

MINUTES OF THE  
MAG ELDERLY PERSONS AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES  
5310 TRANSPORTATION AD HOC COMMITTEE

January 15, 2019

MAG Office Building, Chaparral Room  
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

\*Carolynn Ballard, Town of Florence  
\*Ron Brooks, Valley Metro  
\* Matt Dudley, City of Glendale  
\*Joan Freeman, City of Scottsdale  
\*Autumn Grooms, City of El Mirage  
Ed Jones, City of Mesa  
Martin Lucero, City of Surprise, Chair

#Wendy Miller, City of Phoenix  
Christina Panaitescu, City of Goodyear  
Jeff Tourdot, Maricopa County  
Human Services Department  
#Robert Yabes, City of Tempe, Vice  
Chair

\*Neither present nor represented by proxy.  
#Attended by telephone conference call.  
+ Attended by videoconference

OTHERS ATTENDING

DeDe Gaisthea, MAG  
Shantel Wyke, MAG  
Billy Parker, Chandler Gilbert Arc

1. Welcome and Introductions

Martin Lucero, City of Surprise, Chair of the Elderly Persons and Persons with Disabilities (EPDT) Ad Hoc Committee, called the meeting to order at 10:35 a.m. Introductions ensued.

2. Call to the Audience

Audience members were given an opportunity to address the Committee on items not on the agenda for discussion or information only. There were no comments from the audience.

3. Approval of the MAG Ad Hoc EPDT November 28, 2018 Meeting Minutes

Christina Plante, City of Goodyear, moved to approve the November 28, 2018 meeting minutes. Ed Jones, City of Mesa, seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

4. Transportation Legislative Report

Chair Lucero announced that the legislative report on transportation related items from the local, state, and federal level would be moved to a later date.

5. MAG Subregional Mobility Manager Update

Chair Lucero introduced Sub-Regional Mobility Manager Billy Parker, Chandler Gilbert Arc who

offered an update on projects he would be taking on during 2019. Mr. Parker noted the primary project he will be undertaking are the quarterly vehicle-sharing trainings with regional stakeholders. He noted the vehicle-sharing workshops are a continuous learning process where attendees shared new challenges and opportunities. Mr. Parker noted that one change in the trainings for this year were that former Sub-Regional Mobility Manager Jayne Hubbard, formerly of the Foothills Caring Corps, would still be supporting the workshop as a volunteer trainer. He noted documents from Foothill Caring Corps will no longer be used, but their process would be referenced as an example of a sharing opportunity for agencies. The continued partnership with Ms. Hubbard brings together different perspective on vehicle sharing that benefit the participants. The next Vehicle Sharing workshop will take place on January 17, 2019, here at the MAG offices.

Mr. Parker stated he has had the opportunity to invite two insurance brokers, Bob Ramsey, Silverleaf Insurance Group, and Dave Binsfield, General Southwest Insurance Agency, Inc., to the vehicle-sharing trainings. These brokers have helped Chandler Gilbert Arc build their vehicle-sharing program, and have attended previous vehicle-sharing trainings to present their insight. This has proven to be beneficial when answering attendees' questions regarding liability. Next steps are to reach out to organizational leadership who may be better positioned to make transformational decisions about implementing a vehicle-sharing program at their organization. He has been going to agencies to talk with their leadership about implementing a vehicle-sharing program.

Mr. Parker has worked with Laurie Berg Sapp, MAG Communication Division, to create a vehicle-sharing promotional video with individuals from Valley Center for the Deaf, and DeDe Gaisthea, MAG. The video would be posted on the MAG website once it had been approved for release. Mr. Parker stated he would once again volunteer to offer assistance, and answer questions to agencies may have who would be applying for the Section 5310 grant funds. Mr. Parker noted his recent facilitation at the MAG Human Services Conference on December 4, 2018. He had the opportunity to introduced Rob Antoniak, Valley Metro, on his presentation about alternative transportation options and new technology. This concluded Mr. Parker presentation.

Chair Lucero inquired if participating organization have increased the number of hours, times, or vehicles in their vehicle-sharing program over the past years. Mr. Parker responded that agencies, such as Independence Plus, Inc., were coming closer to establishing a vehicle-sharing program as a result of attending trainings. He noted that insurance and liability are the biggest barriers and are being discussed at the trainings with support from Chandler Gilbert Arc's two insurance brokers. Mr. Parker has reached out to a local Boys and Girls Club, Gilbert School District, and a mobility manager in Flagstaff who were interested in implementing vehicle sharing programs. Chair Lucero commented Mr. Parker for bringing in the two insurance brokers to help with the discussion of liability issues. He emphasized the need of continuing to help organizations see the benefits of vehicle sharing. Chair Lucero noted the progression on the number of organizations active in vehicle sharing would be a goal for Mr. Parker in the

future. Mr. Parker added that he hopes the vehicle-sharing promotional video will help with educating and garnering more interest from organizations.

Ms. Gaisthea noted the Vehicle Sharing workshops were well attended. Many participants have returned to the workshops and have brought other staff members with them to learn about the program. It is anticipated that this effort would help to bring in organizational leaders who could encourage implementing a vehicle sharing program. She also recognized the benefit of Mr. Parker inviting the two insurance brokers at the trainings to provide insight and support. She hoped the promotional video would be ready to share at the next EPDT Ad Hoc Committee meeting and TAP meeting. Ms. Gaisthea noted, Charles Dickson, Community Transportation Association of America (CTAA), has expressed an interested in the vehicle sharing workshop.

Ms. Panaitescu, City of Goodyear, inquired on the benefits of vehicle sharing for nonprofit agencies in regards to the extra work necessary for implementing a program. Mr. Parker noted from his experience having a vehicle sharing program helps utilize the organization's existing vehicle resources, provides transportation access for more people, and can lead to developing relationships with other agencies which can lead to more resource sharing. He added this also provides other Section 5310 grant subrecipients with another opportunity to participate in coordination efforts, which is an FTA requirement. Ms. Miller commented that efficient utilization of federal assets is a priority and vehicle sharing offers an opportunity to meet that priority.

Jeff Tourdot, Maricopa County Human Services Department, commented that subregional mobility managers could explore coordination opportunities with other vehicle providers such as Lyft, to fulfill the broader needs of the community. Chair Lucero noted that the City of Phoenix had explored an alternative transportation pilot program with Lyft. He agreed that utilizing other transportation means, such as Lyft, could be a transportation resource. Mr. Parker noted due to mobility restrictions and capability of consumers in the targeted population, additional assistance to passengers would be a topic to explore. Ed Jones, City of Mesa, noted programs such as RideChoice and Lyft could be an option for nonprofits. Chair Lucero commented that one of the responsibilities of subregional mobility managers is to have knowledge of the different types of programs offered through other entities, and it would helpful to look into these programs. Ms. Gaisthea offered to look into Lyft's ability to provide accessible rides to consumers. Chair Lucero thanked Mr. Parker for his presentation and efforts.

6. Overview of the Federal Transit Administration Section 5310 Enhance Mobility of Seniors and Individuals with Disabilities Program

Chair Lucero introduced Ms. Gaisthea to give an overview of the Section 5310 Grant program. Ms. Gaisthea noted on the legislative level there have been no significant changes to the Section 5310 program. She noted the statewide program coordinated through the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) is on hold due to the federal government shutdown.

The application process and training for agencies applying outside of the Phoenix-Mesa Urbanized Area (UZA) boundary is on hold at this time. She will keep the Committee updated on the statewide Section 5310 application process as she receives further information. Ms. Gaisthea provided overview on the FTA Section 5310 Program. She reviewed eligible applicants were private nonprofit (PNP) organizations, public agencies where no viable PNPs were available and tribal governments. Agencies serving the populations of older adults aged 65 or older and individuals with disabilities. Eligible activities include traditional capital requests such as vehicles, preventive maintenance, equipment, and mobility management. Other capital and operating requests included those that exceeded ADA, improved access to a fixed route, and were alternatives to public transportation. Ms. Gaisthea reviewed the boundary areas for the statewide and Phoenix-Mesa UZA application process.

Ms. Gaisthea noted that under the FAST Act the Section 5310 program has dedicated funding to 2020 plus an additional funding appropriated for 2021. The program require no less than 55 percent of funding to traditional capital requests, 45 percent to "Other" capital and operation, and less than 10 percent to administration. The 2018 funding availability estimate of \$3.1 million for the Phoenix-Mesa UZA would be used for the 2019 process until funding apportionment are announced. Ms. Gaisthea noted it is the role of the MAG EPDT Ad Hoc Committee to serve as the technical committee to develop the priority listing of projects for the Phoenix-Mesa UZA. The priority listing of projects are utilized when FTA final apportionments are released for awarding. The EPDT Ad Hoc Committee evaluates each application according to FTA requirements and criteria outlined in the Section 5310 application handbook. MAG and the City of Phoenix staff will conduct an internal evaluation, allocating points to agencies based on the completeness and accuracy of their applications to addressing the criteria, and they provide an initial ranking to the Committee.

Ms. Gaisthea then proceeded through the flow of the approval process, noting that selected applications pass through approval from the MAG EPDT Ad Hoc Committee, to the MAG Human Services Technical and Community Initiatives Committee, to the MAG Management Committee, and finally to the MAG Regional Council, which consists of elected officials including town managers and their representatives. Once passed through MAG Regional Council, the priority listing for the Phoenix-Mesa UZA is offered to the City of Phoenix for submittal to the FTA. When the final apportionment is received, the 5310 applicants are notified of their awards. Chair Lucero reiterated the Committee's responsibility is to develop the priority listing that will be utilized for the regional program of projects when final funding is apportioned. There were no further comments. Chair Lucero thanked Ms. Gaisthea.

7. Review of the 2019 Section 5310 Application Process and Timeline for the Phoenix-Mesa Urbanized Area

Ms. Gaisthea provided an overview of the FY 2019 Section 5310 application process and application timeline for the Phoenix-Mesa UZA. She noted Committee's feedback received from the previous year's application process had been incorporated into the 2019 application, and the EPDT evaluation guidelines. Ms. Gaisthea reviewed Committee guidelines for the

Section application process for the Phoenix-Mesa UZA. Traditional capital requests are limited to five vehicles, mobility management requests are limited to \$45,000 for full time equivalent (FTE) based on research of national best practices. Other capital and operating requests are on \$125,000 increments based on funding availability. Application evaluations are based on information provided in the application and associated presentations only. Ms. Gaisthea noted clarification was added to the Committee evaluation guidelines, specifying that members of the Committee were to recuse themselves from evaluating their respective agency's application and would refrain from participating in their respective agency's applicant interview. She noted that an agency's participation in project requests that were regionally beneficial would not be a conflict of interest. Ms. Miller noted as an example that in the past she has recused herself from the evaluation table during the City of Phoenix's applicant interview and from participation in the Committee's evaluation of their application. Applicants applying for the first time would be required to attend the Technical Assistance Workshop and all applicants would be required to present at the applicant presentations.

Ms. Gaisthea reviewed key dates for the application schedule. On January 18, 2019, a public notice would go out to notify applicants of the application release date as well as provide contact information and information regarding the ADOT process. The application would be published on January 25, 2019. On January 29, 2019, she and Ms. Miller would offer a proposal assistance workshop, where they would explain the application process and answer questions. Technical assistance will be offered to applicants on February 11 and 12, 2019, by appointment only. This is requirement for first-time applicants. Applications would be due February 25, 2019, at noon and no late applications would be accepted. On the afternoon of the 25, 2019, the City of Phoenix and MAG staff would open the applications and internal reviews for eligibility would be conducted from February 26, 2019 to March 15, 2019.

Ms. Gaisthea noted on March 19, 2019, applications would be distributed to the EPDT Ad Hoc Committee and training would take place. The Committee will submit clarification questions, solely based on the application, to MAG staff, by April 11, 2019, who forward to applicants. Applicants would submit their responses, and the Committee would receive those responses by April 16, 2019. The Committee's initial scores would be due to MAG staff on April 19, 2019, at 1:00 p.m. Applicant presentations, which would take place on April 23 and 24, 2019, during a two-day application review process in the Cholla Room, MAG. Lunch for the Committee would be provided. During this two-day review, the Committee will develop the priority listing. She noted the City of Phoenix has offered provide estimated funding scenarios for reference. Chair Lucero asked for questions and comments. No further comments were received. Chair Lucero thanked the City of Phoenix and MAG staff for consolidating the Committee's questions and feedback into the process for maximum clarification and advancement. Ms. Gaisthea expressed appreciation for Ms. Miller's time and efforts in moving the process forward.

Chair Lucero called a vote for the approval of the 2019 Section 5310 application process and timeline for the Phoenix-Mesa UZA. Ms. Panaitescu motioned to approve the application

process and timeline. Ms. Miller seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

8. Request for Future Agenda Items

Chair Lucero requested future agenda items. Ms. Gaisthea noted per Committee's comments to look into a future Lyft presentation.

9. Comments from the Committee

No comments from the Committee were provided.

10. Adjourn

Chair Lucero called for a motion to adjourn the meeting. Ms. Miller motioned, and Mr. Jones seconded it. The motion passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at 12:07 p.m.