

FINAL MEETING MINUTES
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
TRANSIT COMMITTEE

May 8, 2014

Maricopa Association of Governments; Ironwood Room;
302 N. 1st Avenue, Suite 200
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

ADOT: Nicole Patrick	*Paradise Valley: Jeremy Knapp
Avondale: Kristen Sexton	#Peoria: Walt Begley as Proxy
#Buckeye: Andrea Marquez	Phoenix: Ken Kessler for Maria Hyatt
Chandler: Dan Cook for RJ Zeder	Queen Creek: Mohamed Youssef
*El Mirage: Jorge Gastelum	Scottsdale: Madeline Clemann, Chair
#Gilbert: Kristin Myers	Surprise: Martin Lucero for David Kohlbeck
Glendale: Debbie Albert for Cathy Colbath	Tempe: Robert Yabes
*Goodyear: Cato Esquivel	Tolleson: Chris Hagen
#Maricopa: David Maestas	Valley Metro: Wulf Grote
*Maricopa County DOT: Mitch Wagner	Youngtown: Grant Anderson
Mesa: Jodi Sorrell	

*Members neither present nor represented by proxy. + - Attended by Videoconference
- Attended by Audioconference

OTHERS PRESENT

Eileen Yazzie, MAG	Ann Marie Riley, Chandler
Marc Pearsall, MAG	Jeff Martin, Chandler/Mesa
Margaret Boone, MAG	Kevin Link, Glendale
John Bullen, MAG	Joe Bower, Phoenix
Alice Chen, MAG	Stephanie Child, Phoenix
DeDe Gaisthea, MAG	Dianna Evans, Phoenix
Teri Kennedy, MAG	Kini Knudson, Phoenix
Steve Tate, MAG	Wendy Miller, Phoenix
Julie Walker, MAG	Karen Sypniewski, Phoenix
	#Janeen Gaskins, Surprise
	Reyes Medrano, Tolleson
	Bob Antila, Valley Metro
	Abhi Dayal, Valley Metro
	Mike Sabatini, Baker
	Yung Koprowski, Lee Engineering

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 10:04 a.m. by Chair Clemann. She welcomed everyone in attendance and announced that a quorum was present. She noted that four members were joining the meeting by teleconference: Andrea Marquez of Buckeye, Kristen Myers of Gilbert, David Maestas of Maricopa and Walt Begley of Peoria. Chair Clemann asked if there were any public comment cards, and there being none, proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

2. Approval of Draft April 10, 2014 Meeting Minutes

Chair Clemann asked if there were any comments or corrections to the Draft April 10, 2014 meeting minutes. Hearing none, she called for a motion. Mr. Anderson of Youngtown moved to approve the motion, Mr. Yabes of Tempe seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Chair Clemann then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

3. Call to the Audience

Chair Clemann stated that she had not received any request to speak cards from the audience and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

4. Transit Program Manager's Report

Chair Clemann invited Eileen Yazzie of MAG to brief the Committee with the Transit Program Manager's Report.

Ms. Yazzie began by explaining that she had a few items. She referred to a memo recently developed and distributed to each member. The memo was an information summary to document where the region currently stood with its Preventive Maintenance distribution and how it related to the FY14 and the 2014-2018 TIP that was approved in February. She said that in 2010-2011, the Transit Operators Working group and Transit Committee spent over a year adopting a process, formula and methodology to assist in the distribution of maintenance funds. She added that earlier in 2014, the MAG Region distributed over \$21.8 million in PM funds, but would drop back down to under \$10 million per year moving forward, using the new programming guidelines that allocates 25% of 5307 funds for PM. Brief discussion followed.

Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Yazzie for her report and asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing none, she moved onto the next item on the agenda.

5. JARC Priority Ranking and Funding Recommendations

Chair Clemann then invited Ms. Alice Chen of MAG to present on the JARC Priority Ranking and Funding Recommendations. Chair Clemann noted that the item was on the agenda for possible approval.

Ms. Chen explained that there was a handout at each members place. She stated that on March 26, 2014, the MAG Regional Council approved programming guidelines for the Job Access and Reverse Commute (JARC) program for the Phoenix-Mesa urbanized area. Those guidelines provided for the establishment of a working group to review JARC funding applications and required that the working group be composed of representatives from the MAG Transit Committee and the Chair and Vice Chair of Elderly and Persons Disability Committee. She then noted that the working group had just met on Monday, May 5, 2014 to interview applicants for JARC funding for Federal Fiscal Years 2014 and 2015. Applications for JARC funding were due to MAG on Thursday, April 17, 2014 and a total of twenty applications were received and referred to her presentation spreadsheet, but one applicant related to non-JARC funded operating costs as well as selected partial routes were not eligible. She added that a summary of those applications was included in the meeting packet and the final recommendations were sent prior to the meeting. She concluded by stating that the item was on the agenda for information, discussion and recommended approval of the priority rankings, project funding and inclusion in the FY 2014-2018 Transportation Plan and updates to the Regional Transportation Plan as appropriate.

Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Chen for her presentation and asked if there were any thoughts or comments.

Ms. Kristen Sexton of Avondale inquired about Route 17, wondering if it replaced the Avondale UZA allocation for service or was it in addition to the existing funding. Mr. Kessler replied that City of Phoenix didn't specifically seek the funding for additional service, but that it was a continuation of current services within Phoenix. They noted that they would work together on any outlying details. Mr. Martin Lucero of Surprise commented that it appeared that agreed-upon policy within the region was shifting away from assisting new, unfunded services, by instead emphasizing more assistance by shoring up existing operations and services. He said that the spirit if JARC within SAFETEA-LU and MAP-21 was to extend funding to unfunded PM in the needy outlying communities beyond a central city.

Mr. Grant Anderson of Youngtown agreed and stated that when the original policies were set up, there was a set-aside for non-profits, but they were not currently ranked higher. Some were dropped below the funding line, which was beyond the original intent of JARC. Mr. Reyes Medrano of Tolleson also commented that the spirit of JARC program was encompassed by Tolleson, and that Zoom service benefitted the small community that accommodates over 20,000 employees who influx into the town everyday.

Chair Clemann stated that she got an impression that the group may have set new criteria and that there may be unintended consequences. Mr. Kessler noted that FTA requirements for anything funded under JARC was defined as maintenance or development and described the FTA's defined

language of those projects that qualify. Mr. Dan Cook of Chandler observed that originally the funds were spread around in a more regional fashion for funding of specific requests, but was concerned of newer criteria without vetting it first. Ms. Chen gave some further background on the methodology and history of the JARC program and changes drawn from input of the member agencies. Mr. Lucero, Ms. Debbie Albert of Glendale, and Ms. Chris Hagen of Tolleson added additional comments requesting a document with more detail and a bit easier to work with from an agency user perspective. Additional comment about the Avondale-Goodyear UZA was heard.

Ms. Yazzie inquired if the motion needed to be approved today. Ms. Chen replied that there was a June 30th deadline for submittal in this round, but there was also a future deadline in September/October and that it was not as time sensitive as other programs, so it did not need to be voted on today. Ms. Clemann inquired with Ms. Chen and the committee on whether or not the item should move forward or if additional time was required. Mr. Cook, Mr. Anderson, Ms. Sexton, Mr. Grote, Mr. Lucero and Mr. Medrano commented further on unintended consequences, service cuts, project ranking, scoring, basic tenants of JARC, and taking additional time to review the program.

Chair Clemann inquired if the committee was comfortable and permitted to, within the item language, state that they were okay with funding the recommendations as they are for one year, but then request that the region reevaluate the options before funding for another second year. Ms. Yazzie stated that it was permissible. Mr. Anderson inquired what would happen to these programs if the funding did not come through with this cycle. Ms. Chen replied that if a project did not receive funding, the applying agency should have responded with an alternative funding source. Chair Clemann inquired on any final thoughts on the issues. Mr. Kessler asked if the intent of delaying an action on today's item was going back to the drawing board, which consumed a lot of staff time, and noted that the Committee had previously agreed that the region shouldn't take a spreading-the-peanut-butter approach to funding, hence the guidelines established in the first place for the rankings. Ms. Jodi Sorrell of Mesa, Mr. Mohamed Youssef of Queen Creek, and Ms. Albert also commented.

Mr. Cook observed that the output and ranking appeared to go against the spirit of JARC and even if the region chose to go ahead with one year, programs seven through nineteen would suffer as they were lower on the list. He suggested that the entire program be looked at again. Chair Clemann stated that she had been in the process for three two-year rounds, and every time the final formula was not acceptable to the members as a whole. She said that although Scottsdale ranked high, she was willing to go with the will of the Committee. Ms. Kristin Myers of Gilbert asked that for future JARC applications, there be more distribution of information on policy, guidance, ranking transparency and methodology for the program, in order to assist the members in understanding the application process, and concluded by suggesting the item be tabled until the following meeting. Ms. Chen stated she would be sending out a follow-up email to the committee members seeking supplemental guidance.

Chair Clemann asked if there were any additional comments. Hearing none, she called for a motion. Mr. Cook of Chandler moved to table the item, requesting more time for MAG staff to review additional data and ranking options, then return to the committee during the next meeting. Mr. Anderson of Youngtown seconded, and the motion passed with a majority of ayes and two dissenting nays. Chair Clemann said the motion carried and then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

6. MAG Human Services Coordination Transportation Plan Update

Chair Clemann then invited Ms. DeDe Gaisthea, MAG Human Services Transportation Planner, to provide an update on the MAG Human Services Coordination Transportation Plan update.

Ms. Gaisthea and Ms. Yazzie began by referring to the presentation and noted that under MAP-21, applicants for Federal Transportation Administration Section 5310 Enhanced Mobility of Seniors and Individuals with Disabilities program funding were required to comply with coordination plans efforts. Ms. Gaisthea said that each plan was federally required to include an inventory of services, gaps analysis and prioritized strategies.

She further explained that in March of 2006, under the previous SAFETEA-LU, any organization seeking funding under Sections 5316, 5317 and 5310 must participate in the preparation of a locally derived coordinated plan. In 2012 this was carried forward under MAP-21, and applicants for Federal Transportation Administration Section 5310 Enhanced Mobility of Seniors and Individuals with Disabilities program funding were also required to comply with coordination plans efforts. Under the FTA Section 5310 program, this was intended to enhance mobility for seniors and person with disabilities by providing funds to serve the special needs of transit-dependent populations beyond traditional public transportation service (where public transportation is insufficient, inappropriate or unavailable), and ADA Complementary para-transit services.

Ms. Gaisthea further added that the purpose of the plans within the FTA Circular, was essentially to create a locally developed, coordinated public transit-human services transportation plan that identified the transportation needs of individuals with disabilities, seniors, and people with low-incomes and provided strategies for meeting those local needs. She expounded that the plan was developed with input from regional stakeholders, with 22 agencies receiving Section 5310 funds and more than 115 agencies participating in the process. She said that this group included non-profits that both received and didn't receive federal funds. Municipalities, for profit agencies, healthcare facilities, state agencies, the county, faith-based communities, and volunteer driver programs were included. She also noted that the region won the United We Ride award for a major urbanized area for successfully implementing plans to coordinate human services transportation.

She added that the endeavor began with 25 participants, but now boasted over 50, with participation from Glendale, Scottsdale, Phoenix, Chandler, Tempe, Avondale, Goodyear, and nonprofit agencies. She concluded by stating that Human Services would be engaging in a new Transportation Ambassador training program in the East Valley and would welcome any input from those agencies. She noted that Human Services Coordination Transportation Plan was available on the MAG website.

Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Gaisthea for her presentation and asked if there were any thoughts or comments. She asked about the New Freedoms grant rankings and inquired if the status of those awards notifications could be shared with the Transit Committee in the future. Discussion followed. Chair Clemann again thanked Ms. Gaisthea for her presentation and asked if there were any additional comments. Chair Clemann then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

7. Update on MAG Strategic Transportation Safety Plan

Chair Clemann then invited Ms. Margaret Boone, MAG ITS Safety Engineer, to provide an update on the MAG Strategic Transportation Safety Plan.

Ms. Boone began by explaining that at the August 2013 Transit Committee meeting, MAG Safety staff presented the on-going MAG project to develop a comprehensive Strategic Transportation Safety Plan (STSP). She noted that the first stages of the development of this plan looked at regional crash trends including the trend of increased pedestrian and bicyclist crashes. Recognizing that all transit customers were pedestrians and possibly bicyclists for part of their journey, she said the current phase of the development of the STSP would look at potential regional policies and practices that could be promoted for improving overall road safety performance in the MAG planning area, including that of pedestrian and bicyclist facilities used to access transit. She noted that the following was a presentation of the data gathered and the work being done in this stage of development of the STSP and to explore the possibility of a collaborative effort between the Safety and Transit committees in recommending regional practices for improving pedestrian and bicyclist safety near transit stops and stations. She added that in order to facilitate this collaboration, they would like to form a working group that could bring back the result of this effort for discussion by the committee at a future meeting. She further referred the members to the STSP on the MAG website: www.stsp.azmag.gov

Ms. Boone continued with describing the MAG STSP by adding that the goals of the STSP was to continue to build on the existing plan, and to provide a means to improve overall safety performance in the MAG Planning Area and the current task included exploring a strategy to incorporate safety in the upcoming Regional Transportation Plan. She noted that they anticipate that the RTP would have an increased focus on multi-modal facilities, with investigations on ways to fund any recommendations that get included in the RTP with the resources available through that process for alternate federal, state, regional and local funding. She added that MAG had been in close coordination with the State through their process of developing an update the Strategic Highway Safety Plan, which was required by the federal government and similarly will outline strategies and performance measures to comply with the regulations of MAP-21. She concluded that this section was important as MPO strategies and performance measures must align with the states strategies and performance measures and ultimately meet safety targets. She then highlighted the MAG 2005 STSP accomplishments. At the time, there was recognition that MAG as a planning organization needed the capability to collect and analyze crash data, which was essential to any safety program in assessing areas where there may be safety issues, by establishing trends and prioritizing projects.

She continued by describing the STSP Development Schedule and stated it was a 20 month process that MAG was currently in the middle of. She said that a lot of crash data provided by the RTSIMS application developed to assess the recent historical crash trends and transportation safety performance, then the establishment of a regional vision of zero deaths; zero serious injuries; working in action areas; strategies and performance measures likely to address the trends discovered via research.

Ms. Boone also noted that with the emergence of new ways to look at current data and model safety performance of proposed safety improvements, her team looked at the existing method by which MAG uses crash data to determine high crash locations and sets priorities for safety programs as well as predictive methods including providing a 4 hour workshop on utilization of these methods for planning. She stated that another aspect was the recent emergence of technologies in collecting data, communications between vehicles, vehicle to driver, and traffic operations equipment such as signal controllers, communications with vehicles. The overriding goal here was to discover new safety implications as well as ways in which to introduce safety issues with this technology. She further delved into the task-work by adding that it would include refining the performance measures established in task three and coming up with a regional strategy to monitor and report regional transportation safety performance; which would in turn move into the formulation of the implementation plan and the final report to be delivered at the end of February 2015.

She then expanded her presentation to review pedestrians & bicyclists crashes. She said that it was discovered that there had been a definite increase in pedestrian crashes overall with a slight increase in serious injury crashes with the number of fatalities at a stasis since 2010. She explained that each one was broken down for both intersection related or those which occur approximately 150 feet from the extension of the curb lines of an intersection an non- intersection related which occur outside that distance and in between intersections. Similarly crashes involving bicyclists again revealed an increase from 2010. Both increases suggested that more roadway users were using transit and other modes other than vehicle travel for their commute, as well as a general increase of bicyclists accessing transit and by nature of transit, with about 90% of transit users were pedestrians at some time in their journey.

Ms. Boone demonstrated that staff looked at all crashes reported statewide, broke down the data for the MAG Planning Area, then further to freeway and arterials and local roadways. The key information to highlight was that 47% of all fatalities occurred in the MAG planning area, and of those, 80% were on arterial and local roads as opposed to freeways. For Serious Injury crashes, 85% of those occurred on arterials and local roadways and that data provided highlighted about 26% of these arterials where the fatal and serious injuries occur currently had some form of transit available. She also engaged the committee with a review of fatal and serious injury crashes with pedestrians. She showed a break down of the pedestrian crashes showed that there are were a total of 1,479 crashes involving pedestrians, which was 21% of all fatal crashes in the MAG Planning area with 95% on arterials and local roads and of those 59% are non intersection related. This may suggest mid-block crossings of pedestrians and that while staff didn't know that these were directly correlated with locations of mid-block transit stops, addressing the safety issues could have the effect of increasing the overall safety of how pedestrians access transit. She also noted the category of potential risk of death or serious Injury, In taking a closer look at the increase in crashes involving pedestrians and bicyclists, the question became one of potential risks and what kind of regional practice might we implemented to minimize those risks in the future.

Ms. Boone concluded by examining th future of funding: with an emphasis on Transportation Safety. She stated that much of what drove the staff methods in the plan stemmed from MAP-21 legislation and its primary goal. She stated staff was working on establishing meaningful measures as required aligning with the four core federal measures for addressing serious injuries and fatality rates and the overall number of fatalities and serious injury crashes. This would incorporate Safety within the RTP, with future RTPs to include multi-modal transportation system infrastructure, increased

interaction between all modes, potential practices to improve overall road safety performance, and collaborative efforts between Transportation Safety Committee and Transit Committee, and the working group. She added that the working group meetings may commence in the June-July time-frame; first to explore and define safety practice(s), recommend practice(s) in support of Transit and Transportation Safety; and second to include the adopted practices in the STSP and RTP.

Chair Clemann thanked Ms. Boone for her presentation and asked if there were any thoughts or comments.

Mr. Cook inquired about the percentages of accidents and the need to move forward in a proactive fashion on safety issues, and asked if the federal measures pertained only to preventable accidents, as many types of accidents may not be preventable. Ms. Boone replied that task 3 dealt specifically with those performance measures and actions that were easily to implement and tracked by the jurisdictions. Discussion followed. Mr. Grote inquired if there was any pedestrian accident data linked to transit access or use. Ms. Boone replied that it was a difficult data set to capture because crash reports are culled from the state reports, and the transit data is not recorded on those reports. Ms. Yung Koprowski of Lee Engineering reported that there was a spacial analysis previously performed on bicycle crashes, transit routes and light rail for task 1, but it was not as sufficient or as detailed as was expected. Mr. Youssef inquired with Ms. Boone if the RT Sims system program for crash analysis was available to local agencies, and she replied that MAG was currently working on making it available for agency use along with supplemental training. Mr. Anderson asked how the MAG Region compared with other agencies' peer review, which would help the region prioritize areas of need. It was explained that the MAG Region was in the top five nationally for the areas that were most dangerous to pedestrians.

Chair Clemann again thanked Ms. Boone for her presentation and asked if there were any additional comments. Chair Clemann then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

8. Request for Future Agenda Items

Chair Clemann asked the members of the Committee if there were any issues that they would like added as future agenda items. Hearing no further comments, Chair Clemann proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

9. Next Meeting Date

Chair Clemann thanked those present and announced that the Transit Committee meeting scheduled for Thursday, June 12, 2014, is cancelled. If needed, the next Transit Committee meeting would be scheduled for Thursday, July 10, 2014, at 10:00 a.m. in the MAG Office, Chaparral Room. There being no further business, Chair Clemann adjourned the meeting at 11:45 a.m.