecutors, and the courts to ensure defendant identification information is provided as cases move through the criminal justice system. If fingerprinting is not conducted by police, it may become the responsibility of the perpetrator to do this and in many cases is not done. In some jurisdictions a defendant may be required to drive many miles to a location where the fingerprints can be taken or in other jurisdictions there are extremely limited times prints can be taken. If fingerprints are taken and a criminal record is initiated, there are barriers that can include an ineffective tracking and disposition system. He added that training, technology, and cost issues are also among the reasons dispositions are missing.

Mr. Blackburn Jr. reiterated that in Arizona a criminal record does not exist if fingerprints have not been taken. He noted the Glendale City Court has addressed this issue by acquiring fingerprint live scanners and taking fingerprints before perpetrators leave the court. The question that arises is who is ultimately responsible for ensuring fingerprints are recorded. Mr. Blackburn Jr. noted the Arizona Criminal Justice Commission has spent the past 15 years trying to address these issues and will continue this work into the future. He added he hopes the work of this Council will help bring more attention to this issue.

The Honorable Elizabeth Finn, Presiding Judge at Glendale City Court, provided an overview of the Glendale Court live scan process. Fingerprints are taken through the live scan machine and reported to DPS. Prints are assigned a Process Control Number (PCN) for each event. A form that includes the Final Disposition Report (FDR) is then produced and submitted to the judge. Judge Finn noted she is required by statute to order anybody who has been charged with a misdemeanor to be fingerprinted. She found the only way to ensure this happens is to have them fingerprinted before they leave the court.

Judge Finn noted the aggravated DV charge was created in the 1990s. She noted third time offenses were not being charged as felonies because judges were not receiving the FDRs. She noted the importance of taking fingerprints and reporting information to DPS which serves as the repository for all criminal information. Judge Finn spoke of the process put into place at the City of Phoenix to electronically transfer documents between law enforcement, prosecutors and the courts. She noted the need for a similar process for persons booked into the Maricopa County Sheriff's Office, where there is not currently a system for electronically transferring documents from the police to the court. Part of the goal is ensuring judges know about the FDR and the responsibility for ensuring information is provided to DPS. Judge Finn advised that in her role as a Judge, she cannot endorse the PEP, but is present to support the administration of justice.

Chair Marshall commented on the arrest data being a highly technical area requiring collaboration for success. She noted this as a possible future project for MAG and ACJC. Chair Marshall inquired if it is possible that DV cases are losing their "DV designation" as they proceed through the court process. Mr. Blackburn Jr. agreed this is another possibility, especially when changes are made to the original charges. He spoke about the National Instant Criminal Background System (NICS) and the need to do as much as possible to help improve final disposition in the record system. He commented that the issue of DV was part of the challenges that brought about mandatory fingerprinting. He added a task force has been established to make recommendations for improvement. Ms. Tenney noted the NICS task force will be releasing a report within the next two months. Mr. Blackburn Jr. confirmed this information can be shared with the MAG DV Council and affinity groups to identify opportunities for improving data collection.

Best practice research: Ms. Tenney advised that 15 topics were derived from affinity group discussions and were previously distributed for review. John Belatti, City of Chandler, addressed topics one and two on the list. He advised the Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence has formed a group to draft legislation to add predominant aggressor language to ARS 13-3601. The Coalition met with Representative Russell Pierce who has agreed to sponsor this bill. The legislation is being vetted with various DV groups. Mr. Belatti will forward the proposed legislation to be distributed for review.

In the interest of time, Chair Marshall requested that the Committee take the best practice information back for review and provide input on the topics in terms of which have the most urgency, most relevance and most important to pursue, to either Ms. Tenney or herself.

Implementation survey: Ms. Tenney advised the purpose of the implementation survey was to help establish a baseline to see how the misdemeanor domestic violence protocol model is being implemented, and to determine if there are areas in which further assistance is needed to help with implementation. The survey was distributed to law enforcement statewide and to date, 12 responses have been received. Ms. Tenney advised the deadline has been extended through December 31, 2012.

Training resources: MAG staff continues to work on the training video. Ms. Tenney expressed appreciation to everyone who has assisted with these efforts. She shared the

exciting news that Governor Jan Brewer will be providing an introduction for the video. Due to scheduling conflicts, the video will be completed by end of year with the Governor's portion being added in 2013.

Webinars: Two webinars are scheduled for December 18, 2012, and December 20, 2012. Information was provided in the flyer included in the meeting materials. The webinars mirror presentations presented in October at the PEP Training Event. The topics are Working Better Together: Coconino County Coordinated Community Response Team and Technology Solutions: Connecting Systems and Improving Outcomes.

Chair Marshall requested a motion to approve the next steps for implementation of the Protocol Evaluation Project. Those steps include seeking input from the Committee on areas of focus/best practices to further explore for local relevance and implementation, extending data collection with the Implementation Survey, finalizing the training video, and conducting webinar trainings. Ms. Avila made a motion to approve the next steps for implementation. Alice Ghareib, Area Agency on Aging, seconded the motion. The motion passed.

6. FY2014 Committee Goals

Chair Marshall advised goals are developed each year to guide the work of the Committee and to be included in the FY 2014 Unified Planning Work Program. Ms. Tenney reviewed the FY 2014 Committee Goals available in the meeting materials. She noted the work will primarily focus on the PEP. She explained the goals are categorized by MAG Goals and Partnership Goals. Ms. Tenney noted the Partnership Goals acknowledge important work being done within collaborations where MAG is a supporting partner. She stated MAG staff values the work that has been done, and continues to be done, in collaboration with community partners.

Mr. Blackburn Jr. made a motion to recommend approval of the FY 2014 Committee Goals for inclusion in the MAG FY 2014 Unified Planning Work Program. Ms. Avila seconded the motion. The motion passed.

7. Regional Domestic Violence Council Websites

Chair Marshall invited Ms. Tenney to provide an overview of the DV Council websites. Ms. Tenney advised several facets of the website are in need of updating. She walked through various pages of the site including the two DV Council pages and the Web of Friends page. Ms. Tenney noted the update provides the opportunity to streamline the information by removing redundancies and increase traffic to the website by adding updated information. She sought input from the Committee about what information is important to maintain and update on these web pages.

Committee members provided feedback on various aspects of the web pages. Discussion included concerns about the number of steps required to access the domestic violence pages. Ms. Tenney noted the domestic violence pages are part of the overall MAG website design. Ms. Johnson added those seeking help are likely to access the Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence's website or another direct provider. A recommendation was made to use software such as Google Analytics to determine which web pages are most frequently accessed. Ms. Tenney commented that a similar type of

program is used to track traffic on the Web of Friends website. Information from this program led to the discussion about needing to update the site.

There was consensus to update the Web of Friends page and remove the redundancies on the Domestic Violence Council pages. Ms. Tenney sought input on information to be added to the Web of Friends page and asked if other groups should be approached for feedback on the page. Ms. Avila offered to seek input from the City of Avondale Youth Commission. Ms. Tenney thanked her for taking it to the group.

8. Nominations for Vice Chair Appointment

Chair Marshall advised Chief Monahan will be stepping down as Vice Chair of the Committee due to other commitments. She acknowledged and expressed gratitude for his efforts. Ms. Tenney advised letters of interest are being accepted to fill the Vice Chair position. Letters may be submitted to Mayor Marie Lopez Roger, Chair, MAG Regional Council. Details were provided in the meeting materials. Ms. Tenney advised an appointment will be made by the MAG Executive Committee on January 22, 2013.

9. Success Stories

An opportunity was provided for Committee members to share success stores for their communities.

- Judge Finn advised Glendale has received its fourth domestic violence grant. This totals \$1.5 million for Glendale since 2005. During the last grant, the Department of Justice had reduced the amount of the grant based on city population from \$400,000 to \$300,000 for cities the size of Glendale. The grant was also adjusted to the federal fiscal year which begins in October. The grant supports continuation of the Protective Order Coordinator for two years and adds a High Lethality Advocate position in the police department. Judge Finn noted 12 cities are utilizing Glendale's Protective Order Coordinator. When officers make several unsuccessful attempts to serve a protective order, the order is sent to the Coordinator to conduct more extensive follow up to ensure the order is successfully served. She commented that the addition of this position has helped Glendale significantly increase the number of protective orders filed.

Judge Finn reported a Domestic Violence Offense Report form was created to increase efficiency in serving protective orders. These forms include secondary contact information for victims for follow up by the police. Ten thousand copies of the report have been ordered. Training on use of the form will begin soon at the Glendale Police Department.

- Kristen Scharlau, Tempe Care 7, reported the program has changed their approach to include more outreach to victims who may not know help is available or whom to contact for help. Care 7 advocates are encouraged to go to court hearings and approach individuals to offer assistance and services. She shared this change has made a tremendous difference in raising awareness of the types of assistance available. She added the October Training Event provided an opportunity for Care 7 staff to sit with court personnel and prosecutors for discussion. This

allowed for learning more about each others' roles and has led to ongoing conversations about how they can address issues holistically.

- Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community, advised they will be hiring a Batterers Intervention Counselor, Domestic Violence Advocate, and Domestic Violence Sexual Assault Counselor.
- Ms. Ghareib advised the DOVES Program is fully staffed for the first time in a long time. She noted one of their biggest successes is collaboration.
- Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center, advised she will be resigning from Sojourner Center and transitioning out of the organization within the next two to three months. Dick Geasland was recently appointed Associate Director. Ms. Phillips noted she hopes to remain involved at the policy level and added it was a great opportunity to be an inaugural member of the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council.
- Celeste Adams, Save the Family, advised a ground-breaking ceremony was held for the Escobedo Housing Program. The first phase will include rebuilding an administrative site and 72 new units of affordable housing. Applications will be accepted in Summer 2014.
- Councilmember Lynn Selby, City of El Mirage, shared information on domestic violence outreach efforts.
 - In October, 365 purple ribbons were distributed to residents. Police cars were also outfitted with ribbons.
 - Outreach was conducted to 230 members through presentations and various community events. Councilmember Selby noted community events and fairs provided an opportunity to speak to individuals afraid to come forward to ask for help.
 - Domestic violence posters were placed in business windows across the city.
 - Local media coverage included two radio interviews and two printed articles on domestic violence.
 - El Mirage has successfully implemented the strangulation/suffocation protocol in three domestic violence cases.
 - Last year, the police department instituted the first Victim Assistance Unit with STOP grant funding for a part-time advocate position.

The Committee lost quorum at 3:35 p.m. The following items were not heard.

10. Request for Future Agenda Items

11. Comments from the Council

12. Adjourn:

Chair Marshall thanked everyone for their attendance. The meeting adjourned at 3:35 p.m. due to the loss of quorum.