

**FINAL MEETING MINUTES**  
**MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS**  
**TRANSIT COMMITTEE**

Tuesday February 16, 2016  
Maricopa Association of Governments; Saguaro Room;  
302 N. 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue, Suite 200  
Phoenix, Arizona

**MEMBERS ATTENDING**

*ADOT: Mike Normand	*Paradise Valley: Jeremy Knapp
Avondale: Kristen Taylor, Vice Chair	Peoria: Stuart Kent
*Buckeye: Andrea Marquez	Phoenix: Maria Hyatt, Chair
Chandler: Jason Crampton for RJ Zeder	#Queen Creek: Christine Sheehy for
El Mirage: Jose Macias	Mohamed Youssef
Gilbert: Kristin Myers	Scottsdale: Gregory P. Davies for
Glendale: Kevin Link for Debbie Albert	Madeline Clemann
*Goodyear: Cato Esquivel	Surprise: Martín Lucero
#Maricopa: David Maestas	#Tempe: Robert Yabes
*Maricopa County DOT: Denise Lacey	*Tolleson: Jason Earp
Mesa: Jeff Martin for Jodi Sorrell	Valley Metro: Wulf Grote
	#Youngtown: Grant Anderson

\* Members neither present nor represented by proxy.

# Participated (or attended) by teleconference  
+ Participated (or attended) by videoconference

**OTHERS PRESENT**

Audra Koester Thomas, MAG	Ann Marie Riley, Chandler
Marc Pearsall, MAG	Jorie Bresnahan, Phoenix
Alice Chen, MAG	Stephanie Child, Phoenix
DeDe Gaisthea, MAG	Ken Kessler, Phoenix
Teri Kennedy, MAG	Wendy Miller, Phoenix
Stephen Tate, MAG	Vivian Ybanez, Phoenix
	David Kohlbeck, Surprise
	Abhi Dayal, Valley Metro

### 1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Chair Maria Hyatt. She welcomed everyone in attendance and announced that a quorum was present. She noted that several members were joining the meeting by teleconference: David Maestas of Maricopa, Christine Sheehy of Queen Creek, Robert Yabes of Tempe and Grant Anderson of Youngtown. She asked if there were any public comment cards, and there being none, proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

### 2. Approval of Draft January 19, 2016 Meeting Minutes

Chair Hyatt inquired if there were any comments or corrections to the Draft January 19, 2016 Minutes. Hearing no further comments, she called for a motion on the Draft January 19, 2016 Minutes. Kristen Taylor of Avondale moved to approve the motion, Jeff Martin of Mesa seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Chair Hyatt then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

### 3. Call to the Audience

Chair Hyatt stated that she had not received any request to speak cards from the audience and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

### 4. Transit Planning Report

Chair Hyatt introduced the MAG Transit Planning Project Manager, Audra Koester Thomas. Ms. Koester Thomas then proceeded to brief the Committee with the Transit Planning Report. She noted that she had several items to report on with recent transit planning activities and followup for previous agenda items.

She stated that on February 10, 2016, U.S. Transportation Secretary Foxx announced \$3.5 Billion in funding to expand transit options that improve access to jobs and opportunities. Highlighted were funds as recommended in President Obama's Fiscal Year 2017 budget, which advanced the construction or completion of 31 rail, bus rapid transit and streetcar projects in 18 states. These projects were competitively funded through the FTA's Capital Investment Grant (CIG) Program. Of interest to the MAG Region, was the \$75 million in Small Starts funding recommended for the Tempe Streetcar. The FTA also announced the FY2016 apportionments and allocations, which included ongoing funding for existing CIG projects. The latest Apportionment Tables were now available on FTA's website, as authorized under the Consolidated Appropriations Act of 2016 and the FAST ACT. The region was still awaiting the Federal Register notice to announce the apportionment and allocation of FY 2016 funds directly aligned with the released tables.

She then noted a few items of interest from the upcoming calendar: Arizona's 29th Annual Transit Conference would be presented by AzTA & ADOT in Flagstaff, AZ at the High Country Conference

Center on April 10-12, 2016. She said there was a training opportunity as well: TSI's Transit Safety/Safety Management Systems would take place in Phoenix, AZ on June 22-24, 2016.

She added that a couple of other outstanding items were that earlier today at Valley Metro's RTAG on February 16th, the FAST Act Bus Replacement program was discussed in regards the regional bus fleet management plan and using it to compose a regional strategy. By late February or early March, the FTA would release the details on how to jointly proceed on a regional level. ADOT was also in review of the 5304 'Local Rural/Small Urban' Grant applications that MAG and other COG/MPOs submitted back in December 2015.

She closed with a special thanks to Valley Metro, the cities of Mesa, Tempe, Phoenix, Chandler as well as ADOT, ASU and Sustainable Communities Collaborative on the successful visit by the Abu Dhabi, UAE delegation to learn from the MAG Region about transit. Chair Hyatt thanked Ms. Koester Thomas. She asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing no further comments, Chair Hyatt proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

#### 5. Regional Transit Survey Overview Update

Chair Hyatt invited Alice Chen of MAG to present on the item. Ms. Chen explained a brief background regarding the Regional Transit Survey Review.

She began with a discussion of the Regional Transit Survey and requested guidance of how to move forward with generating programming scenarios. She also reviewed a schedule update for the Transit element of the Transportation Programming Improvement Program and the findings of the Regional Transit Survey that were discussed at the January 19, 2016 Transit Committee meeting. She added that the member agencies collaborated to identify processes to address the regional transit needs by project category. She also explained that MAG staff summarized the discussion and sent the document out for review on January 29, 2016. She added that as of mail-out, no additional comments had been received and she continued with an update on the schedule and next steps.

In her presentation, she reviewed cost estimates by category for Federal Transit Administration Fiscal Year 2016 apportionments (released 2/9/2016), as well as the MAG Transportation Programming priorities. She summarized and completed her presentation by noting the Transit Programming Fiscal Years 2016-2021. Ms. Chen completed her presentation overview and invited the committee members to engage the process as she updated the interactive spreadsheet.

Chair Hyatt thanked Ms. Chen and asked the if there were any comments or input from members. Mr. Martin inquired on the fleet prioritization and in regards to the SRTP, if the region could fund both replacement and expansion vehicles within that program. Ms. Chen replied that staff was coordinating with Valley Metro staff for placeholder scenarios for expansion. Chair Hyatt noted that locally in Phoenix, replacement and expansion fleet would continue over the lifetime of proposition 104, but that both she and Mr. Grote acknowledged that bus fleet was a top priority for the TLCP and that Prop 104 was adding extra demand on regional needs. Discussion followed.

There was commentary on whether new local agencies could fund expansion, but they may be at the bottom of TLCP list. Ms. Myers added that the region could add expansion to list; but that it had to be a regional coordinated process and perhaps the region consider replacement buses for the outer years beyond 2021. Mr. Kent inquired as to what the percentage was for replacement and the definition of an expansion route through the TLCP. Chair Hyatt offered that in regards to Phoenix and the T2050 plan, there was no plan for expansion fleet and service until CY2018, with only expanded service hours over the next two years as immediate improvements.

Mr. Lucero commented on the where the need was for expansion; or in replacement backlog. He inquired as to whether communities should get in line for expansion fleet. Ms. Chen commented on the SRTP's five year planning horizon and the TLCP, and Chair Hyatt supported the need for setting up regional priorities and fleet needs so that other communities could benefit from the fleet expansion. Mr. Crampton commented on federal fleet expansion and Mr. Grote, Ms. Myers added comments on the percentage requirements for fleet reserves, such as two year and five year windows. Mr. Lucero and Mr. Martin requested that Valley Metro staff to work with MAG on creating funding ideas for fleet, and Mr. Grote added that there was a need for focusing some of the program on bus fleet rehabilitation and rebuilds. Chair Hyatt added that at a future meeting Valley Metro could talk about SRTP to help educate the committee on priorities and needs.

Chair Hyatt again thanked the members and asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing none, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

## 6. Job Access and Reverse Commute Program Review

Chair Hyatt invited Ms. Chen of MAG to continue to present on the item, the Job Access and Reverse Commute Program Review.

Ms. Chen explained that the Job Access and Reverse Commute (JARC) program was a sub-allocated Federal Transit Administration program providing funding for projects that “improve access to transportation services to employment and employment related activities for welfare recipients and eligible low-income individuals and to transport residents of urbanized areas and non-urbanized areas to suburban employment opportunities”. She reminded the members that the program was initiated under TEA-21 and SAFETEA-LU. Under MAP-21, the program was repealed as a stand-alone funding program and subsequently consolidated into Section 5307 program to be utilized for JARC eligible activities. On March 27, 2013, the MAG Regional Council approved the allocation of approximately \$1.8 million to be utilized in the region for JARC eligible activities. The FTA circular C9050.1 provided the program details. Prior to 2014, the City of Phoenix lead the coordination of the JARC application process; and in 2014, MAG assumed primary responsibility for setting the goals, guidelines, and developing the application for the program. On August 27, 2014, the MAG Regional Council requested, upon approval of the programming priorities and projects for fiscal years FY2014-2015, that the programming guidelines be updated. She explained the history of past awards, programming guidelines, and the FTA programming goals and objectives and added that the current guidelines were approved by MAG Regional Council on March 18, 2014.

She then explained the Program Goals (FTA Circular 9050.1) and stated that the goal of the JARC program was to improve access to transportation services to employment and employment related activities for welfare recipients and eligible low-income individuals and to transport residents of urbanized areas, and non-urbanized areas to suburban employment opportunities. She added a brief history of JARC from 2000 through 2016, and touched on eligible projects (review), guidelines development process, transit committee information & discussion: 1/9/2014, working groups from 1/23/2014, 1/30/2014, and 2/6/2014, transit committee recommended approval of guidelines: 2/27/2014, management recommended approval of guidelines: 3/12/2014, and RC approval of recommended approval of guidelines in 3/24/2014. She stated that the current guidelines (approved March 18, 2014), and the program goals provided for improving access for low-income persons to jobs and job-related services, and eligibility - JARC eligible activities per the FTA Circular.

Ms. Chen noted funding guidelines, operating, with two years worth of funding, when the applicant may reapply with a demonstration of success. For non-operating, there was a one year funding period, where the applicant may reapply with a demonstration of its success. She stated that the funding amounts, were \$30,000 minimum, \$200,000 maximum, and \$400,000 maximum in a multi-agency application.

She then reviewed the evaluation criteria and points measurements: target population served (30 percent weight), coordination and outreach (30 percent weight), performance indicators (20 percent weight), and meets program intent (20 percent weight). She concluded by noting that the original motion called for the recommend approval of the rankings and funding recommendations of the evaluation panel for fiscal years 2014 and 2015, and the re-evaluation of the JARC guidelines and principles for fiscal years 2016 and beyond. She reminded that the motion was originally approved by MAG Regional Council on August 27, 2014. Ms. Chen completed her presentation. Chair Hyatt thanked Ms. Chen and asked the if there were any comments or input from members

Chair Hyatt noted that there was no federal requirement that the region continue to utilize JARC, so the region should consider if it further wishes to funding JARC, no longer needs the program, or perhaps consider further funding it using a mix of scenarios. JARC was still considered a value to some communities. Mr. Lucero, Mr. Grote, and Mr. Crampton commented on capital funding within the region, and Ms. Myers advised of the unintended consequences of what may occur to JARC funded routes that may be affected by Title VI issues. Discussion followed.

Mr. Grote, Mr. Lucero and Vice Chair Taylor commented on future, potential JARC routes that may be affected by City of Phoenix' transit service expansion. Chair Hyatt advised that the City of Phoenix now planned to continue expansion of bus service with prop 104 funding, whether or not JARC funding was available to them. Chair Hyatt Maria recommended that Ms. Chen work with Phoenix and Valley Metro to present programming options and scenarios for the future of JARC and its impact on the Valley's transit system.

Chair Hyatt again thanked the members and asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing none, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

## 7. Semiannual Status Report on Federal Grant Activity

Chair Hyatt introduced Mr. Ken Kessler and his staff from the City of Phoenix Transit Department. She advised that Phoenix was the Designated Recipient of federal transit funds, and that Mr. Kessler and his staff were available to answer committee questions for the semiannual status report on federal grant activity ending with December 31, 2015. Chair Hyatt asked if there were any questions or comments on the agenda item. Hearing no further comments, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

## 8 . Request for Future Agenda Items

Chair Hyatt asked the members of the Committee if there were any issues that they would like added as future agenda items. It was requested that the MAG Transit Committee continue discussing the Short Range Transit Program, JARC and the bus fleet management plan at future meetings. Hearing no further comments, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

## 9. Next Meeting Date

Chair Hyatt thanked those present and announced that the next meeting of the MAG Transit Committee would be held on Tuesday, March 15, 2016, at 3:00 p.m. in the MAG Office, Saguaro Room. There being no further business, Chair Hyatt adjourned the meeting at 4:14 p.m.