

MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS  
REGIONAL DOMESTIC VIOLENCE COUNCIL  
MEETING MINUTES  
MARCH 1, 2005

MEMBERS ATTENDING:

- \*Tracy Bame, Phelps Dodge Corp.
- Tony Vidale for John A. Blackburn, Jr., AZ  
Criminal Justice Commission
- \*Jerry Boone, Maricopa County Department of  
Public Health
- \*Cmdr Jim Brad, Town of Gilbert
- \*Dr. Mary Ellen Bradshaw, Arizona Public  
Health Assoc.
- \*Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa  
Indian Community
- Dena Salter for Dr. Dean Coonrod, Maricopa  
Integrated Health Systems/MedPro
- \*Gene D'Adamo, The Arizona Republic
- \*Jill Faver, Arizona Foundation for Women
- Martha Fraser Harman, Men's Anti Violence  
Network
- Susan Glawe, Blue Cross Blue Shield
- \*Gabriella Guerra, Value Options
- Anna Maria Leff, DES/DCYF for Laura  
Guild, DES
- Cindy Hallman, Marley House
- Sheri Lauritano for Vicki Hill, City of  
Phoenix
- \*Dan Hughes, City of Surprise
- Cmdr. Kim Humphrey, City of Phoenix,  
Public Affairs Bureau, Vice Chair
- Linda Dickerson for Roger Illingworth, Dept.  
Of Public Safety
- Cindy Richmond for Mary Lynn Kasunic,  
Area Agency on Aging
- \*Phil Lieberman, Council member of Glendale
- Sue Linney, Councilmember of Goodyear
- \*Marie Lopez-Rogers, Councilmember of  
Avondale
- \*JoEllen Lynn, American Express
- \*Linda Martin, Foundation for Senior Living
- \*Judy Mattingly, Justice Services, Inc
- \*Preston McMurry, McMurry Publishing
- Carolyn McBurney, Envision Project  
Management
- Lisa Melton, Community Legal Services  
Craig Mills, PPA
- Carmen Shudde for Marna McClendon, Office  
of the Attorney General
- \*Karen O'Connor, Maricopa County
- \*Michael Parascandola, City of Goodyear
- Celeste Adams for Janice Parker, Save the  
Family Foundation
- \*Sandi Perez, BHHS Legacy Foundation
- \*Keith Perkins, Never Again Foundation
- \*Don Peyton, City of Phoenix Fire Dept.
- Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center
- John Pombier, City of Mesa
- Lynn Potts, City of Mesa
- Wallace Kemp for Lonetta Sanders, Phoenix  
Police Department
- Ginger Spencer, Phoenix Family Advocacy  
Center
- \*Mike Stedman, City of El Mirage
- \*Marie Sullivan, AZ Women's Education and  
Employment
- Kristen Scharlau for Judy Tapscott, City of  
Tempe
- Mary Thomson, Governor's Office
- Sheri Lauritano for Kerry G. Wangberg, City  
of Phoenix Prosecutor's Office
- Phillip Westbrook, Councilmember of  
Chandler, Chairman
- Dale Wiebusch, Arizona Coalition Against  
Domestic Violence
- \*Terri Woodmansee, City of Goodyear

OTHERS PRESENT:

- Nichole Ayoola, City of Mesa
- Evelyn Buckner, Governor's Division for  
Women
- Teresa Franquiz, MAG
- DeDe Gaisthea, MAG
- Lindsey Higginson, MAG
- Carol Lopinski, Child Crisis Center
- Lynn Timmons, City of Phoenix

\* Those not present or represented by proxy  
+ Those attending by video/audio conference.

1. Call to Order

Craig Mills, EADV Chairman opened the meeting and called the Council to order at 9:10am, welcomed everyone and began introductions.

Teresa Franquiz, MAG, announced four new members to the Council: Lisa Melton, East Valley Community Legal Services; Ginger Spencer, Phoenix Family Advocacy Center; Patricia Stevens, Maricopa County Attorney's Office; and Patricia Klahr, Chrysalis Shelter.

2. Call to the Audience  
No comments were made at this time.
3. Approval of the January 6, 2005 Council Meeting Minutes  
Minutes were tentatively approved by consent until a quorum was available. The minutes passed unanimously by consent with no changes.
4. Formal Approval of Action Items From January 6, 2005 Council Meeting  
Formal approval of action items from January 6, 2005 were held over until a quorum was available.
5. Working Group Progress Reports
  - EADV Subcommittee-Carolyn McBurney, Envision Management, stated that the Walk to End Domestic Violence will be held on April 23 with 29 teams already signed up, ahead of pace from last year. At the recent MAG Regional Council meeting, a challenge was issued to all cities to form a team. She reported that there is already good representation from the cities, but if there are any cities that have not formed a team and would like to, they can see her or Loni Padilla. She stated the Governor is the honorary chair of the event and this year there is the ability to register for the Walk on-line at [dvwalk.azcentral.com](http://dvwalk.azcentral.com). Ms. McBurney commented that sponsorship is up from last year and the goal of 5,000 participates could be reached. She also stated that they are looking to distribute \$250,000 to providers and would like to thank the City of Phoenix, Blue Cross Blue Shield of AZ and the Governor's Office for their support.

Teresa Franquiz, MAG, gave a brief description of the Cut It Out Program, which will be brought to Arizona by the Attorney General's Office in partnership with the Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence and the State Cosmetology Board. The national program aims to educate salon practitioners about domestic violence and how to provide appropriate referrals for their clients. Clairol, Southern Living, and the National Cosmetology Association founded the program in Birmingham, AL and is now operating in several states. Free training and materials are available from national Cut It Out. The first step will be to bring a Cut It Out trainer to Arizona to provide a train the trainer session. In Arizona, training will be offered to students at cosmetology schools before attempting to target individual salons. EADV will be able to support their efforts by helping to get the word out, potentially

offering a table at the Walk, and recruiting salon professionals for EADV membership.

- Victim Services Subcommittee- Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center, provided an update on the activities of the Victim Services Subcommittee. Representatives from DES, CONTACTS Shelter Hotline, and ASU West have been assisting with their current project to achieve an unduplicated count of the number of women and children attempting to access shelter in Maricopa County. All the shelters have agreed to assist with the effort by asking those who contact the shelter for service if this is their first call and if not, how many other calls they have made. This survey will run from March 15 to April 15. Dr. Richard Knopf from ASU West will assist with the analysis. There will also be a written survey provided to shelter clients. Ms. Phillips said that she felt this project will help in articulating the extent of the need for services and that the capacity issue is the highest priority.

Mary Thomson, Governor's Office, commented that this was an excellent project and a good opportunity to reach potential victims.

Chairman Westbrook agreed and added that the Chandler City Council has voted to reallocate some \$250,000 in capital funds, originally earmarked by a new family advocacy center in Chandler, toward expanded shelter capacity in the area. The estimate is that the funds would provide an additional eight beds. The City will be developing an RFP over the next few months.

#### 6. Regional Domestic Violence Council Membership

Chairman Westbrook reminded the Council that over the last few months, they have been working to revitalize their membership. Late last year, MAG staff sent out letters to all of the current members asking for their commitment to the Council. There was another letter sent to regularly attending audience members to gauge interest among other community members in joining the Council. He asked Teresa Franquiz, MAG, to provide an update for the Council on the number of responses received.

Ms. Franquiz said that in response to the letters, four members had resigned from the Council; however, three new members have been added, coming to a total of 51 members currently. (New member Patricia Stevens from the Maricopa County Attorney's is a replacement for Maria Armijo and does not increase the total number). She reported that the chair group had discussed establishing a list of those members who did not respond to the membership letters and who have not attended any DV Council meetings in the past year. Those members could be moved from the members list to the "interested others" list—they would still receive updates on the activity of the Council and pertinent subcommittees, but they would not be standing members counted towards meeting quorum. If this step is taken, a final letter could be distributed notifying the members of the Council's action.

In preparation for today's meeting, Ms. Franquiz had compiled a list of ten Council members who have not been in attendance for at least twelve months, did not respond to the membership letters, and are not available by phone when calls are made to remind members of upcoming meetings. These ten members included:

Commander Jim Brad, Town of Gilbert  
Mary Ellen Bradshaw, AZ Public Health Assoc.  
Councilmember Phil Lieberman, City of Glendale  
Linda Martin, Paradise Valley United Methodist Church  
Judy Mattingly, Justice Services Inc.  
Preston McMurry, McMurry Publishing  
Karen O'Connor, Maricopa County Superior Court  
Sandi Perez, BHHS Legacy Foundation  
Marie Sullivan, AZ Women's Education & Employment  
Terri Woodmansee, City of Goodyear

Members of the Council pointed out that some of these members may no longer be with their former organizations. Ms. Franquiz replied that if that is the case, hopefully a replacement can be found for them, as it is the organization that maintains the seat on the Council, rather than the individual.

There was also concern that the process of notifying an elected official of a change in the status of their membership may be different than for other non-elected members. Ms. Franquiz said that she would double-check on this process before proceeding.

Mr. Frasier Harmon asked if it might be a better idea to engage in some strategic planning to clearly identify goals and objectives for the upcoming year before changing the composition of the Council. Commander Humphrey agreed, but stated that unfortunately, with several members not attending meetings, it has been difficult to obtain a quorum in order to take action to approve new goals and objectives. He suggested working on establishing a workable committee membership structure first, determining new goals and objectives next, then extending membership invitations to new members as warranted by the new goals.

The group discussed the need to remain inclusive and to maintain a balance of varied representation on the Council. Some voiced concern that certain essential stakeholders will no longer be represented. Ms. Franquiz replied that the goal is absolutely to remain inclusive and to continue to reach out to those organizations whose representatives are no longer able to attend and to other new organizations as needed. It was suggested that a small group be formed to look at membership to ensure that representation is equally distributed.

**Chairman Westbrook called for a motion to approve moving the ten individuals from the Council membership roster to an “interested others” distribution list. Vice Chair Humphrey moved to approve the action, with a second by Mr. Mills. Carolyn McBurney, Martha Frasier-Harmon, and Sue Glaw voted no, with all others voting yes. The motion passed twenty-two to three.**

7. Regional Domestic Violence Council Structure

Chairman referred the Council to a flowchart depicting the construction of the domestic violence related committees and subcommittees at their relation to the Regional Domestic Violence Council. Mr. Pombier noted that the Phoenix Domestic Violence Task Force and Mesa Domestic Violence Council were not included on the flow chart; however, there are members of both of those groups who are also members of the Regional Council. Ms. Franquiz said that it was a good idea to include those two groups on the flow chart and would add them. She also said that she would contact the staff persons for both groups and begin attending those meetings, as she was able. The group agreed that coordination between all the groups is the most important issue, rather than simply reporting.

**Chairman Westbrook called for a motion to approve the organizational flowchart, with the addition of the Phoenix and Mesa domestic violence councils. Mr. Mills moved to approve the flowchart, seconded by Ginger Spencer. The motion passed unanimously.**

*At this time a quorum was available. Councilmember Linney moved to approve the minutes and items for consent that had been held over earlier in the meeting. Mr. Mills seconded the motion. The minutes and consent items were passed unanimously.*

8. Costs of Domestic Violence to Municipalities

Chairman Westbrook introduced Nichole Ayoola, City of Mesa, who gave a presentation on the cost to the City of responding to a domestic violence call in Mesa. Ms. Ayoola began her presentation by stressing that the information she was about to present was not scientific, but that it was simply a snapshot of one, very simple case. She stated that due to the budget crisis, she had been asked to put together a budget presentation to justify continued funding for the human service division. She added that the City’s Human Services Department does not provide direct services; all human services are contracted out to providers.

To put together her case, she made calls to emergency responders to gather information on the cost of a standard domestic violence call to the police department. She stressed that there is no typical case or call, but that this only an example. There is no way to get a true cost estimate that is always the same. She added that they only measured the cost of staff time in responding to a domestic violence call, and did not include any peripheral costs. Her slide showed that the

average cost of responding to a very simple call is approximately \$861.94. This is over  $\frac{3}{4}$  more than what the City allocates for each client currently.

Ms. Ayoola suggested that it would be interesting and helpful to do a regional study on the economic impact of domestic violence. She said that the Council could consider doing research on the costs involved to the Cities in order to explain to those who make the budgeting decisions why funding is needed.

Ms. Melton worried that the total looked a little low. For example, the cost of obtaining an order of protection was not included. Ms. Ayoola and Mr. Pombier replied that for this initial presentation, the goal was to keep the case as simple as possible and only to include costs to the City for illustrative purposes. Ms. Ayoola stated that when the city council was given this presentation, it was received very well.

Dale Weibusch, ACADV, commented that the cost of a night in a shelter was one of the cheapest things. He stressed that this was a very valuable tool in trying to get the issue across to legislators and he appreciated the presentation.

Ms. Linney said that she also appreciated the information and said that she would like to see a similar project done in the City of Goodyear. Commander Humphrey added that the public would be looking at a \$60-\$70 million annual cost statewide if we were to assume that the costs were the same across the board. Ms. Salter pointed out that even one trip to the emergency room could triple this cost. Ms. Spencer added her approval as well and recommended that if future case studies are done, that including the cost of an order of protection be included in the tally of basic needs. In response to a question from Ms. Linney, Ms. Ayoola said that children in need of services in Mesa are referred to the East Valley Child Crisis Center or to CPS.

Anna Maria Leff said that she would like, ideally, for the cost of prevention to be looked at as well, as it is likely much lower than the cost of providing for emergency services. Mr. Pombier stressed that this case study was very narrowly focused, as the purpose was to go before the city council to make a case for continued funding of the Human Services Department. Ms. Scharlau noted that it would be difficult to compare across jurisdictions if a regional study was done, because services are provided differently in almost every community. For example, in Tempe, Care 7 covers a lot of the costs of domestic violence. Ms. Linney again thanked Ms. Ayoola for the information and said that this really shows where to put a city's prevention dollar.

9. Update on the Governor's Commission to Prevent Violence Against Women  
Chairman Westbrook introduced Mary Thomson, Director of the Governor's Division for Women, who gave an update on the current activities of the Governor's Commission to Prevent Violence Against Women. Ms. Thomson began by saying that she was glad that there would now be a standing item on this

Regional Council's agenda to provide an update on what is going on with the Commission, as it provides a good opportunity for MAG and the Council to stay informed and potentially get involved.

She provided an update of a state-wide attitudinal survey of law enforcement officers that is being conducted by the Morrison Institute on behalf of the Commission. The survey will be distributed across the state and will be followed up by focus groups with some departments. The goal is to determine have attitudes about domestic violence and DV victims have changed, in order to inform training curriculums of law enforcement officers. The initial phase will be completed in the next 3-4 months and they hope to have a finished product by the end of the summer. The hope is to update training curriculums for basic training at police academies and to engage in an AZPOST curriculum review.

She added that the Commission has been doing a lot of work around children who have witnessed domestic violence and could potentially see a role for this Council to assist in that effort by forming a relevant planning group and in developing materials on how to respond to children who have been impacted by DV.

There is also a professor from ASU who is assisting the Commission to update the fatality review of domestic violence cases state-wide. Some communities have expressed an interest in forming their own fatality review teams.

The Governor has proposed a \$1.5 million increase in the state budget for shelter services. She asked that the members of the Council express their support to their respective legislators.

Commander Humphrey said that the law enforcement study is a great opportunity for the Council to link up to a project that the state is currently working on. They are already doing focus groups and it may be possible for the Council to team up with Morrison to do more focus groups here in Maricopa County specifically. Ms. Franquiz said that she would follow up with Mary Thomson and Cmdr. Humphrey to get contact information for someone with the Morrison Institute.

#### 10. Update on Domestic Violence Legislative Issues

Chairman Westbrook introduced Dale Weibusch, ACADV, who gave an update on domestic violence related items currently before the Arizona State Legislature. Mr. Weibusch said that we need to impress upon legislators that having shelter services available to victims of DV will save money in the long-run. He thanked Ms. Ayoola again for her earlier presentation.

Mr. Weibusch stated that appropriations bill 2705 did not get a hearing last week and will have to be attached to another bill in order to get one. This bill would provide additional funding to DES for domestic violence shelters and programs.

Senate bill 1040 on spousal rape passed in the Judiciary Committee in the Senate with only one no vote, though it has not yet been assigned to a House committee.

House bill 2593 would prevent eviction when a resident dials 911. This bill has passed unanimously out of the Commerce Committee in the House.

Senate bill 1086, concerning the restriction of access to the public records of DV and stalking victims, has been assigned to the Government Reform and Finance Committee.

Mr. Weibusch added that the House is currently in discussion about the creation of anti-bullying policies. A draft policy passed in the Senate with only three no votes.

He also reported on the recent STOP Violence Against Women rally held by ACADV on the Senate lawn. The event was very successful and moving. He reported that Senator Blendu was in attendance.

Both the Senate and House versions of the fatality review bills are identical; all that is needed for passage now are enough floor votes.

Ms. Spencer asked about the status of a bill concerning orders of protection. Mr. Weibusch reported that there are currently two versions, one of which was thrown out within two weeks. The issue is working its way through CIDVIC. He added that on March 17 and 18, there will be a national conference that will include information on the uniformity of orders of protection called Project Passport. The project began in Kentucky; Mr. Weibusch plans to attend the conference.

11. Announcements

Mr. Weibusch announced that the Coalition will hold their annual conference on Tuesday May 3 and Wednesday May 4 at the Embassy Suites Hotel on Greenway Rd in Phoenix.

12. Adjourn

The meeting adjourned at 11:00am.

**Due to the Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence Conference on May 3-4, 2005 the Council agreed to reschedule the next meeting to Tuesday, May 10 from 9:00 – 11:00am at the MAG offices, Saguaro Room.**