

**FINAL MEETING MINUTES**  
**MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS**  
**TRANSIT COMMITTEE**

April 9, 2015

Maricopa Association of Governments; Ironwood Room;  
302 N. 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue, Suite 200  
Phoenix, Arizona

**MEMBERS ATTENDING**

ADOT: Jaclyn Meli	*Paradise Valley: Jeremy Knapp
Avondale: Kristen Sexton, Vice Chair	Peoria: Stuart Kent
#Buckeye: Andrea Marquez	Phoenix: Maria Hyatt, Chair
Chandler: Jason Crampton for RJ Zeder	#Queen Creek: Sarah Mertins for
#El Mirage: Jose Macias	Mohamed Youssef
#Gilbert: Kristin Myers	Scottsdale: Ratna Korapella for Madeline
Glendale: Debbie Albert	Clemann
*Goodyear: Cato Esquivel	Surprise: Martin Lucero
#Maricopa: David Maestas	#Tempe: Robert Yabes
Maricopa County DOT: Suparna Dasgupta	*Tolleson: Chris Hagen
Mesa: Jodi Sorrell	Valley Metro: Wulf Grote
	#Youngtown: Grant Anderson

\*Members neither present nor represented by proxy + - Attended by Videoconference  
# - Attended by Audioconference

**OTHERS PRESENT**

Eileen Yazzie, MAG	Matthew Dudley, Glendale
Marc Pearsall, MAG	Ken Kessler, Phoenix
Alice Chen, MAG	Kristy Ruiz, Phoenix
DeDe Gaisthea, MAG	Gregory Davies, Scottsdale
Teri Kennedy, MAG	Abhi Dayal, Valley Metro
	Arnad Gupta, Parsons Brinckerhoff

### 1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 1:04 p.m. by Chair Maria Hyatt. She welcomed everyone in attendance and announced that a quorum was present. She noted that seven members were joining the meeting by teleconference: Andrea Marquez of Buckeye, Jose Macias of El Mirage, Kristin Myers of Gilbert, David Maestas of Maricopa, Sarah Mertins for Mohamed Youssef of Queen Creek, Robert Yabes of Tempe, and Grant Anderson of Youngtown. She asked if there were any public comment cards, and there being none, proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

### 2. Approval of Draft January 8, 2015 Meeting Minutes

Chair Hyatt inquired if there were any comments or corrections to the Draft January 8, 2015 Minutes. Hearing no further comments, she called for a motion on the Draft January 8, 2015 Minutes. Jeff Martin of Mesa moved to approve the motion, Grant Anderson of Youngtown seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Chair Hyatt then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

### 3. Call to the Audience

Chair Hyatt stated that she had not received any request to speak cards from the audience and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

### 4. Transit Program Manager's Report

Chair Hyatt invited Eileen Yazzie of MAG to brief the Committee with the Transit Program Manager's Report.

Ms. Yazzie said that she had two items to report on. The first was new TIGER Grant availability, Round 7, a discretionary grant program with a total of \$500 million (\$100 million set aside for rural projects and \$400 million set aside for urban projects). She added that the minimum total project cost had to be \$12.5 million, with a 20% local match requirement. It featured the same five initial criteria as previous TIGER rounds, such as sustainability, innovation, state of good repair and she noted that there was a recent webinar on how to compete for TIGER projects, with major themes being transformative and innovative for your region, as well as the Ladders of Opportunity initiatives. She stipulated that the one new element of the Round 7 grant was the FTA requirement for a pre-application, which was due May 4<sup>th</sup>, and the final submittal being June 4<sup>th</sup>. She noted that potential transit projects for consideration would be discussed at Valley Metro's RTAG meeting the week of April 13<sup>th</sup>, and that both MAG and Valley Metro had been working together by sending out a spreadsheet soliciting project ideas from the member agencies, with a submission to MAG by April 16<sup>th</sup>. She also noted that MAG was awaiting word on the current status of the Federal Apportionment, which would expire at the end of May, so she noted that MAG would notify the members as soon as Congress acted on the new bill or Continuing Resolution. Chair Hyatt thanked Ms. Yazzie and asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item.

## 5. Amendment to the Regional Programming Guidelines for Federal Transit Formula Funds – Preventive Maintenance/ Operating/Complementary ADA

Alice Chen of MAG presented on the agenda item, Regional Programming Guidelines for Federal Transit Formula Funds Preventive Maintenance/ Operating/Complementary ADA. She noted that it had been previously approved by MAG Regional Council on March 27, 2013. She added that the item was on the agenda for information, discussion, and recommended approval. She then referred the members to attachment #1 from the agenda and her presentation for overview and reference.

She then began to explain complimentary ADA, in that it was a different type of specific ADA service for fixed route service within 3/4 miles. She specifically noted that the amendment was for Section 300 of the guidelines addressing MAG Transportation Programming Priorities, previously approved in 2011 by MAG Regional Council and she added that MAG had been using the most up-to-date published NTD data from 2013 (lagging two years). She then reviewed 5307 program, which required a 20% local match for urbanized area under population of 200,000 (Avondale-Goodyear UZA). The exception for large urbanized areas was for areas that do not operate bus fleets greater than 15 in size (the cities of Glendale; Scottsdale). She stated that the FTA also allows 10% of the apportionment for complimentary ADA service.

Ms. Chen then reviewed the MAG Programming Priorities from 2013. She focused on the amendment for priority number 3, to fund Preventive Maintenance(PM)/Operations with PM to agencies that currently operate service using an approved formula since this guideline was approved. Avondale-Goodyear UZA operating funds would also be permitted. She then clarified that the amendment would permit Complementary ADA service in lieu of P M, and stipulated that it would not change the PM formula that the region's member agencies had worked hard on over the past few years. At present, it appeared that the only agency that may wish to take advantage of this program would be Peoria, because of the challenges of federal reporting. She explained that any changes in the future would come through the Transit Committee in the TIP approval process, thus ensuring transparency on the program. Further information was explained by Ms. Chen. She again noted that the item was on the agenda for information, discussion, and recommended approval of the Amendment to the Regional Programming Guidelines for Federal Transit Formula Funds.

Chair Hyatt thanked the members and asked if there were any questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Mr. Lucero inquired as to whether the 10% was off of the full PM allocation or just the small organizations percentages of PM. Ms. Chen replied that the 10% was for complimentary ADA from the FTA in section 5307, or about \$53 million per year (of which the region could use about \$5 million.). She further added that in the MAG region, 25% of the MAG apportionment was set aside for this issue, but PM was used specifically used only to offset operating costs for operators. Ms Chen did offer that the language could be modified that once an agency had used all of their PM, then that would trigger the ability to use other funds. Mr. Lucero said that he just wanted to ensure that the spirit and guideline of each funding source should be adhered to and used appropriately for that purpose, in order to prevent funding sources from being drained for other programs. Ms. Chen concurred. Mr. Stuart Kent and Ms Yazzie clarified that this issue effects operators only. Further discussion continued.

Chair Hyatt inquired with the member agencies if there was any interest in using the 5307 formula funds for Complimentary ADA after PM funds were exhausted. After at length discussion that included input from Phoenix, Peoria, Tempe, Glendale, and MAG staff, it was decided that the revised, clarifying language for section 400.4 would be as follows: Transit Operators that have exhausted all expenses related to Preventive Maintenance may choose to utilize the balance of the agency's allocation for Operating Assistance for Complementary ADA Service. This option does not change the agency's allocation or the regional allocation formula for PM. Martin Lucero moved to approve the motion, Vice Chair Sexton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Chair Hyatt thanked the members and asked if there were any further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing none, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

6. Project Changes – Amendment and Administrative Modification to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and as appropriate, to the 2035 Regional Transportation Plan

Alice Chen of MAG presented on the agenda item. She advised that the Project Changes-Amendment and Administrative Modification to the FY2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and as appropriate, to the 2035 Regional Transportation Plan was on the agenda for information, discussion, and recommended approval. She noted that she did not have a formal presentation and directed the members to review the attachment #2.

She explained that there were a variety of main items that were bundled together for approval. The first was the City of Glendale had completed the initial cost estimates related to the North of Union Hills Dr. and West of 101L Park-and-Ride and transit center. They had requested an additional \$129,059 in funding for design and a decrease of the same amount from construction related activities, and the total project cost remains unchanged.

Ms. Chen then explained that the second and third items were related to Peoria, and that in lieu of Preventive Maintenance, that the work be changed to Complimentary ADA para-transit service where the dollar amounts do not change. She then explained that the next few items were related to Surprise and were funds that were about to expire at the end of the federal fiscal year. They must be reprogrammed or lost to the region. Discussion and explanation continued on the details of reprogramming of the project. She then mentioned the last item regarding an interest to the FTA. She explained that the program states that any vehicle that has mileage under 500,000 miles, that asset could still be sold on the open market. If the federal nets a sale amount above \$5001, it must be reported but could be reinvested in the region and recognized as federal interest. In the last fiscal year, the region has reported over \$1.1 million in federal interest and the proceeds from Valley Metro/RPTA would be utilized towards the purchase of the 700 Mgh wireless project and a variety of other areas for the FFY15 POP.

Ms. Chen concluded her presentation and advised that the item was on the agenda for information, discussion, and recommended approval of amendments to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and as appropriate, to the 2035 Regional Transportation Plan. Chair Hyatt thanked Ms. Chen and asked if there were any questions or comments regarding the agenda item.

Hearing none, she called for the motion. Stuart Kent moved to approve the motion, Grant Anderson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Chair Hyatt thanked the members and asked if there were any further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing none she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

#### 7. Scottsdale/Rural LINK Project Update

Chair Hyatt then invited Mr. Abhishek Dayal of Valley Metro/RPTA will provide an update on the Scottsdale/Rural LINK project. He began by referring to his presentation and the memo #3 for additional information. He explained that the item was on the agenda for information only and was a followup to the previous presentation he gave in January.

Mr. Dayal began by noting that transit operations and capital improvements in the Scottsdale Road\Rural Road corridor had been identified through a project definition study originally initiated to define elements for the implementation of Valley Metro LINK service in the corridor. He added that as an interim step to implementing LINK or some other form of a limited stop or overlay bus service, the study recommendations identified frequency improvements to the existing Route 72 between the Tempe Transportation Center and Camelback Road with a limited number of trips serving the Thunderbird Park-and-Ride.

He continued by summarizing that capital improvements, as part of this project, would include additional fleet, upgrades at select bus stop locations, and infrastructure to deploy transit signal priority in the corridor. Funding for operations and capital expansion is programmed in the Transit Life Cycle Program (TLCP) and Transportation Improvement Program (TIP). He explained that the Scottsdale/Rural LINK was a good long term solution. He noted that Scottsdale and Tempe accepted a staff recommendation to pursue interim service improvements in the corridor utilizing available funding, with service improvement options that included increase weekday base frequency from 20 minutes to 10 minutes (between TTC and Camelback Road), and select trips to Thunderbird PNR (2 hours of service at 20 minute headways trips).

Mr. Dayal then referred to capital improvement needs, which included an available budget of \$20.2 million, with an estimated cost of capital needs of \$8.7 million. He then noted that the fleet needs included 11 buses at \$6,050,000, with a scheduled fleet procurement plan to utilize the Valley Metro contract with Gillig. He briefly reviewed the potential schedule with varying dates: place order: April 2015; fleet delivery: September 2016; in service availability: October 2016 and a plan to use existing fleet (spares) to provide additional service between Camelback Road and TTC by April 2016.

He also explained the passenger stop needs, which included enhanced passenger comfort and access. The needs also called for replacing non-standardized shelters in corridor (Scottsdale Road Design Standard) at eleven locations, with all locations to include new SRDS shelters, and right of way(row) potentially required at 6 locations. Two art shelters would be stored in the interim, along with additional coordination required with Tempe and Paradise Valley.

Mr. Dayal also highlighted some additional assumptions for passenger stop needs. Valley Metro would complete categorical exclusions for bus stop improvements, and would set up bus stop coordination meetings with other jurisdictions. The City of Scottsdale would store or re-install art shelters and it would be responsible for land acquisition, bus stop designer, and construction contractor. He stated that the total estimated capital needs cost was \$8,197,000. He completed his presentation by explaining the next steps / action items, with a note on initiation of fleet procurement in April 2015 through to a contract with Clever Devices for TSP expansion in January 2016.

Chair Hyatt thanked Mr. Dayal and asked if there were any questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Ms. Sorrell of Mesa inquired as to clarification of on the spare buses for the service plan. She wanted to know what the existing spare fleet size was for Camelback Road to Tempe service. He replied that it was six buses and confirmed that it would be a bridge fleet until the new fleet arrived in September, approximately six months. She asked what kind of effect would it have on the spare ratio for the rest of the East Valley's fleet. Mr. Dayal replied that Valley Metro was working within the Short Range Transit Program and that it was helping to determine that the spare ratio would most likely be sufficient to bridge the gap for those six months.

Chair Hyatt thanked the members and asked if there were any further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing none, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

#### 8. Fiscal Year 2015 Draft Program of Projects and Amendment and Administrative Modification to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and as appropriate, to the 2035 Regional Transportation Plan

Alice Chen of MAG returned to present the item on Fiscal Year 2015 Draft Program of Projects and Amendment and Administrative Modification to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and as appropriate, to the 2035 Regional Transportation Plan. She explained that she did not have a presentation and that the conceptual changes had been documented in the four-page memo. She walked the committee through only the items the items in the memo that were in red (text changes or in need of discussion or clarification.)

She added that the Program of Projects (POP) was required by Federal Transit Administration (FTA) to provide an annual listing of Transit Projects funded by the Section 5307 program. By federal legislation, it was also required to be developed in consultation with interested parties, in coordination with public transportation services providers and is subject to public participation requirements. She noted that as it was stated in the MAG Public Participation Plan, the MAG Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) process was used to satisfy the public participation process of the POP that is required in U.S.C. Section 5307. As of April 1, 2015, the final transit apportionment from the FTA and the annual STP apportionment from the Arizona Department of Transportation was not yet finalized.

She began by explaining the first change would be the Laveen / 59<sup>th</sup> Avenue Park and Ride. It would be deferred until FY2016 and would flex the item over to the highway program because the facility would serve populations near the Loop 202 freeway, which would include a large construction

program of its own. This would save transit dollars for the Valley. The next item was the Associated Transit Improvements item which was updated to match MAP-21 language. The following item was the City of Phoenix bus purchase plan, which would replace 40 foot vehicles with new articulated buses. The next change was for Surprise Dial A Ride. When the TIP was approved in January 2014, the region was not certain that City of Surprise would be operating transit. So the region's bus fleet previously set aside for Surprise operations was no longer needed as Surprise now contracted with Discount Cab for their para-transit service, however, the regional bus fleet will be available in the future should Surprise choose to operate their own fleet. The following item was for Tempe fixed route for Preventive Maintenance program and for Tempe bus purchases, the city would be buying standard length 40 foot buses instead of articulated buses. For Scottsdale Road's BRT project, there would be eleven buses purchased for the Scottsdale/Rural bus service enhancements.

Ms. Chen then elaborated on the next item on the list, there are things that the region could do in order to meet federal requirements, such as ADA compliance at bus stops throughout the region. Some of the bus stops in the MAG Region are not up to ADA standards, so one of the new ideas for the study is to perform an inventory of all of the elements of each bus stop and then plan for a schedule that would enable those improvements to be funded in the long-term. Valley Metro and MAG would work on this inventory as co-lead agencies.

The next item she outlined was a transit communication upgrade, a \$27 million expenditure which was previously discussed earlier in the meeting. Chair Hyatt inquired on the ADA bus stop inventory, and explained that Phoenix staff had just completed their own comprehensive inventory of their system facilities. Ms. Chen replied that the City of Phoenix standards were the ones that the region was collectively trying to reach, so Phoenix staff has been involved in helping to assemble the inventory checklist. Ms. Riley of Chandler added that her community was currently working on their bus stops improvements and wanted to ensure that Valley Metro was working with Chandler as to not contravene the progress that Chandler had already made. Ms. Chen replied that Chandler and the others cities would be receiving information from Valley Metro, looking for assistance in helping compile a list of everything (components, standards, best practices, etc) that is currently in the field today. The time-line for the inventory was looking towards a implementation in fiscal year 2016, with completion sometime in summer 2016.

Ms. Dayal then noted that two areas of the inventory would be ADA compliance, as well as ADA accessibility. This would permit a more holistic view of the area around the bus stop to ensure that passengers and users could actually utilize the sidewalks, curb-cuts, pad, etc are as user friendly as possible. Since Phoenix' standards were above the minimum Federal Standard, the region would look to match that, as well as emphasizing a priority that Phoenix had been pursuing, which was shade/canopy at and around the bus stops. Available right of way for construction and improvements was also an issue effecting bus stop ADA issues. Ms. Myers of Gilbert asked how this inventory would effect Phase 3 of the current Transit Standards and Performance Measures if it did at all. Mr. Dayal replied that the inventory would not conflict with the TSPM study guidelines. Discussion followed on the bus stop warrants program and the federal 'Prowag' issued since 2010.

Ms. Chen then walked through the Preventive Maintenance elements of the document. (Pages 2-4) She explained JARC apportionment as previously approved by MAG Regional Council in 2014. A variety of bus routes in Phoenix, Avondale, Tempe, TLCP projects, federal interest for PM , and administrative items were discussed.

Ms. Chen completed her presentation and explained that the while the item was not in need of action today, they did not expect anything to change in the coming month. Chair Hyatt thanked Ms. Chen and asked if there were any questions or comments regarding the agenda item. After discussion, it was agreed that a revised motion would reflect the ability of the committee to open the item for changes at the May meeting, should any arise in the next four weeks in regards to the JARC component. After further input, Chair Hyatt called for the motion.

Chair Hyatt, Mr. Lucero and MAG staff advised that the new motion would read as follows: Approval of amendments to the Fiscal Year 2015 Draft Program of Projects and Amendment and Administrative Modification to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and as appropriate, to the 2035 Regional Transportation Plan. Should any additional financial or project modifications occur in the interim, then those proposed changes would be provided back to the Transit Committee for additional review and discussion at a subsequent meeting. Martin Lucero moved to approve the motion, Debbie Albert seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Chair Hyatt thanked the members and asked if there were any further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing none, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

#### 9. Request for Future Agenda Items

Chair Hyatt asked the members of the Committee if there were any issues that they would like added as future agenda items. Ms. Debbie Albert and Martin Lucero inquired as to when the committee could begin to discuss the JARC programming process, as noted by Alice Chen in the previous cycle, especially since we were already one year into that two year cycle. Additionally, Chair Hyatt responded to Ms. Kristin Myers of Gilbert's previous request that Arizona Department of Transportation present an update on the Tucson-Phoenix Passenger Rail Study. She added that they would present in the June/July time-frame. Hearing no further comments, Chair Hyatt proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

#### 10. Next Meeting Date

Chair Hyatt thanked those present and announced that the next meeting of the MAG Transit Committee would be held on Thursday, May 14, 2015 at 10:00 a.m. in the MAG Ironwood Room. There being no further business, Chair Hyatt adjourned the meeting at 2:04 p.m.