

DRAFT MINUTES OF THE
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
TRANSPORTATION REVIEW COMMITTEE

December 8, 2011

Maricopa Association of Governments Office
302 North First Avenue, Suite 200, Saguaro Room
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

Peoria: David Moody, Chair	Litchfield Park: Paul Ward for Woody
Scottsdale: David Meinhart, Vice-Chair	Scoutten
ADOT: Robert Samour for Floyd Roehrich	Maricopa County: John Hauskins
Avondale: Kristen Sexton for David Fitzhugh	Mesa: Scott Butler
*Buckeye: Scott Lowe	Paradise Valley: Bill Mead
Chandler: Dan Cook for Patrice Kraus	Phoenix: Rick Naimark
#El Mirage: Lance Calvert	Queen Creek: Tom Condit
Fountain Hills: Randy Harrel	RPTA: Bob Antilla for Bryan Jungwirth
*Gila Bend: Eric Fitzer	Surprise: Bob Beckley
*Gila River: Doug Torres	Tempe: Chad Heinrich
Gilbert: Tami Ryall	Valley Metro Rail: John Farry
Glendale: Terry Johnson	Wickenburg: Rick Austin
Goodyear: Cato Esquivel	Youngtown: Grant Anderson for Lloyce Robinson
*Guadalupe: Gino Turrubiarres	

EX-OFFICIO MEMBERS ATTENDING

*Street Committee:	ITS Committee: Debbie Albert, Glendale
*Bicycle/Pedestrian Committee: Katherine Coles, City of Phoenix	*Transportation Safety Committee: Julian Dresang, City of Tempe

* Members neither present nor represented by proxy. + - Attended by Videoconference
- Attended by Audioconference

OTHERS PRESENT

Eric Anderson, MAG	Brent Stoddard, Glendale
Maureen DeCindis, MAG	Jeff Martin, Mesa
Bob Hazlett, MAG	Andy Granger, Peoria
Roger Herzog, MAG	Tom Remes, Phoenix
Eileen Yazzie, MAG	Nicole Patrick, MCDOT
Kwi-Sung Kang, ADOT	Lee Jimenez, MCDOT
Tim Wolfe, ADOT	Jeanne Sapon, Austin Bridge & Road
Debbie Albert, Glendale	Jason Watson, Horrocks Eng.
Jenna Goad, Glendale	Greg Haggerty, Dibble Eng.

1. Call to Order

Chairman David Moody from the City of Peoria called the meeting to order at 10:01 a.m.

2. Approval of Draft October 27, 2011 Minutes

Chairman Moody asked if there were any changes or amendments to the October 27, 2011 meeting minutes, and there were none. Mr. David Meinhart from City of Scottsdale motioned to approve the minutes. Mr. John Hauskins from Maricopa County seconded, and the motion passed by a unanimous voice vote of the Committee.

3. Call to the Audience

Chairman Moody announced that he had not received any cards requesting to speak and moved on to the next item on the agenda.

4. Transportation Director's Report

Chairman Moody invited Mr. Eric Anderson from MAG to provide the Transportation Director's Report. Mr. Anderson informed the Committee that October 2011 Regional Area Road Fund (RARF) revenues were up 7.8 percent over the previous year. He stated that year-to-date revenues were up 8.2 percent noting strong growth for the first four months of the fiscal year.

Mr. Anderson reported that the Highway User Revenue Fund (HURF) collections were relatively flat for the fiscal year noting that the HURF revenues were up 0.3 percent from the previous fiscal year. Mr. Anderson explained that gas tax collection and vehicle license tax collections were both negative compared to the forecast. He stated that the sales tax collections appeared to have stabilized and commented that he was hopefully that the upward trend would continue.

Next, Mr. Anderson discussed the revised sales tax projections released by the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT). He stated that the revised projections developed by an expert panel indicated a decrease of \$220 million in forecasted revenues over the life of the tax. He stated that MAG Staff was surprised at the decrease in forecasted revenues given the positive collections over the last several months.

Mr. Anderson reported that MAG had met with ADOT to discuss the revised revenue forecast. He explained that MAG could not make ad hoc adjustments to the forecast because the process was well established at ADOT. He stated that MAG was disappointed with the forecast revenues for the outer years because they were significantly more pessimistic than the previous forecast. He noted that the decreased projections did not pose an issue with bonding at this time. Mr. Anderson commented that the situation was not unlike what occurred in the early 1990s. He stated that MAG would coordinate with ADOT and the expert panel next year to review the inputs into the econometric model used to develop the revenue forecast.

Moving on, Mr. Anderson discussed the Performance Audit on the Implementation of Proposition 400. He reported that MAG had completed formal comments on the draft report. He stated that the report was confidential at this time and would be released to the public later in December. He stated the METRO and RPTA were in the process of reviewing the draft and preparing final comments as well.

Mr. Anderson stated that the Arizona Auditor General's Office would incorporate agency comments into the final report, which would be available on December 19th and would be released to the public on December 20, 2011. Mr. Anderson reported that a public hearing on the audit would be conducted before the MAG Transportation Policy Committee meeting in January 2012.

Next, Mr. Anderson announced that Ms. Teri Kennedy had been hired to replace Ms. Yazzie as the MAG Transportation Improvement Program Manager. He stated that Ms. Kennedy had been in charge of managing the Transit Program for ADOT.

In conclusion, Mr. Anderson announced that Chairman David Moody would be stepping down as the Chair of the Transportation Review Committee. He reported that Mr. Meinhart would ascend to the chair position and that Mr. David Fitzhugh from the City of Avondale would become the new vice-chair. Mr. Anderson acknowledged the great work Chairman Moody had done during his time as Chair. Mr. Hauskins applauded the efforts of the Chair as well as the new appointees. The Committee concurred.

Chairman Moody inquired if there were any questions or comments. There were none, and he proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

5. Consent Agenda

Addressing the next item of business, Chairman Moody directed the Committee's attention to the consent agenda. He asked the Committee if there were any questions or comments regarding consent agenda items 5a on the ADOT Red Letter Process and 5b on the Transportation Review Committee 2012 Committee Tentative Meeting Schedule. There were none. Mr. Hauskins motioned to approve the consent agenda. Mr. Meinhart seconded, and the motion passed with a unanimous voice vote of the Committee.

6. Project Changes – Amendment and Administrative Modification to the FY 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program

Chairman Moody invited Ms. Eileen Yazzie, MAG Transportation Planning Project Manager, to present amendments and administrative modifications to the Fiscal Year (FY) 2011 - 2015 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP). Ms. Yazzie directed the Committee's attention to the attachments in the agenda packet as well as a revised handout at their places.

Ms. Yazzie stated that the series of project changes in Table A consisted of Arterial Life Cycle

Program (ALCP) project changes approved by the MAG Regional Council in September 2011 pending a finding of conformity. Ms. Yazzie explained that MAG Staff needed to run conformity due to changes in construction project schedules and/or project scope. She stated that the Table B include non-ALCP project changes noting that a revised version of the table was at their places. She explained that Table B included six projects from Peoria that had received Highway Safety Improvement Program (HSIP) funds from ADOT. She added that Table C listed ALCP project changes that fell outside of the TIP window, but affected the model.

Mr. Rick Naimark from the City of Phoenix stated that two numbers were inversed on a Phoenix project. Ms. Yazzie replied that she would correct the error in the change sheet as it proceeded through the Committee process for approval.

Mr. Hauskins motioned to recommend to approve amendments and administrative modifications to the FY 2011-2015 MAG TIP, and as appropriate, to the RTP 2010 Update. Mr. Dan Cook from the City of Chandler seconded, and the motion passed with a unanimous voice vote of the Committee.

7. Recommendation of Projects for FY 2012 Traffic Signal Optimization Program (TSOP)

Chairman Moody invited Ms. Debbie Albert, Chair of the MAG Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) Committee, to present the Recommendation of Projects for the Fiscal Year (FY) 2012 Traffic Signal Optimization Program (TSOP). Ms. Albert informed the Committee the goal of the program was to provide technical assistance to local agencies with complex traffic signal coordination tasks and to provide related training through an annual SYNCHRO workshop.

Ms. Albert announced that call for TSOP projects resulted in seven submittals and requests from six member agencies for the SYNCHRO training. She stated that the seven projects submitted would address signal timing at 127 intersections in the region. She stated that requests for a before-and-after studies had been submitted for the seven projects. Ms. Albert reported that the project would begin in February 2012 and that a MAG On-Call consultant would be used to perform the work.

Ms. Albert stated that the workshop would be for SYNCHRO Levels I and II. She stated that the workshop would be held at no cost to member agency participants. She announced that the training would be held from February 29, 2012 through March 2, 2012, at the Maricopa County Training Facility.

Next, Ms. Albert addressed the project and workshop costs. She stated that the total costs for the projects would be \$240,740 citing that \$430,000 in funding was available. She stated that because of the remaining balance that a second call for projects would be issued to identify additional projects. She informed the Committee that member agencies were limited to one application per agency during a call for projects. She added that projects funded through the program did not require a local match.

Mr. Hauskins motioned to recommend the list of FY2012 TSOP projects, before-and-after project evaluations and a regional training workshop on SYNCHRO software. Mr. Grant Anderson from the Town of Youngtown seconded, and the motion passed by a unanimous voice vote of the Committee. Chairman Moody inquired if there were additional questions or comments about the agenda item. There were none, and he proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

8. High Occupancy Vehicle (HOV) Lane Ramps at Loop 101 and Maryland Avenue

Chairman Moody invited Mr. Eric Anderson to present the High Occupancy Vehicle (HOV) Lane Ramps at the Loop 101 and Maryland Avenue. Mr. Anderson provided a brief overview of the project. He stated that an overpass was located at the intersection of Maryland Avenue and the Loop 101. He stated that the overpass had been constructed to accommodate direct access to the HOV lanes.

Mr. Anderson stated that when the Loop 101 HOV lane construction project proceeded through the Committee process that the Regional Council had allocated an additional \$9 million to the project to complete HOV lanes from Tatum to Interstate 10 (I-10) in the west valley. He reported that the HOV lane improvements were almost complete and that the project was expected to come in under budget and below the engineer's estimate. Mr. Anderson estimated that \$36 million in project savings would be actualized upon project completion.

Mr. Anderson informed the Committee that when the Regional Council approved the budget increase for the project, the project scope was revised to widen the project in the area of Maryland Avenue to accommodate future direct HOV ramps. He stated that late in the Summer of 2011, the City of Glendale had contacted MAG about building the HOV ramps at Maryland Avenue.

Mr. Anderson reported that the ADOT estimate for the direct HOV connection and ramps was approximately \$14.5 million. He stated that the project had major implications for traffic movements during special events at the University of Phoenix Stadium, the Jobing.com arena, and at the Westgate entertainment complex. Mr. Anderson reported that in researching funding sources, Glendale identified available funding in the Statewide Acceleration Needs (STAN II) account established by the State Legislature in 2005.

Mr. Anderson stated that approximately \$10 million in STAN funding was in the MAG account. He stated that MAG had been surprised to learn of the available funds because MAG had been informed that the State Legislature had swept all of the STAN funding in 2009. Mr. Anderson reported that MAG Staff had met with ADOT in early November and determined that STAN funding was available. He noted that ADOT estimated the available funding at \$8 million.

Mr. Anderson informed the Committee that the City of Glendale had proposed to allocate the funds for the HOV ramps before the State attempted to sweep the remaining funds to balance the State budget. He stated that STAN funds had to be used on improvements to the State Highway System and that the direct HOV ramp project would be a good use for the funds

giving the estimated project cost and the funding available. He added that the City of Glendale had suggested that any cost savings from the HOV lane improvements to the Loop 101 be used to cover the project costs in excess of the STAN funds.

Mr. Terry Johnson from the City of Glendale thanked the staff at ADOT and MAG for their efforts in verifying available funding and ascertaining project costs. Mr. Grant Anderson from the Town of Youngtown inquired if an HOV lane from Maryland Avenue to a park-and-ride lot one-half mile north of the project location had been considered. Mr. Johnson replied that the City had not considered it, but could look at the possibility. A brief discussion followed.

Mr. Meinhart inquired if there were additional projects in the region that could use these funds. Mr. Eric Anderson replied that MAG Staff could not identify another eligible project in the region that could use the funds. He explained that typically highway improvements were expensive and would exceed the amount of funding available.

Mr. Naimark from the City of Phoenix motioned to recommend the approval a new project to add HOV direct connection ramps at the L101 and Maryland Avenue for an estimated cost of \$14.5 million, that the remaining uncommitted funds in the Statewide Transportation Acceleration Needs Account (STAN) for the MAG region, estimated to be approximately \$8.0 million, be allocated to this project with the MAG Freeway / Highway program paying for the balance of the costs up to \$7.5 million, and that the FY 2010-2014 MAG Transportation Improvement Program and the Regional Transportation Plan 2010 Update be amended, pending a finding of air quality conformity. Mr. Dan Cook from the City of Chandler seconded, and the motion passed by a unanimous voice vote of the Committee. Chairman Moody inquired if there were additional questions or comments about the agenda item. There were none, and he proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

9. Implementation of MAG Federal Fund Projects Development Status Report

Next, Chairman Moody invited Ms. Eileen Yazzie to present on the implementation of the MAG Federal Fund Projects Development Status Report. Ms. Yazzie informed the Committee that after the approval of the Federal Fund Guidelines by the Regional Council, MAG Staff had sent workbooks to member agencies with projects programmed with Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality (CMAQ) funds in Fiscal Years (FY) 2012 and 2013 in the MAG Transportation Improvement Program (TIP). She stated that the workbooks were provided to member agency staff in October 2011 and that agency staff had four weeks to update project information, such as scope, schedule, changes, and project development milestones.

Ms. Yazzie announced that MAG Staff had encountered a number of issues in obtaining the requested information. She reported that agencies had not submitted workbooks on time. She explained that according to the approved guidelines, if project data was not submitted on time, the guidelines called for the project to be deleted from the program. She reported that member agencies also had submitted incomplete workbooks, questionable project development schedules, and/or requests to defer projects when local funds had not been committed to the projects.

Ms. Yazzie reported that MAG did not have sufficient man power to coordinate with member agency staff on these issues in order to develop a status report to provide to the Committee at this time. She stated that MAG was working to address the man power issue adding that insufficient information also would have made developing the status report difficult.

Mr. Eric Anderson stated that MAG's goal was to ensure that local agencies were successful in obligating projects. He stated that last fiscal year, the region had carried over \$42 million in federal funds due to projects failing to obligate on time. He explained that ADOT had assisted the region in obligating those funds, but cautioned that ADOT would not be able to help obligate funds in the future. Mr. Anderson emphasized that if the region did not obligate the federal funds that the monies would be returned to the federal government for redistribution to other states. He added that MAG was coordinating with partnering agencies to identify transit or highway projects that could obligate flexed CMAQ funds.

Chairman Moody inquired if MAG Staff would like the Committee to discuss the issue at this time. Ms. Yazzie stated yes. She noted that MAG Staff had repeatedly encouraged ADOT to develop project development timelines to assist local agency staff with developing realistic project development schedules for federally funded projects. Mr. Eric Anderson stated that MAG had conducted a frank discussion with ADOT Staff regarding a variety of issues impacting the obligation of federal funds, such as staffing, organizational changes, and accountability issues. He stated the MAG Staff was on record requesting that ADOT develop project development timelines. He added that MAG Staff would continue to coordinate with ADOT on this issue.

Mr. Cook inquired if there was a plan to complete the reports on the information submitted. Ms. Yazzie replied that developing the report was a possibility citing MAG Staff's continued efforts to coordinate with member agency staff. Mr. Cook suggested that the MAG Street Committee may be able to assist in the project development review process. A brief discussion followed.

Mr. Hauskins stated that the Maricopa County Department of Transportation had developed a scoreboard process to help identify project development issues. He stated that the County had identified that grouping projects together had resulted in a burden on staff for reporting on and processing projects. He noted that the revised process had led to a bump in work during the summer and spring. He offered to discuss the process before the Committee.

Mr. Paul Ward from the City of Litchfield Park addressed funding firewalls. He stated that during the discussion, it was alluded to that the region may need to violate the firewalls in order to ensure the obligation of federal funds. He stated that MAG may need to get legislative action to allow the firewall violation. He suggested that the region should look for large projects that could absorb unobligated OA. He inquired about the possibility of accelerating the design phase of projects as a method to address the issue in the future.

Mr. Meinhart suggested moving from a semi-annual to a quarterly status report. He explained that with more frequent reporting member agencies might be able to prevent priority projects from lapsing. Mr. Meinhart suggested coordinating with ADOT to facilitate the environmental review process. He noted that issues with the timing of projects might be related to the number

of winter visitors.

Ms. Tami Ryall from the Town of Gilbert noted a cluster of projects during the summer. She explained that cluster occurs in part due to the ADOT review process citing issues in getting projects past PS&E. Discussion followed.

Mr. Ward and Mr. Cook encouraged advancing design and right-of-way activities to facilitate the obligation of federal funds. Mr. Anderson cautioned that clearances needed to be obtained before work could proceed past a certain point.

Ms. Yazzie asked the Committee how MAG Staff should proceed with agencies that failed to submit project data on time. She cited the approved Federal Fund Guidelines that required the deletion of projects if agencies failed to submit data on time. Chairman Moody stated that MAG should adhere to the adopted guidelines particularly if failure to address the issue would result in a loss of federal funds to the region. Mr. Naimark inquired how frequent the issue was. Ms. Yazzie replied that the issue applied to a handful of agencies. Mr. Scott Butler from the City of Mesa stated that MAG should enforce the recently adopted guidelines. He added that by enforcing the policy that it would encourage member agencies to meet the established guidelines.

Mr. Eric Anderson stated that enforcing the policy had been MAG Staff's initial reaction. He cautioned that this was the first round of implementing the policy and inquired if MAG should still enforce the policy on the first round. Mr. Butler stated that MAG needed to start enforcing the policy at some point. Mr. Chad Heinrich from the City of Tempe concurred with Mr. Butler and suggested that MAG use the first attempt as a practice round. He stated that MAG should proceed with implementing the policy from here on out.

Mr. Cato Esquivel from the Town of Goodyear inquired how many projects would be affected if the policy was implemented right now. Ms. Yazzie replied that two projects would be deleted.

Next, Ms. Yazzie inquired how MAG Staff should proceed with project schedules that appeared unreasonable. She asked if MAG should have the Street Committee review the project development schedules submitted. Mr. Meinhart encouraged using the Street Committee more. He added the if MAG believed a project schedule was unreasonable then MAG should coordinate directly with the member agencies instead of adding additional time by vetting schedules through the Committee process.

Ms. Yazzie replied that MAG Staff was having an issue with agencies holding firm on unrealistic project schedules. Mr. Cook noted that several issues were affecting the obligation of federal funds. He suggested extending the current deadline to submit project data by two weeks because it was the first effort. He stated that for unreasonable schedules, MAG Staff should coordinate with member agencies. He added that if agencies held firm on unrealistic schedules, then MAG should bring the project before the Street Committee for review. Discussion followed.

Chairman Moody addressed the failure of ADOT to establish project development timelines.

He suggested that the MAG Street Committee and/or subcommittee of the TRC develop timelines for MAG Staff to use. Mr. Grant Anderson agreed with Chairman Moody. He noted the amount of pressure that member agencies can place on MAG Staff. He stated that by developing timelines, MAG Staff would be able to lean back on a schedule developed by member agency staff with knowledge of the project development process. Mr. Eric Anderson agreed with the suggestion.

A brief discussion continued. Mr. Nairmark left the meeting. Chairman Moody asked if the Committee could task the Street Committee with developing a schedule. Ms. Yazzie stated she could present the suggestion the Management Committee for approval. Mr. Eric Anderson stated that he did not believe the development of a schedule required action. Ms. Ryall left the meeting. Ms. Albert suggested that the ITS Committee provide input to the Street Committee regarding project schedules for ITS procurement projects. The Committee agreed.

Chairman Moody inquired if there were any additional questions or comments, and there were none.

10. Preliminary Work Transportation Program Ideas for the FY 2013 Unified Planning Work Program

Moving on, Chairman Moody invited Mr. Eric Anderson to present preliminary work transportation program ideas for the FY 2013 Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP). Mr. Anderson stated that MAG Staff was in the early stages of developing projects for the FY 2013 UPWP. He encouraged member agencies to contact MAG with any comments on specific projects as well as suggestions on new projects.

Mr. Anderson provided brief summaries on preliminary projects for the FY 2013 UPWP. He stated that MAG would conduct a performance measurement data collection and project status dashboard project as a result of the performance audit on the implementation of Proposition 400. He stated that the project would create a graphic interactive web-based platform capable of pulling information from MAG transportation databases.

Mr. Anderson stated a transit planning tool project also was proposed. He reported that MAG had coordinated with RPTA, METRO, and the City of Phoenix on the project. He explained that the tool would help the region understand potential transit markets, evaluate under-/over-served markets, test alternative service plans, and maximize ridership to effectively deploy resources and be good stewards of public money.

Next, Mr. Anderson discussed a proposed Freight Transportation Plan. He explained that the proposed project would build on the Freight Framework Study and would analyze the existing freight corridors throughout Maricopa County. He stated that a freight program was being considered in federal discussions regarding the reauthorization.

Mr. Anderson announced that several programs would continue in FY2013. He stated the MAG Bicycle and Pedestrian Assistance Program would continue. He reported that the amount of funding to be allocated to the program had not been determined due to a reduction in the

number of proposed projects submitted. He announced that the Traffic Signal Optimization Program and Road Safety Audits (RSA) also would be continued.

In closing, Mr. Anderson addressed two potential projects that might be deferred to a later fiscal year. He stated that at some point, MAG would initiate Phase II of the Managed Lanes Study based on the Phase I recommendation. He added that a Hispanic population travel survey may be conducted in a later year as well.

Ms. Ryall returned to the meeting. Mr. Bill Mead from the Town of Paradise Valley left the meeting. Mr. Hauskins informed the Committee that Maricopa County Department of Transportation had developed a program similar to the RSAs. He stated the program was based on a request by the Federal Highway Administration.

Mr. Ward addressed the reduced submissions for the Bicycle and Pedestrian Design Assistance Program. He explained that in the past, projects could be designed under the program. He stated that due to revised federal guidance, the program would only cover project scoping.

Mr. Butler left the meeting. Mr. Rick Austin from the Town of Wickenburg left the meeting. Chairman Moody inquired if there were any additional questions or comments on the presentation. There were none, and he continued to the next item on the agenda.

11. Request for Future Agenda Items

Chairman Moody inquired if the members had any topics or issues of interest they would like to have considered for discussion at a future Committee meeting. There were none, and Chairman Moody moved onto the next agenda item.

12. Member Agency Update

Chairman Moody asked members of the Committee if they would like to provide updates, address any issues or concerns regarding transportation at the regional level, and asked if any members in attendance would like to address recent information that was relevant to transportation within their respective communities. There were none.

13. Next Meeting Date

Moving on, Chairman Moody informed members in attendance that the next regularly scheduled meeting of the Committee would be held on Thursday January 26, 2012, at MAG. There being no further business, Chairman Moody adjourned the meeting at 11:26 a.m.