

MEETING MINUTES
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
TRANSIT COMMITTEE

June 13, 2013

Maricopa Association of Governments; Ironwood Room;
302 N. 1st Avenue, Suite 200
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

ADOT: Nicole Patrick	*Paradise Valley: Jeremy Knapp
Avondale: Kristen Sexton for Rogene Hill	Peoria: Maher Hazine
#Buckeye: Andrea Marquez	Phoenix: Maria Hyatt
Chandler: Dan Cook for RJ Zeder	Queen Creek: Chris Anaradian
*El Mirage: Sue McDermott	Scottsdale: Madeline Clemann, Chair
Gilbert: Leslie Hart	Surprise: David Kohlbeck
Glendale: Matthew Dudley for Cathy Colbath	#Tempe: Greg Jordan
Goodyear: Cato Esquivel	*Tolleson: Chris Hagen
Maricopa County DOT: Mitch Wagner	Valley Metro: Wulf Grote
Mesa: Jodi Sorrell	Youngtown: Grant Anderson

*Members neither present nor represented by proxy. + - Attended by Videoconference
- Attended by Audioconference

OTHERS PRESENT

Eileen Yazzie, MAG	Kristen Sexton, Avondale
Marc Pearsall, MAG	Christine McMurdy, Goodyear
Alice Chen, MAG	Kini Knudson, Phoenix
Monique de los Rios-Urban	Ted Mariscal, Phoenix
DeDe Gaisthea, MAG	Wendy Miller, Phoenix
Teri Kennedy, MAG	Bob Antila, Valley Metro
Stephanie Shipp, HDR	Deron Lozano, Valley Metro
	Mark Wavering, Gannett Fleming

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 10:05 a.m. by Chair Madeline Clemann. She welcomed everyone in attendance and announced that a quorum was present. She noted that three members were joining the meeting by teleconference; Andrea Marquez of Buckeye, and Greg Jordan of Tempe. Chair Clemann asked if there were any public comment cards, and there being none, proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

2. Approval of Draft April 11, 2013 and Draft May 9, 2013 Meeting Minutes

Chair Clemann asked if there were any comments or corrections to the Draft April 11, 2013 and May 9, 2013 meeting minutes. Hearing none, she called for a motion. Mr. Grant moved to approve the motion, Mr. Hazine seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Chair Clemann then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

3. Call to the Audience

Chair Clemann stated that she had not received any request to speak cards from the audience and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

4. Transit Program Manager's Report

Chair Clemann invited Eileen Yazzie of MAG to brief the Committee with the Transit Program Manager's Report.

Ms. Yazzie noted that she had a few items to present. She said that the Section 5310 and 5307 applications due date was on June 7. She noted that the Elderly Persons with Disabilities application program received 26 applications from 22 organizations for the 5310 and for the 5307-JARC there were 12 applications from 6 agencies, which were currently under review with decisions by July and a return in August/September to Transit Committee. Chair Clemann inquired what the total funding amounts was for JARC and the 5310 programs. Ms. Yazzie explained there was \$1.8M for JARC and \$2.4M 5310, respectively, and a total request was \$3.7M 5310 with an available pot of \$5M; and for and \$4.7M JARC with an available pot of \$1.8M.

Ms. Yazzie noted that the Sustainable Transportation and Land Use Study (STLUIIS) study was set for approval in April, but it was requested to be heard at later time. After a May stakeholder meeting, the revised text was sent out and edits were received and the MAG staff was still comments reviewing comments. The final changes would be made in the next couple of weeks and would return to the committee in July. Ms. Yazzie also noted that the new FY14 UPWP provided funding for the new Southeast Valley Transit System Study (SEVTSS), a study jointly conducted with MAG and Valley Metro. She noted that an email has been sent out and advised the PMT members to contact Jorge Luna so that MAG could share the scope and get the project launched in late summer.

Ms. Yazzie also welcomed Maria Hyatt as the new interim director of Phoenix Public Transit Department. Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Yazzie for her report and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

5.- FY 2013 Draft Program of Projects and FY 2014-2018 Draft Transportation Improvement Program

Chair Clemann requested that Alice Chen present an update to the committee on the MAG FY 2013 Draft Program of Projects and FY 2014-2018 Draft Transportation Improvement Program.

Ms. Alice Chen informed the Committee of how the full fiscal year Transit Formula fund apportionment for 2013 has been made available by the Federal Transit Administration. The development of the FY2014-2018 Transportation Improvement Plan (TIP) is currently underway. She noted that the Transit committee was tasked with programming and balancing the TIP, which included fiscal year 2013. She also said that MAG staff had been working with Valley Metro/RPTA to reconcile the needs of the Transit Life Cycle Program (TLCP) and to program the priorities of the Regional Programming Guidelines. She added that the item was on the agenda for information, discussion and possible recommended action.

Ms. Chen explained that for FY2013, there were changes made to the handout that was sent out on Monday June 10th. She stated that on page 1 of the handout, the first change was the Avondale apportionment number, was brought up to \$2.8M. She noted that on page 2, the Valley Metro friction brake phase 1 amount was brought up to \$331,000. She added that on page 3 the Central Mesa, adjustments were pending, where the small starts apportionment was \$18M, but the programmed amount was \$20M. She added that work would continue with Valley Metro to remedy those numbers. She said that on the original, but not on the handout, there was a FY2012 discretionary project; but it was removed because it would now be included in a grant. Ms. Chen said that there were no changes in FY14-18, however she said the number of buses noted in the TIP would now move from six from three units pushed to the horizon years, notably buses used for Express service.

Chair Clemann stated that in FY13, Scottsdale had a line item included for purchasing vehicles, but asked if they were they folded into the regional bus purchases. Ms. Chen replied that those buses were programmed under CMAQ flex on page 2 of the document, in the fourth section, line item 2. Ms. Chen also said that the funding programs changed within MAP 21 and some elements needed to be shifted, under the new and consolidated funding sources. Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Chen and asked if there were any comments from the Committee. Ms. Kristen Sexton asked if there was a line missing in the Avondale park and ride. Ms Chen replied that there would be two in FY14 and one in FY15. Ms. Yazzie added a clarification, noting that FY2014 begins on July first.

Ms. Chen noted that the item was on the agenda for recommended approval in relation to air quality conformity. Chair Clemann asked if there were any further questions or comments. Hearing none, she called for a motion. Mr. Hazine moved to approve the motion, Mr. Anderson seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Chair Clemann then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Yazzie and asked if there were any further questions. Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

6. American Recovery and Reinvestment Act (ARRA) Project Close-Out

Chair Clemann requested that Ms. Yazzie present an update to the committee on the American Recovery and Reinvestment Act (ARRA) Project Close-Out.

Ms. Yazzie explained the proposed project changes to transit projects in the MAG FY2011-2015 TIP as related to the American Recovery and Reinvestment Act (ARRA), which was passed by Congress and signed into law by President Obama in February 2009. She stated that the legislation required all Federal Transit Administration funds to be obligated by September 30, 2010 and also required all ARRA funds be drawn down/reimbursed by September 30, 2013.

Ms. Yazzie also explained that Alice Chen was coordinating with City of Phoenix, and as of January 2013, there was \$11 million identified that was not reimbursed at the time. At the February 2013 meeting, MAG Transit Committee approved the recommendation to allocate any unspent ARRA funds by May 31, 2013 to operations or preventive maintenance utilizing the approved May 25, 2011 distribution methodology. She added that as of June 1st when COP reconciled the reimbursement request, there were \$3,721,455 in unspent ARRA funds. The funds had been reallocated to operations based on the approved methodology and presented in the project change sheet in Attachment #1. The motion was to spend the unallocated money on operations and PM. She added that there was a memo on how the remaining balance was processed through the distribution methodology, and in step 2 it outlined the current amount of funding the region had for Operations, She concluded that in step 3, it showed the adjustment rounding was for \$3 and that the new total to be unspent operations was \$5.4M with the table showing the amounts not spent.

Chair Clemann asked if there were any further questions or comments. Mr. Esquivel asked if the projects listed on step 3 were a part of ARRA. Ms. Yazzie replied yes. Mr. Dudley asked if the pending amounts and funds should be sent it to the City of Phoenix. Ms. Yazzie replied there were current operation IGA's in place and Mr. Ken Kessler added that there were change orders to the IGA's. Ms. Yazzie added that for changes the members should contact Ken Kessler at the City of Phoenix directly.

Ms. Yazzie summarized that the item was on the agenda for information, discussion and possible action to recommend approval of the project changes to the MAG FY2011-2015 Transportation Improvement Program related to the reallocation of \$3,721,455 of unspent federal ARRA funds to operations. Chair Clemann asked if there were any further questions or comments. Hearing none, she called for a motion. Ms. Patrick moved to approve the motion, Mr. Dudley seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Chair Clemann then proceeded to the next item on the agenda

Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Yazzie and asked if there were any further questions. Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

7. Unused Preventive Maintenance Funds

Chair Clemann requested that Ms. Yazzie continue with update to the committee on Unused Preventive Maintenance Funds.

Eileen Yazzie informed the Committee of how unused preventive maintenance (PM) funds from small transit operators are allocated. She noted that between FY2011 and FY2015, it was estimated that the region would contribute \$77.8 million in federal funds to transit operators for PM. She said that MAG had an approved preventive maintenance distribution methodology that was documented in the MAG Regional Programming Guidelines for Federal Transit Formula Funds. She added that in some cases, the PM funds allocated to smaller transit operators was more than their budget needs. In the past, the unused funds had been distributed back through the methodology to the other operators that still had unmet needs. It was anticipated that this situation would occur again in FY2013, 2014, and 2015. Currently the situation had not been documented in the Transit Programming Guidelines, but may be if the Committee so chose.

Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Yazzie and asked if there were any further questions or comments. Ms. Yazzie noted that there was an approved methodology, and that the region was putting a lot of money into PM. She noted that smaller agencies had reached their PM limit, but that currently the amount is revised to redistribute the funds. Mr. Hazine asked if it was possible for the Committee to hear if the City of Peoria could not use their PM funds, and if they could allocate their unused funds to another agency. He noted that Peoria was using fewer buses and more cabs and that the funds were unused, but inquired if they could be used sooner than later. He added that at currently, Peoria was covered for PM for the next five years and would like to direct their portion of the regional funds to their operator (VM and COP) so their costs, Peoria's, would go down.

Chair Clemann asked if these funds could be used in facility maintenance. Ms. Yazzie stated that it had been previously agreed that it was to be used on buses. Ms. Hazine added that it might be applied for facilities, but many smaller agencies have city staff working there. Mr. Kohlbeck noted that the disposal of buses with Phoenix had been previously discussed as well, however Ms. Yazzie noted that Surprise was being removed from the methodology because the city was no longer operating service. Chair Clemann noted that Valley Metro was taking over operations and asked if Peoria had used those funds to bring down the cost of the cabs. Mr. Hazine noted that Peoria had asked that question prior to the change because the vehicles belonged to the taxi cab company.

Ms. Hyatt noted that any additional cost would reduce the cost per mile for all those purchasing service. Chair Clemann asked if there was a way to apply the money to those agencies. Ms. Yazzie replied that since Surprise was no longer a service operator, that Surprise would no longer get PM as it was only set aside for operators that report to NTD. Discussion followed and it was asked if the region wanted to change the allocation and dollar to dollar amount which would be up to the operators. Ms. Clemann noted that one loses PM, but gain efficiencies by reduced costs from DAR to cab. Mr. Cook asked of cities or operators were listed in step 2, and was there some regional policy that says they'll get PM money regardless if they operating money or not. Ms. Yazzie said there was text on the methodology, and that if a city was reporting to the NTD, then money was allocated.

Mr. Kohlbeck asked that with City of Phoenix taking over the 5310 program that belonged to ADOT, could that be used or plugged into that program. Ms. Yazzie said that the 5310 was mainly individual organizations that apply for money, but said that MAG would look further into the inquiry. Mr. Anderson said that during their introduction, the city could put their unused amount to another agency, but then they said that they want to put it back to the pot and redistributed to get a benefit for their improvements. He added that there were some communities that there was no assurance that the money being put back into the pot, but the benefit is not accrued back to the agency. Mr. Hazine replied that if a city doesn't use the money, the money is redirected back to the pot. Brief discussion followed.

Mr. Hazine said there was a CMAQ discussion, and that the question was that if the city of Chandler got a one to one benefit. If so, the amount went back into the general pot. He added that the current conversion was really no different, but it's the same discussion and should be treated equally. He inquired on what the process was for going forward. Ms. Yazzie noted that the hybrid transition happened three years ago, and that unused amounts beefed up the PM distribution. She added that since then, the Region allocated the money using NTD approved data, with some of the numbers in the future, and that the amounts would go down because they were now a hybrid system. She added that along with Ms. Chen's item, when the region programs, we may ask the operators if they had reached their limit today and in the next few years. She said that this could happen within the TIP.

Mr. Hazine said that the region had done this with the buses because in Peoria's case, there was no bus fleet. He added that in any new grants, in '15 or '16 the city had enough money for the next five years, but Peoria didn't want to lose the place in line after the current amount was used up and eventually be able to tap into the funds. Ms. Yazzie replied that MAG would look at that in the distribution process in order not to lose sight of the funds. Ms. Clemann said that Peoria would not be removed from their place in line, but the formula will track along and with less vehicles would subsequently have less maintenance. Mr. Hazine stated that the goals were to run as efficient a system as possible, so the analysis should be looked at.

Mr. Anderson added that it was important that the allocation remained the same, but because of retaining Peoria would keep everyone on the same basis. He said also that the entire region benefitted as a rider from one city uses the services in another. Mr. Hazine replied that Peoria wanted folks that desired service expansion and noted that allocation was dropped, and that money within the funding pot did not allow Peoria to institute those requested services. Mr. Cook inquired if a community did begin operating services, then would the formula will help those new operators if a city becomes one. Ms. Yazzie replied in the affirmative.

Chair Clemann asked if there were any additional comments or questions. Mr. Dudley asked if a city had the PM and a taxi operator and their rate included PM, could the city not use PM for someone else that owns that vehicle. Mr. Hazine stated that an agency could own its vehicles, but federally owned vehicles could only use the PM. He noted that private cabs did not qualify because they could not individually break out the accounting for miles, maintenance, etc. Discussion followed. Mr. Dudley inquired about allocation percentages. Ms. Yazzie said that the methodology was based on NTD data, and that it included the current NTD percentages. Any changes in the dollar amount for distributed 5307 would use current NTD data; as it was ARRA and the Region used current distribution methodology. She added that even two years ago the Region did not have METRO in the methodology mix, as they had reported, but the LRT system was not queued into the mix yet.

Mr. Dudley asked that if in the long run, when Surprise goes away as an operator, would Peoria have less funding as well. Ms. Yazzie said that the percentages would change slightly. She added that she would work with Ms. Chen to run the numbers again and do a QA/QC to see if the funds could be used in 2013, '14, '15 and '16. Mr. Dudley asked if the allocation would go down as well for Tempe. Ms. Yazzie add that it would go down and that the region approved it on using data for distribution. He replied that Glendale was on the same page as they were paying for PM approved methodology. Discussion concluded. Mr. Cook inquired and asked if the committee needed to take action. Chair Clemann noted that action was only needed if the committee wished to change if the committee accepted to change it. Chair Clemann noted that no action was need on the item.

Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Yazzie and asked if there were any further questions. Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

8. Transit Service Holiday Operations Discussion

Chair Clemann noted that she had originally requested the item be presented to the Transit Committee. She noted that Jorge Luna was to lead the discussion regarding the transit service holiday operations in the region, with a background on what the current hours of service are, and the number and actual holidays that were on the schedule for 2014. He was to also discuss the cost of current holiday service per day and the cost difference per day between running a holiday service schedule to a regular schedule. She noted that prior to the meeting, Valley Metro informed her that they would be putting the item on the upcoming RTAG agenda. MAG staff had sent the pertinent data to Valley Metro staff so that it may be included in the RTAG discussion. Therefore Chair Clemann advised that there would be no need for Transit Committee review of on the agenda item.

Chair Clemann thanked Mr. Luna and asked if there were any further questions. Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

9. Request for Future Agenda Items

Chair Clemann asked the members of the Committee if there were any issues that they would like added as future agenda items. Mr. Dudley inquired on the status of LTAF II funds and observed that they were typically expended by now. Mr. Grote replied that he would inquire with Paul Hodgins. Discussion ensued. Mr. Anderson noted that there was a call for bike ped review of grant applications and that design assistance meeting was on the same day as the next Transit Committee meeting. Ms. Yazzie stated that she would check on the conflicting schedules, but noted that there was a high probability of cancelling the next Transit Committee meeting. Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

10. Next Meeting Date

Chair Clemann thanked those present and she announced that the next meeting of the MAG Transit Committee may be held on Thursday, July 11, 2013 at 10:00 a.m. in the MAG Office, Ironwood Room. There being no further business, Chair Clemann adjourned the meeting at 10:58 a.m.