

MEETING MINUTES
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
TRANSIT COMMITTEE

December 12, 2012
Maricopa Association of Governments; Ironwood Room;
302 N. 1st Avenue, Suite 200
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

*ADOT: Nicole Patrick
Avondale: Kristen Sexton for Rogene Hill
*Buckeye: Andrea Marquez
Chandler: Dan Cook for RJ Zeder
El Mirage: Sue McDermott
Gilbert: Mike Gillespie for Nicole Dailey
Glendale: Matt Dudley for Cathy Colbath,
Chair
Goodyear: Christine McMurdy for Cato
Esquivel
*Maricopa County DOT: Mitch Wagner
Mesa: Jeff Martin for Jodi Sorrell

*Paradise Valley: Jeremy Knapp
Peoria: Maher Hazine
Phoenix: Ken Kessler for Neal Young
*Queen Creek: Kevin Johnson
Scottsdale: Madeline Clemann, Vice Chair
Surprise: David Kohlbeck
Tempe: Robert Yabes for Greg Jordan
*Tolleson: Chris Hagen
Valley Metro: John Farry for Wulf Grote
Youngtown: Grant Anderson for Jim Fox

*Members neither present nor represented by proxy. + - Attended by Videoconference
- Attended by Audioconference

OTHERS PRESENT

Marc Pearsall, MAG
Alice Chen, MAG
Teri Kennedy, MAG
Jorge Luna, MAG
De De Gaisthea, MAG

Wendy Miller, Phoenix

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 10:06 a.m. by Vice Chair Madeline Clemann. She welcomed everyone in attendance and announced that a quorum was present. She noted that no members were joining the meeting by teleconference. Vice Chair Clemann asked if there were any public comment cards, and there being none, proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

2. Approval of Draft November 8, 2012 Minutes

Vice Chair Clemann asked if there were any comments or corrections to the Draft November 8, 2012 meeting minutes. Hearing none, she called for a motion to approve the draft meeting minutes. Dan Cook moved to approve the motion and Maher Hazine seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

3. Call to the Audience

Vice Chair Clemann stated that she had not received any request to speak cards from the audience and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

4. Transit Program Manager's Report

Vice Chair Clemann invited Ms. Eileen Yazzie to brief the Committee with the Transit Program Manager's Report and she welcomed Ms. Yazzie back from her maternity leave. Ms. Yazzie noted that she had a few items to present. She said that it was nice to be back and that her baby and entire family were doing well. She noted that there was much work ahead for the attendees over the next six to eight months with the adoption of the TIP and squaring away the 2013 Program of Projects under MAP-21. Mr. Dan Cook offered a welcome back to Ms. Yazzie on behalf of the attendees. Vice Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Yazzie and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

5. MAG Regional Programming Guidelines for Federal Transit Formula Funds

Vice Chair Clemann then requested that Alice Chen of MAG present and update on MAG Regional Programming Guidelines for Federal Transit Formula Funds.

Ms. Chen began by noting that the presentation would be using interactive spreadsheets so that members could work through the agenda items together in a live setting. She stated that MAG staff had been working in collaboration with the Transit Committee, Regional Public Transit Authority (RPTA), along with the designated recipients City of Phoenix and the Transit Operators Working Group to draft policy guidelines for Regional Programming Guidelines for Federal Transit Formula Funds. She stated that several issues needed to be resolved as the region moved towards defining a set of guidelines. She noted that the issues to be discussed include: 1) Schedule, 2) Financial Overview, 3) Preventive Maintenance, PHX-MESA UZA, 4) Preventive Maintenance, 5.) the Avondale- Goodyear UZA, and Job Access Reverse Commute (JARC).

Ms. Chen added that while the item was not on the agenda for recommended action to MAG regional council, she implored that in order to move forward with the process, it was suggested that the issues discussed herein needed resolution during the meeting and an agreement needed to be reached in order to meet other deadlines within the MAG Committee calendar.

Ms. Chen then referred to her PowerPoint presentation and the supplemental attachments within the agenda packet. Ms Chen noted that this topic had come through the Transit Committee previously, but no action had been taken during those briefings. She began reviewing the schedule for the Transportation Improvement Programming (TIP) year for MAG, namely projects that needed to be accepted by Regional Council by September 2013. She recalled that although it was only December 2012, a decision on a package of Projects was required by July 2013 in order to make the deadline for Regional Council for inclusion in the TIP. She then briefly reviewed the calendar schedule, noting that in December 2012, an overall financial outlook for Programming levels for PM.

She added that JARC allocation of 5307 Funds would be presented in January 2013, with the Evaluation Committee would review the development of application, evaluation criteria, the closeout process, and the qualifying criteria. By February 2013, there would be a full policy document for approval through MAG committee process, with applications made available to member agencies in March 2013 ; and by April 2013, applications were due for the May 2013 reading scores. The final steps would be in June 2013 , with projects approved by Transit Committee; and in July 2013, those projects approved by MAG Regional Council for inclusion in the TIP.

Ms. Chen then explained to the Committee the Financial Overview. She noted that some things had changed since the last time the Committee had discussed the topic. With changes under MAP-21 legislation, there were vast difference, especially in regards to the Region's apportionment amounts. She said that currently the full 5307 funding allocation for the MAG region had not been made available by FTA. However, the Phoenix-Mesa UZA had received the half year allocation for the 5307 funds in the amount of \$22.7 Million. Given the initial allocation, it was expected that the region would receive \$45.3M for FY 2013. She said this represented a decrease of roughly \$8 Million dollars from previous years. She noted that the names and titles of some of the programs had also been changed, merged or deleted. She also noted the Committee on Job Access Reverse Commute program (JARC), was facing a loss of \$1.8 million formula funds, and the elimination of the discretionary grant program which amounted to a \$5 million increase in formula funds but a \$10 million decrease in discretionary funds.

Ms. Chen then displayed a side by side comparison chart showing how the funding programs-landscape had changed from pre-2012 to the present. She explained that under the previous scenario, the MAG Region received \$69.8 million in federal funds; and by contrast under MAP-21, she noted that the Region is looking to receive approximately \$52.9 million. She also reviewed the previous apportionments for the Avondale-Goodyear compared to their current allocations. After summarizing, she declared that MAG was recommending baseline Preventive Maintenance (PM) funding for the Phoenix-Mesa UZA region be set at 20% of the formula 5307 funds. She said that this translated into approximately \$9 million per year. She stated that if JARC is added up (which may be used for operations), along with the CMAQ funds received this year in the amount of \$22 million, and then allocated the funds over a six year time span, it would disperse approximately \$14.6 million per year for PM and/or operations. She noted that since the TLCP was a living document, it provided the region with about \$4 million in competitive funds on an annual basis.

Ms. Chen noted that for PM for the Avondale- Goodyear UZA, MAG was recommending the same amount as was programmed for FY2012, which was approximately \$1.1 million, which would leave the UZA with competitive funds of about \$1.6 million. She said that there was some initial confusion on MAG's recommendation on the UZA, but that it was resolved and there would not be an adjustment with the TLCP, as to not interfere with Avondale's proposed bus purchases over the next few years. She reiterated that those funds would not be programmed with the Phoenix-Mesa UZA, as initially thought by some, but funded strictly within the Avondale-Goodyear UZA. Brief discussion followed and Ms. Chen clarified that the Avondale- Goodyear UZA 5307 funds may be used directly for both PM as well as operations, whereas the Phoenix-Mesa UZA may only use their allotment for PM.

Ms. Chen then continued with discussing Job Access Reverse Commute (JARC), as noted previously. She said that under SAFTEA-LU, the MAG Region was allocated \$1.8 million in FY 2012 specifically for JARC eligible projects, but with the passage of MAP-21, JARC dedicated funding was repealed. She said, however that JARC projects were still eligible under 5307 formula funds. She briefly reminded the Committee that the program's goals were to support the development and maintenance of job access projects designed to transport welfare recipients and eligible low income individuals to and from jobs and activities related to their employment; and to supports reverse commute projects designed to transport residents o f urbanized areas and other than urbanized areas to suburban employment opportunities.

She added that JARC eligibility included private and public agencies, operations and capital projects under MAP-21 did not have to be derived from the Human Service Coordination Plan. She said that the FTA encouraged MPO's and recipients to continue the coordinated planning process in identifying and developing projects for funding. She stated that the plan was available for review on the MAG website along with the JARC circular on the FTA website. She concluded the segment by stating that MAG staff was recommending that JARC funding levels remain unchanged from FY 2012, with annual adjustments consistent with 5307 increases. She said that JARC funds may be used for capital and operations and that in the past it had provided valuable operations support to routes that had high employment and low income populations.

Ms. Chen said that in the event there are unutilized JARC funds, the balance would be distributed as Preventive Maintenance utilized under the existing methodology. In previous years, City of Phoenix led the JARC evaluation process coordinating with the MAG Human Services Division. Future applications would be a coordinated effort between MAG Human Services Division and the City of Phoenix with final approval from MAG Regional Council. She restated that MAG was recommending that all JARC funding proceed through the MAG Committee Process, unlike previous years when it was strictly an ADOT function. She also noted that a comprehensive list of all the programs being funded by JARC would be provided in the future. Spirited discussion followed and it was informally decided that JARC would be left as-was without any funding being depleted for other purposes, and Ms. Chen would follow up later with five funding scenarios.

Ms. Chen concluded with a update of the next steps in the process. She noted that other issues would need to be resolved prior to the recommendation of the policy guidelines for approval and that they would need to be discussed in the January 2013 Transit Committee meetings. The concerns to be addressed would include: project application; projection evaluation criteria; project evaluation committee; close-out process; and qualifying criteria. Brief discussion followed.

Vice Chair Clemann then asked Ms. Chen to continue with her final presentation on PM and competitive funds. Ms. Chen then stated that with Committee participation, she would review different scenarios, namely 25%, 22.5%, 20%, and graduated scenarios spread out over six years. Ms. Chen said that since MAP-21 was only positioned for two years, there was great value in agreeing upon a set standard now in order to tide the region over through 2014 with continuous and predictable streams of funding. Discussion followed and there was overall vocal support for a 25% rate by the members.

Vice Chair Clemann asked if there were any more comments on the topic. Ms. Sexton asked if the Avondale-Goodyear UZA members might meet with the pertinent partners in order to discuss and vet the numbers. She suggested that she meet with the A-G UZA member cities and report back to the Transit Committee in January with some decisions on the funding scenarios. Further discussion followed. Chair Clemann agreed. Ms. Chen concluded by requesting that the members discuss their views and general consensus on direction for 5307 percentages in order for her to proceed with her followup report. Scenario One featuring a 25% rate was supported by unanimous voice consent.

Vice Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Chen for her presentation and the Committee for their dialogue and said that she looked forward to the January meeting. Vice Chair Clemann then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

6. Transit Committee 2013 Meeting Schedule

Vice Chair Clemann asked the members of the Committee if there were any issues with the proposed 2013 meeting schedule for the Transit Committee. Hearing none, she called for a motion to accept the schedule as presented by MAG. Mr. Dan Cook moved to approve the motion and Mr. Ken Kessler seconded, and the meeting schedule was accepted.

7. Request for Future Agenda Items

Vice Chair Clemann asked the members of the Committee if there were any issues that they would like added as future agenda items. Mr. Matthew Dudley inquired if a summary update could be provided regarding the status of available future funding for the 5310 and 5317 programs. Ms. Chen replied that an update would be provided in the near future. Hearing no further comments, Vice Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

8. Next Meeting Date

Vice Chair Clemann thanked those present and she announced that the next meeting of the MAG Transit Committee would be held on Thursday, January 10, 2013 at 10:00 a.m. in the MAG Office, Chaparral Room. There being no further business, Vice Chair Clemann adjourned the meeting at 11:20 a.m.

Adjourn.