

**MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
REGIONAL DOMESTIC VIOLENCE COUNCIL
MEETING MINUTES – February 7, 2013**

MEMBERS ATTENDING

*Celeste Adams, Save the Family
+Christina Avila, City of Avondale
Sgt. Marc Rivers for Lt. Robert Bates,
Phoenix Police Dept.
*John Belatti, City of Chandler Prosecutor's
Office
Libby Bissa, Phoenix Family Advocacy
Center
John A. Blackburn, Jr., Arizona Criminal
Justice Commission
Allie Bones, Arizona Coalition Against
Domestic Violence
*Councilmember Samuel Chavira, City of
Glendale
Chief Steve Campbell, City of El Mirage,
Vice Chair
Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa
Indian Community
*Lacey Rose Cox, Town of Gilbert Police
Dept.
Councilmember Ginny Dickey, Town of
Fountain Hills
*Jon Eliason, City of Mesa Prosecutor's
Office
*President Diane Enos, Salt River Pima-
Maricopa Indian Community
Kristen Scharlau for Naomi Farrell, City of
Tempe
Linda Melendez for Janeen Gaskins, City of
Surprise
Patricia George for Will Gonzalez, City of
Phoenix Prosecutor's Office
Laura Guild, Arizona Dept. of Economic
Security
*Cmdr. Kim Humphrey, City of Phoenix
Police Dept.
+Lynette Jelinek, Glendale Fire Dept.
*Mary Lynn Kasunic, Area Agency on
Aging
*Patricia Klahr, Chrysalis Shelter, Inc.
Councilmember Suzanne Klapp, City of
Scottsdale

+Councilmember Sheri Lauritano, City of
Goodyear
Barbara Marshall, Maricopa County
Attorney's Office, Chair
Leah Meyers for Mary Murphy, Governor's
Office for Children, Youth, and Families
Dottie O'Connell, Chicanos por la Causa
Dick Geasland for Connie Phillips, Sojourner
Center
Kay Daukei for Kerry Ramella, City of
Phoenix Fire Dept.
Councilmember Lynn Selby, City of El
Mirage
+Sarah Youngblood, Community Legal
Services

OTHERS PRESENT

Aimee Currey, El Mirage Police Department
Rosalie Hernandez, A New Leaf
Iva Rody, El Mirage Police Department
Lora Reid, Valley of the Sun United Way
Larry Grubbs, Arizona Criminal Justice
Commission
Dana Martinez, A New Leaf
Angela Rose, City of Scottsdale
Brenda Nichols, Arizona Department of
Health Services
Mel Liggett, Chandler Police Department
Melissa Certo, City of Phoenix
Mary Alice McKone, The Salvation Army
Janine Letelier, Maricopa County Attorney's
Office
Janice Simpson, City of Avondale

Rachel Brito, MAG
Amy, St. Peter, MAG
Renae Tenney, MAG

+Those attending by video/audio conference
* Those not present or represented by proxy

1. Call to Order

Chair Barbara Marshall, Maricopa County Attorney's Office, called the meeting to order at 2:08 p.m. She welcomed Chief Steve Campbell, City of El Mirage, as the newly appointed Vice Chair, and new members Libby Bissa, City of Phoenix Family Advocacy Center, and Councilmember Ginny Dickey, Town of Fountain Hills. Introductions ensued.

2. Call to the Audience

An opportunity was provided for members of the audience to address the Council on non-agenda items that fall under the jurisdiction of MAG, or agenda items for discussion but not for action. There were no comments.

3. Approval of the December 6, 2012 Meeting Minutes

Chair Marshall called for approval of the December 6, 2012, MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting minutes. Chief Campbell motioned to approve the minutes. John Blackburn, Arizona Criminal Justice Commission seconded the motion. The motion passed.

4. Domestic Violence Public Service Announcement

Chair Marshall invited Vice Chair Campbell to present on a public service announcement (PSA) effort in El Mirage to raise awareness about domestic violence. Vice Chair Campbell acknowledged Debbie Heuett and Aimee Currey for the idea to develop the PSAs as a way to inform the public and raise awareness about domestic violence in the City of El Mirage.

Twelve PSAs were created with a focus on raising awareness, reducing the number of domestic violence incidents, and reducing recidivism. The PSAs were developed through a grant from the Verizon Corporation and with assistance from the Arizona Peace Officers Standards and Training Board (AZ POST). The Institute for Safe Families, the Governor's Office, MAG, Arizona Coalition against Domestic Violence, Dysart High School, and City of El Mirage employees were also acknowledged for their assistance.

The PSAs will be played on Channel 11, placed on the City's website, and uploaded to YouTube. They focus on various domestic violence situations involving friends, neighbors, co-workers, and students. Vice Chair Campbell advised the PSAs are available for anyone interested in utilizing them in their community. Renae Tenney, MAG, advised the PSAs are available on the MAG website for downloading.

5. City of Phoenix Domestic Violence Advisory Group

Libby Bissa, City of Phoenix Family Advocacy Center, provided an overview of the Phoenix City Council's efforts to enhance its response to domestic violence issues and public safety. In December, the Phoenix City Council initiated a domestic violence work group comprising 40 to 50 people including domestic violence service providers, law enforcement, prosecutors, and others. The group reviewed the City's existing efforts and opportunities for improvement to make the cities response to domestic violence a nationwide model. The first work group was held in January 2013. Smaller work groups

are now addressing objectives and strategies to present to the Phoenix City Council in a few months.

Ms. Bissa advised a request for proposal (RFP) for \$200,000 in grant funding was issued. Several applications were received. On February 20, 2015, the Council will be asked to approve the RFP award to the Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence. Through this collaboration, funding will be used in the community through June 2014.

Allie Bones, Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence (AzCADV), shared information on the proposal submitted in response to the RFP. The proposal includes nearly all domestic violence programs in Maricopa County and Apache Junction. Over the course of the 16-month grant period, AzCADV will add all of the shelters in the region into a centralized shelter screening that will be operated by A New Leaf's Autumn House. A New Leaf is currently conducting centralized screening for their two domestic violence programs as well as for UMOM and other homeless shelter programs.

Funding will allow four new case managers to be added to the phone line to conduct screening for seven additional shelters in the valley. Also included in the proposal is a housing specialist to work with victims of domestic violence in five Phoenix shelters. The housing specialist will work with women in emergency shelters and transitional housing who are ready to move into permanent housing. The specialist will be a part of UMOM's housing team. Ms. Bones expressed excitement over the joint proposal submitted by the valley's domestic violence programs. She noted this is an unprecedented level of collaboration and expressed gratitude to the City of Phoenix for their support.

6. Protocol Evaluation Project Update

Chair Marshall invited Ms. Tenney to offer an update on renewed STOP Grant funding and plans to continue the work of the Domestic Violence Protocol Evaluation Project (PEP). Ms. Tenney advised the Governor's Office has renewed STOP Grant funding for the next year. This will allow continuation of the PEP project. A copy of the revised misdemeanor protocol model was included in the meeting materials. Staff will continue to review the model, research best practices, and refine the model as necessary. Input was requested on any issues or opportunities to enhance the protocol model moving forward.

Additionally, through support of the Governor's Office, the domestic violence shoe cards and safety plans were updated. Revisions included adding advocacy center phone numbers and updating the text. Ms. Tenney expressed gratitude to staff at AzCADV for assisting in these efforts. With assistance from Lynn Howe, Arizona Peace Officers Standards and Training Board, the revised resources will be distributed to law enforcement during future training sessions. Ms. Tenney advised the Governor's Office will also be printing additional safety plans and shoe cards to be made available for community-based organizations. Any regional law enforcement agency seeking these resources may contact Ms. Tenney.

Ms. Tenney provided an overview of additional efforts underway. She advised Governor Jan Brewer will provide opening remarks for the training video. Governor Brewer will speak to law enforcement on the importance of working with domestic violence

advocates. Moving forward in 2013, staff will continue to hold affinity group meetings and will continue assessing arrest data provided by the Arizona Criminal Justice Commission and Department of Public Safety (DPS).

Ms. Tenney noted the misdemeanor protocol model implementation survey has been distributed. Responses are indicating law enforcement agencies across the state are using the protocol model. She commented that Nathalea Silva, MAG, will offer a presentation on preliminary results of the survey later in the agenda.

In collaboration with the O'Connor House, quarterly networking and training opportunities are being developed for victim advocates. The first brown bag training is scheduled for February 19, 2013 from 11:30 a.m. – 1:00 p.m. at the Phoenix Family Advocacy Center and will focus on self-care for victim advocates. Ms. Tenney noted training topics will be identified from input received from victim advocates during a New Leaf's Domestic Violence Collaborator's Meeting.

Ms. Tenney reviewed the timeline for 2013, which was included in the meeting handouts. She noted the Protocol Evaluation Project Training Event will be held earlier in May or June this year. Input was requested on any events scheduled in May and June that could cause scheduling conflicts for community stakeholders. Ms. Bones indicated the National Domestic Violence Fatality Review Initiative Conference will be held May 19 to 21 in Phoenix. Having no further input from the Committee, a motion was requested.

Ms. Bones made a motion to approve the 2013 Domestic Violence Protocol Evaluation Project timeline. Vice Chair Campbell seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

7. Misdemeanor Domestic Violence Protocol Model Implementation Survey

Nathalea Silva, MAG, reported on findings gathered from law enforcement agencies about their use of the MAG Misdemeanor Domestic Violence Protocol Model. The purpose of the survey was to assess the level of implementation of the protocol model across the state. With assistance from the Arizona Association of Chiefs of Police, the survey was distributed to 73 agencies across the state. Of those agencies, 20 have responded. In Maricopa County, 98 percent of survey respondents have implemented the protocol model. Survey respondents in other Arizona counties reflect 90 percent implementation. A list of protocols not currently implemented was made available in the meeting handouts.

Ms. Silva spoke about the barriers to implementation provided by respondents. She stated limited staff is one of the largest barriers to implementation followed by agencies not having victim advocates available to go on scene. Agencies noted additional resources such as more staff, additional funding, increased training, and technical assistance would assist in further implementation of the protocol model.

Ms. Silva advised the survey results were presented at a PEP Partner meeting. Discussion was held among PEP Partners on how to increase the number of agencies participating. Ms. Tenney noted PEP Partners commented on the need for more education and awareness about the intent of the protocol model. She noted of 49

agencies within Maricopa County, 11 agencies responded. At the PEP Partners meeting, Chief Campbell offered to personally contact police chiefs for the agencies that have not yet responded. In addition, he had commented on the opportunity to present at the March Arizona Association of Chiefs of Police meeting to encourage statewide participation.

Chair Marshall stated there are between 21 and 23 local law enforcement agencies within Maricopa County. Ms. Silva clarified the previous count included sheriff offices and multiple stations within cities. Ms. Tenney stated staff would review the number of agencies and noted the partners concerns about having more agencies on board before moving forward. Amy St. Peter, MAG, noted 11 out of 20 agencies in the region completed the survey, representing 74 percent of the County's population. She noted the agencies that did not complete the survey may not be using the protocol model. She added the need to communicate to complete the survey even if this is the case. Knowing the reasons it is not being used is important in helping us develop ways to help.

Chair Marshall advised this item is on the agenda to approve the baseline data for measuring implementation of the MAG Misdemeanor Domestic Violence Protocol Model. She inquired whether the Committee would prefer to wait for further responses before making a motion. An inquiry was made as to when the survey was distributed. Ms. Tenney advised the survey was originally distributed in November and extended into December. She added the PEP Partners had indicated their support for redistributing the survey to request additional participation.

Chief Campbell made a motion to table this vote until additional information is obtained. He offered to follow-up with his peers about the importance of completing the survey. Dick Geasland, Sojourner Center, seconded the motion. The motion passed.

Mr. Geasland noted the lack of response from rural communities and commented on the importance of communicating that the protocol model is not specific to Maricopa County. He commented that other counties may need reassurance that the protocol model applies to them as well.

8. Success Stories

An opportunity was provided for Committee members to share success stories.

- Chair Marshall shared comments received by Kim Sterling-Heplin from the O'Connor House. Ms. Sterling-Heplin and a few colleagues met at a restaurant and spent a long time at their table sorting through brochures and other awareness materials about domestic violence. Their server was especially accommodating even though they were there a long time. When they were ready to leave, the server shared that she was a domestic violence survivor and thanked them for their efforts to help victims leave abusive relationships.
- Chief Campbell said he is honored to serve on the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council. He noted his involvement with the Orders of Protection Task Force at the O'Connor House and his recent appointment to the Arizona Supreme Court Committee on the Impact of Domestic Violence and the Courts (CIDVC).

Chief Campbell added he looks forward to serving the Council at the highest level possible.

- Ms. Bones noted the grant proposal to the City of Phoenix and collaborative partnership among domestic violence shelters as the Coalition's success story. She also shared that the legislative bill on predominant aggressor passed out of the Public Safety Committee on a vote of eight to zero.
- Sergeant Marc Rivers, Phoenix Police Department, acknowledged the City of Phoenix City Council's efforts against domestic violence. Their support is a huge asset for law enforcement, prosecution and service providers.
- Mr. Geasland shared a story of a woman at Sojourner Center. The woman, who was in her late 50s, had shared with him that for the first time in a year she felt safe because she woke up in Sojourner Center.
- Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community (SRP-MIC), discussed the addition of a batterer's intervention counselor and domestic violence advocate. SRP-MIC will be adding a Senior Behavioral Health Counselor for domestic violence within the next month.
- Mr. Blackburn offered an update on the Crime Victim Compensation rules. He noted the number of requests for compensation are expected to increase due to the rules expanding to cover additional expenses.
- Councilmember Ginny Dickey, Town of Fountain Hills, discussed efforts in Fountain Hills including development of a Public Safety Advisory Commission to the Council, the Crisis Activated Response Effort Fountain Hills (C.A.R.E. / F.H.) and a Text-A-Tip program for kids to provide anonymous crime information. Councilmember Dickey noted Amy Anderson was on Horizon discussing the Cradles to Crayons program. She offered to distribute the link to anyone interested.
- Councilmember Suzanne Klapp, City of Scottsdale, advised the video featuring the Scottsdale Family Advocacy Center developed last year continues to be shown on their Channel 11. She inquired about the possibility of showing the City of El Mirage's public service announcements on Scottsdale's Channel 11. Additionally, she plans to bring greater awareness to the Scottsdale City Council about ongoing efforts by the police department to raise awareness and prevent domestic violence.
- Councilmember Lynn Selby, City of El Mirage, advised the City Council approved additional funds to make their part-time victim advocate into a full-time position. He noted the City of El Mirage is co-chairing the West Valley Domestic Violence Fatality Review Team in collaboration with the Town of Buckeye and the City of Surprise. Additional agencies have been invited to participate. The first meeting was held in January and the team will review their first case in the coming months.

He stated the City of El Mirage is taking a serious approach to eliminating domestic violence. In the past six months, police department personnel have been trained in domestic violence law, strangulation, family domestic violence and orders of protection. These efforts are supported 100 percent by the City Council. Additionally, the City will be receiving two new mobile fingerprint kits. This will help prevent officers from having to leave the field and return to the station to process fingerprint identifications.

- Kristen Scharlau, Tempe's Care 7, shared exciting news regarding a law that considers records between a client and victim advocates to be confidential. The new law protects victim advocates from having to testify in a case where records are subpoenaed. She spoke about a recent case where a victim advocate at Care 7 was able to utilize this law.
- Ms. Meyers advised the Governor's Office has renewed 23 STOP grants and is in the process of renewing funding for the Fatality Review and Safety Audits. A safety audit was conducted in Coconino County and is being conducted in Pinal County. Additionally, safety audits will be conducted in Maricopa County. The Governor's Office is processing funds for Arizona State University to evaluate the City of Phoenix's training of law enforcement. She also noted the Victims' Rights Week event is tentatively planned for April 22, 2013. Additional information will be forthcoming.

Ms. Meyers shared that in November, the Governor's Commission to Prevent Violence Against Women approved a resolution to support the Start By Believing campaign. The national campaign reaches out to victims of sexual assault with the message that first responders will believe them. The campaign has been very effective in Coconino County.

- Dottie O'Connell, Chicanos por la Causa, discussed the MAG Continuum of Care (CoC) Regional Committee to End Homelessness' application to the Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). Ms. O'Connell noted there is a lack of understanding between the homeless and domestic violence communities. For example, she spoke of the homeless community's misconception that because domestic violence shelters do not report information in HMIS, they do not conduct reporting. During a recent CoC meeting, this led to questioning why domestic violence shelters are funded by HUD dollars if they do not comply with HUD reporting requirements. Ms. O'Connell strongly encouraged having a member of the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council serve on the CoC.

Ms. Tenney advised that per Open Meeting Law, this topic would need to be put on a future agenda to allow for discussion. Ms. Bissa noted both groups do phenomenal things to help individuals in need but their efforts are vastly different. She agreed more collaboration would be beneficial for both groups to increase the level of understanding and respect for each other's efforts. The topic was added as a request for future agenda items.

Chair Marshall noted a proposed Supreme Court rule change that challenges the constitutionality of weapons forfeiture and the injunction on orders of protection statute. Ms. Bones advised this topic will be discussed at an upcoming CIDVC meeting and may be added to CIDVC's strategic agenda.

9. Request for Future Agenda Items

- Discussion about MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council representation on the MAG Continuum of Care Regional Committee on Homelessness.
- Presentation on the national Start By Believing campaign.

10. Comments from the Council

Detective Liggett, Chandler Police Department Family Crimes Unit, addressed the Committee. Mr. Liggett noted his experience working patrol, robbery, and homicide before taking a position in the courts as a domestic violence police liaison. The position was eventually eliminated three years after grant funding was eliminated.

Detective Liggett noted there are problems with the law that states a victim does not have to press charges. He noted the victim still has to go to trial or the case is dismissed. Most cities will send mailings and if the victim does not appear, the case is dismissed. He stressed that when a victim has been victimized for several years and finally goes to court the abuser gets treated as a first-time offender because all previous cases were dismissed. Detective Liggett used to serve subpoenas on witnesses. He noted issues with cities using private companies to serve subpoenas. He stated defendants have commented they were told by public defenders not to let the victim get served and the case will be dismissed.

Detective Liggett is now working in Chandler's Family Crimes Unit and is starting to see a pattern with laws surrounding strangulation cases. He noted a 30 percent increase in strangulation charges. He stated the City of Chandler uses SANE nurses to conduct examinations. He noted the nurses will provide the evidence but will not state that a woman has been strangled. He noted it seems prosecutors are looking for that statement from forensic personnel or an expert. Detective Liggett stressed the importance of increasing communication between the police department and prosecutors about what is being done. Misdemeanor cases are very important and are an opportunity for early intervention.

Chair Marshall noted as Chair of the Maricopa County Attorney's Office Ethics Committee that should information come to light about a defense attorney encouraging someone to avoid service of a subpoena, they would be referred to the Arizona State Bar.

Ms. Bones advised that the AzCADV, the Morrison Institute and O'Connor House were awarded a grant from the Nina Mason Pullium Charitable Trust to conduct a study on the needs of victims of domestic violence in Maricopa County. The purpose is to find out about the needs of victims in shelter, out of shelter and those who have never been to a shelter to identify the service needs in this community. The survey is being finalized and AzCADV will be seeking assistance disseminating the survey to the community and

especially to those victims not in the shelter system. The final report is anticipated by the end of the year with implementation following in the second and third year.

Chair Marshall noted a proposal to exempt children 15 years of age and under from the mandatory arrest statute. A hearing on this topic is scheduled for the coming week.

11. Adjourn:

Chair Marshall thanked everyone for their attendance. The meeting adjourned at 3:20 p.m. The next MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting is scheduled for April 4, 2013.