

**MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
REGIONAL DOMESTIC VIOLENCE COUNCIL
MEETING MINUTES – June 6, 2013**

MEMBERS ATTENDING

- *Celeste Adams, Save the Family
- *Christina Avila, City of Avondale
Lt. Bryan Coley for Lt. Robert Bates, City of Phoenix Police Dept.
- *John Belatti, City of Chandler Prosecutor's Office
Libby Bissa, City of Phoenix Family Advocacy Center
Larry Grubs for John A. Blackburn, Jr., Arizona Criminal Justice Commission
Yvonne Taylor for Allie Bones, Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence
- *Councilmember Samuel Chavira, City of Glendale
Chief Steve Campbell, City of El Mirage Police Department., Vice Chair
Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community
- *Lacey Rose Cox, City of Gilbert Police Dept.
Councilmember Ginny Dickey, Town of Fountain Hills
Jon Eliason, City of Mesa Prosecutor's Office
- *President Diane Enos, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community
- *Naomi Farrell, City of Tempe
- +Jessica Blazina for Janeen Gaskins, City of Surprise
- *Will Gonzalez, City of Phoenix Prosecutor's Office
Constance Halonen, City of Apache Junction Police Department
Laura Guild, Arizona Dept. of Economic Security
- *Cmdr. Kim Humphrey, City of Phoenix Police Dept.
- *Lynette Jelinek, City of Glendale Fire Dept.
Alice Ghareib for Mary Lynn Kasunic, Area Agency on Aging
- *Patricia Klahr, Chrysalis Shelter, Inc.
- *Councilmember Suzanne Klapp, City of Scottsdale
- +Sheri Lauritano, City of Goodyear
- *Barbara Marshall, Maricopa County Attorney's Office, Chair

- Mary Murphy, Governor's Office for Children, Youth, and Families
Maribel Gloria for Dottie O'Connell, Chicanos por la Causa
Dick Geasland for Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center
Kay Daukei for Kerry Ramella, City of Phoenix Fire Dept.
- *Councilmember Lynn Selby, City of El Mirage
Sarah Youngblood, Community Legal Services

OTHERS PRESENT

- Carl Mangold, Private Practice
Iva Rody, City of El Mirage Police Dept.
Beya Thayer, Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence
Carol Comito, Fountain Hills Public Safety Advisory Commission
Kate Henderson, Arizona Department of Public Safety
Dana Martinez, A New Leaf
Larry Grubbs, Arizona Criminal Justice Commission
Daniel Ane, Chicanos por la Causa
Leah Meyers, Governor's Office
Rosalie Hernandez, A New Leaf
Teisha Portee, City of Scottsdale Police Department
Tom Hutchinson, A New Leaf
Virginia Rice, Arizona Foundation for Women
- Amy St. Peter, MAG
Renae Tenney, MAG
Nikki Oxford, MAG

- +Those attending by video/audio conference
- * Those not present or represented by proxy

1. Call to Order

Vice Chair Steven Campbell, Chief of Police for the City of El Mirage, called the meeting to order at 2:11 p.m.

Vice Chair Campbell welcomed a new member to the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council, Constance Halonen. Constance Halonen stated she is the community resource coordinator for the Apache Junction Police Department. She serves on the Pinal County Domestic Violence Fatality Review Team and serves as secretary for the Pinal County Domestic Violence Coalition.

Vice Chair Campbell recognized Lieutenant Robert Bates, Phoenix Police Department and Iva Rody, El Mirage Police Department, for being honored with receipt of the Arizona Attorney General's Distinguished Service Awards.

2. Call to the Audience

An opportunity was provided for members of the audience to address the Council on non-agenda items that fall under the jurisdiction of MAG, or agenda items for discussion but not for action. No comments were made.

3. Approval of the April 4, 2013 Meeting Minutes

This item was taken out of the order after agenda item five. Vice Chair Campbell called for approval of the April 4, 2013, MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting minutes. Vice Chair Campbell, asked the Council if everyone had a chance to review the minutes and if there were any revisions that needed to be made. Hearing none, Vice Chair Campbell entertained a motion to approve the minutes. Libby Bissa, Phoenix Family Advocacy Center, motioned to approve the minutes. Laura Guild, Arizona Department of Economic Security, seconded the motion. The motion passed.

4. 2012 Domestic Violence Fatality Report

This item was taken out of the order after agenda item three. Vice Chair Campbell introduced Beya Thayer, Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence, to present on the 2012 Domestic Violence Fatality Report. Ms. Thayer serves as the Coalition's Domestic Violence Fatality Review Team Coordinator. Her report includes a summary of findings and recommendations based on the work of Domestic Violence Fatality Review Teams across the state.

Ms. Thayer noted the Domestic Violence Fatality Review Report includes incidents of intimate partner violence, homicides committed by family members, and suicides. Perpetrators and bystanders who are killed by law enforcement during a domestic violence call are also included. Ms. Thayer noted that, although the methodology for this report is comprehensive, there are still homicides and deaths occurring that are not included in this data.

Ms. Thayer mentioned an important change in the work of the Domestic Violence Fatality Review Teams. Through a partnership with the Federal Bureau of Investigation and other groups, the Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence was able to obtain information about instances of domestic violence occurring on tribal lands. Inclusion of these crimes added another 17 deaths, which is about a 14 percent increase, to the number reported in the initial domestic violence fatality report. Ms. Thayer indicated this is the first report to compile information from Domestic Violence Fatality Review Teams across the state. Because of this, Ms. Thayer noted her presentation does not include data trends or comparisons.

Ms. Thayer presented on the various domestic violence related fatality categories, the reported number of domestic violence related fatalities, relationship of the perpetrator to the deceased, the cause of death, as well as gender and geographical differences in the data. She stated the Domestic Violence Fatality Review Report states 139 domestic violence related deaths were reported last year. Ages of the victims ranged from nine weeks old to 88 years old. The majority of the deaths, 67 percent, were related to intimate partner violence. Firearms are the leading cause of death, occurring in 60 percent of domestic violence reported deaths. Women are most likely to be killed by a current or former intimate partner. Men are most likely to be killed by their own hand or by law enforcement. In about 42 percent of the reported intimate partner violence related homicides, the perpetrators take their own lives. Bipolar disorder and morbid jealousy were found to be antecedents to this type of behavior.

Ms. Thayer announced Arizona has 12 Domestic Violence Fatality Review Teams with two more in the planning stages. In reviewing cases, the Domestic Violence Fatality Review Teams found commonalities across the state. These commonalities included multiple issues with orders of protection, ranging from not knowing how to serve one or enforce violations. Coordination issues were found to be a problem across the state, both coordination from within an agency and coordination with other agencies. Other common issues included mental health problems, offender treatment issues, and the lack of resources available to children who experience domestic violence. She noted there are more barriers for victims of domestic violence seeking help, if the perpetrator is a member of law enforcement.

The Domestic Violence Fatality Review Teams encourage their communities to develop plans, if possible, for implementing their recommendations. These recommendations include the following:

- Support offender treatment programs in order to assist in improving their effectiveness.
- Conduct ongoing training about orders of protection for law enforcement, prosecutors and the judiciary including methods for better enforcement, and breaking down barriers to using them effectively. One suggestion was to create an educational video about orders of protection to assist with training.
- Make lethality assessment and screening tools available to first responding officers and medical personnel including training for their use.
- Increase community awareness about domestic violence, especially for youth.

- Provide training for law enforcement about responding to domestic violence situations involving returning military personnel, including the role of Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder and other issues unique to this population.

Ms. Thayer provided an overview of key findings of the Domestic Violence Fatality Review Report. Teams statewide noted communication as a barrier to improving how domestic violence situations are handled. Limited communication and coordination was seen between officers. In addition, they commented that bystanders, neighbors, co-workers, medical personnel and other community members did not appear to know how to respond to domestic violence. In addition, the teams pointed out the lack of information available regarding services for children in the wake of an intimate partner violence attack. Overall, a lack of communication across multiple sectors and levels had a negative impact on the domestic violence cases the teams reviewed.

One recommendation from the Domestic Violence Fatality Review Report is currently being implemented in some communities. In these communities, the police department started a lead officer domestic violence program making domestic violence calls easier to track. This will be especially helpful if one particular household has made several domestic violence calls to the police department. This new program allows police officers to keep track and follow up with these calls. Ms. Thayer noted the importance of open communication with the mental health community about suicide and how suicide should be considered not only a danger to the individual person, but also a danger to the community as a whole.

Ms. Thayer clarified the recommendations came out of the work of domestic violence fatality review teams statewide. The teams are encouraged to take action on recommendations based on what is feasible in their individual communities. The Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence serves as a member on several teams and provides support to all. Ms. Thayer noted the recommendations presented from the Domestic Violence Fatality Review Teams are separate from the Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence.

Vice Chair Campbell solicited questions from the Council. In response to Ms. Thayer's presentation, Councilmember Ginny Dickey asked whether the Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence advocates for specific legislation around gun laws. Ms. Thayer responded that the Coalition takes a firm stance about the use of guns and domestic violence. She stated the Coalition supports legislation to keep guns away from people who are not allowed to have them. Ms. Thayer commented that the Coalition recently released a report about the use of guns and domestic violence.

Vice Chair Campbell asked for clarification on findings involving victims whose perpetrators are law enforcement personnel. Ms. Thayer clarified that nine perpetrators were killed by law enforcement intervention. She noted this data came from a source separate from the case reviews. She stated the Domestic Violence Fatality Review Teams found additional barriers for victims whose perpetrator was a law enforcement personnel. For example, obtaining an order of protection against an abuser who is law enforcement might mean that the abuser would lose employment. Vice Chair Campbell noted there are serious consequences for police officers involved in domestic violence.

Vice Chair Campbell inquired about the lack of services for child witnesses of domestic violence. He asked if the fatality review teams made any recommendations about the types of immediate and ongoing services needed for child witnesses. Ms. Thayer noted this recommendation came from Pinal County. She asked Constance Halonen, who sits on the Pinal County Fatality Review Team, to provide additional information. Ms. Halonen explained that for several years now, the team has observed that no services are noted as being provided to children who are survivors of fatalities or domestic violence altercations. She said the Pinal County Fatality Review Team established a new workgroup to inventory existing services available for children and identify opportunities for making these services more readily available.

Vice Chair Campbell expressed concerns with barriers to sharing information about victims. For example, the barriers medical personnel might face trying to share information with law enforcement, especially taking into account the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act (HIPAA) laws. Vice Chair Campbell noted sharing this information with local law enforcement can assist them in better servicing victims. Ms. Thayer indicated she is not familiar with these procedures. Ms. Thayer commented the Phoenix and Glendale Police Departments are using lethality assessments to help determine victims' levels of danger. If victims' scores reach a certain threshold, then officers would contact victim advocates. The victim advocates would then assist victims with connecting to various services they may need. She added victim advocates would not share information with officers unless victims gave them prior permission.

Ms. Thayer noted medical personnel in hospitals in Flagstaff are trained to ask screening questions for domestic violence. Based on the patients' answers, their levels of danger are determined. If there are high levels of risk, medical personnel will talk with patients about concerns for their safety and recommend connecting them with victim advocates. If patients are not comfortable with talking with advocates, they are offered information about services they can access at a later time, if they decide to do so.

Jon Eliason, City of Mesa Prosecutor's Office, noted Mesa is working on a lethality assessment tool for their police officers. The tool is anticipated to be completed by August 2013. Mr. Eliason commented Ms. Thayer's presentation was helpful in highlighting how other communities across the state use lethality assessment tools. He noted his interest in how lethality scores are determined and how the score is used to identify a certain response. Ms. Thayer referred Mr. Eliason to the lethality assessment tools training scheduled in July 2013 in Coconino County. Vice Chair Campbell stated this would be a good topic for a future presentation to the Council.

5. Approval of the Resolution of Support for the Start by Believing Campaign

This item was taken out of the order after agenda item two. Renae Tenney, MAG, provided background information on the Resolution of Support for the Start By Believing campaign. She noted a presentation on the campaign was offered by Chief Jerald Monahan, Prescott Police Department, during the April MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting. The Start By Believing (SBB) Campaign is a public awareness campaign focusing on the public's response to sexual assault. The campaign is meant to encourage victims of assault to come forward, be believed and feel supported.

This campaign strives to help victims through the process of coming forward, reporting these crimes, and being assisted through the criminal justice system in a respectful way.

Vice Chair Campbell called for any questions or comments about the Resolution of Support for the SBB Campaign. Hearing none, Vice Chair Campbell called to recommend approval of the Resolution of Support for the Start by Believing Campaign. Councilmember Ginny Dickey, Town of Fountain Hills, motioned to approve the Resolution for Support for the SBB Campaign. Jon Eliason, City of Mesa Prosecutor's Office, seconded the motion. The motion passed.

Councilmember Dickey asked Vice Chair Campbell if he would recommend the municipalities adopt a Resolutions of Support prior to approval of the MAG Regional Council or if they should wait for action on this item. Vice Chair Campbell responded that municipalities can move forward with their own resolutions of support as they see fit. Vice Chair Campbell thanked Chief Monahan for bringing the SBB Campaign to the Council's attention.

6. Protocol Evaluation Project Update

Rena Tenney, MAG, provided an update on the Protocol Evaluation Project to include the Stronger Systems, Safer Survivors training event; the Structure and Membership Workgroup, and plans for the training video. Ms. Tenney reminded the Council of the time change for the training event at the Glendale Civic Center on Tuesday, June 18, 2013. She indicated the training event was changed from a full-day event to a half-day event. Registration for the event has reached 120 people. Ms. Tenney encouraged Council and audience members to register for the event.

Ms. Tenney announced the upcoming Structure and Membership Workgroup meeting scheduled from 10:00-11:30 a.m. on Tuesday, June 25, 2013. The purpose of the workgroup is to review representation on the Council and assess if changes are needed. She encouraged anyone interested in taking part in this discussion to contact her for additional information.

Ms. Tenney proposed an outline for development of the 2013 MAG Protocol Evaluation Project training video. Ms. Tenney noted the primary audience for the video is law enforcement with secondary audiences including prosecutors and the general public. She commented the video will provide information to assist law enforcement in further implementation of the MAG Misdemeanor Domestic Violence Protocol Model. The video will be sent to municipal public access channels.

Ms. Tenney reviewed proposed topics for inclusion in the video. She indicated the topics were developed from affinity group discussions as well as data gathered from the implementation survey earlier this year. Protocols reported as having the lowest implementation level were included. Proposed topics were connecting victims with crisis response or victim advocate services, conducting safety planning and providing resources to victims on-scene of domestic violence calls, strengthening investigations of domestic violence, and keeping offenders accountable. Details to be included under these topics were provided in a handout to the Council. Ms. Tenney asked for feedback and comments

on the proposed outline. Vice Chair Campbell suggested the video include information about lethality assessment tools and the successes seen by agencies using them.

Dick Geasland, Sojourner Center, commented on domestic violence being about more than physical injuries. He noted psychological abuse can be more devastating and have more of a lasting impact than physical abuse. These forms of domestic violence are harder for police to identify and harder for medical personnel to recognize. Mr. Eliason noted his agreement with Mr. Geasland. He commented it can be very difficult to measure emotional or psychological abuse, especially from a lawyer's perspective. Mr. Eliason said this issue should be talked about more often. Mr. Eliason commented that sometimes victims of emotional abuse do not even consider themselves victims because they grew up with abuse.

Mr. Eliason stated there is a need to better track domestic violence cases. The information available is only as good as the data recorded. He noted the system for tracking a Driving Under the Influence (DUI) charge is fairly accurate while the system for tracking domestic violence cases is not. Mr. Eliason stated as a region, collaboration on this effort could make a real difference. Mary Murphy, Governor's Office, agreed with Mr. Eliason.

Vice Chair Campbell called for the approval of proposed plans for the 2013 MAG Protocol Evaluation Project training video. Mr. Eliason, City of Mesa Prosecutor's Office, motioned to approve the concepts as discussed for development of the training video. Larry Grubbs, Arizona Criminal Justice Commission, seconded the motion. The motion passed.

7. City of Phoenix Update

Libby Bissa, City of Phoenix, provided an update on the Roadmap to Excellence, which outlines plans to make Phoenix a national model for addressing domestic violence. She noted these efforts include a community campaign and the enhancement of city policies for addressing domestic violence. Ms. Bissa noted the City of Phoenix had already built a solid foundation in its approach to domestic violence crimes. This foundation allowed for Phoenix to look into methods for further improvement in this area. The goal is to create a cultural shift in attitudes towards domestic violence communitywide.

Ms. Bissa explained the Roadmap to Excellence consists of five focus areas. These areas are referred to as pillars and task forces have been established to guide implementation of efforts in each area. The pillars are Community Awareness, Phoenix as a Model, Systems Reform, Coordinated Services, and Partnerships. She provided an overview of the components of each pillar.

Ms. Bissa stated the Community Awareness Task Force is charged with raising public awareness as well as leading prevention and early intervention efforts. She referred to discussion about developing annual community events to assist with community awareness. Plans are underway for a media event in October called Paint Phoenix Purple. As part of this event, Phoenix City Hall will be lit up with purple lights. The work of this task force includes a marketing campaign, coordinating with the Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence to make resources available on their website, and adopting domestic violence curriculum in schools based on existing promising practices. She noted

teaching children that domestic violence is not acceptable is the best way to start creating a cultural shift in how the community responds to domestic violence. The intent is for the curriculum to promote awareness in the homes of these children as they share with their parents what they learned in school that day. Ms. Bissa commented the City of Phoenix wants the community to see domestic violence as being abhorrent.

Ms. Bissa reported the Phoenix as a Model Task Force will lead the community by its example of adopting best practices in all city operations. This includes making policy adjustments, updating their employee manual, and training all City of Phoenix employees on how to provide assistance to someone experiencing domestic violence. Ms. Bissa noted Phoenix will take into consideration workplace policies on domestic violence, sexual assault, and sexual harassment prior to establishing contracts with outside vendors. She commented that a training video has been discussed to assist in these efforts.

Ms. Bissa stated the Systems Reform pillar focuses on Phoenix leading the nation by adopting best practices in all city and state policies. To this end, Phoenix will be reinstating their Domestic Violence Fatality Review Team, establishing a vertical prosecution model, and analyzing offender treatment programs to determine effectiveness.

The Coordinated Services Task Force will work to protect all victims by strengthening, coordinating, and improving their access to services. Ms. Bissa indicated the primary focus of this group is to increase the number of trained victim advocates connecting domestic violence victims to services. She noted they are looking at the Maryland Model of connecting victims to advocates via the phone as an option.

Ms. Bissa noted the final pillar with Partnerships. This task force will engage every level of the community to solve the issue of domestic violence. She indicated working with the O'Connor House and members of the private sector to help gather resources for moving this work forward.

Vice Chair Campbell thanked Ms. Bissa and opened the floor for questions. Yvonne Taylor, Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence, asked for clarification on the definition of a vertical prosecution model and how this makes it easier for prosecutors to keep track of domestic violence cases. Ms. Bissa answered that vertical prosecution allows for prosecutors to be assigned to a case and stay with the case until a decision is made. She asked Mr. Eliason if he could provide additional information. He noted in offices, like Mesa, a large number of domestic violence cases come through. This makes it difficult to remember a case or keep track of a decision. Mr. Eliason stated without the vertical prosecution model, there can be more room for gaps of information. He further noted that without this model, one case can be passed along to several different prosecutors before a final decision is made.

Councilmember Dickey asked Ms. Bissa if there are plans for the training video to address human trafficking. She noted domestic violence can lead someone into human trafficking. Ms. Bissa indicated the Phoenix video would most likely include information related to domestic violence and sexual assault. Councilmember Dickey noted the overlap between domestic violence and human trafficking. She stated that relationships that

develop between the captors and their victims have similar qualities to those considered to be present in domestic violence. Councilmember Dickey noted her surprise that these issues are not being connected more often. Vice Chair Campbell agreed there can be commonalities between the two issues.

8. Success Stories

The Committee had an opportunity to share stories of success experienced during their work with survivors of domestic violence.

Councilmember Dickey shared the Fountain Hills City Council learned about human trafficking at a recent meeting. She asked Carol Comito, City of Fountain Hills Public Safety Advisory Commission, to provide additional information. Ms. Comito stated a presentation was given by the Star Bright Foundation. The presentation brought awareness to the community about the complexity of sex crimes, domestic violence, and human trafficking. She noted the presentation was informative. She noted the importance of recognizing human trafficking is occurring in our communities.

Vice Chair Campbell acknowledged that people think of human trafficking as occurring in foreign countries but it is happening in our communities too. He noted there is overlap between the abuses and barriers faced by victims of domestic violence and human trafficking.

9. Request for Future Agenda Items

Topics or issues of interest that the Regional Domestic Violence Council would like to have considered for discussion at a future meeting was requested. Vice Chair Campbell's suggestion for a presentation on lethality assessment tools was noted.

10. Comments from the Council

An opportunity was provided for the Regional Domestic Violence Council members to present a brief summary of current events. The Regional Domestic Violence Council is not allowed to propose, discuss, deliberate or take action at the meeting on any matter in the summary, unless specific matter is properly noticed for legal action. No comments were made.

11. Adjourn

Vice Chair Campbell thanked everyone for their attendance. The meeting adjourned at 3:25 p.m. The next MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting is scheduled for August 1, 2013.