

DRAFT MINUTES OF THE  
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS  
TRANSPORTATION REVIEW COMMITTEE

December 17, 2015

Maricopa Association of Governments Office  
302 North First Avenue, Suite 200, Saguaro Room  
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

Avondale: David Fitzhugh, Chair  
ADOT: Kwi-Sung Kang for Mike Kies  
Apache Junction: Giao Pham  
\*Buckeye: Scott Lowe  
\*Cave Creek: Ian Cordwell  
Chandler: Dan Cook, Vice Chair  
El Mirage: Jorge Gastelum  
#Fountain Hills: Randy Harrel  
\*Gila Bend: Ernie Rubi  
Gila River Indian Community: Tim Oliver  
Gilbert: Leah Hubbard  
Glendale: Debbie Albert  
\*Goodyear: Cato Esquivel  
\*Litchfield Park: Woody Scoutten

\*Maricopa (City): Paul Jepson  
Maricopa County: Clem Ligocki for Jennifer Toth  
Mesa: Jeff Martin for Scott Butler  
\*Paradise Valley: Jim Shano  
Peoria: Andrew Granger  
Phoenix: Ray Dovalina  
#Pinal County: Louis Andersen  
Queen Creek: Mohamed Youssef  
Scottsdale: Todd Taylor for Paul Basha  
Surprise: Mike Gent  
Tempe: Robert Yabes for Shelly Seyler  
Valley Metro: John Farry  
\*Wickenburg: Vince Lorefice  
\*Youngtown: Grant Anderson

EX-OFFICIO MEMBERS ATTENDING

\*Street Committee: Maria Deeb, City of Mesa  
\*ITS Committee: Marshall Riegel, City of Phoenix  
\*FHWA: Ed Stillings  
\* Members neither present nor represented by proxy.

\* Bicycle/Pedestrian Committee: Jim Hash, City of Mesa  
\* Transportation Safety Committee: Renate Ehm, City of Mesa

+ - Attended by Videoconference  
# - Attended by Audioconference

OTHERS PRESENT

John Bullen, MAG  
Alice Chen, MAG  
Ryan Gish, MAG  
Bob Hazlett, MAG  
Chaun Hill, MAG  
Teri Kennedy, MAG  
Audra Koester Thomas, MAG  
Sarath Joshua, MAG

David Massey, MAG  
Brian Rubin, MAG  
Audrey Skidmore, MAG  
Jessica Blazina, Avondale  
David Janover, Avondale  
Mike Sabatini, Michael Baker International  
Stephen Wilcox, AECOM

1. Call to Order

Chair David Fitzhugh called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. Chair Fitzhugh noted that the quorum requirement for the December 17, 2015 Transportation Review Committee meeting was 13 committee members. Chair Fitzhugh informed the committee that there were three handouts at the table.

2. Approval of Draft October 1st, 2015 Minutes

Chair Fitzhugh asked the committee if there were any comments on the draft October 1, 2015, meeting minutes. Mr. Louis Andersen noted that Mr. Joe Ortiz had been in attendance by audioconference, which was not noted on the minutes. Mr. Jeff Martin moved to approve the minutes as amended. Mr. Ray Dovalina seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

3. Call to the Audience

There were no public comments from the audience.

4. Transportation Director's Report

Chair Fitzhugh invited Mr. Eric Anderson, MAG Transportation Director, to provide the Transportation Director's Report.

Mr. Anderson stated that Regional Area Road Fund (RARF) revenues for November, which are based on October business activities, totaled \$32.11 million. He noted that this is an increase of 6.8% over the previous November and that revenues are up 4.9% year-to-date. He stated that some improvement in the economy is starting to show up in the revenue numbers and that in this fiscal year we should exceed the peak revenue received in October 2007.

Mr. Anderson stated that the Highway User Revenue Fund (HURF) revenues for October are up 8.1% for the month. He noted that HURF revenues have been flat during the recession and are tracking closer to 2004 levels. He stated that revenues are up 6.1% year-to-date, which is good to see. He stated that with lower gas prices, gas tax revenue is up 6.2% and diesel fuel tax revenue is up 5.3%. He stated that the increased travel can be seen on the road system, and that public transportation ridership has declined slightly as gas prices have fallen.

Mr. Anderson noted that the Fixing America's Surface Transportation Act (FAST Act) was passed by Congress and signed by President Obama. He noted that this provides a five year funding plan with some certainty in funding levels. He stated that MAG is still looking at the revenue and policy implications, and noted that in general there will be a little more money coming into the state. He noted that the suballocated Surface Transportation Program (STP) funding which is designated for the Arterial Life Cycle Program (ALCP) is decreasing a little because of funding for bridges being taken from STP. He noted that the percentage of STP allocated to metropolitan areas is scheduled to increase from 50% to 55% over the life of the FAST act.

Mr. Anderson noted that members of the Committee may have been following the activity at Valley Metro/RPTA and that he has been happy to work on stabilizing the agency and keeping business activity moving forward. He stated that Valley Metro has a good management staff and that they will get through this.

Mr. Anderson noted some changes in MAG staffing. He stated that Mr. Jason Stephens has been chosen as the new primary bicycle and pedestrian planner. He noted that Mr. Stephens is an avid bicyclist and is excited to take that position. Mr. Anderson noted the hiring of Ms. Audra Koester Thomas as the Transportation Planning Project Manager. He stated that she comes from Texas A&M and grew up in Minnesota. He stated that MAG is ready to get the planning program working again after the recent staff departures.

Mr. Jeff Martin expressed his appreciation to Mr. Anderson for helping out at Valley Metro.

Chair Fitzhugh thanked Mr. Anderson for his report.

5. Consent Agenda

Chair Fitzhugh directed the Committee's attention to the consent agenda items.

Chair Fitzhugh asked the Committee if there were any questions or comments. There were none.

Mr. Jeff Martin moved to approve the consent agenda. Mr. Mike Gent seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

5A – MAG Federally Funded, Locally Sponsored Project Development Status Report

The MAG Transportation Review Committee, by consent, recommended acceptance of the MAG Federally Funded, Locally Sponsored Project Development Status Report.

5B – Programming of Transportation Alternatives/Safe Routes to School Projects in FY 2017

The MAG Transportation Review Committee, by consent, recommended a list of six (6) projects for FY2017 in the total amount of \$260,407 to be added to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and to add the lists of FY 2017 projects to the Draft FY 2017-2021 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and 2035 Regional Transportation Plan as appropriate.

5C – Request for Connection to the Regional Community Network

The MAG Transportation Review Committee, by consent, recommended approval of the revision of the RCN Roles and Responsibilities document to allow Arizona State University (ASU) to obtain a connection to the Regional Community Network.

5D – Prioritized List of Proposed PM-10 Certified Street Sweeper Projects for FY 2016 CMAQ Funding

The MAG Transportation Review Committee, by consent, received the prioritized list of proposed PM-10 certified street sweeper projects for FY 2016 CMAQ funding.

5E – Arterial Life Cycle Program Status Report: April 2015 - November 2015

The MAG Transportation Review Committee, by consent, received the Arterial Life Cycle Program Status Report: April 2015 – November 2015.

5F – 2015 Annual Report on the Status of the Implementation of Proposition 400

The MAG Transportation Review Committee, by consent, received the 2015 Annual Report on the Status of the Implementation of Proposition 400.

5G – Recommendation of Projects for MAG FY 2016 Traffic Signal Optimization Program

The MAG Transportation Review Committee, by consent, recommended approval of the list of FY 2016 Traffic Signal Optimization Program projects.

6. Federal Fiscal Year 2015 Year End Actuals Report of Federal Highway Administration Suballocated MAG Regional Funds, and Evaluation of Federal Fiscal Year 2016 Funding Levels

Chair Fitzhugh invited Ms. Teri Kennedy to present this item.

Ms. Kennedy presented the Federal Fiscal Year 2015 actual funding numbers as funds were suballocated to the MAG region. She noted that there was an overall 2015 funding amount of \$109 million that came into the region, and that the region ended the year with a balance of -\$375,570. She stated that obligation authority is use it or lose it and that the MAG region has met the target of having no carry forward for the third year in a row. She thanked all of the regional agencies for filling out their project workbooks and noted that the region has done a good job of getting obligation authority usage under control every year.

Ms. Kennedy stated that the FAST Act was signed into law as the meeting agenda was being released. She noted that she had done all analysis for closeout for Federal Fiscal Year 2016 based on MAP-21 information. She stated that she is expecting some changes but the numbers should not be too different. She noted that there is an estimated \$4.6 million available for closeout. She stated that she is using the same amount for final vouchers and awards as last year for the estimate. She added that the Grant Anticipation Notes (GANs) debt service is finished after 2016. She presented a chart showing the estimated numbers used for closeout.

Ms. Kennedy stated that the purpose of closeout is to use obligation authority that is unprogrammed as projects move out of the current fiscal year or cancel. She added that

final vouchers and redistribution of federal funds also add unused obligation authority that has to be dealt with. She noted that closeout is not guaranteed every year as if programming is done perfectly and all assumptions are met, there will be zero dollars left over. She noted that without a long term surface transportation act it has been difficult to do that. She stated that the FAST Act is brand new and that new information is coming out every day.

Ms. Kennedy stated that she issued a call for closeout funding requests which is due on January 15th. She stated that after that, she will build scenarios for closeout which will be presented to the Committee in January for recommendation. She stated that to receive closeout projects have to be already federally funded with suballocated funding, including Transportation Alternatives (TA) and Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality (CMAQ) bicycle and pedestrian funding, CMAQ ITS funding, Highway Safety Improvement Program (HSIP) funding and STP funding designated for Pinal County. She stated that the project has to be obligated with ADOT by June 1 or the project will lose any awarded closeout funding.

Chair Fitzhugh inquired whether there had been changes to the final voucher process. Ms. Kennedy responded that final vouchers are from projects that have historically completed with as-builts submitted to ADOT. She noted that ADOT effort plays a part in getting this money back to the region. She stated that if ADOT's staff time allows, we will see money back from final vouchers. She noted that starting in 2013 ADOT has put a lot of effort into closing out projects and that they will have as much staff working on final vouchers this year as last year. She noted that the estimated amount of money from final vouchers should be about \$5.8 million.

Chair Fitzhugh thanked Ms. Kennedy for her presentation.

7. Programming of Paving of Unpaved Road Projects for MAG Federal Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement Funding in the Draft FY2017-2021 MAG Transportation Improvement Program

Chair Fitzhugh invited Ms. Teri Kennedy to present this item.

Ms. Kennedy presented an overview of the Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality (CMAQ) program, noting that projects are evaluated on a technical basis and that they will score best if they are located within air quality nonattainment areas. She presented a map showing the nonattainment areas within the MAG planning area.

Ms. Kennedy stated that the Bicycle and Pedestrian Committee reviewed project applications and made recommendations at their meeting two days before and those recommendations would be presented to the Committee in January for action.

Ms. Kennedy presented the table of projects showing their ranking and recommended funding. She stated that there was a small amount of carry forward which is not enough to offer to another project and will be saved for the next programming process for paving of unpaved dirt roads. She presented the projects recommended for funding in 2018, noting those projects which would be funded by CMAQ-2.5 funding. She presented the projects recommended for funding in 2019, noting a slight overprogramming for 2018 and 2019. She presented projects recommended for funding in 2020, noting underprogramming. She

then presented a summary of programming for all three years, showing the carry forward balance to be programmed in 2021.

Mr. Jorge Gastelum expressed his thanks to MAG staff and the other communities for assisting in the process. He stated that he recognizes the reasons why El Mirage's application scored low but that they see it as a true air quality concern. He stated that next time he would like to see a process that could provide funding for all communities that need it.

Vice Chair Cook inquired regarding two projects which requested 2019 funding but were programmed for 2020. Ms. Kennedy stated that because of overprogramming in 2019, the most cost effective projects received funding for their priority year. Vice Chair Cook asked if this means that Chandler and the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community's projects would move to 2020 from the requested date. Ms. Kennedy responded that Chandler and SRPMIC had requested funding in 2019 but were moved to 2020 with the concurrence of the Street Committee.

Ms. Debbie Albert moved to recommend approval of the list of projects. Vice Chair Dan Cook seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

8. Programming of Intelligent Transportation Projects for MAG Federal Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement Program Funding in the Draft FY2017-2021 MAG Transportation Improvement Program

Chair Fitzhugh invited Mr. Sarath Joshua to present this item.

Mr. Joshua noted that the table provided for this item showed arterial Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) projects for fiscal years 2018 and 2019. He noted that in the Regional Transportation Plan, ITS funds were separated for the freeway system and the arterial system. He stated that the freeway projects have been before the Committee before and were invested in the Freeway Management System (FMS). He stated that the arterial ITS funding was accelerated and that 2018 and 2019 are the last years that money is available for arterial ITS.

Mr. Joshua stated that the total amount of funding available was \$3.68 million each year. He stated that the ITS Committee had prepared the evaluation process and presented the criteria used for project evaluation. He stated that the first priority is that the project is in compliance with the Regional ITS Architecture. He stated that the second priority is that the project conforms to the 2012 ITS plan. He stated that projects were scored using the Congestion Management Process tool, the Air Quality score based on emission reduction potential and assigned by the Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee, and the safety score based on the potential for the project to improve safety.

Mr. Joshua stated that MAG received a total of 31 applications. He stated that there was a recommended maximum funding level of \$400,000 per project. He stated that projects could be combined if they were submitted in phases due to the \$400,000 limitation. He noted that combined projects help avoid paying additional ADOT review fees for each project. He also noted that project identification numbers were combined to show a single project with multiple phases.

Ms. Debbie Albert stated that thanks to Mr. Joshua, early on in the process, combined projects were identified to help lower the cost of ADOT review fees. She thanked the city of Mesa for doing some trading of projects with Glendale.

Mr. Joshua stated that MAG had to keep the \$400,000 cap as it would be a more difficult task to program a small amount of money if project funding requests came in at \$1 million or \$2 million.

Mr. Ray Dovalina moved to recommend approval of the list of projects. Mr. Jorge Gastelum seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

9. Programming of the Pinal County Surface Transportation Program (PC-STP) Projects in Fiscal Year 2018 and Fiscal Year 2020

Chair Fitzhugh invited Mr. John Bullen to present this item.

Mr. Bullen stated that in 2013 Governor Brewer signed an order expanding the MAG planning area into Pinal County. He stated that with the new members came an apportionment of Surface Transportation Program (STP) funding which is distributed throughout the state based on population. As a result MAG had to create a new suballocated program as the existing STP funding for the MAG region was fully allocated to the Arterial Life Cycle Program (ALCP).

Mr. Bullen stated that a managers' working group created policies for the program and that the Pinal County STP program was approved by the Regional Council in February. He stated that funds for 2017 through 2019 were programmed in May and that this process is programming funding for 2020 and also a small portion of leftover funding from 2018.

Mr. Bullen stated that three applications were received requesting a total of \$3.6 million and that there is \$1.6 million in funding available. He stated that after the Street Committee reviewed the applications, one was deemed ineligible as the application was for paving and paving is specifically excluded from the Pinal County STP program as there is an existing program with funding for paving projects.

Mr. Bullen stated that the Street Committee reviewed the remaining two applications and that after the evaluative process was completed, the two projects ranked identically. He noted that the total funding request exceeded \$1.6 million and that the Street Committee asked if projects would be able to move forward with partial funding. The Gila River Indian Community indicated that their project could not move forward without full requested funding. Apache Junction indicated that they would be able to move forward with partial funding. Mr. Bullen stated that in 2018 a small amount of design funding was recommended for Apache Junction and that in 2020 the Gila River Indian Community receives full funding for their project and Apache Junction receives partial funding.

Mr. Giao Pham expressed his appreciation for working with MAG staff and the Gila River Indian Community.

Mr. Robert Yabes moved to recommend approval of the list of projects as presented. Mr.

Louis Andersen seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

10. Project Changes – Amendment and Administrative Modification to the FY 2014-2018 MAG Transportation Improvement Program and to the 2035 Regional Transportation Plan

Chair Fitzhugh invited Ms. Teri Kennedy to present this item.

Ms. Kennedy noted that all materials for this item were in the mailout or in an updated table given as a handout. She noted that there is a little more information on Table C and that with continuing guidance from FTA about eligibility there may be subsequent changes to the City of Phoenix transit items.

Ms. Kennedy also noted the upcoming December 30th deadline for Project Initiation Pool funding. She stated that any agencies with 2017 or 2018 Federally funded projects yet to start design can submit project information and \$171 to ADOT before December 30th to receive \$3000 of funding toward the ADOT review fees.

Vice Chair Dan Cook moved to recommend approval of the project changes. Mr. Jeff Martin seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

11. Request for Future Agenda Items

Mr. Clem Ligocki requested that at an appropriate time to have an agenda item to discuss the FAST Act and its implications. He noted that there are a lot of moving parts and options that may impact project development and environmental processes and permitting. He stated that it would be good to have a discussion on how it will impact local agencies.

Chair Fitzhugh requested that MAG staff schedule a presentation on the ADOT local project review process. He stated that Avondale is still having issues in terms of timeliness of project reviews and that it would be worthwhile to bring this up for discussion again to see how we are doing and what we can do better to understand what is happening. Mr. Ligocki noted that the FHWA Every Day Counts stakeholders group is meeting and discussing issues like this. He added that if it makes sense before or following a discussion by the Committee, there is the opportunity to bring this topic into that group where FHWA is at the table.

12. Member Agency Update

Mr. Ray Dovalina noted that the Phoenix Transportation 2050 program would be starting in January.

Chair Fitzhugh noted that this was both his last meeting as chair of the Committee and his last meeting as a member of the Committee. He stated that Mr. David Janover, the Avondale City Engineer, will replace him on the Committee. He stated that he has been on the Committee since 2001 or 2002. He added that he is now on the Management Committee and is getting further away from direct involvement in transportation. He stated that it has been a privilege and an honor to serve on the Committee.

13. Next Meeting Date

The next regular Transportation Review Committee meeting will be scheduled for Thursday, January 28, 2015 at 10:00 a.m. in the MAG Office, Saguaro Room.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:46 a.m.