

FINAL MEETING MINUTES
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
TRANSIT COMMITTEE

September 12, 2013
Maricopa Association of Governments; Ironwood Room;
302 N. 1st Avenue, Suite 200
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

*ADOT: Nicole Patrick	*Paradise Valley: Jeremy Knapp
Avondale: Rogene Hill	Peoria: Vice Chair Maher Hazine
#Buckeye: Andrea Marquez	Phoenix: Ken Kessler for Maria Hyatt
Chandler: Dan Cook for RJ Zeder	*Queen Creek: Chris Anaradian
El Mirage: Sue McDermott	Scottsdale: Madeline Clemann, Chair
#Gilbert: Leslie Hart	*Surprise: David Kohlbeck
Glendale: Matthew Dudley for Cathy Colbath	Tempe: Robert Yabes
Goodyear: Cato Esquivel	#Tolleson: Chris Hagen
#Maricopa: David Maestas	Valley Metro: Deron Lozano for Wulf Grote
*Maricopa County DOT: Mitch Wagner	*Youngtown: Grant Anderson
Mesa: Jeff Martin for Jodi Sorrell	

*Members neither present nor represented by proxy. + - Attended by Videoconference
- Attended by Audioconference

OTHERS PRESENT

Eileen Yazzie, MAG	Kristen Sexton, Avondale
Marc Pearsall, MAG	Ted Mariscal, Phoenix
Alice Chen, MAG	Mindy Kimball, ASU School of Sustainability
DeDe Gaisthea, MAG	Matt Tsark, Strand
Jorge Luna, MAG	

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 10:06 a.m. by Vice Chair Maher Hazine. He welcomed everyone in attendance and announced that a quorum was present. He noted that four members were joining the meeting by teleconference; Andrea Marquez of Buckeye, Leslie Hart of Gilbert, David Maestas of Maricopa and Chris Anaradian of Queen Creek. Vice Chair Hazine asked if there were any public comment cards, and there being none, proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

2. Approval of Draft August 8, 2013 Meeting Minutes

Vice Chair Hazine asked if there were any comments or corrections to the Draft August 8, 2013 meeting minutes. Hearing none, he called for a motion. Mr. Martin moved to approve the motion, Mr. Kessler seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Vice Chair Hazine then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

3. Call to the Audience

Vice Chair Hazine stated that he had not received any request to speak cards from the audience and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

4. Transit Program Manager's Report

Vice Chair Hazine invited Eileen Yazzie of MAG to brief the Committee with the Transit Program Manager's Report.

Ms. Yazzie noted that she had a few items to present. She noted that the Federal Transit Administration had released its list of the awards for the latest round of TIGER discretionary grants earlier in the week. The MAG Region did not receive any funds, but the Port of Tucson freight facility in Tucson did receive some funding. She noted that some of the MAG Region projects that had been submitted for included the Tempe Streetcar and upgrades to the South Maintenance Facility, but none were awarded. In regards to streetcar awards, the new project in Kansas City did receive a TIGER Grant. Ms. Yazzie then reminded the committee members of the upcoming Arizona Rail Passenger Conference sponsored by AzTA (Arizona Transit Association) in Tucson on November 14-15, 2013. She referred members to their website and the flyer and noted that one of the main features of the conference would be to showcase the new Tucson Streetcar.

She also briefed the committee on the two small, MAG on-call studies featuring rail components: The Regional Bicycle and Pedestrian Rail Crossing Recommendations Study, which features railroad and pedestrian safety improvements in the communities in Chandler, Gilbert and Tempe along the Union Pacific Railroad; and the Hassayampa Valley Rail Corridor Cost Analysis Study which would review new conceptual freight railroad lines between Wickenburg, Buckeye and Gila Bend in the far West Valley. Both were due for completion by Spring 2014. Ms. Yazzie concluded her report by referring the members to the new MAG Committee Quorum guidelines, which stipulates that a member would no longer be counted toward the quorum total after three absences. However, that absent member would again be included towards the quorum count upon their return at a subsequent meeting. The quorum issue had arisen in other committees where quorums were not being met due to consistent absences of a majority of members' representatives. Ms. Yazzie completed her report.

Vice Chair Hazine thanked Ms. Yazzie for her report and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

5. Northwest Valley Local Transit System Study - Draft Report Final Acceptance

Vice Chair Hazine invited Mr. Marc Pearsall of MAG to present on the Northwest Valley Local Transit System Study (NWVLTSS) - Draft Report Final Acceptance.

Mr. Pearsall thanked the committee and noted that the item was on the agenda for possible action and that it would make its way to Regional Council by mid-October. He explained that the Northwest Valley Local Transit System Study (NWVLTSS) began as a grassroots effort nearly three years ago. He noted that MAG was initially contacted by the Northwest Valley senior advocacy group Benevilla after the closure of the all-volunteer Sun City Area Transit (SCAT), which left a the Northwest, specifically Sun City, without a public transit option. MAG was commissioned in 2011 to craft a plan to work with local agencies along the corridor, including Glendale, Peoria, El Mirage, Youngtown, Surprise, Maricopa County, Sun City, Sun City West, Sun City Festival, and Valley Metro, to develop a scope of work for the study.

He continued by noting that the NWVLTSS was a sister study to the Southwest Valley Local Transit System Study (SWVLTSS), recently completed by Mr. Jorge Luna of MAG and approved by the TRC at the March 25, 2013 meeting. Mr. Pearsall explained that the two studies had similar goals: to identify where people live and the destinations they most frequented in their daily trips to craft a reasonable transit system. He said that the Northwest Valley had not completed a plan such as this in at least 20 years. As the study revolved around a demand-based approach, he explained that the lack of a standard grid system was a challenge for providing transit services in the Northwest, while another challenge from a local perspective identifying what types of services people desired.

He continued by noting that MAG's Project Management Team (PMT), consisting of the communities of the Northwest Valley, Maricopa County, Valley Metro and MAG, hired Moore and Associates as the consultant for the study in spring of 2012. He explained that the project was extensive in its public involvement timeline between September 2012 and May 2013, noting that 33 public meetings were conducted, involving neighborhood groups, non-profits, churches, and senior centers. Topics included frequency of potential service and who would manage the program. The consultants maintained an extensive online presence and conducted field intercept surveys, in addition to the 2200 surveys and various public meetings. He noted that the potential cost of the transit improvements did not seem to surprise the residents; the community was excited about the idea of transit, but understood that no funding was identified. He explained that the study was a blueprint for how the community could move forward with providing transit service. He also added that MAG was continuing to work with the PMT on guiding principles that had been drafted by Maher Hazine of Peoria, on how to identify funding, and how to work with Valley Metro to provide service moving forward.

Mr. Pearsall then described the demographics of the Northwest Valley. The population of respondents was primarily baby boomers and retirees, but there were also students and younger families mixed in. Newer residents to the area had expressed a general frustration about the lack of decent transit in the area, having moved to the region from other parts of the nation where transit service was available, even in suburban areas. Marc then displayed maps which showed where people in the Northwest Valley live and work. The data shown in these maps validated ideas that came out of the NWVLTSS. Community trips and demographics were shown on a graph showing where Glendale & Peoria residents lived and worked. As an example, Mr. Pearsall also pointed out

that a large number of people who live in El Mirage and Surprise commute along the east/west corridor generally represented by SR-101. The commute patterns bolstered the idea that basic connections such as neighborhood circulators and extended east/west bus service are a fundamental foundation of transit in the community. He said that communities with aspirations of higher levels of transit, such as commuter rail or light rail, it was essential to start with basic bus service, a strong underlying bus service could build ridership and bolster the case for adding those enhanced services.

Mr. Pearsall concluded by displaying three maps of recommendations for the region (short-term, mid-term, and long-term), explaining that the suggestions displayed were beginning discussion points, not final service plans. He broke down the service recommendations maps (draft) of near-term recommendations (zero to five years); plus mid-term recommendations (five to ten years); and, long-term recommendations (10 to 15+ years). He said the study assisted local agencies to use the recommendations; in order to further the local needs decision-making processes, where appropriate. He thanked Benevilla, which was the driving force for getting the study started. He also noted that they had thoughtfully used their grassroots effort from 2010 to present in order to team with Sun Health to create the premise of Northwest Connections. While working toward these longer-term recommendations, communities in the Northwest Valley have worked to expand dial-a-ride services with Discount Cab. Additionally, a new program called Connect 60+ was created as a one-stop shop for allowing retired and elderly adults to connect with each other, particularly for home-bound people who feel isolated. He added that the NWV Transportation Stakeholders group would continue to promote those services.

Mr. Pearsall noted that the next step for the study was the development of guiding principles at the direction of MAG's partner cities. Marc planned to meet with seven municipalities to discuss what they want out of a guiding principles and partnering agreements. Vice Chair Hazine thanked Mr. Pearsall for his report and asked if there were any questions or comments. Mr. Cook offered brief comment and Chair Clemann and Vice Chair Hazine thanked MAG, the member agencies and Moore & Associates for their work on the study. Vice Chair Hazine asked if there were any further questions or comments. Hearing none, he called for a motion. Chair Clemann moved to recommend approval, Mr. Dudley seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

Vice Chair Hazine again thanked Mr. Pearsall and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

6.- Job Access Reverse Commute Coordination – Lead Agency Change

Vice Chair Hazine requested that Ms. Chen present an update to the Job Access Reverse Commute Coordination – Lead Agency Change agenda item.

Ms. Chen stated that the item was on the agenda for possible action. She explained that on March 27, 2013, the MAG Regional Council approved the Regional Programming Guidelines for Federal Transit Formula Funds. She said that Under Section 300 of the Guidelines, the programming priorities included allocation for funding for Job Access Reverse Commute (JARC) related activities. Also, Under Section 703 of the Guidelines, it was recommended that the City of Phoenix, the regional designated grant recipient, that they continue as the lead in the JARC application process,

coordinating with MAG Human Services staff and the MAG Elderly and Persons with Disability Transportation Program (EPDT) Ad Hoc Committee.

She further explained that the Fiscal Year 2013 application process was completed in July 2013. The MAG EPDT Ad Hoc Committee held a debrief meeting on August 22, 2013. It was recommended at the debrief meeting, that given the MAG Transit Committee member's backgrounds regarding JARC criteria, that MAG staff, working with the Transit Committee assume the lead for future JARC applications. She described the current language of the criteria. She then explained 703. Job Access Reverse Commute (JARC) - 2. City of Phoenix would lead the JARC evaluation process coordinating with the MAG Human Services Division. Applications would be a coordinated effort between MAG Human Services Division and the City of Phoenix with final approval from MAG Regional Council.

Ms. Chen then reviewed the proposed revised language for the criteria: 703. Job Access Reverse Commute(JARC) - 2. City of Phoenix MAG would lead the JARC evaluation process coordinating with the MAG Transit Committee and MAG Human Services Division. Applications would be a coordinated effort between MAG Transit Committee and MAG Human Services Division and the City of Phoenix with final approval from MAG Regional Council.

Ms. Chen completed her presentation and advised that she or DeDe Gaisthea of MAG were happy to answer any questions. Vice Chair Hazine thanked Ms. Chen for her presentation and asked if there were any questions or comments. Brief comments were contributed by Mr. Dudley, Ms. Hill and Mr. Lozano regarding grants and operations funding. Mr. Cook and Mr. Dudley discussed JARC and agreed with the new language and the coordination efforts.

Vice Chair Hazine asked if there were any further questions or comments. Hearing none, he called for a motion. Mr. Yabes moved to recommend approval, Mr. Kessler seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

Vice Chair Hazine again thanked Ms. Chen and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

7. Regional Competitive Grants - Project Priority Listing and Funding Allocation

Vice Chair Hazine requested that Ms. Chen present an update to the Regional Competitive Grants - Project Priority Listing and Funding Allocation agenda item.

Ms. Alice Chen explained that again on March 27, 2013, the MAG Regional Council approved The MAG Regional Programming Guidelines for Federal Transit Formula Funds. She noted that under Section 701 of the Guidelines document, it was recommended that any unprogrammed funds in the Phoenix-Mesa Urbanized Area be utilized through a competitive evaluation process.

She continued by explaining that the process began in February 2013 and that eight projects were submitted for consideration of funding. The Evaluation Committee met on April 24, 2013 to review staff presentations and recommend a list of priority projects. At the April 24, 2013 meeting, there were no available funds to be programmed towards the projects submitted. She then noted that on

August 21, 2013, MAG Regional Council approved the deletion of a duplicate Transit Life Cycle Program (TLCP) Project which made available \$3,989,281 in FY2013 funds. The Evaluation Committee met on August 12, 2013 to discuss funding of the projects with the new source of revenue.

Ms. Chen then explained that projects were recommended for funding priority, utilizing the evaluation criteria worksheet developed by the working group and approved by the Transit Committee. She noted that the working group recommended: 1) Partial funding in the amount of \$2.5 million for the project ranked first, the South Transit Facility Refurbishment. The project was submitted to FTA USDOT for the Transportation Investment Generating Economic Recovery (TIGER) discretionary grant program in early 2013. She said that the awards for TIGER had not been announced and given the uncertainty of the TIGER grant, the committee recommended setting-aside \$2.5 million for this project, pending FTA decision. She said that the funds would be “freed up” if the project is awarded TIGER funding or made available for the project if it is not awarded TIGER funding. She also noted that the funding awards for TIGER grants were eventually announced on September 5, 2013. The South Transit Facility Refurbishment project did not receive any funds and therefore the recommendation is to move forward with awarding \$2.5 million to City of Phoenix for the South Transit Facility Refurbishment.

Ms. Chen further explained that 2) Funding the full requested amounts for projects were ranked numbers two through six: 2-HASTUS 2013 Upgrade, 3-EVBOM - Building systems and CO/O2 sensors, 4-Tempe Route 56 Bus Stop Improvements, 5-Chandler Shelter Procurement and Installation, 6-EVBOM - CNG Pump Expansion. She noted as well: 3) Fund the minimum requested for project ranked number 7-Crosscut Canal Bridge - Pathways to Transit and; 4) The balance of funds, \$37,163 was made available to City of Chandler for the ranked 8-Park and Ride Parking Canopies. She noted that the amount was below their minimum requested amount and therefore the city declined the funds. She concluded that the funds would remain unprogrammed pending future needs. She completed her presentation and advised the members to refer to the attachments for the recommended priority listing and funding amounts and noted that she or Teri Kennedy were happy to answer any questions.

Vice Chair Hazine thanked Ms. Chen for her report and asked if there were any questions or comments. Mr. Kessler and Ms. Chen added a clarification regarding the CNG pump project, and discussion continued regarding use of the remaining \$37,000 and to which municipality it should be released to. Mr. Martin, Mr. Lozano, Mr. Cook and Mr. Yabes discussed East Valley transit investments. After at length discussion, Chair Clemenn noted that she would support the surplus \$37,000 being provided to the Tempe project, but advised that greater care be taken in next year’s by MAG staff in the ranking and vetting process, as to prevent a similar current funding situation for projects in the future. Vice Chair Hazine asked if there were any further questions or comments. Hearing none, he called for a motion. Ms. Clemann moved to recommend approval, Mr. Dudley seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

Vice Chair Hazine again thanked Ms. Chen and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

8. Request for Future Agenda Items

Vice Chair Hazine asked the members of the Committee if there were any issues that they would like added as future agenda items. Hearing no further comments, Vice Chair Hazine proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

9. Next Meeting Date

Vice Chair Hazine thanked those present and he announced that the next meeting of the MAG Transit Committee would be held on Thursday, October 10, 2013 at 10:00 a.m. in the MAG Office, Ironwood Room.

There being no further business, Vice Chair Hazine adjourned the meeting at 11:21 a.m.